

Interactive comment on “Separating agricultural and non-agricultural fire seasonality at regional scales” by B. I. Magi et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 4 June 2012

Magi et al. separate the agricultural from non-agricultural fires based on satellite data. This topic is relevant and the presented results useful for the improvement of fire modelling within earth system models. The methods are clearly described and the results presented in a well structured way. The discussion gives a nice review of regional differences in fire patterns. Although the results are relevant, the results presented are few and could be extended with for instance showing a global map with the peak month of agricultural and non-agricultural burning or plots similar to Fig 3. but instead of presenting the interannual variability as error bars, the variability within the region. An interesting addition could also be the separation not only in agricultural but directly into cropland and pasture fires. It would also be interesting to see how these results compare to seasonality of the emission data of the GFED version 3 database, which have been separated into sources.

C1660

specific comments:

p.5552,l.20: see also Kloster et al. 2010 and Thonicke et al. 2010, both use the population density p. 5553, l.1: missing blank

p.5555, l. 3: the hyde data for the year 2000 is used until 2004, for 2004 the year 2005 might be more representative.

Fig. 3: the zero line is not necessary and can be confusing as it has the same color as the lightning frequency.

Fig. 4: the fraction of burned pasture and burned crops to burned land would be an interesting addition.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 5551, 2012.