

Interactive
Comment

***Interactive comment on* “New products for a better characterisation of smoke plume and gas/aerosol dispersion from boreal eurasian forest fires: the ALANIS Smoke Plume project” by J.-P. Muller et al.**

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 17 February 2012

The authors present general plans of the work to be done in the ESA ALANIS Smoke Plume project and motivate these plans with a few demonstration products that cover the Russian fire episode of summer 2010. The demonstration products consist of

- a map of CO total columns retrieved from observations by the IASI instrument
- a map of smoke plume injection height that has been derived from AATSR observations
- a map of Oxygen A-band ratios from MERIS observations
- a map of burnt area

C5806

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- two maps of simulated CO total columns

The main conclusion is that "the EO-missions" have a high potential for the tracking of smoke plumes. I guess that this statement refers to AATSR and MERIS, but this is not explicitly stated.

The manuscript completely lacks a description of the methodologies with which the presented products are obtained. Furthermore, the products are only shown as plots and no quantitative description whatsoever is attempted. On top of that the products are not validated and not even put into the context of other published results. Due to these shortcomings, the main conclusion is not substantiated in a scientific sense. The entire approach seems adequate for a project proposal but it is not suitable for publication in a scientific journal as BG.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 8, 9747, 2011.

BGD

8, C5806–C5807, 2012

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

