#### Challenges and opportunities in <u>land surface</u> modelling <u>of</u> savanna ecosystems

#### V 3.1

**Authors:** Rhys Whitley<sup>1\*</sup>, Jason Beringer<sup>2</sup>, Lindsay B. Hutley<sup>3</sup>, Gabriel Abramowitz<sup>4</sup>, Martin G. De Kauwe<sup>1</sup>, Bradley Evans<sup>5</sup>, Vanessa Haverd<sup>6</sup>, Longhui Li<sup>7</sup>, Caitlin Moore<sup>8</sup>, Youngryel Ryu<sup>9</sup>, Simon Scheiter<sup>10</sup>, Stanislaus J. Schymanski<sup>11</sup>, Benjamin Smith<sup>12</sup>, Ying-Ping Wang<sup>13</sup>, Mathew Williams<sup>14</sup>, Qiang Yu<sup>7</sup>

#### Institutions:

<sup>1</sup>Department of Biological Sciences, Macquarie University, North Ryde, NSW 2109, Australia

<sup>2</sup>School of Earth and Environment, University of Western Australia, Crawley, WA 6009, Australia

<sup>3</sup>-Research Institute for the Environment and Livelihoods, Charles Darwin University, Casuarina, NT 0909, Australia

<sup>4</sup>Climate Change Research Centre, University of New South Wales, Kensington, NSW 2033, Australia

<sup>5</sup>Faculty of Agriculture and Environment, University of Sydney, Eveleigh, NSW 2015, Australia

<sup>6</sup>CSIRO Ocean and Atmosphere, Canberra 2601, Australia

<sup>7</sup>School of Life Sciences, University of Technology Sydney, Ultimo, NSW 2007, Australia

<sup>8</sup>School of Earth, Atmosphere and Environment, Monash University, VIC, 3800, Clayton, Australia

<sup>9</sup>Department of Landscape Architecture and Rural Systems Engineering, Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea

<sup>10</sup>Biodiversität und Kilma Forschungszentrum, Senckenberg Gesellschaft für Naturforschung, Senckenberganlage 25, 60325 Frankfurt am Main, Germany

<sup>11</sup>ETH Zurich, Department of Environmental System Science, Zurich, Switzerland

<sup>12</sup>Department of Physical Geography and Ecosystem Science, Lund University, Lund, Sweden

<sup>13</sup>CSIRO Ocean and Atmosphere, Aspendale, Victoria 3195, Australia

<sup>14</sup>School of GeoSciences, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, United Kingdom

# \*Corresponding author:

Name: Rhys Whitley Jason Beringer

Email: <u>jason.beringer\_rhys.whitley@uwa.mq</u>.edu.au

Address: <u>School of Earth and Environment</u>Department of Biological Sciences

The University of Western Australia Macquarie University

North Ryde<u>Crawley</u>, <u>WA</u>NSW

<del>2109<u>3800</u>, Australia</del>

#### 1 Abstract

2 The savanna complex is a highly diverse global biome that occurs within the seasonally 3 dry tropical to sub-tropical equatorial latitudes and are structurally and functionally 4 distinct from grasslands or and forests. Savannas are open-canopy environments that 5 encompass a broad demographic continuum, often characterised by a dynamically 6 changing dominance between C<sub>3</sub>-tree and C<sub>4</sub>-grass vegetation, where frequent 7 environmental disturbances such as fire modulates the balance between ephemeral and 8 perennial life forms. Climate change is projected to result in significant changes to the 9 savanna floristic structure, with increases to woody biomass expected through CO<sub>2</sub> 10 fertilisation in mesic savannas and increased tree mortality expected through increased 11 rainfall interannual variability in xeric savannas. The complex interaction between 12 vegetation and climate that occurs in savannas has traditionally challenged <del>current-</del> 13 generation terrestrial biosphere models (TBMs), which aim to simulate the interaction 14 between the atmosphere and the land-surface to predict responses of vegetation to 15 changing in environmental forcing. In this review, we examine whether TBMs are able to adequately represent savanna dynamics fluxes and what implications potential 16 17 deficiencies may have for climate change projection scenarios that rely on these models. 18 We start by highlighting the defining characteristic traits and behaviours of savannas, 19 how these differ across continents, and how this information is (or is not) represented 20 in the structural framework of many TBMs. We highlight three dynamic processes that 21 we believe directly affect the water-use and productivity of the savanna system, namely: 22 phenology; root-waterroot water access; and fire dynamics. Following this, we discuss 23 how these processes are represented in many current generation TBMs and whether 24 they are suitable for simulating savanna dynamics fluxes.

25 -Finally, we give an overview of how eddy-covariance observations in combination with 26 other data sources, can be used in model benchmarking and inter-comparison 27 frameworks to diagnose the performance of TBMs in this environment and formulate 28 roadmaps for future development. Our investigation reveals that many TBMs 29 systematically misrepresent phenology, the effects of fire and root-water root water 30 access (if they are considered at all) and that these should be critical areas for future 31 development. Furthermore, such processes must not be static (i.e. prescribed 32 behaviour), but be capable of responding to the changing environmental conditions in 33 order to emulate the dynamic behaviour of savannas. Without such developments, 34 however, TBMs will have limited predictive capability in making the critical projections 35 needed to understand how savannas will respond to future global change.

#### 36 **1** Introduction

37 Savanna ecosystems are a diverse and complex biome covering approximately 15 to 38 20% of the global terrestrial surface (Scholes and Hall, 1996) and provide are important 39 in providing ecosystem services, that maintain biodiversity and support the majority of 40 the global livestock (Van Der Werf et al., 2008). Savannas are characterised by a 41 multifaceted strata of vegetation, where an open  $C_3$ -woody canopy of trees and shrubs 42 overlies a continuous  $C_4$ -grass dominated layer-understorey and occur in regions that 43 experience a seasonal wet-dry climate, have low topographic relief and infertile soils 44 (Scholes and Archer, 1997). For simplicity, in this paper all woody plants are referred to 45 as trees, while grasses include all herbaceous vegetation. Savanna vegetation structure 46 (defined by the ratio of woody to herbaceous cover) is further modulated by disturbance 47 events (predominantly fire) and that create demographic bottlenecks, preventing 48 canopy closure that results in an open, woody system (Scholes and Archer, 1997). 49 Indeed, fire disturbance is a defining characteristic of savannas, particularly for mesic 50 regions (mean annual precipitation (-MAP) > 650 mm), potentially holding the 51 ecosystem in a 'meta-stable' state, such that if  $\frac{1}{1+fire}$  were excluded this open C<sub>3</sub>/C<sub>4</sub> 52 system would likely shift to a closed C<sub>3</sub> forest or woodland (Bond et al., 2005; Sankaran 53 et al., 2005b). The role of fire in modulating vegetation structure allows savannas to 54 occur across a broad demographic continuum, where the density of woody biomass is 55 coupled to the annual amount of rainfall (Hutley et al., 2011; Lehmann et al., 2011). 56 These environmental traits and behaviours therefore mark savannas as one of the most 57 complex terrestrial biomes on the planet, and understanding the vegetation dynamics 58 and underlying processes of this ecosystem type (especially in response to future global 59 change) has proven a <u>challenging</u> task for the ecosystem modelling community(House et 60 al., 2003; Scheiter et al., 2013; Scheiter and Higgins, 2007). 61 Terrestrial biosphere models (TBMs) are -defined here as bottom-up modelling

62 approaches that simulate coupled dynamics of water, energy, carbon, and in some cases

63 <u>nutrients in vegetation and soils. These models which aim to predict ecosystem water</u>

64 and carbon transfer between the land-surface and the atmosphere (among other

65 processes), have mostly underperformed <u>when modelling fluxes from for</u> savanna

- 66 ecosystems (Whitley et al., 2016). <u>TBMs range from stand models, which simulate</u>
- 67 <u>specific ecosystems in detail, up to DGVMs, which can simulate ecosystem composition</u>
- 68 and structure, biogeochemical processes and energy exchange and the spatial
- 69 distribution of multiple ecosystems at regional to global scales (Scheiter et al. 2013).
- 70 <u>Consequently, TBMs collectively operate over different temporal and spatial scales and</u>

71 <u>employ processes of different scope in simulating ecosystem dynamics. However,</u>

- 72 <u>common to all TBMs are that they are governed by the same biophysical principles of</u>
- 73 energy and mass transfer that determines the dynamics of plant life (Pitman, 2003) and
- 74 this review will focus on the performance of this suite of models. Consequently, the
- 75 predictive capability of different TBMs at determining the exchange of water, energy and
- 76 <u>carbon between the surface and atmosphere should be convergent within a reasonable</u>
- 77 degree of error (Abramowitz, 2012). However, model intercomparison and

78 <u>benchmarking studies have shown that many TBMs are unable to meet reasonable</u>

79 levels of expected performance as a result of a systematic misrepresentation of key

