

1 Dear editor,

2 Many thanks for your comments. We have asked the Editage Editing Service Company to
3 edit the English thoroughly once again (please see the following letter from the editor of this
4 company). Meantime, we have inserted figures into manuscript. Thus, we sincerely hope to
5 publish it in BG journal. Please contact me freely if you have any questions.

6 Best Regards,

7 Guoan Wang

Letter from the editor



Message from your editor, Thomas

Dear Author,

It was a pleasure working on your document. Do go through my changes and comments in the edited file, as well as the notes in this document.

Please send me your feedback or any questions through your Editage Online account (online.editage.cn).

8 |

9 **A point-by-point response Referee #1**

10 Dear Dr. Martin J. Hodson,

11 Many thanks for your comments. We have modified the manuscript following the
12 comments.

13

14 Response to the comments:

- 15 1) The reviewer felt it needs some shortening of the discussion. We think the
16 suggestion is great, thus, some unnecessary contents have been deleted in the new
17 discussion.

- 18 2) The reviewer felt that the English needs attention. Thank you. We have asked
19 Professor Eric Posmentier in department of Earth Sciences, Dartmouth College to
20 do the English editing again, and he had edited the English thoroughly. Thus, I
21 believe the English must be greatly improved. Actually, Professor Eric Posmentier
22 has done English-editing of the manuscript last year, however, we added some
23 new contents in the manuscript after his editing, this may introduce some English
24 mistakes.

- 25 3) The title was changed following the comment.

26

27

28

29

A point-by-point response to Referee #2

30 Dear Dr. SL Yang,

31 Many thanks for your comments. We have modified the manuscript following the
32 comments.

33

34 Response to the comments:

35 1) Your suggestion that the discussion needs some shortening is great, thus, some
36 unnecessary contents about C₄ plant distribution in China (in the first paragraph in
37 the old version) have been deleted in the new discussion. In addition, we have
38 deleted the discussion about the influence of precipitation on soil isotope.

39 2) The reviewer felt that the English needs some corrections. We had asked Professor
40 Eric Posmentier in department of Earth Sciences, Dartmouth College to do the
41 English editing again. We believe English was greatly improved in the new
42 version. Thank you.

43

44

45

46

A point-by-point response to Referee #3

47 Dear Referee #3.

48 Many thanks for your comments. We have modified the manuscript following the
49 comments.

50

51 **Comment-1:** That being said, said that the discussion wanders quite a bit and discusses
52 several topics that are irrelevant to the paper or are obvious, such as the humidity cline
53 and the plant variation. The discussion should focus mainly on the temperature and soil
54 main effect and that would tighten it up and strengthen it.

55 **Response:** We think the suggestion is great, thus, the influence of precipitation was
56 deleted in new discussion; the content with respect to plant variation was greatly
57 shortened.

58

59 **Comment-2:** Overall, there are several grammatical errors including missed commas,
60 etc. The writing is okay, but could be improved and it needs to be retitled.

61 **Response:** Thank you. In order to improve the English, we asked an English service
62 company, Editage Company, to edit the manuscript thoroughly. Referee #3 suggested
63 that it needs to be retitled. Referee #1 also suggested us to change the title. Thus, we
64 modified the title following their suggestions.

65

66

67 Best wishes
68
69 Sincerely yours,
70
71 Guoan Wang

72 | **Temperature exert~~ed~~ no influence on ~~the~~ organic matter**
73 | **$\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of surface soil along the 400~~-~~mm isopleth of mean**
74 | **annual precipitation in China**

75

76 | Yufu Jia, Guoan Wang, Qiqi Tan, and Zixun Chen

77 | ¹College of Resources and Environmental Sciences, China Agricultural University,

78 | Beijing 100193, China

79

80

81

82

83

84

85 | Author for correspondence:

86 | Guoan Wang

87 | Tel: +086-10-62733942

88 | Email: gawang@cau.edu.cn

89

90

91

92

93

94 **Abstract**

95 Soil organic carbon is the largest pool of carbon in the terrestrial ecosystem, and its
96 ~~carbon~~-isotope composition is affected by many a number of factors. However, the
97 influence of environmental factors, especially temperature, on soil organic carbon
98 isotope values ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$) is poorly constrained. This impedes ~~interpretations and the~~
99 application of the variability of organic carbon isotopes ~~in to~~ reconstructions of
100 paleoclimate, ~~and~~ paleoecology, and global carbon cycling. Given the considerable
101 temperature gradient along the 400-mm isohyet (isopleth of mean annual
102 precipitation – MAP) in China, this isohyet provides ideal experimental sites for
103 studying the influence of temperature on soil organic carbon isotopes. In this study,
104 the effect of temperature on surface soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ was assessed by a comprehensive
105 investigation ~~at of~~ 27 sites across a temperature gradient along the isohyet. ~~This work~~
106 Results demonstrates that temperature ~~did~~-does not play a role in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$. This
107 suggests that organic carbon isotopes in sediments cannot be used for
108 paleotemperature reconstruction and that the effect of temperature on organic carbon
109 isotopes can be neglected in the reconstruction of paleoclimate and paleovegetation.
110 Multiple regressions with MAT (mean annual temperature), MAP, altitude, latitude,
111 and longitude as independent variables and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ as the dependent variable show
112 that these five environmental factors ~~in total~~together account for only 9% of soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
113 variance. However, one-way ANOVA analyses suggest that soil type and vegetation
114 type are significant ~~influential~~ factors influencing on soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$. Multiple regressions,
115 in which the five aforementioned environmental factors were taken as quantitative
116 variables and vegetation type, soil type based on the Chinese Soil
117 Taxonomy nomenclature soil type, and World Reference Base (WRB) soil type were
118 separately introduced-used as dummy variables, ~~separately~~ show that 36.2%, 37.4%,
119 and 29.7%, respectively, of the variability in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ are explained, ~~respectively~~.
120 Compared to the multiple regressions in which only quantitative environmental
121 variables were introduced, the multiple regressions in which soil and vegetation were
122 also introduced explain more of the isotopic variance, suggesting that soil type and

