

Interactive comment on “An overview of chemosynthetic symbioses in bivalves from the North Atlantic and Mediterranean Sea” by S. Duperron et al.

P. Dando (Referee)

pdando@mba.ac.uk

Received and published: 3 February 2013

General comments

The manuscript "An overview of chemosynthetic symbioses in bivalves from the North Atlantic and Mediterranean Sea" presents a detailed account of current knowledge on symbioses in the Mytilidae, Vesicomidae, Solemyidae, Thyasiridae and Lucinidae. The review concentrates particularly well on the distribution of the bivalve species and differences in their bacteria. The ecology is less well studied, especially factors affecting competition between species of bivalves with symbionts and parameters controlling bivalve density and biomass. The Summary Table of species for which there is infor-

C7918

mation about the symbiosis is particularly useful. The final manuscript should be a helpful summary of current knowledge in the field.

Specific Comments

Nucinellidae and Montacutidae

(Oliver & Taylor 2012) described two species of the Nucinelidae with bacteriocytes in the gill from an oxygen minimum zone in the Arabian Sea, off Oman, not the Atlantic, as stated on p16833. Although these authors regarded it as probable that the bacteria were sulphur-oxidisers there was no direct evidence for this. Oliver and Taylor (2012) do discuss related species in the Atlantic that might host bacterial symbionts but the gills have not been examined for these. Oliver et al. (2013) report symbiotic bacteria, of more than one morphotype, on the epidermis of specialised bacteriocyte cells in the gills of *Syssitomya pourtalesiana* (Montacutidae) from the Bay of Biscay, the Norwegian Sea and the Rockall Trough. This bivalve lives on the anal spines of the seep-sea echinoid *Pourtalesia miranda*. It was proposed that the bacteria obtained nutrients from the anal stream of the echinoid. A further unusual feature is that the bacteria were not covered by microvilli or a glycocalyx and large number of hemocytes were found above the bacteria, suggesting that the bacteria were ingested by hemocytes, for transfer into the bivalve, as well as by phagocytes in the bacteriocytes. These recent discoveries expand the families of bivalves in which symbiotic bacteria have been found and suggest further species and habitats to explore. The general deep-sea environments may prove to have as many symbiont-containing species as the seeps and vents.

Idas

The type species is *Idas argentius*. The recent, cited, paper by Ockelmann & Dinsen (2011) on this species makes it clear that *I. simpsoni* and related species do not belong in this genus. Until the taxonomy is clarified I suggest that you refer to such species as "Idas", in quotes. "*Idas*" *simpsoni* has been reported from the Mediterranean (Pastorelli

C7919

et al. 1999) as has another related whale-fall species "I" cylindricus (Pelorce & Poutiers 2009). Another "Idas" species was found, along with *Spinaxinus sentosus*, on organic cargo in the wreck of the *Francois Vieljeux* (Dando et al. 1992). "Idas" *simpsoni* (and an unidentified "Idas" species) has been found in large numbers on an oil-coated cuttings pile (Hartley & Watson 1993) and it is possible that this species colonises natural oil seeps as well as organic falls.

Thyasiridae

Symbiosis has been investigated in more than 9 species of thyasirids in the area. (Southward 1986) reported studies 4 unidentified deep-sea species, two of which had symbiotic associations, each with two morphologically distinct bacteria. None of these bacteria contained sulphur vesicles and their energy source is unknown. At least some of the thyasirid species without symbionts contain peculiar gill cells with large and very abundant mitochondria, unlike the situation in normal bivalve gills (Southward 1986). These cells were surrounded by smaller cells like the intercalary cells in lucinids. Southward (1986) stated "The mitochondria seem, to some extent, to take the position of the symbiotic bacteria - -". The 'mitochondria' of *Mendicula* (*Thyasira*) *ferruginea* are very electron dense. (Southward, 2006; Dufour 2005) It is possible that these unusual and numerous mitochondria are chemotrophic, oxidizing reduced compounds from the environment and generating ATP by electron transport phosphorylation, but the gills do not use this ATP to fix CO₂. This has been shown for some other bivalves (Parrino et al. 2000). However, the generation of ATP would reduce the reliance on heterotrophic feeding. In the case of *Mendicula ferruginea* it is possible that the mitochondria generate ATP by the oxidation of Fe⁺⁺. ATP generation by electron transport phosphorylation coupled to sulphide oxidation has been demonstrated also in mitochondria from some bivalves with symbiotic bacteria (O'Brien & Vetter 1990). Research is needed to explore whether all thyasirids are adapted to exploit reduced environments

Reduced sources available to bivalves with sulphur-oxidising symbionts.