- 80 ecosystem processes (Abramowitz et al., 2008; Best et al., 2015; Blyth et al., 2011;
- 81 <u>Mahecha et al., 2010).</u>

82 While the reasons for this are, in some cases model-specific, a general question can be 83 formed about whether the current generation of TBMs have has ve the predictive 84 capability to adequately simulate savanna dynamics <u>fluxes</u> and their response to future 85 global change. Additionally, if such-limitations do exist, are they a result of an incorrect 86 parameterisation of physical parameters (e.g. root depth, maximum RuBisCO activity, 87 sand and clay soil contents, soil properties etc.), the misunderstanding inadequate or 88 absent\_ce of dynamic biophysical processes (e.g. phenology, root-water root water 89 uptake, impacts of fire etc.), the challenge of simulating stochastic events linked to 90 disturbance, or a combination of all three these factors? Particular attributes that 91 characterise savanna environments, such as frequent fire disturbance, highly seasonality 92 available soil water and the annual recurrence of C<sub>4</sub> grasses (which, except for 93 grasslands, are absent in other biomes) are not universally represented in most model 94 frameworks. While some TBMs have been specifically designed with savanna dynamics 95 in mind (e.g. Coughenour, 1992; Haverd et al., 2016; Scheiter and Higgins, 2009; Simioni 96 et al., 2000), some are <del>closer to simply</del> modified agricultural models (Littleboy and 97 Mckeon, 1997), with most TBMs attempting to capture savanna fluxes through 98 calibration to the observed time-series data and ad-hoc substitutions of missing 99 processes (Whitley et al., 2016). Furthermore, little has been done to investigate why 100 simulating savanna dynamics has fallen outside the scope and capability of many TBMs, 101 such that these problems can be identified and used in on-going model development.

102 In this paper, we review the current state of modelling for the savanna complex, with

- 103 emphasis on how the dynamics and of biophysical processes fluxes of mass and energy
- 104 of the from savanna ecosystems and how application of models to this ecosystem may
- 105 challenge current-generation TBMs. We start with an overview of the global savanna

107 Wwe discuss how the distinct characteristics, dynamics and regional differences among 108 global savanna types may have implications for future global change. We then outline 109 how some of the defining physical processes of savannas are commonly misrepresented 110 in TBMs. and if these hamper the necessary predictive capability to answer questions on 111 the future of this biome. Finally, we conclude with a discussion on model evaluation and 112 benchmarking for this ecosystem, where we argue that and show that eddy flux 113 measurements in combination with observations from multiple data sources

complex and the many floristic assemblages that fall under this definition. Moreover,

114 (phenocams, remote-sensing products, inventory studies) are needed to give a essential

115 <u>to capture the seasonality of fluxes from soil, grasses and tree components and to</u>

116 <u>capture the high frequency of disturbance events that perturb the carbon cycle in</u>

- 117 <u>savanna ecosystems. complete assessment of whether simulated processes are</u>
- 118 representative of savanna dynamics.

119

106

## 120 **2**. **The savanna biome**

## 121 2.1 Characteristics and global extent

122 At a global scale, biome distributions typically conform to climatic and soil envelopes 123 and current and future distributions are predictable based on climate and ecosystem 124 physiology. However, savannas occur in climatic zones that also support grasslands and 125 forests (Bond 2005, Lehmann et al. 2011), a characteristic that poses major challenges 126 for TBMs and Dynamic Global Vegetation Models (DGVMs)<sub>5</sub>. Savannas occur in-across 127 the tropical to sub-tropical equatorial latitudes, occupying a significant portion of the 128 terrestrial land-surface that in experiences a seasonal wet-dry climates (Fig. 1). 129 Savannas are therefore associated with many ecosystem types ecoclimatice regions and 130 are the second largest tropical ecosystem after rainforests with a have a global extent 131 that covers of 15.1 million km<sup>2</sup>-, (which comprises almost half) of the African continent 132 (Menaut, 1983), 2.1 million km<sup>2</sup> of the Cerrado, Campos and Caatinga ecoregions in 133 South America (Miranda et al., 1997), 1.9 million km<sup>2</sup> of the Australian tropical north 134 (Fox et al., 2001), as well as parts of peninsular India, southeast Asia (Singh et al., 1985), 135 California and the Iberian peninsula (Ryu et al., 2010a). 136 While the structure of vegetation in these regions has converged towards a formation of 137 mixed  $C_3$  trees and  $C_4$  grasses, the extensive geographical range of savanna gives rise to

138 <u>a wide range of physiognomies and functional attributes with multiple interacting</u>

139 <u>factors, such as seasonality of climate, hydrology, herbivory, fire regime, soil properties</u>

140 and human influences (Walter, 1973; Walter and Burnett, 1971). <u>A range of</u>

141 <u>savannSavannas range a types results withacross tree-grass ratio varying from near</u>

142 <u>tree-less grasslands to open forest savanna of high tree cover (Torello-Raventos et al.,</u>

- 143 2013). These savanna assemblages can shift to grassland or forest in response to
- 144 <u>changes in fire regime, grazing and browsing pressure as well as changing levels of</u>
- 145 <u>atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (Franco et al., 2014) and modelling this structural and functional</u>
- 146 <u>diversity is challenging- (Moncrieff et al., 2016b). Lehmann et al. (2011) quantified the</u>
- 147 <u>different extents of savanna globally, showing that for each continent they occupy</u>
- 148 <u>distinctly different climate spaces. For example, South American savannas are limited to</u>
- 149 <u>a high but narrower range of MAP (~1000 to 2500 mm), while African and Australian</u>

150 savannas occur over lower but wider range of MAP ( $\sim 250$  to 2000 mm)<sub>7</sub> and are further

151 <u>separated by strong differences in interannual rainfall variability and soil nutrient</u>

152 <u>content (Bond, 2008). Furthermore, Lehmann et al. (2014) showed that different</u>

- 153 <u>interactions between vegetation, rainfall seasonality, fire and soil fertility occur on each</u>
- 154 <u>continent and act as determinants of above-ground woody biomass.</u>
- 155 <u>2.2 Conceptual models of tree and grass co-existence</u>

156 Savannas consist of two co-existing but contrasting life forms; tree and grasses. These 157 life forms can be considered as mutually exclusive given their differing fire responses, 158 and shade tolerances as well as their competitive interactions, with grasses typically 159 outcompeting trees for water and nutrients when their roots occupy the same soil 160 horizons (Bond, 2008). Ecological theory would suggest exclusion of one or the other 161 lifeforms, and not the coexistence that is a defining characteristic of savanna (Sankaran 162 et al., 2004). Over the last five decades, numerous mechanisms have been proposed to 163 explain tree-grass coexistence (Bond, 2008; Lehmann et al., 2011; Lehmann and Parr, 164 2016; Ratnam et al., 2011; Scholes and Archer, 1997; Walter and Burnett, 1971). 165 Contrasting conceptual models have been largely supported by empirical evidence, but 166 no single model has emerged that provides a generic mechanism explaining coexistence 167 across the three continents of the tropical savanna biome (Lehmann et al., 2014). 168 **M**Ecological models can be broadly classified into two categories; 1) competition-based 169 models that feature spatial and temporal separation of resource usage by trees and 170 grasses that proposedly minimises interspecific competition enabling the persistence of 171 both lifeforms and, 2) demographic-based models where mixtures are maintained by 172 disturbance that results in bottlenecks in tree recruitment and/or limitations to tree

173 growth that enables grass persistence.

174 Root-niche separation models suggest there is a spatial separation of tree and grass root 175 systems that minimises competition, with grasses exploiting upper soil horizons and 176 trees developing deeper root systems, fi.e. Walter's two-layer hypothesis (Walter and 177 Burnett, 1971). Trees rely on excess moisture (and nutrient) draining from surface 178 horizons to deeper soil layers. Phenological separation models invoke differences in the 179 timing of growth between trees and grasses. Leaf canopy development and growth in 180 many savanna trees occurs prior to the onset of the wet season, often before grasses 181 have germinated or initiated leaf development. As a result, trees can have exclusive 182 access to resources at the beginning of the growing season, with grasses more 183 competitive during the growing season proper. Given their deeper root systems, tree 184 growth persists longer into the dry season, providing an added period of resource 185 acquisition at a time when grasses may be senescing. However, grasses are better able 186 to exploit pulses of resources such as surface soil moisture and nitrogen following short-187 term rainfall events, particulatrly important processes regulating semi-arid savanna 188 (Chesson et al., 2004). The spatial and temporal separation of resource usage is thought 189 to minimise competition, also enabling co-existence. Other competition models suggest 190 that tree density becomes self-limiting at a threshold of available moisture and/or 191 nutrient, and are thus unable to completely exclude grasses. These models assume high 192 rainfall years favour tree growth and recruitment, with poor years favouring grasses 193 and high interannual variability of rainfall maintaining a relatively stable equilibrium of 194 trees and grasses over time (Hutley and Setterfield, 2008).