123 | vegetation type exerted significant influence on $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$.

124

125

126 | **1. Introduction**

127 | ~~While g~~Global climate change has ~~recently~~ received a great deal of attention in recent
128 | years, ~~and~~ effective predictions of future climate change depend on ~~the~~ relevant
129 | information ~~from about~~ climate in the geological past. Over recent decades, stable
130 | carbon isotopes in sediments such as loess, paleosol, as well as in lacustrine, and
131 | marine sediments have been widely used to reconstruct paleo-vegetation and
132 | paleo-environments, and have provided important insights into patterns of past
133 | climate and environmental al changes. For examples, ~~many~~numerous researchers have
134 | used organic carbon isotopes of loess to reconstruct paleo-vegetation and
135 | paleo-precipitation. Vidic and Montañez (2004) conducted a reconstruction of
136 | paleovegetation ~~at of~~ the central Chinese Loess Plateau during the Last Glaciation
137 | (LG) and Holocene using ~~the~~ organic carbon isotopes in loess from Jiaodao, Shanxi
138 | Province. Hatt é and Guiot (2005) carried out a paleo-precipitation reconstruction by
139 | inverse modeling using the organic carbon isotopic signal of the Nußloch loess
140 | sequence (Rhine Valley, Germany). Rao et al. (2013) reconstructed high-resolution
141 | summer precipitation variations in on the western Chinese Loess Plateau during the
142 | LG using a well-dated organic carbon isotopic dataset. Yang et al. (2015) ~~derived~~
143 | reconstructed a minimum 300-km northwestward migration of the monsoon rain belt
144 | from the Last Glacial Maximum to the Mid-Holocene using ~~the~~ organic carbon

145 isotope datas from 21 loess sections across the Loess Plateau. However, to our
146 knowledge, there are no ~~researchers have conducted~~ paleo-temperature
147 reconstructions using organic carbon isotope records of loess and paleosol because it
148 has been argued that temperature exerts only a slight, or even no influence on soil
149 organic carbon isotope values ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$). While this may be likely, it needs to be
150 ~~demonstrated-investigated~~ because only a few studies have addressed the influence of
151 temperature on organic carbon isotopes of modern surface soil. Lee et al. (2005) and
152 Feng et al. (2008) both reported no relationship between temperature and surface soil
153 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ in central-east Asia. However, Lu et al. (2004) discovered a nonlinear
154 relationship between mean annual temperature (MAT) and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ ~~from-for~~ the
155 Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. Sage et al. (1999) compiled the data from Bird and Pousai
156 (1997) and also found a nonlinear trend for the variation in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ along a
157 temperature gradient in Australian grasslands and savannas.

158 Plant residues are the most important source of soil organic matter. Values for
159 $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ ~~is-are~~ generally close to plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values, despite isotopic fractionation
160 during ~~the~~ decomposition of organic matter (Nadelhoffer and Fry, 1988; Balesdent et
161 al., 1993; Ågren et al., 1996; Fernandez et al., 2003; Wynn, 2007). Thus, the
162 ~~influential~~ factors ~~for-influencing~~ plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ might also influence $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$. Plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
163 ~~values in plants~~, especially those of C_3 plants, ~~is-are~~ tightly associated with
164 precipitation, ~~so-suggesting that~~ precipitation may also affect soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (Diefendorf et
165 al., 2010; Kohn, 2010). In addition to the effect of precipitation, ~~many~~ numerous other
166 factors, such as temperature, air pressure, atmospheric CO_2 concentration, altitude,

