

Interactive comment on “Temperature exerted no influence on the organic carbon isotope of surface soil along the isopleth of 400 mm mean annual precipitation in China” by Yufu Jia et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 1 July 2016

Overall, I believe the conclusion of the paper to be strong. The author's found no effect of MAT on C13 isotopes across this latitude. While this confirms prior results, I think this is an important paper in the field and will affect the interpretation of carbon isotope results for both biologists and geologists. Even though the result is negative, it is an important negative result. The study was carried out carefully and the statistical analysis was appropriate.

That being said, the discussion wanders quite a bit and discusses several topics that are irrelevant to the paper or are obvious, such as the humidity cline and the plant variation. The discussion should focus mainly on the temperature and soil main effect and that would tighten it up and strengthen it.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



Overall, there are several grammatical errors including missed commas, etc. The writing is okay, but could be improved and it needs to be retitled.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., doi:10.5194/bg-2015-624, 2016.

BGD

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