195 In many savannas, root distribution is spatially separated, with mature trees exploiting 196 deeper soil horizons as the competitive root-niche separation model predicts. In semi-197 arid savannas investment in deep root systems could result in tree water stressmay 198 seem counter-intuitive, as rainfall events tend to be sporadic and small in nature, with 199 little deep drainage. In this case, surface roots are more effective at exploiting moisture 200 and mineralised nutrients following these discrete events and shallow rooted grasses 201 tend to have a faster growth response than trees to these pulse events (Jenerette et al., 202 2008; Nielsen and Ball, 2015).

Differences in the magnitude and interaction of environmental effects have indicated
savanna vegetation dynamics to be region-specific\_(Bond, 2008; Bowman and Prior,
2005; Lehmann et al., 2014; Lloyd et al., 2008; Scholes and Hall, 1996), such that <u>T</u>there
are marked differences in how regional flora (primarily woody species) coordinate
theirhave evolved functional traits to operate within their respective climate space
(Lehmann et al., 2014; Cernusak et al., 2011; Eamus, 1999). For example, and major

- 209 distinctions can be drawn between the savanna flora of Africa, Australia and South
- America. Canopies of the African and South American savanna regions-tree species are
- 211 <u>predominantly</u> characterised by shallow rooted, by deciduous woody species that are in
- 212 <u>most cases (although not always) shallow-rooted and</u> follow a short-term growth
- strategy that maximises productivity while environmental conditions are favourable
- 214 (Bowman and Prior, 2005; Lehmann et al., 2011; Scholes and Archer, 1997; Stevens et
- al., 2017). In contrast, <u>mesic</u> savanna canopies of northern Australia are dominated by
- deep rooted, evergreen *Eucalyptus* and *Corymbia* woody species that favour a long-term
- strategy of conservative growth that is insured against an unpredictable climate
- 218 (Bowman and Prior, 2005; Eamus et al., 1999, 2001).

219 Consequently, the functional traits that support deciduous, evergreen or annual
220 strategies have a major impact on the water and carbon exchange of the

- 221 ecosystem<u>savanna</u>. For example, Australian mesic savanna tree canopies operate at
- almost constant rates of assimilation and transpiration all year round, due to their deep
- 223 and extensive root system and ability to make adjustments to canopy leaf area in times
- of stress (O'Grady et al., 1999). <u>In these savannas, root competition between both trees</u>
- 225 <u>and grass roots in upper soil layers is apparent, contrary to predictions of niche-</u>
- 226 <u>separation models and that would predict that tree and grass competition for water and</u>
- 227 <u>nutrients would be intense. This system serves as an example of where both root-niche</u>
- 228 and phenological separation is likely to be occurring (Bond, 2008) and These differences
- highlights quite importantly the fact that savanna ecosystems cannot be simply reduced
- to-a generalised plant functional types (PFT) and applied globally in some-land-surface
- 231 <u>model (LSM) and or dynamic global vegetation model (DGVM)</u> frameworks (Moncrieff et
- al., 2016a). One alternative may be to define region rRegion-specific PFTs may be
- 233 <u>required</u> to fully capture the distinctly different dynamics that are occurring across the
  234 ensemble of savanna biomes.
- 235 <u>Demographic-based models of tree-grass co-existence view savannas as meta-stable</u>
- 236 <u>ecosystems, where a range of stable states is possible, but the ecosystem can be</u>
- 237 <u>deflected from an equilibrium with climate and soil due to a combination of frequent</u>
- 238 <u>disturbances (fire and herbivory), resource limitation (soil-moisture and soil nutrients)</u>
- 239 <u>and growing conditions, in particular temperature</u> (Lehmann et al., 2014). In this
- 240 <u>paradigm, demographic-based models suggest that moisture and nutrient partitioning is</u>
- 241 <u>not the sole driver of co-existence and that determinants of tree demographics and</u>
- 242 <u>recruitment processes ultimately set tree:grass ratios. Fire, herbivory and climatic</u>
- 243 <u>variability are fundamental drivers of tree recruitment and growth, with high levels of</u>

<u>disturbance resulting in demographic bottlenecks that constrain recruitment and/or</u>
 <u>growth of woody components and grass persistence results. At high rainfall sites, in the</u>
 <u>absence of disturbance, a savanna tends towards forest. Alternatively, high levels of</u>
 <u>disturbance, particularly fire and herbivory, can push the ecosystem towards a more</u>

248 <u>open canopy or grassland; this ecosystem trajectory is more likely at low rainfall sites.</u>

# 249 <u>2.3 Determinants of savanna structure</u>

250 The inherent complexity in savanna function is evident when savanna structure is 251 correlated with environmental factors. Sankaran et al. (2005a) examined the 252 relationship between tree cover and mean annual rainfall with a large scatter of tree 253 cover observed at any given rainfall for African savannas. Rainfall set an upper limit of 254 savanna tree cover, with cover below this due to the interaction of other determinants 255 such as herbivory, site characteristics (drainage, nutrient availability, temperature) and 256 fire frequency reducing tree cover and biomass below a maximum for a given rainfall. 257 Lehmann et al. (2011, 2014) took this approach further and examined 'savanna-limiting' 258 mechanisms across tropical Africa, Australia and South America. Their analysis 259 suggested that tropical landscapes consist of mosaics of closed-canopy forest, savanna 260 and grasslands suggesting that the limits of savanna is not simply determined by 261 climate and soils alone. Over the entire range of environmental conditions in which 262 savannas occur, some fraction of the land surface is 'not-savanna' (Lehmann et al., 2011) 263 suggesting that savannas are not necessarily a stable state ecosystem.

264 A promising alternative approach of some recent models is to allow savanna 265 composition to emerge from environmental selection from a mixture of PFTs or trait 266 combinations, reflecting global diversity in savanna vegetation (e.g. Haverd et al., 2015; 267 Scheiter and Higgins, 2009; Scheiter et al., 2013; Smith et al., 2001). For the As an 268 example, the HAVANA model allows traits such as tree and grass phenology, leaf-area, 269 rooting depth and relative cover to emerge from incident the meteorological variations 270 and their effect on the evolving ecosystem state (Haverd et al. 2015). Because traits 271 define the response of the vegetation to climate, it is important that they are themselves 272 adequately represented in TBMs.

273

# 274 2.<del>24</del> The implications Potential impacts of climate change

275 Projected global increases in both temperature and the variability of precipitation 276 patterns as a result of anthropogenic climate change are expected to lead to significant 277 changes in the structure and diversity of global terrestrial ecosystems (IPCC, 2013; 278 Wilks Rogers and Beringer, 2017). This will make modelling ecosystem distributions 279 and biogeochemical fluxes under these transient conditions difficult, challenging TBMs 280 in how they represent the response of the savanna ecosystem to structural shifts in 281 vegetation through CO<sub>2</sub> fertilisation, increased rainfall seasonality, changes in VPD and 282 changing fire dynamics (Beringer et al., 2015).

283 Savannas may be susceptible to small perturbations in climate and could potentially 284 shift towards alternate closed-forest or open-grassland states as a result (Scheiter and 285 Higgins, 2009). The total carbon pool of some savannas can be considered as modest 286 when compared with other ecosystems (e.g. rainforests) (Kilinc and Beringer, 2007). 287 However, in terms of net primary productivity (NPP), tropical savannas and grasslands 288 occupy the top ranks among terrestrial biomes, together contributingmake up a 289 significant proportion, contributing -c. 30% of annual global NPP (Grace et al., 2006). A 290 shift in the savanna state towards a more closed system, may lead to these regions 291 becoming a substantially larger carbon sink (Higgins et al., 2010). Observations of 292 increased woody vegetation cover (woody encroachment) in many semi-arid 293 ecosystems and savannas worldwide over recent decades have been attributed to 294 positive effects of increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> on plant water-use effects (Donohue et al., 295 2009; Fensholt et al., 2012; Liu et al., 2015). Models suggest that such effects are 296 predicted to continue in the future. CO<sub>2</sub> fertilisation is also expected to favour the more 297 responsive  $C_3$  vegetation, leading to the competitive exclusion of  $C_4$  grasses via 298 supressed grass growth and reduced fire impacts (Bond et al., 2005). Model projections 299 by Scheiter and Higgins (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009), and Higgins and Scheiter (Higgins 300 and Scheiter, 2012) suggest future range shifts of African savanna into more arid 301 climates as a consequence of elevated  $CO_2$ , with concurrent transformation of current 302 savanna habitats to forests under a stationary rainfall assumption. Recent evidence 303 underscores the significant role of savannas in the global carbon cycle (Ahlström et al., 304 2015; Haverd et al., 2016; Poulter et al., 2014).