167 latitude, and longitude may also influence $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ in plants (Körner et al., 1991; Hultine
168 and Marshall, 2000; Zhu et al., 2010; Xu et al., 2015). Although variation patterns of
169 ~~variation in~~ plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ with respect to temperature are so far unresolved ~~so far~~ (e.g.,
170 Schleser et al., 1999; McCarroll and Loader, 2004; Treydte et al., 2007; Wang et al.,
171 2013), it ~~has been~~ is widely accepted that temperature has a slight effect on plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$.
172 ~~As such~~ Therefore, if the ^{13}C enrichment during soil organic matter decomposition is a
173 constant value, we expect only a slight or no influence of temperature on soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$.
174 However, ~~this~~ ^{13}C -enrichment is affected by environmental and biotic factors (Wang
175 et al., 2015). Thus, it is difficult to determine whether or how temperature affects soil
176 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, and there should be specific investigations focusing on this issue. Although the
177 relationship between temperature and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ has been investigated in the studies
178 mentioned above, these studies were unable to effectively separate the influence of
179 temperature from the effect of precipitation. In addition, there are no meteorological
180 stations near most of the sampling sites in the aforementioned previous studies,
181 suggesting that mentioned above; thus, they had to interpolate meteorological data
182 had to be interpolated, which can be lead to unrealistic precipitation data in regions
183 with strong topographical variability. This interpolation could have
184 produced introduced errors in the relationships between temperature and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ that
185 were established in these studies. –
186 ~~Thus, new investigations are necessary.~~ The present study includes ~~an intensive~~
187 detailed investigation of the variation in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ with respect to temperature across a
188 temperature gradient along the 400 ~~–~~ mm isohyet (isopleth of mean annual

189 precipitation; MAP) in China. We sampled surface soil along ~~the a~~ specific isohyet to
190 minimize the effect of precipitation changes on $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$.

191 ~~In addition, there are no meteorological stations near most of the sampling sites in~~
192 ~~the previous studies mentioned above; thus, they had to interpolate meteorological~~
193 ~~data, which can be unrealistic in regions with strong topographical variability. This~~
194 ~~interpolation could have produced errors in the relationships between temperature and~~
195 ~~$\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ that were established in these studies. In the present investigation addition,~~ we
196 collected samples only at ~~those~~ sites with meteorological stations; ~~thus~~ Thus, the
197 climatic data ~~that~~ we obtained from these stations are probably likely more reliable
198 compared to than the interpolated values pseudo data.

199

200 2. Materials and methods

201 2.1. Study site

202 In this study, we set up a transect along the 400 mm isohyet from LangkkazZi (site 1,
203 29°3.309'N, 90°23.469'E) on the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau in southwest China to
204 BeijJicCun (Site27, 53°17.458'N, 122°8.752'E) in Heilongjiang Province, ~~in~~ northeast
205 China (Fig. 1, Table 1). The straight-line distance between the ~~above~~ two sites is
206 about 6000 km. Twenty-seven (27) sampling sites were set along the transect. Among
207 these sampling sites, 10 sites ~~were~~ are located on the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau and
208 the ~~others remaining sites were~~ are in north China. Beijicun ~~BeiJiCun~~ and KudDueEr
209 ~~had~~ have the lowest MAT of -5.5-C C, while ShenmMu ~~had~~ has the highest MAT of
210 +8.9-C C. The average MAP of these sites ~~was~~ is 402 mm. In north China, rainfall

211 from June to September accounts for approximately 80% of the total annual
212 precipitation, and the dominant control over the amount of precipitation is the strength
213 of the East-Asian monsoon system. ~~In~~ On the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau, however,
214 precipitation is associated with both the Southwest monsoon and the Qinghai-
215 -Tibetan Plateau monsoon; approximately 80-90% of rainfall occurs in the summer
216 season (from May to October).

217

218 Fig. 1

219 Table 1

220 2.2 Soil sampling

221 Soil samples were collected in the summer of 2013 between 12 July ~~12~~ and 30 August
222 ~~30~~. To avoid disturbance ~~of~~ by human activities, sample sites were chosen 5-7 km
223 from the towns where the meteorological stations are located. We set three ~~quadrates~~
224 squares (0.5 × 0.5 m) within a 200-m² area to collect surface mineral soil (0-5 cm)
225 using a ring knife. The O-horizon, including litters, moders, and mors, was removed
226 before collecting mineral soils. About 10 g of air-dried soil was sieved ~~at~~ using a 2-
227 mm mesh. Plant fragments and the soil fraction coarser than 2 mm were removed. The
228 remainder of the sieved sample was immersed ~~using excessive~~ in -HCl (1 mol L⁻¹)
229 for 24 hours. To ensure that all carbonate was ~~cleared~~ removed, ~~we conducted~~
230 ~~artificial~~ the samples were ~~stirred~~ ing four times during the immersion. Then, the
231 samples ~~was~~ were washed to neutrality using distilled water. ~~Finally it was~~
232 oven-dried at 50°C, and ground. Carbon isotope ratios were determined ~~on~~ using a

带格式的: 上标

233 Delta^{Plus} XP mass spectrometer (Thermo Scientific, Bremen, Germany) coupled with
234 an elemental analyzer (FlashEA 1112; CE Instruments, Wigan, UK) in continuous
235 flow mode. The elemental analyzer combustion temperature was 1020°C.

236 ~~The carbon~~Carbon isotopic ratios are reported in delta notation relative to the
237 V-PDB standard using the following equation:

$$238 \quad \delta^{13}\text{C} = (\text{R}_{\text{sample}}/\text{R}_{\text{standard}} - 1) \times 1000 \quad \text{---(1)}$$

239 where $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ is the carbon isotope ratio of the sample (‰) and R_{sample} and $\text{R}_{\text{standard}}$ are
240 the $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratios of the sample and the standard, respectively. ~~For this measurement,~~
241 ~~we~~We obtained a standard deviation of less than 0.15‰ among replicate
242 measurements of the same soil sample.