C7920

This review concentrates mainly on habitats with high concentrations of dissolved sulphide, whether at seeps, vents or inshore sediments with high organic loading. However, the majority of reducing sediments contain free ferrous ions, resulting in sulphide produced by sulphate-reducing bacteria being rapidly precipitated and low concentrations of dissolved sulphide, often < 0.1 μM, within the burrowing range of bivalves. Despite such low concentration, bivalves with sulphur-oxidising symbionts inhabit such sediments, their tissues being greatly depleted in ¹³C (Spiro et al. 1986). Many of the bivalves inhabiting such sediments, such as *Thyasira flexuosa* and *Lucinoma borealis*, have semi-permeable inhalent tubes. Experimental models, sulphur-isotope studies and microcosm and mesocosm experiments have shown that these bivalves can obtain the reduced sulphur compounds required by their symbionts through the partial oxidation of insoluble iron sulphides in the sediment either side of their inhalent tubes (Dando et al. 1994b, Dando et al. 2004). *Lucinoma borealis* and *Myrtea spinifera* are well adapted to this since they reposition their inhalent tubes every few days, so that eventually there is an inverted cone of oxidised sediment above the animals (Dando et al. 1986). Geochemical analysis suggests that such a system, of 'mining' the iron sulphides, is also used by the frenulates living on the continental slope (Dando et al. 2008). A habitat that might be exploited by bivalves with sulphur-oxidizing symbionts is the sediments, under the vent plumes, that have high concentrations of sulphide particles. The infauna in these sediments has been poorly sampled.

Ecology

In the list of Atlantic cold seep sites that have been investigated the Skagerrak seeps, at more than 300 m, might be included. These have been the subject of over six cruises and publications and are inhabited by the symbiont-containing *Thyasira sarsi* and *T. equalis*. The densities of these two species varied dramatically, with sulphide concentrations, over a distance of < 30 cm (Dando et al. 1994a). Similar studies have been made elsewhere, relating bivalve densities to sulphide concentrations. Some comparative data on the biomass of bivalves with chemosynthetic bacteria in different

C7921

Atlantic and Mediterranean habitats would be useful. A neglected area is resource partitioning between different bivalve species with symbionts in the same habitat. As many as four such species can be collected in the same core sample at some sites.

References

- Dando PR, Bussmann I, Niven SJ, O'Hara SCM, Schmaljohann R, Taylor LJ (1994a) A methane seep area in the Skagerrak, the habitat of the Pogonophore, *Siboglinum poseidoni*, and the bivalve mollusc *Thyasira sarsi*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 107:157-167
- Dando PR, Dixon DR, Southward AJ, Southward EC, Crawford A, Crawford M (1992) Shipwrecked tube worms. *Nature* 356:667
- Dando PR, J. SA, C. SE (2004) Rates of sediment sulphide oxidation by the bivalve mollusc *Thyasira sarsi*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 280:181-187
- Dando PR, Ridgway SA, Spiro B (1994b) Sulphide 'mining' by lucinid bivalve molluscs: demonstrated by stable sulphur isotope measurements and experimental models. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 107:169-175
- Dando PR, Southward AJ, Southward EC (1986) Chemoautotrophic symbionts in the gills of the bivalve mollusc *Lucinoma borealis* and the sediment chemistry of its habitat. *Proceedings of the Royal Society, London Series B* 227:227-247
- Dando PR, Southward AJ, Southward EC, Lamont P, Harvey R (2008) Interactions between sediment chemistry and frenulate pogonophores (Annelida) in the north-east Atlantic. In: *Deep-Sea Research I*, Vol 55, p 966-996
- Dufour SC (2005) Gill anatomy and the evolution of symbiosis in the bivalve family Thyasiridae. *Biological Bulletin* 208:200-2012
- Hartley JP, Watson TN (1993) Investigation of a North Sea oil platform drill cuttings pile. *Offshore Technology Conference, Houston*, p 749-756

C7922

- O'Brien J, Vetter RD (1990) Production of thiosulphate during sulphide oxidation by mitochondria of the symbiont-containing bivalve *Solemya reidi*. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 149:133-148
- Oliver PG, Southward EC, Dando PR (2013) Bacterial symbiosis in *Syssitomya pourtalesiana* Oliver, 2012 (Galeommatoidea: Montacutidae), a bivalve commensal with the deep-sea echinoid *Pourtalesia*. *Journal of Molluscan Studies* 79:30-41
- Oliver PG, Taylor JD (2012) Bacterial symbiosis in the Nucinellidae (Bivalvia: Solemyidae) with descriptions of two new species. *Journal of Molluscan Studies* 78:81-91
- Parrino V, Kraus DW, Doeller JE (2000) ATP production from the oxidation of sulfide in gill mitochondria of the ribbed mussel *Geukensia demissa*. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 203:2209-2218
- Pastorelli AM, Rositani L, De Zio V, Marano G (1999) Rinvenimento di *Adula simpsoni* (Marshall, 1900) e *Xylophaga dorsalis* (Turton, 1819) - Mollusca Bivalvia - sul relitto della Kater I Rhades. *Biologia Marina Mediterranea* 6:418-420
- Pelorce J, Poutiers J-M (2009) Une nouvelle espèce de Bathymodiolinae (Mollusca, Bivalvia, Mytilidae) associée à des os de baleine coulés en Méditerranée. *Zoosystema* 31:975-985
- Southward EC (1986) Gill symbionts in thyasirids and other bivalve molluscs. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the U.K.* 66:889-914
- Spiro B, Greenwood PB, Southward AJ, Dando PR (1986) $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratios in marine invertebrates from reducing sediments: confirmation of nutritional importance of chemoautotrophic endosymbiotic bacteria. *Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.* 28:233-240

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., 9, 16815, 2012.

C7923