The response of savanna structure and function to changes in precipitation patterns is highly uncertain (Wilks Rogers and Beringer, 2017). Scheiter et al. (2015) investigated the effect of variable rainfall seasonality, projecting modest to large increases in aboveground biomass for savannas in northern Australia. The authors showed that woody biomass in this region increased despite significant changes to precipitation regimes, 310 being predominantly driven by  $CO_2$  fertilisation and rainfall seasonality determining the 311 magnitude of the increase (Fig. 2) (Scheiter et al., 2015). However, some studies have 312 indicated that while increased rainfall seasonality may have a small effect in mesic 313 savanna systems, it may potentially act as an opposing effect to woody encroachment in 314 semi-arid savanna systems (Fensham et al., 2009; Hiernaux et al., 2009). For example, 315 Fensham et al. (Fensham et al., 2009) have shown significant tree mortality to occur as a 316 result of drought in a semi-arid savannas in south-west Queensland, suggesting that 317 severe water-stress may counteract the positive effect of CO<sub>2</sub> fertilisation on ecosystem 318 carbon balance. Alternatively, forest dieback as a result of increased rainfall seasonality 319 and more frequent drought occurrence may lead to an expansion of savanna distribution 320 in some regions. For example, simulations of the Amazon basin have projected a 321 possible conversion of rainforest to savanna in eastern Amazonia as a result of forest 322 dieback induced by severe water stress and fire disturbance (Cox et al., 2004; Malhi et 323 al., 2009).

324 Finally, fire can play a critical role in mediating the floristic structure of the savanna 325 ecosystem, deflecting woody vegetation from its physiognomic potential with climate (Scholes and Archer, 1997). Increased warming and changes to rainfall seasonality is are 326 327 expected to alter the interaction between climate, fire and savannas in the future 328 (Beringer et al., 2015), however, we leave discussion of savanna fire dynamics and the 329 ability of TBMs to simulate this process until <u>later</u> in thise paper. Permanent shifts in the 330 structure and physiology of the savanna complex as a result of climate change is 331 expected to have a major impact on the exchange of water, energy and carbon that 332 occurs in this system, which in turn ultimately affects global biogeochemical cycling and 333 climate (Beringer et al., 2015; Pitman, 2003).

334

# 335 2<u>3</u>. The capability of models <u>TBMs</u> to simulate <u>mass and energy exchange from</u> 336 savanna ecosystems:

- 337 The term '*terrestrial biosphere model*' refers to a variety of bottom-up modelling
- 338 approaches that simulate coupled dynamics of water, energy, carbon, and in some cases
- 339 nutrients in vegetation and soils. TBMs range from stand models, which simulate
- 340 specific ecosystems in high detail, up to dynamic global vegetation models (DGVMs),
- 341 which can simulate <u>processes distribution multiple ecosystems at a coarser level.</u>
- 342 Consequently, TBMs collectively operate over different temporal and spatial scales and

343 employ processes of different scope in simulating ecosystem dynamics. However, 344 common to all TBMs is are that they are governed by the same biophysical principles of 345 energy and mass transfer that determines the dynamics of plant life (Pitman, 2003). 346 Consequently, the predictive capability of different TBMs at determining the exchange of 347 water, energy and carbon between the surface and atmosphere should be convergent 348 within a reasonable degree of error (Abramowitz, 2012). However, model 349 intercomparison and benchmarking studies have shown that many TBMs are unable to 350 meet reasonable levels of expected performance as a result of a systematic 351 misrepresentation of certain ecosystem processes (Abramowitz et al., 2008; Best et al., 352 2015; Blyth et al., 2011; Mahecha et al., 2010). The misrepresentations of ecosystem 353 processes is particularly evident in savannas, for which many TBMs have not been 354 developed for, nor tested on (Baudena et al., 2015; Cramer et al., 2001; Whitley et al., 355 2016). Seasonal competition and access to belowground resources (soil moisture and 356 nutrients), impacts of browsing and grazing, -and stochastic disturbance events (fire), 357 are less prevalent in other ecosystems and are therefore not well represented (or even 358 missing) in many TBMs (House et al., 2003; Whitley et al., 2016). Other stochastic events 359 common in savanna environments are precipitation pulses that in semi-arid savanna, 360 drive production and respiration processes (Huxman et al., 2004; Williams et al., 2009). 361 High spatial and temporal variability of pulse events, coupled with the differential 362 responses of tree and grasses complicates application of TBMs in savannas. 363 Precipitation pulses are particularly significant in semi-arid ecosystems and pulse size 364 determines the relative response of ecosystem respiration (Re) and gross primary 365 production (GPP), with large events driving high rates of Re that proceedes any 366 response in GPP and the ecosystem may switch to source of  $CO_2$  to the atmosphere for a 367 period post event (Huxman et al., 2004). The annual C balance can be determined by the 368 frequency, magnitude and duration of pulse events (Cleverly et al., 2013). 369 Conventional TBMs still lack a lot of this capability and tend to underestimate Re and 370 overestimate Ra in semi-arid regions (Mitchell et al., 2011) and therefore have limited 371 application for biomes in the seasonally dry tropics, which in turn becomes a large 372 source of uncertainty in future global studies (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009). However, we 373 believe that incorporating key processes that drive savanna dynamics into current-374 generation TBMs has great potential, considering that even small modifications can lead 375 to large gains in performance (Feddes et al., 2001; Whitley et al., 2011). It is clear from 376 the above background and discussion that the ecological processes in savannas are 377 numerous, detailed, complex and important as they can all have differential responses to <u>environmental drivers. We suggest that most of the detailed ecological processes</u>
<u>become emergent properties within model frameworks. Therefore we do not attempt to</u>
<u>capture everything but Below, rather</u> we have identified phenology, root-water root
<u>water</u> uptake and fire disturbance as three critical processes in savannas that deserve
special consideration in modern TBMs as explained below.

#### 383 <u>-23</u>.1 Phenology

384 Phenology is an expression for of the seasonal dynamics of the structural vegetation 385 properties of an ecosystem that define their, defining its growing season and ultimately 386 its their productivity (Moore et al., 2016a). Here we limit our discussion to the 387 phenology of leaf cover. In seasonally dry climates phenology is driven by soil-moisture 388 availability, and the length of the growing season for shallow rooting plants is 389 determined by the seasonality of rainfall (Kanniah et al., 2010; Ma et al., 2013; Scholes 390 and Archer, 1997). Plants respond differently to water availability, such that phenology 391 is a function of the dominant species within the ecosystem. Deciduous trees and annual 392 grasses are photosynthetically active during the wet season only and respectively 393 senesce or become dormant or senesce at the beginning of the dry season, while 394 evergreen trees may remain permanently active throughout the year, potentially 395 responding to soil-moisture depletion by gradually reducing their canopy leaf area 396 (Bowman and Prior, 2005). These dynamics are critically important, as they control the 397 amount and seasonality of carbon-uptake and water-use. In TBMs, ecosystem phenology 398 is typically represented in one of two ways. The first is via direct *prescription* of this 399 information as an additional input to the model, where observations of leaf area index 400 (LAI) (either in-situ measurements or satellite derived products) are used to express the 401 change in ecosystem canopy cover over time (Whitley et al., 2011). The second is as a 402 *prognostic* determination using a growth sub-module, where carbon allocation and leaf metabolic activity are simulated and dependent upon the time-varying conditions of 403 404 temperature and soil-water availability (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009). Prescription of 405 phenology from observed LAI dynamics requires an accurate determination of the 406 separate tree and grass components from bulk ecosystem LAI to be feasible for savanna 407 ecosystems (Whitley et al., 2011). In many cases, this separation is assumed to be static, 408 ignoring the different seasonal changes in tree and grass cover over time (Scholes and 409 Archer, 1997). In fact, no models that we are aware of dynamically partitions prescribed 410 LAI as it is prescribed. Donohue et al. (Donohue et al., 2009) offers an a priori method 411 that can determine separate tree and grass LAI signals. This method assumes that the 412 high variability in the bulk signal is attributed to herbaceous vegetation, such that the

413 remaining, less variable signal is attributed to woody vegetation (Fig. 3). A prescription 414 of separate tree and grass LAI inputs was found to be necessary for simulating water 415 and carbon exchange for a mesic savanna site in northern Australia (Whitley et al., 416 2011), and in determining a reduced error estimate of the Australian continental water 417 and carbon balance (Haverd et al., 2013) to which savannas contribute significantly. The 418 major drawback to prescribing LAI as a model input is that the model's scope is limited 419 to hindcast applications. Because this information is supplied to the model, the floristic 420 structure and its evolution over time is fixed, and cannot respond to changing 421 environmental conditions (e.g. shifts in precipitation patterns) that are likely to have an 422 impact on the tree-grass demography (Ma et al., 2013). Consequently, a dynamic 423 approach where savanna phenology is explicitly simulated and dynamically responds to 424 climate and disturbance offers a more promising path forward.