243

244 3. Results

245 Except for one $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ value (-18.8‰), all other data ~~ranged-vary from-between~~
246 ~~-20.4‰ to-and~~ -27.1‰ with a mean value of -23.3‰ (n = 80, s.d. = 1.45). Multiple
247 regressions with MAT, MAP, altitude, latitude, and longitude as independent
248 variables and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ as the dependent variable shows that only 9% of the variability
249 in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ can be explained ~~as-by~~ a linear combination of all five environmental
250 factors (p = 0.205; Table 2). Considering the possibility of correlations among the five
251 explanatory variables, stepwise regression was used to eliminate the potential
252 influence of collinearity among them. Variables ~~were incorporated into the model~~ with
253 P-values < 0.05 were incorporated into the model and ~~excluded-variables~~ with
254 P-values > 0.1 were excluded. Statistical analysis showed that only latitude ~~was-is~~

255 included in the stepwise regression model ($R^2 = 0.077$, $p = 0.012$). In order to better
256 constrain the relationship between soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and each environmental factor, bivariate
257 correlation analyses of soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ against some of the environmental factors were
258 conducted. The bivariate correlation analyses show that $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ is not related to MAT
259 ($p = 0.114$) or SMT ($p = 0.697$) along the isohyet (Fig. 2a, b). In addition, in order to
260 further determine the response of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ to temperature, we considered three subsets
261 of our soil samples defined according to the climate, topography, or vegetation type of
262 the Qinghai–Tibetan Plateau (mainly alpine meadow, ~~including~~ 10 sites), steppe or
263 grassland (11 sites), and coniferous forest (six sites; Table 1). Bivariate correlation
264 analyses within these subsets also show no relationship between $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ and MAT
265 for all categories. The correlation analysis of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ with respect to altitude is shown
266 in Fig. 3, which displays no relationship ($p = 0.132$). Although longitude ~~was is~~ not
267 found to influence $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ in the above stepwise regression, bivariate correlation
268 analyses showed that both latitude and longitude ~~were are both~~ negatively correlated
269 ~~to with~~ $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ ($p = 0.012$ and 0.034 , respectively; Fig. 4a, b).

270 In addition to the effects of quantifiable environmental factors, qualitative factors
271 such as soil type and vegetation type may influence $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$. Various concepts have
272 been introduced in soil taxonomy, leaving varied soil nomenclatures in use. In this
273 study, we adopted the Chinese Soil Taxonomy soil nomenclature and the World
274 Reference Base (WRB) to describe the observed soils. The soil ~~was samples can be~~
275 divided into eight or six types based on the Chinese Soil Taxonomy or WRB,
276 respectively (Table 1). One-way ANOVA analyses suggest that both soil and

277 | vegetation type played a significant role ~~in-for~~ $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ ($p = 0.002$ for soil type based
278 | on the Chinese Soil Taxonomy, $p = 0.003$ for soil type based on WRB, and $p = 0.001$
279 | for vegetation type; Fig. 5).

280 | To further constrain the effects of soil and vegetation type on $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$, multiple
281 | regressions with soil and vegetation type as dummy variables were conducted.
282 | Considering the tight relationship between soil type and vegetation type, especially in
283 | ~~the~~ Chinese Soil Taxonomy~~soil taxonomy~~, ~~the~~ soil variables and ~~the~~ vegetation
284 | variables were separately introduced into the statistical analyses. Multiple regression,
285 | in which the five aforementioned explanatory environmental factors were taken as
286 | quantitative variables and the eight soil types of the Chinese nomenclature as values
287 | of a dummy variable, shows that environmental factors and soil types ~~in total~~ account
288 | for 37.4% of the soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variance ($p < 0.001$; Table 2). Using the six soil types based
289 | on WRB rather than the Chinese nomenclature, 29.7% ($p = 0.003$) of the variability is
290 | explained (Table 2). Similarly, multiple regression with vegetation types as dummy
291 | variables shows that the five environmental factors and vegetation types ~~in~~
292 | ~~total~~together can explain 36.2% of the variability in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ ($p = 0.001$; Table 2).
293 | Compared to the multiple regressions in which only quantitative environmental
294 | variables were introduced, the multiple regressions in which soil and vegetation were
295 | also introduced explain more of the variance, suggesting that soil type and vegetation
296 | type played a significant role in $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ variability.

