

Interactive comment on “Organic matter dynamics and stable isotopes for tracing sources of suspended sediment” by Y. Schindler Wildhaber et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 9 March 2012

General comments: An interesting manuscript with a nice set of data and a detailed analyses of these data. Although this approach has been used in other rivers, the context within which the questions concerning the impact of the sediment on the brown trout are addressed is also a scientifically interesting question of interest to geo- as well as biogeoscientists and biologists. In addition, the controls and the model used to determine the individual contributions to the sediment as a function of time and place is good as this is also a relatively small catchment river. Sadly, however, the authors do not really get back to responding to this question after a detailed description and discussion of their analyses and data.

C256

In addition, the text is often somewhat confusing and awkwardly phrased. The English certainly needs improving. The text is in some places also too long and there is some repetition of things that are already given in the diagrams or tables.

Hence, the manuscript ought to be revised and rewritten. Overall data and the models and conclusions proposed are valid though.

Specific comments have been added to the margins of the manuscript as notes (see supplement pdf)

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/9/C256/2012/bgd-9-C256-2012-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 453, 2012.

C257