425 Allocation-growth schemes allow models to express phenology in terms of the evolution 426 of carbon investment in leaf area over time, limited by the availability of resources for 427 growth (Haverd et al., 2016). These schemes effectively work by distributing assimilated 428 carbon (via net primary productivity; NPP) to the root, stem and leaf compartments of 429 the simulated plant, where allocation to the leaf is dependent on the plant being 430 metabolically active or dormant (Cramer et al., 2001). In some TBMs, allocation to these 431 compartments is a fixed ratio (set according to plant functional type) and metabolic leaf 432 activity is defined through a set of threshold bioclimatic indicators (e.g. photoperiod, 433 moisture availability and temperature) that determine whether conditions are 434 favourable for photosynthesis (Jolly et al., 2005). However, more recent advances, use 435 an alternative approach of dynamically guiding allocation towards the compartment 436 that most limits a plant's growth (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009) or dynamically optimising 437 daily allocation, to maximise long-term NPP and control the competitive balance 438 between trees and grasses (Haverd et al., 2016). The latter approach, based on 439 optimality theory (Raupach, 2005), is related to the approach followed by Schymanski et 440 al. (2009), who assumed that vegetation dynamically optimises its properties (root 441 system and foliage) to maximise its long-term net carbon profit. These approaches, 442 which assume a more dynamic coupling between allocation and phenology, allow plant 443 form and community structure to evolve in response to changes in resource availability 444 (light, water or carbon) over time, with phenology becoming an emergent property of 445 this process. Dynamic allocation schemes enable a TBM to answer questions regarding 446 how changing climate or elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations may alter structural

- properties of the ecosystem, and the resultant feedbacks on water, carbon and energy
  cycling (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009; Schymanski et al., 2015).
- 449

## 450 <u>23</u>.2 <u>Root-water Root water</u> access and uptake

451 The root zone is critically important in maintaining water and carbon fluxes, as it 452 defines an ecosystem's accessible belowground resources and vulnerability to 453 prolonged dry periods (De Kauwe et al., 2015). <u>Savannas occurs in For</u> seasonally dry 454 climates and (common for savannas), where productivity is primarily limited by dry 455 season water-availability (Kanniah et al., 2010, 2011, 2012), which is largely determined 456 by plant regulation of water transport (through leaf stomatal conductance and stem 457 <u>capacitance</u>) and the root zone water storage capacity and access and hence 458 rootingdistribution of fine root biomass-depth) (Eamus et al., 2002). Co-ordination of 459 the whole soil-root-leaf-atmosphere pathway in response to the highly seasonal climate 460 is critical to the survival of savanna plants and is intrinsically linked to their phenology. 461 Partitioning of root water uptake is a key component of competition models describing 462 tree-grass co-existence as described above. For example, deciduous and annual savanna 463 species have shallow root profiles (approx. 0.5 to 2 m) and highly conductive vascular 464 systems to maximise productivity during the wet season (February and Higgins, 2010). 465 In contrast, evergreen savanna species invest in highly regulated hydraulic architectures 466 and deep root systems (> 2 m) that can access deep soil water stores to maintain 467 continuous productivity throughout the dry season (Bowman and Prior, 2005). It is 468 therefore critically important that the specific root system and hydraulic architectures 469 of savanna species be adequately represented in models to simulate water and carbon 470 fluxes of this system.

471 Soil and plant hydraulic traits such as rooting depth and distribution, stem hydraulic 472 resistance, and sand and clay contents are typically represented as fixed parameters in 473 TBMs. Of these traits, the root profile acts as the first-order control on soil-water supply 474 and therefore determines the capability of a simulated plant to remain active through 475 rain-free periods (Eamus et al., 1999). The root profile within a soil column is generally 476 modelled as an exponentially declining of-root-surface area with depth, the limit of 477 which extends to some prescribed level. Although some models are capable of 478 dynamically determining the size of the root profile as an emergent property of 479 productivity and climate (e.g. Haverd et al., 2016; Schymanski et al., 2009), more

480 typically, the maximum rooting depth is fixed at approximately 1.5 to 2.0 m (Whitley et 481 al., 2016). However, studies have shown that woody plants in semi-arid or seasonally 482 dry climates (particularly those in Australia) exhibit deep root systems to remain active 483 during prolonged dry periods (Duursma et al., 2011; Hutley et al., 2000; O'Grady et al., 484 1999). Numerous modelling studies have shown that a rooting profile of significant 485 depth (> 2 m) is required to achieve good model-data agreement (Fisher et al., 2007; 486 Haxeltine and Prentice, 1996; Schymanski et al., 2009; Whitley et al., 2016, 2011). While 487 characterisation of the rooting depth in savanna modelling exercises may be seen as a 488 matter of correct parameterisation rather than one of systematic process, its role as a 489 first-order control on water supply in seasonally water-limited systems gives it 490 significant weight in the overall determination of carbon uptake. Furthermore, long-491 term responses of rooting depth to climate change or elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> 492 concentrations may substantially alter structure, resource use and carbon uptake of 493 savanna ecosystems (Schymanski et al., 2015). Consequently, rooting depths that 494 sufficiently represent either deciduous or evergreen tree species need to be considered 495 when modelling savannas.

496 Directly coupled to the characterisation of the root-zone is the systematic process by 497 which soil-water is extracted by the root system. The process of root-water root water 498 uptake in TBMs has been simulated using numerous schemes. One approach assumes 499 that the amount of extracted water by roots is a function of the root density distribution 500 within the soil column and is expressed through an additional sink term to the Richard's 501 equation, which represents the flow of water in an unsaturated soil (Wang et al., 2011). 502 In such schemes, root water root water uptake may be weighted by the distribution of 503 fine-root biomass in the soil, such that soil-layers with the greatest density of fine-root 504 biomass largely determine the soil-water status of the plant, its stomatal behaviour, and 505 therefore its sensitivity to soil drying (Wang et al., 2011). The exponential decay 506 function conventionally used to describe the root profile in most TBMs (an exception is 507 Schymanski et al. 2009) can result in simulated stomatal behaviour that is heavily 508 weighted towards the moisture content of the upper soil profile, making them highly 509 sensitive to drought (De Kauwe et al., 2015). In reality, the active root distribution of 510 savannas is not static, nor so limited, but responds dynamically to wherever water is 511 available. For example, eucalypts occurring in Australian mesic savannas invest in 'dual-512 root' systems that are capable of switching their root activity between subsurface and 513 subsoil respectively to access water continually during both wet and dry seasons (Chen 514 et al., 2004). Alternative root water root water uptake schemes do exist that describe a

515 more dynamic response to long-term changes in soil conditions. One such scheme by 516 Williams et al. (2001) considers root activity to change over time and be concentrated 517 towards parts of the root zone where the plant can sustainably extract the maximal 518 amount of available water. Consequently, this scheme effectively weights soil-water 519 status over the distribution of fine-root biomass, such that simulated root-water-root 520 water uptake dynamically responds to the wetting and drying of the soil profile over 521 time (Fig. 4). Another alternative approach by Schymanski et al. (Schymanski et al., 522 2008) allows the root zone to dynamically adjust the vertical distribution of root 523 biomass in the profile to balance canopy water demand while minimising structural 524 costs of maintaining such a root system . These alternate schemes offer a more dynamic 525 approach to modelling the hydraulic architecture of species occurring in savannas and 526 other semi-arid ecosystems, and have demonstrated high predictive skill in these 527 environments (Schymanski et al., 2008, 2009; Whitley et al., 2011). Therefore, given the 528 distinct seasonality of savanna ecosystems, dynamic root water root water extraction 529 schemes are needed to simulate how the root zone responds to the evolution of soil-530 water supply over time.

- 531 <u>In should be noted that the above discussion on <del>root-water root water</del> uptake is one</u>
- 532 <u>based on relatively simple model processes</u>. However, savanna ecosystems have much
- 533 <u>more complex interactions across the soil-root-stem-leaf-atmosphere continuum.</u>
- 534 <u>Additional processes such as adaptive changes in root architecture across seasonal and</u>
- 535 <u>interannual timescales, rhizosphere-root interactions, hydraulic redistribution, plant</u>
- 536 <u>stem water storage and limitations on leaf function due to water demand across soil-</u>
- 537 <u>root-stem-leaf-atmosphere continuum (</u>Lai and Katul, 2000; Steudle, 2000; Vrugt et al.,
- 538 2001) may also be important in simulating root water uptake.