297 | Table 2

298 | Fig. 2a, b

299 Fig. 3
300 Fig. 4a, b
301 Fig. 5

302

303 4. Discussion

304 Soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ depends on the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of plants and on carbon isotopic fractionation during
305 organic matter decomposition. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of C_3 plants vary between -22‰ and -34‰
306 with a mean of -27‰ , and C_4 plants range from -9‰ to -19‰ with a mean of -13‰
307 (Dienes, 1980). Carbon isotope fractionation occurs during the process of plant litter
308 decomposition ~~into to~~ soil organic matter in most environments, especially in non-arid
309 environments, causing ^{13}C -enrichment in soil organic matter compared to the plant
310 sources (Nadelhoffer, 1988; Balesdent et al., 1993; Ågren et al., 1996; Fernandez et al.,
311 2003; Wynn et al., 2005; Wynn, 2007). ~~An intensive~~ A detailed investigation of
312 isotope fractionation during organic matter decomposition, which was conducted ~~in~~
313 on Mount Gongga, an area of the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau dominated by C_3
314 vegetation with herbs, shrubs, and trees, showed that the mean ^{13}C -enrichment in
315 surface soil (~~0-5 cm depth~~) relative to the vegetation was 2.87‰ (Chen et al., 2009).
316 Another investigation of 13 soil profiles from the Tibetan Plateau and north China
317 showed that the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ difference between surface soil (~~0-5 cm depth~~) and the original
318 biomass varied from 0.6 to 3.5‰ with a mean of 1.8‰ (Wang et al., 2008). Thus, the
319 $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ dataset from this study ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ ranges from -20.4‰ to -27.1‰) indicates
320 that the modern terrestrial ecosystem along the isohyet is ~~greatly~~ dominated by C_3

321 plants. This result is consistent with the observations of vegetation along the isohyet
322 completed in our previous study (Wang et al., 2013). ~~We are surprised by such~~The
323 ~~high-relatively heavy~~ soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (~~mean: -20.4%~~) ~~occurring~~ at RikKazZe (Site 2;
324 Fig. 3 and Table 1) ~~are surprising~~ because only four ~~species of~~ C_3 plants ~~grew-grow~~
325 there, and ~~there were no~~ C_4 species ~~are absent~~. This ~~abnormal~~ observation suggests
326 that very ~~high-large~~ carbon isotope fractionation ~~with-during~~ SOM degradation has
327 occurred in the local ecosystem. Previous studies have ~~also~~ observed a similar
328 phenomenon, although the mechanism responsible for the unusually ~~high-large~~
329 isotopic fractionation remains unclear. For example, Wynn (2007) reported that
330 ~~isotopic the~~ fractionation enriched soil organic carbon ~~by~~ ^{13}C up to $\sim 6\%$ with
331 respect to the original biomass.

332 The MAT, MAP, altitude, latitude, and longitude combined are responsible for only
333 9% of the variability in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ in the multiple regression model, suggesting that the
334 contribution of these five environmental factors to ~~the~~ soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ variance is very small.
335 Our previous study conducted along the ~~same~~ isohyet ~~resulted in~~indicated a strong
336 positive relationship between the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of plants and MAT, with a coefficient of
337 $0.104\% \text{ } ^{\circ}\text{C}^{-1}$ (Wang et al., 2013). The difference between the maximum and
338 minimum temperature along the isohyet is $15\text{-}^{\circ}\text{C}$, so the greatest possible effect of
339 temperature on plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ along the temperature gradient is 1.56% , which is not very
340 substantial. Because the main source of soil organic matter along the isohyet is C_3
341 plants, the induced variance in soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ by plant $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ ~~can~~ also ~~cannot~~ be very high.
342 On the other hand, although the ^{13}C -enrichment ~~with-during~~ SOM degradation

带格式的: 上标

343 follows a Rayleigh distillation process (Wynn, 2007), our recent study shows that
344 temperature does not influence carbon isotopic fractionation during decomposition of
345 organic matter (Wang et al., 2015), which also explains the lack of a relationship
346 between soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and temperature. Feng et al. (2008) and Lee et al. (2005)
347 ~~respectively~~ reported no relationships between soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and MAT and SMT,
348 respectively, which is consistent with our results. Their field campaigns were
349 conducted in central Asia, which is also dominated by C_3 plants, similar to the area
350 along the 400-mm isohyet. This is the reason why the same pattern exists in both
351 central Asia and in the area along the 400-mm isohyet.

352 ~~The observations~~ Observations in ~~by~~ Bird and Pousai (1997) and Sage et al. (1999)
353 appear to be inconsistent with our findings; ~~they~~ the authors found a nonlinear
354 relationship between soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and MAT in Australian grasslands. However, if they
355 considered only soil with pure C_3 plants (MAT is below 16°C), soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and
356 temperature were not related in Australian grasslands, which agrees with our results.

357 Below 15°C, the C_4 contribution to productivity in Australian grasslands is
358 negligible, whereas above 23°C, C_3 contribution is negligible. Between 14°C and 23°C,
359 soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ is positively correlated with MAT, indicating an increase in C_4
360 representation ~~increasing~~ with increasing MAT (Sage et al., 1999). Lu et al. (2004)
361 also reported a nonlinear relationship between soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and MAT. Similarly, if ~~the~~
362 their soil data with C_4 plants are excluded from the nonlinear correlation, soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ is
363 also not related to MAT ~~in Lu et al. (2004)~~ (see Fig. 5 b in Lu et al., 2004). Thus, the
364 present study and the previous observations are consistent in showing that in a

365 terrestrial ecosystem in which the vegetation is dominated by C₃ plants, temperature
366 does not influence soil δ¹³C variance.

