

Interactive comment on “An overview of chemosynthetic symbioses in bivalves from the North Atlantic and Mediterranean Sea” by S. Duperron et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 17 December 2012

General comments

The manuscript "An overview of chemosynthetic symbioses in bivalves from the North Atlantic and Mediterranean Sea" presents a thorough synthesis of the state of current knowledge regarding the ecology, life cycle, and connectivity of five bivalve families (Mytilidae, Vesicomidae, Solemyidae, Thyasiridae and Lucinidae). As the focus of this manuscript is clearly to review current knowledge, there is little new data presented. Thus, the major contribution of this work is to provide a concise overview of the current research in this area, which it does quite well. The overall manuscript is well structured and with some additional revision, will be a good contribution to the field.

C6649

Specific comments Pg 16830 L16-17 - How is *E. guiness* typical of vesicomimid symbioses? More specific details would be helpful here.

Pg 16844 L22-29 - What is it about the 1971 gastropod study that actually provides a viable counterpoint to the 2012 study, given the 40 year time interval? More detail would be helpful here as the comparison is not very convincing as currently presented.

Technical corrections

In general, the flow of this manuscript would be improved by a detailed review by a native English-speaker. It becomes difficult to read, at times, due to the presence of run-on sentences and somewhat awkward phrasing (e.g. pg 16818 L27-28) The use of semi-colons to break apart some of these long sentences would help improve the flow of the manuscript (e.g., lines 6-13, pg 16823). In some instances, such as pg 16835 L14-21, long lists of information might be better placed in a table.

There were also a number of spelling and grammar mistakes (pg 16818 L18,pg 16819 L20, pg 16821 L13 (change to shells), pg 16825 L1 (change someway to somehow?),pg 16829 L24-25, pg 16830 L5 (change symbiont to plural), pg 16831 L16 (symbionts-based to symbiotic), pg 16832 L15-16, pg 16847 L5-7, and pg 16849 L24-26.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 16815, 2012.

C6650