## 539 <u>23</u>.3 Disturbance

Ecosystem structure and function in seasonally dry tropical systems such as savanna, is
strongly shaped by environmental disturbance, such as persistent herbivory pressures,

- 542 frequent low-impact fire events, and infrequent high-impact cyclones (Bond, 2008;
- 543 Hutley and Beringer, 2011) <u>all determining</u>that shape tree demographics. Fires have a
- significant impact on land-surface exchange and vegetation structure and contribute to
- 545 greenhouse gas emissions through the consumption of biomass (Beringer et al., 1995,
- 546 2015). Fire has the capacity to alter land-surface exchange fluxes through the removal of
- 547 functional leaf area (reduced LAI) and the blackening of the surface (reduced albedo),
- temporarily reducing net carbon uptake (Beringer et al., 2003, 2007) and altering the

549 atmospheric boundary layer to affect convective cloud formation and precipitation 550 (Görgen et al., 2006; Lynch et al., 2007). Regarding vegetation structure, fire influences 551 the competitive balance between tree and grass demographics, suppressing recruitment 552 of woody saplings to adults, thereby deflecting the system from reaching canopy closure 553 (Beringer et al., 2015; Higgins et al., 2000). Work by Bond et al. (Bond et al., 2005) 554 underlines the potential effect of removing fire from the savanna system, with 555 substantial increases in woody biomass and major structural shifts towards closed 556 forests. This is further supported by more empirical studies involving fire exclusion 557 experiments and showing similar tendencies towards woody dominance (Bond and Van 558 Wilgen, 1996; Scott et al., 2012). Given that future climate projections point to predict 559 higher temperatures and less precipitation for sub-tropical regions (Wilks Rogers and 560 Beringer, 2017) the representation of short- and long-term impacts of fire on savanna 561 structure and function in TBMs may be important in understanding how savanna 562 landscapes may respond to changes in fire frequency and intensity (Bond et al., 2005).

563 Fire is commonly simulated as a stochastic process, with the probability of occurrence 564 increasing with the accumulation of litterfall and grass biomass (fuel loads), combined 565 with dry and windy environmental conditions that promote ignition (generally through 566 lightning) (Kelley et al., 2014). The simulated amount of biomass consumed after an 567 ignition event differs among models. Recent advances in simulating savanna fire 568 processes have led to more complete representations of the complex interaction 569 between fire and woody vegetation and how this shapes savanna structure. For 570 example, Scheiter and Higgins (2009) consider a 'topkill' probability that supresses 571 woody plant succession if fire intensity is of a critical magnitude determined by the 572 plant's fire-resisting functional traits (e.g. height, stem diameter, bark thickness). This 573 scheme allows fire to directly shape the savanna tree population through the dynamics 574 of woody establishment, resprouting and mortality. Additionally, Kelley et al. (2014) 575 have similarly considered how fire-resisting functional traits of woody vegetation alter 576 the fire dynamics of seasonally dry environments. It should be noted that both studies 577 do not consider anthropogenic ignition events, whereas recent work by Scheiter et al. 578 (Scheiter et al., 2015) suggests that fire management can be simulated using fixed fire 579 return intervals.

580 Many TBMs simulate fire as an instantaneous event through emissions and removal of 581 biomass, but may not consider the transient effects that fire has on land-surface after the 582 event has occurred. It has been demonstrated previously that these post-fire effects on 583 canopy surface mass and energy exchange can be significant, with fire indirectly

584 supressing productivity by c. 16% (+0.7 tC ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) (Fig. 5) (Beringer et al., 2007). 585 During this period, resprouting rather than climate drives productivity, with respiration 586 exceeding photosynthesis as a result of the regenerative cost of replacing damaged or 587 lost stems and leaf area (Cernusak et al., 2006). In fact many modelling analyses of 588 savannas dynamics have removed the post-fire periods completely from any assessment 589 of performance, such that evaluation has been limited to periods where the model is 590 considered to be 'fit for purpose' (Whitley et al., 2016, 2011). Fire is an integral part of 591 savanna dynamics; it is important to include fire events in the analysis of savanna 592 carbon and water fluxes or model performance. Furthermore, an accurate and robust 593 representation of fire effects on savanna ecosystems is needed to answer questions 594 about how savanna dynamics may change under future climate scenarios, as fire 595 regimes have significant impacts on the carbon balance of these systems (Beringer et al., 596 2015).

597 Other disturbance processes regimes such herbivory pressures and impact of cyclones 598 have limited to no representation in models. The removal of aboveground biomass through grazing and browsing, is commonly represented as a set fraction of cover or 599 600 pordcutivty productivity that is removed over time according to the degree of local 601 agricultural pressures, but has been represented dynamically in some models (e.g. 602 Pachzelt et al., 2015). Grazing and browsing are of central importance in many of the 603 world's savannas and like fire, strongly influences cover and productivity (Bond and 604 Keeley, 2005). The importance of herbivory as a determinant varies between savanna 605 regions, and appears to largely reflect the abundance of large herbivores present. In 606 parts of Africa, woody vegetation density has sometimes been reduced by large 607 herbivores, for example uprooting of trees by elephants when browsing (Asner et al., 608 2016; Laws, 1970). (Laws, 1970; Levick et al., 2016). Impact on savanna structure and 609 function via consumption of biomass, seed predation, trampling of understory, and the 610 pushing over and killing of trees and shrubs.

611 Bond and Keeley (2005) suggested that browsing is analogous to fire as once saplings

612 <u>escape a flame or browsing height, they are beyond the reach of most mammal</u>

- 613 <u>herbivores. Invertebrates are also significant herbivores, particularly grasshoppers,</u>
- 614 <u>caterpillars, ants and termites. Mammal herbivores are typically categorized as grazers,</u>
- 615 <u>browsers or mixed feeders, who can vary their diet depending on food availability.</u>
- Large herbivores can lead to changes in species composition, woody vegetation density
- 617 <u>and soil structure</u>. Browsers such as giraffes can reduce woody seedling and sapling
- 618 growth thereby keeping them within a fire-sensitive heights for decades. Reductions in

619 grass biomass following grazing leads to a reduction of fuel and thus fire frequency and
620 intensity, enhancing the survival of saplings and adult tress (Bond, 2008). Fire also
621 affects herbivory as herbivores may favour post-fire vegetation regrowth.

622 Termite pressures have also been shown to supress productivity (Hutley and Beringer, 623 2011), but this loss may be too small to be considered as a significant consumer of 624 biomass in TBMs. No models that the authors are aware of simulate the effect of 625 cyclones on vegetation dynamics in tropical systems despite their impact on long-term 626 ecosystem structure and productivity. Cyclones are infrequent but high impact 627 disturbance events that occur in any mesic savanna that lies close to the coastline, and 628 can effectively 'restart' the savanna system through the mass removal of woody biomass 629 (Hutley et al., 2013). Hutley and Beringer (2011) have shown that for an Australian 630 mesic savanna, a bimodal distribution of the tree class sizes at the site indicates two 631 major recruitment events that corresponds with two of the last great cyclones to occur 632 in the region. Despite the immediate and significant loss of woody biomass during those 633 events, recovery was possible and pushed this site to a carbon sink over many decades 634 [Beringer et al. 2007]. Despite the impact that cyclones have on savanna structure it is 635 somewhat understated in the literature, possibly due to the integrated loss in 636 productivity over long-periods being small (Hutley et al., 2013) as well as the difficulty 637 in simulating cyclone frequency and intensity at landscape scales at present or in the 638 future. However, we believe because cyclones modulate savanna structure so strongly, 639 there is a need for such dynamicsthem to be considered in TBM frameworks, 640 particularly for long-term projections on productivity. While few models have the 641 capability to simulate the full spectrum of environmental disturbance effects on savanna 642 ecosystems explicitly, the significant modulating impact they have on savanna structure 643 and function flags these processes as a high priority in future model development.

644

## 645 **<u>34</u>**. Testing and developing models for application in savannas

Given that there are strong indications that critical savanna processes are likely
misrepresented in current-generation TBMs, there is a clear need for further model
testing and evaluation to be conducted for this ecosystem. Savannas have been the
subject of improved research over the past two decades, resulting in a good and
evolving understanding of their complicated structure, function, and contribution to
global biogeochemical cycling (Higgins and Scheiter, 2012; Lehmann et al., 2014;

- 652 Sankaran et al., 2005b; Scholes and Archer, 1997). Despite this, our increased
- 653 understanding of savanna dynamics has not been properly translated into many modern
- TBMs, with the effect of major deficiencies in modelling this ecosystem (Whitley et al.,
- 655 2016). Consequently, there is still a great necessity for continuous, consistent and
- objective studies to test and develop how savanna dynamics are represented and
- 657 simulated. Below we highlight how datasets from multiple sources that include eddy
- 658 flux towers, satellites, and <del>ground-based</del> *in situ* studies can inform model development
- and be used in evaluation and benchmarking studies.
- 660 <u>34</u>.1 Datasets to inform model development