367 ~~Because All all the~~ soil samples were taken along the 400-mm isohyet; ~~thus~~, this
368 study shows that the contribution of precipitation to the variability in soil δ¹³C is
369 negligible. Although stepwise regression and correlation analysis both show a
370 significant influence of latitude on soil δ¹³C (p = 0.012; Fig. 4a), which was also
371 described by Bird and Pausai (1997) and Tieszen et al. (1979), the five environmental
372 variables, including latitude, ~~were are~~ responsible for only 9% of the variability in soil
373 δ¹³C in a multiple regression model (Table 2), suggesting that the contribution of
374 latitude to soil δ¹³C ~~was is~~ also limited. ~~This study shows a negative correlation~~
375 ~~between latitude and δ¹³C_{SOM} (p=0.012). Bird and Pausai (1997) and Tieszen et al.~~
376 ~~(1979) reported a similar pattern.~~ Latitude is a comprehensive environmental factor,
377 and change in latitude can bring about changes in other environmental factors, such as
378 temperature, irradiation, cloud amount, and moisture. Among those, tTemperature and
379 irradiation ~~_, however,~~ should be most strongly related to latitude ~~and obviously~~
380 ~~change with latitude~~. The observed ~~significant~~ relationship between latitude and soil
381 δ¹³C (~~Fig. 4a~~) suggests that environmental factors other than temperature might also
382 contribute ~~more or less~~ to the variance in soil δ¹³C.

383 Control of soil δ¹³C by vegetation type mainly reflects the effect of life forms on
384 plant δ¹³C, which in turn influences ~~and the effect of substrate quality on~~ isotope
385 fractionation during organic matter decomposition. Communities in which life forms
386 of dominant plants are similar are generally treated as the same vegetation type. Plant

387 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ is ~~tightly~~closely related to life form (Diefendorf et al., 2010; Ehleringer and
388 Cooper, 1988), ~~and which this~~ causes $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ differences among varying vegetation
389 types, ~~consequently~~ resulting in the observed effect of vegetation type on soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$.

390 Substrate quality partly quantifies how easily organic carbon is used by soil
391 microbes (Poage and Feng, 2004). It can be related to plant type and is often defined
392 using ~~a the~~ C/N ratio, lignin content, cellulose content, and/or lignin content/N ratio
393 (Melillo et al., 1989; Gartern et al., 2000). Our study ~~in of~~ Mount Gongga, China,
394 showed that litter quality played a significant role in isotope fractionation during
395 organic matter decomposition, and ~~that~~ the carbon isotope fractionation factor α
396 increases ~~d~~ with litter quality (Wang et al., 2015). Thus, the isotope fractionation
397 factor should differ among sites because litter quality is dependent on vegetation, ~~and~~
398 ~~this makes soil which causes~~ changes ~~its in soil~~ $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ with vegetation type.

399 The effect of soil type on soil $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ may be associated with the effect of soil type on
400 isotope fractionation during organic matter decomposition, which involves at least
401 two mechanisms (~~see~~ Wang et al. [2008] ~~has for a detailed discussioned the~~
402 ~~mechanisms in detail~~). First, properties and compositions of microbial decomposer
403 communities are dependent on soil type (Gelsomino et al., 1999). Different microbes
404 can have different metabolic pathways, even when they decompose the same organic
405 compound (Macko and Estep, 1984), and the extent of isotope fractionation during
406 decomposition may be ~~tightly~~closely related to the metabolic pathways of microbes
407 (Macko and Estep, 1984). Second, physical and chemical properties such as pH,
408 particle size fraction, and water-holding capacity ~~display are~~ considerably

409 | differentees among soil types, ~~and this~~which causes organic compounds to decay at
410 | different rates in different soil environments. The magnitude of isotope fractionation
411 | during decomposition is linked to the degree of organic matter decomposition (Feng,
412 | 2002). Thus, soil type plays a significant role in soil carbon isotopic fractionation.

413

414 | **5. Conclusions**

415 | The present study ~~measured-analyzed~~ organic carbon isotopes in surface soil along a
416 | 400-mm isohyet of mean annual precipitation in China. ~~Our results indicate-and~~
417 | ~~observed~~ that both soil type and vegetation type ~~both~~-significantly influenced soil
418 | organic carbon isotopes. However, temperature ~~was-is~~ found to have no observable
419 | impact on $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$, suggesting that $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ signals in sediments cannot be used for ~~the~~
420 | temperature reconstructions ~~of temperature~~-and that the effect of temperature on
421 | $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{SOM}}$ should be neglected in reconstructions of paleo-climate and paleo-vegetation
422 | that use carbon isotopes of soil organic matter.

423

424

425 | **Acknowledgments**

426 | This research was supported by grants from the National Basic Research Program
427 | (2014CB954202), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 41272193),
428 | and the China Scholarship Council (File No.201506355021). We would like to thank
429 | Ma Yan for analyzing the stable carbon isotope ratios in the Isotope Lab at the
430 | College of Resources and Environment, China Agricultural University. We would

431 also like to thank Professor Eric Posmentier in the department of Earth Sciences,
432 Dartmouth College, for his constructive suggestions.

433

434

435 **References**

436 Ågren, G.I., Bosatta, E., and Balesdent, J.: Isotope discrimination during
437 decomposition of organic matter: A theoretical analysis. *Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J.*, 60,
438 1121-1126, 1996.