661 Eddy-covariance (EC) systems that observe the instantaneous response of water, energy 662 and carbon exchange to variability in climate and the evolution of this response over 663 time provide crucial information on which to test and develop TBM application in 664 savanna ecosystems (Beringer et al., 2016a, 2016b). Turbulent fluxes measured by EC 665 systems that include net ecosystem exchange and latent and sensible heat are common 666 model outputs, such that this information is commonly used to validate TBMs. Local 667 meteorological forcing (e.g. short-wave irradiance; SW, air temperature, rainfall, etc.) 668 that is concurrently measured with the turbulent fluxes by other instruments (rainfall 669 and temperature gauges, radiation sensors, etc.) are common model inputs and are used 670 to drive TBMs. Additionally, both turbulent fluxes and meteorological forcing are 671 measured at Quantities measured by EC directly mirror the inputs and outputs of TBMs, 672 namely turbulent fluxes of water, heat and CO<sub>2</sub> observed in parallel with local 673 meteorological forcing (e.g. short-wave irradiance; SW, air temperature, rainfall, etc.) at 674 the same temporal and spatial ecosystem scale at which TBMs are commonly run 675 (Aubinet et al., 2012). Consequently, these datasets offer an unparalleled capability in 676 diagnostic model evaluation (Abramowitz, 2012; Balzarolo et al., 2014; Mahecha et al., 677 2010). The use of EC datasets to evaluate TBMs and inform further development has 678 been a long running practice within the ecosystem modelling community, with 679 particular success being reported for some savanna studies in Australia\_(Barrett et al., 680 2005; Haverd et al., 2013, 2016, Schymanski et al., 2007, 2009, Whitley et al., 2016, 681 2011). Here we outline two opportunities of using EC systems into assessing model skill 682 for savanna ecosystems are highlighted in these studies.

The first of these addresses the problem <u>of that</u> EC datasets representing the integrated
sum of turbulent fluxes for the entire system (i.e. soil, grass, shrubs and trees) <u>that</u>, and
these are not easily separated. Assessing model performance using bulk measurements

686 does not consider the separate responses of the functionally different  $C_3$  tree and  $C_4$ 687 grass components that respond differently to climate (Whitley et al., 2016, 2011). 688 However, a recent study by Moore et al. (Moore et al., 2016b) has shown for a mesic 689 savanna site in Australia that separate observations of canopy and understorey fluxes 690 can be determined by using a 'dual tower' EC system that observes turbulent fluxes at 691 reference points above and beneath the canopy (Fig 6). Datasets such as this provide a 692 valuable resource to analyse the skill of separate model processes, i.e. simulation of tree 693 and grass leaf gas-exchange, which and tests the degree of model equifinality (Bevan 694 and Freer, 2001) at predicting the bulk ecosystem flux. A further collection of coupled 695 over- and understorey EC datasets is therefore critically needed to verify that simulated 696 tree and grass dynamics are correctly represented in TBMs.

697 The second opportunity addresses the issue of savanna landscape heterogeneity. 698 Savannas are not a homogeneous PFT, but rather a continuum of changing tree and 699 grass demographics that shift biogeographically with rainfall and other factors (Ma et 700 al., 2013). Ecological gradient studies, such as the Kalahari Transect (Scholes et al., 701 2004) and North Australian Tropical Transect (NATT) (Hutley et al., 2011), have shown 702 turbulent fluxes along a declining rainfall gradient to be strongly linked to structural 703 changes in vegetation (Beringer et al., 2011a, 2011b). In essence, the spatial response to 704 a systematic decline changes in rainfall (or other resources or disturbance intensities) 705 represents the possible future temporal response to changing climate, such that 706 transects can be used to evaluate TBMs by their ability to emulate the full spectrum of 707 savanna behaviour rather than at just one point. A recent model intercomparison study 708 by Whitley et al. (2015) used turbulent flux observations sampled along the NATT to 709 evaluate a set of six TBMs, and documented only poor to moderate performance being 710 observed for those savanna sites. Model evaluations studies that test model predictive 711 skill across both time and space are therefore crucial to projecting how savannas

712 dynamically respond to changing climate.

713 While EC systems provide valuable datasets on which to test and develop models, they

are unable to provide a complete evaluation, as they cannot <u>completely</u> capture long-

term temporal and spatial scale features (e.g. demographic structural shifts in

vegetation), nor provide detail on underlying ecosystem processes (e.g. root-water root

- 717 <u>water</u> dynamics and carbon allocation) (Abramowitz, 2012; Haverd et al., 2013; Keenan
- et al., 2012). Additional sources of data and their collection are therefore critical to
- informing how well models are representing the specific dynamics that unique to
- savannas. Model inversion studies have shown EC datasets give significant constraint to

721 predictions of NPP, however extra ancillary data that is informative of other underlying 722 processes was required to further constrain uncertainty (Haverd et al., 2013; Keenan et 723 al., 2012). Here, we suggest how each of the three critical savanna processes highlighted 724 in this paper can potentially be tested in addition to EC datasets. Satellite derived 725 estimates of remotely sensed near-surface reflectance (Ma et al., 2013; Ryu et al., 2010b) 726 and digital imagery from 'PhenoCams' (Moore et al., 2016a; Sonnentag et al., 2012), 727 provide a good resource for testing simulated phenology, particularly the 'green-up' and 728 'brown-down' phases. Additionally, Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer 729 (AVHRR) data can provide 'burnt area' maps that quantify the frequency of fire events, 730 which can inform the probability of occurrence in simulated fire-dynamics. Above- and 731 belowground carbon inventory studies (Chen et al., 2003; Kgope et al., 2010) provide 732 highly valuable sources of information in how plants allocate their resources for growth, 733 which can test the efficacy of TBM allocation scheme. Digital soil maps also provide an 734 excellent resource in parameterising simulated soil profiles (e.g. Isbell, 2002; Sanchez et 735 al., 2009). However the spatial resolution of these data products can be coarser than 736 operating resolution of many TBMs, such that site-level measurements should be used 737 when possible. Excavation studies that quantify savanna tree root-systems (Chen et al., 738 2004) and soil-moisture probes installed to greater depths (> 2 m) are informative 739 about the evolution of the soil-root zone over time (e.g. surface root density, root depth), 740 and such data may be critical to understanding whether current root-water root water 741 extraction schemes in TBMs are capable of simulating the dry season response of 742 savanna tree species (Whitley et al., 2016). Other useful approaches for elucidating how 743 and where plants gain their water, include sap flow measurements (Zeppel et al., 2008), 744 gas chambers (Hamel et al., 2015) and soil-plant-water experiments (Midwood et al., 745 1998). In additional, hydrogen and oxygen stable isotope ratios of water within plants 746 provide new information on water sources, interactions between plant species and 747 water use patterns under various conditions (see review by Yang et al. (2010)). 748 Finally, localised observations of plant traits such leaf-mass per area, stomatal 749 conductance  $(g_s)$ , tree height, etc. are needed to inform a better parameterisation of 750 savanna specific PFTs (Cernusak et al., 2011). For example, specific leaf-level 751 information such as Rubisco activity (V<sub>cmax</sub>) and RuPB regeneration (I<sub>max</sub>) for both C<sub>3</sub> and 752 C4 plants are critically needed to inform the Farquhar leaf photosynthesis models 753 (Farquhar et al., 1980), while information on  $g_s$  and leaf water potential ( $\Psi_{\text{leaf}}$ ) are 754 important in parameterising the many stomatal conductance models used in TBMs (Ball 755 et al., 1987; Medlyn et al., 2011; Williams et al., 1996). Leaf capacitance and water

potential data are also critically important in characterising model sensitivity to drought
(Williams et al., 2001), but this information is severely lacking for savannas.

758 Given that there are many interacting effects occurring in savannas, an integration of 759 multiple data sources is therefore necessary for a more complete evaluation of how well 760 TBMs perform in this environment. We recommend that future EC studies, particularly 761 along transects as mentioned above, should include intensive field campaigns that are 762 targeted towards a more complete characterisation of the site. This would include root 763 excavations and the collection of plant trait measurements that sample such data within 764 the footprint of an EC tower. Collaborative research networks, such as those of TERN 765 (Terrestrial Ecosystem Research Network), NEON (National Ecological Observatory

- 766 <u>Network) and SAEON (South African Environmental Observation Network) that have</u>
- 767 <u>the resources and infrastructure to conduct such campaigns will be needed to meet</u>
- 768 <u>these demands for more observational data.</u>
- 769

# 770 <u>34</u>.2 Model evaluation and benchmarking

Multiple dynamic processes drive savanna structure and function, and an understanding 771 772 of the causes and reasons for why TBMs systematically misrepresent this ecosystem is 773 paramount to future development. Consequently, a complete diagnostic evaluation of 774 model performance in savanna ecosystems requires more than just simple model-model 775 and model-data comparisons where 'good performance' is determined from a score in a 776 given metric (e.g. a high correlation between observed and predicted values). Instead 777 evaluation should also consider parsimony, physical representativeness and 'out-of-778 sample' capability of the model itself (Abramowitz et al., 2008). A holistic evaluation of 779 the biophysical, biogeochemical and ecological processes represented in TBMs has 780 therefore been the aim of many international model intercomparison projects, with 781 some notable examples being the Project for the Intercomparison of Land surface 782 Parameterization Schemes (PILPS) (Pitman, 2003) and the Coupled Carbon Cycle 783 <u>Climate Model Intercomparison Project (C4MIP)</u> (Friedlingstein et al., 2006). <u>Most</u> 784 recently the International Land Model Benchmarking Project (ILAMB) has been 785 established to holistically assess the major components of TMBs, through a model-data comparison framework that utilises standardised benchmarking and performance 786 787 metrics to identify critical model deficiencies and guide future development (Luo et al., 788 2012). A major goal of ILAMB is to support the development of open-source software