439 Balesdent, J., Girardin, C., and Mariotti, A.: Site-related $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of tree leaves and soil
440 organic matter in a temperate forest. *Ecology*, 74, 1713-1721, 1993.

441 Bird, M.I., and Pousai, P.: Variations of delta C-13 in the surface soil organic carbon
442 pool. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 11, 313-322, 1997.

443 Chen, P.N., Wang, G.A., Han, J.M., Liu, X.J., and Liu, M.: $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ difference between
444 plants and soil organic matter along the eastern slope of Mount Gongga. *Chinese*
445 *Science Bulletin*, doi:10.1007/s11434-009-0405-y, 2009.

446 Deines, P. The isotopic composition of reduced organic carbon. *Handbook of*
447 *environmental isotope geochemistry I, The terrestrial environment* (eds. by P. Fritz &
448 J.C. Fontes), pp. 329-406. Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1980.

449 Diefendorf, A.F., Mueller, K.E., Wing, S.L., Koch, P.L., Freeman, K.H.: Global
450 patterns in leaf ^{13}C discrimination and implications for studies of past and future
451 climate. *Proceedings of the National Academy of the Sciences of the United States of*
452 *America*, 107, 5738-5743, 2010.

453 Ehleringer, J. R., and Cooper, T. A.: Correlations between carbon isotope ratio and
454 microhabitat in desert plants. *Oecologia*, 76, 62–66, 1988.

455 Feng, X.H.: A theoretical analysis of carbon isotope evolution of decomposing plant
456 litters and soil organic matter. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 16, 4–1119. doi: 10.
457 1029/2002GB001867, 2002.

458 Feng, Z.D., Wang, L.X., Ji, Y.H., Guo, L.L., Lee, X.Q., and Dworkin, S. I.: Climatic
459 dependency of soil organic carbon isotopic composition along the S-N Transect from
460 34°N to 52°N in central-east Asia. *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology*,
461 257, 335–343, 2008.

462 Fernandez, I., Mahieu, N., and Cadisch, G.: Carbon isotopic fractionation during
463 decomposition of plant materials of different quality. *Glo. Biogeochem. Cyc.*, 17, 1075,
464 doi: 10. 1029/2001GB001834, 2003.

465 Gartern, C.T.Jr., Cooper, L.W., Post, W.M., and Hanson, P.J.: Climate controls on
466 forest soil C isotope ratios in the Southern Appalachian Mountains. *Ecology*,
467 81, 1108–1119, 2000.

468 Gelsomino, A., Keijzer-Wolters, A.C., Cacco, G., and van Elsas, J.D.: Assessment of
469 bacterial community structure in soil by polymerase chain reaction and denaturing
470 gradient gel electrophoresis. *Journal of Microbiological Methods*, 38, 1–15, 1999.

471 Hatt é C., and Guiot, J.: Palaeoprecipitation reconstruction by inverse modelling using
472 the isotopic signal of loess organic matter: application to the Nußloch loess sequence
473 (Rhine Valley, Germany). *Climate Dynamics*, 25, 315–327,
474 doi:10.1007/s00382-005-0034-3, 2005.

475 Hultine, K.R., and Marshall, J.D.: Altitude trends in conifer leaf morphology and
476 stable carbon isotope composition. *Oecologia*, 123, 32–40, 2000.

477 Kohn, M.J.: Carbon isotope compositions of terrestrial C₃ plants as indicators of
478 (paleo)ecology and (paleo)climate. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*
479 of the United States of America, 107: 19691–19695, 2010.

480 Körner, C., Farquhar, G.D., and Wong, S.C.: Carbon isotope discrimination by plants
481 follows latitudinal and altitude trends. *Oecologia*, 88, 30–40, 1991.

482 Lee, X.Q., Feng, Z.D., Guo, L.L., Wang, L.X., Jin, L.Y., Huang, Y.S., Chopping, M.,
483 Huang, D.K., Jiang, W., and Jiang, Q.: Carbon isotope of bulk organic matter: A
484 proxy for precipitation in the arid and semiarid central East Asia. *Global*
485 *Biogeochemical cycles*: 19, GB4010, doi: 10.1029/2004GB002303, 2005.

486 Lu, H.Y., Wu, N.Q., Gu, Z.Y., Guo, Z.T., Wang, L., Wu, H.B., Wang, G., Zhou, L.P.,
487 Han, J.M. and Liu, T.S.: Distribution of carbon isotope composition of modern soils on
488 the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. *Biogeochemistry*, 70, 273–297, 2004.

489 Macko, S.A., and Estep, M.L.F.: Microbial alteration of stable nitrogen and carbon
490 isotopic composition of organic matter. *Organic Geochemistry*, 6, 787–790, 1984.

491 McCarroll, D., Loader, N. J.: Stable isotopes in tree rings. *Quaternary Science Reviews*
492 23, 771–801, 2004.

493 Melillo, J.M., Aber, J.D., Kinkins, A.E., Ricca, A., Fry, B., and Nadelhoffer, K.J.
494 Carbon and nitrogen dynamics along the decay continuum: Plant litter to soil organic
495 matter. *Plant and Soil*, 115, 189–198, 1989.

496 Nadelhoffer, K.J., and Fry, B.: Controls on natural nitrogen-15 and carbon-13

497 abundances in forest soil organic matter. *Soil Science Society of American Journal*,
498 52,1633–1640,1988.

499 Poage, M.A., and Feng, X.H.: A theoretical analysis of steady state $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ profiles of
500 soil organic matter. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 18, GB2016, doi: 10.
501 1029/2003GB002195, 2004.

502 Rao, Z.G., Chen, F.H., Cheng, H., Liu, W.G., Wang, G.A., Lai, Z.P., and Bloemendal,
503 J.: High-resolution summer precipitation variations in the western Chinese Loess
504 Plateau during the last glacial. *Scientific Reports*, 3, 2785, doi: 10.1038/srep02785,
505 2013.

506 Saga, R.F., Wedin, D.A., and Li, M.: The biogeography of C_4 photosynthesis: patterns
507 and controlling factors (pp. 313-373.). In: Saga, R.F., Monson, R.K. (Eds.), *C_4 Plants
508 Biology*. Academic Press, San Diego, California, 1999.

509 Schleser, G. H., Helle, G., Lucke, A., and Vos, H.: Isotope signals as climate proxies:
510 the role of transfer functions in the study of terrestrial archives. *Quaternary Science
511 Reviews*, 18, 927–943, 1999.

512 Tieszeen, L.L., Senyimba, M.M., Imbamba, S.K., Troughton, J.H.: Distribution of
513 C_3 and C_4 gasses and carbon isotope discrimination along an altitudinal and Moisture
514 Gradient in Kenya. *Oecologia*, 37, 337–350, 1979.

515 Treydte, K., Frank, D.; Esper, J., Andreu, L., Bednarz, Z., Berninger, F., Boettger, T.,
516 D'Alessandro, C. M., Etien, N., Filot, M., Grabner, M., Guillemin, M. T., Gutierrez,
517 E., Haupt, M., Helle, G., Hiltunen, E., Jungner, H., Kalela-Brundin, M., Krapiec, M.,
518 Leuenberger, M., Loader, N. J., Masson-Delmotte, V., Pazdur, A., Pawelczyk, S.,

519 Pierre, M., Planells, O., Pukiene, R., Reynolds-Henne, C. E., Rinne, K. T., Saracino,
520 A., Saurer, M., Sonninen, E., Stievenard, M., Switsur, V. R., Szczepanek, M.,
521 Szychowska-Krapiec, E., Todaro, L., Waterhouse, J. S., Weigl, M., and Schleser, G.
522 H.: Signal strength and climate calibration of a European tree-ring isotope
523 network. *Geophysical Research Letters* 34: L24302, doi:10.1029/2007GL031106,
524 2007.

525 Vidic, N.J., and Montanez, I.P.: Climatically driven glacial-interglacial variations in
526 C-3 and C-4 plant proportions on the Chinese Loess Plateau. *Geology*, 32,337–340,
527 2004.

528 Wang, G.A., Feng, X.H., Han, J.M., Zhou, L.P., Tan, W.B., and Su,
529 F.: Paleovegetation reconstruction using $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of Soil organic matter. *Biogeosciences*,
530 5, 1325–1337, 2008.

531 Wang, G.A., Li, J.Z., Liu, X.Z., and Li, X.Y.: Variations in carbon isotope ratios of
532 plants across a temperature gradient along the 400 mm isoline of mean annual
533 precipitation in north China and their relevance to paleovegetation reconstruction.
534 *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 63, 83–90, 2013.

535 Wang, G.A., Jia, Y.F., and Li, W.: Effects of environmental and biotic factors on
536 carbon isotopic fractionation during decomposition of soil organic matter. *Scientific*
537 *Reports*, 5, 11043, doi: 10.1038/srep11043, 2015.

538 Wynn, J.G., Bird, M.I., Wong, V.N.L.: Rayleigh distillation and the depth profile of
539 $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratios of soil organic carbon from soils of disparate texture in Iron Range

540 National Park, Far North Queensland, Australia. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 69,
541 1961-1973, 2005.

542 Wynn, J.G.: Carbon isotope fractionation during decomposition of organic matter in
543 soils and paleosols: Implications for paleoecological interpretations of paleosols.
544 *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 251, 437-448, 2007.

545 Xu, M., Wang, G.A., Li, X.L., Cai, X.B., Li, X.L., Christie, P., Zhang, J.L.: The key
546 factor limiting plant growth in cold and humid alpine areas also plays a dominant role
547 in plant carbon isotope discrimination. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 6,
548 doi:10.3389/fpls.2015.00961, 2015.

549 Yang, S.L., Ding, Z.L., Li, Y.Y., Wang, X., Jiang, W.Y., Huang,
550 X.F.: Warming-induced northwestward migration of the East Asian monsoon rain belt
551 from the Last Glacial Maximum to the mid-Holocene. *Proceedings of the National
552 Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*,
553 www.pnas.org/cgi/doi/10.1073/pnas.1504688112

554 Zhu, Y., Siegwolf, R. T. W., Durka, W., and Körner, C.: Phylogenetically balanced
555 evidence for structural and carbon isotope responses in plants along elevational
556 gradients. *Oecologia*, 162, 853-863, 2010.

557

558

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