789 that can facilitate such a benchmarking framework by the international modelling

790 <u>community.</u> The Protocol for the Analysis of Land-Surface models (PALS;

791 http://www.pals.unsw.edu.au/) has been recently developed to offers such ameet the 792 formalism outlined by ILAMB, using standardised experiments to benchmark TBMs in 793 terms of how well they should be expected to perform, based on their complexity and 794 the information used to drive them (Abramowitz, 2012). In brief, PALS uses a set of 795 empirical benchmarks to fulfil the role of an arbitrary TBM of increasing complexity by 796 quantifying the amount of information in the meteorological forcing useful to reproduce 797 water, carbon and energy exchange. This gives a point of reference to measure at what 798 level of complexity a TBM is performing, by comparison of the statistical performance 799 between model and benchmark (Best et al., 2015). For example, we can assess whether 800 a sophisticated, state-of-the-art DGVM can outperform a simple linear regression against 801 shortwave irradiance (SW) at predicting GPP. If the outcome of this test were negative, 802 then this may suggest that the model does not capture the sensitivity of GPP to SW 803 accurately, flagging it as a priority for investigation and development. The important 804 distinction to make with the benchmarks is that they have no internal state variables 805 such as soil moisture and temperature, nor any knowledge of vegetation or soil 806 properties; they represent a purely instantaneous response to the meteorological 807 forcing (Abramowitz et al., 2008). The protocol of PALS meets the four criteria outlined 808 by ILAMB that objectively, effectively and reliably measure the underlying processes of a 809 TBM to improve its predictive skill (Luo et al., 2012). A direct application of this protocol 810 was presented in a model intercomparison study by Whitley et al. (Whitley et al., 2015), 811 to-where they assessed the predictive capability of TBMs in savanna ecosystems by 812 comparing model outputs to 3 simple empirical benchmarks. In this study the authors 813 used 6 calibrated TBMs to predict ecosystem latent energy and GPP at five savanna sites 814 along the NATT, and found that in almost all cases the LSMs could perform only as well 815 as a multiple linear regression against SW, temperature and vapour pressure deficit (Fig 816 7). While an additional assessment of other outputs is required, the study highlighted 817 that there are likely systematic misrepresentations of simulated phenology and root-818 water root water access in some of these models (Whitley et al., 2016). This is the first 819 assessment of its kind for investigating how well savanna dynamics are captured by 820 modern TBMs, and implies that without further development TBMs may have limited 821 scope as investigative tools for future projections of savanna ecosystems.

822

823 **4<u>5</u>. Conclusion** 

824 There is a large degree of uncertainty as to what impact climate change may have on the 825 structure and function of savanna ecosystems given their complex interaction with climate. Projected higher temperatures and rainfall variability, potentially promoting 826 827 more frequent fires, could favour C4 grasses in mesic savanna, while drier conditions are expected to increase tree mortality in semi-arid savanna. Conversely, increases to 828 829 atmospheric CO2 are expected to favour C2 trees, reflecting woody encroachment that is already observed in many savannas globally (Donohue et al., 2009). Climate change 830 831 therefore has the potential to alter the carbon balance, which may have major feedbacks 832 on global climate and biogeochemical cycling. Because TBMs are the only interpreter of 833 vegetation dynamics available to us that can reconcile the combination of effects 834 induced by climate change, their predictive capability at representing savanna dynamics 835 is of significant importance (Scheiter and Higgins, 2009). For TBMs to have the 836 necessary skill required to simulate savannas under both present and future climate, 837 model development must be concentrated towards more adequate representations of 838 phenology, root-water root water uptake, and disturbance dynamics, notably fires. We 839 outline our recommendations below in these areas:

- 840 (1) Phenology: A dynamic representation of how leaf area responds to seasonally
  841 changing environment conditions, such that it becomes an emergent property of
  842 the coupled dynamics of weather and ecosystem function.
- Root-water Root water uptake: Rooting depth and root distribution profiles that
  represent the contrasting strategies of trees and seasonal grasses, including their
  temporal dynamics. Additionally, root-water root water extraction schemes that
  can dynamically respond to the wetting and drying of the soil over time, accessing
  soil-water from where it is sustainably available rather than where the highest
  density of root biomass occurs.
- 849 Disturbances: The role of disturbance (ubiquitous to all savannas) in keeping (3) 850 savanna systems open needs to be accounted for in models. Models need to 851 represent the dynamic processes that capture the effect of fire on savanna 852 composition, particularly in suppressing woody growth. Additionally, recovery 853 periods whether through intense herbivory, fire (re-sprouting) or storm or 854 cyclonic events (re-establishment), such processes should also be considered 855 given the dynamic influence these events have on the long-term carbon balance of 856 savannas.

857 In addition to the recommended areas for TBM development above, we also stress that 858 any improvements made in the representation of the above processes must be followed 859 with a more complete evaluation and benchmarking of TBMs that considers multiple 860 data sources in order to better constrain model uncertainty. We have highlighted that 861 EC systems provide an unparalleled source of data for testing the predictive capability of 862 TBMs at simulating water and carbon exchange in savannas. The role of regional flux 863 communities, such as the OzFlux network (Baldocchi et al., 2001; Beringer et al., 2016a), 864 will be to advance applications of EC systems that target savanna characteristics 865 specifically.

866 Indeed, more studies are needed that measure overstorey and understorey turbulent 867 fluxes (Moore et al., 2016b), given their ability to quantify the contribution of co-868 dominant tree and grass functional types. Additionally, a greater use of ecological 869 transects as tools for model evaluation are needed to quantify the ability of TBMs to 870 simulate savanna behaviour over changing floristic structure and climate (Hutley et al., 871 2011). However, additional ecological and physiological measurements are also needed 872 to test modelled representations of root-zone water dynamics, carbon allocation and 873 growth, phenology and the recovery of vegetation after major disturbance events (fire 874 and cyclones); dynamic processes that cannot be verified by EC datasets alone. Facilities 875 such as the Australian Super Site Network (Karan et al., 2016) run by the Terrestrial 876 Ecosystem Research Network (TERN) will be critical to the collection of 877 ecophysiological information that can inform how savanna dynamics are represented in 878 TBMs.

879 Finally, we outline that future model experiments and inter-comparison studies that 880 leverage EC and ecophysiological datasets should target each of the three previously 881 mentioned processes individually. These may include rooting depth and water 882 extraction experiments that test the sensitivity of TBMs to the dry season transition 883 period, or fire management studies that investigate how the floristic structure in TBMs 884 responds to variable fire frequency. Furthermore, such studies must also be conducted 885 for savanna sites that have well-established datasets to test the processes in question. 886 For example, we expect that any study that attempts to test or improve the 887 representation of fire dynamics in TBMs is to be conducted at a site that has a long-888 running EC record (given the variable return time of fire events) and a full suite of 889 concurrent ecophysiological measurements that quantifies the response of vegetation 890 under post-fire recovery.

892 Remote sensing observations suggest tree cover is increasing and grassland-savannaforest boundaries are changing (Bond, 2008) and these changes can have large 893 894 feedbacks to the earth-atmosphere system (Liu et al., 2015). There is still great 895 uncertainty in predicting the future of savanna biomes (Scheiter et al., 2015; Scheiter 896 and Higgins, 2009) and Himproving how savanna ecosystems are represented by TBMs 897 will likely encompass the consideration of additional processes that have not been 898 mentioned here. This will no doubt include improved understanding of ecological 899 theory that will lead to improvements in modelling ecosystem demographics and tree-900 grass interaction that will improve DGVMs. However, we believe that by identifying 901 these processes as the cause for degraded model performance in this ecosystem, a 902 roadmap for future development can be constructed that leverages the availability of

903 rich datasets and current state-of-knowledge.

904

891

# 905 Acknowledgements

- 906 This study was conducted as part of the 'Australian Savanna Landscapes: Past, Present
- and Future' project funded by the Australian Research Council (DP130101566). The
- 908 support, collection and utilization of data were provided by the OzFlux network
- 909 (<u>www.ozflux.org.au</u>) and Terrestrial Ecosystem Research Network (TERN)
- 910 (www.tern.org.au), and funded by the ARC (DP0344744, DP0772981 and
- 911 DP130101566). PALS was partly funded by the TERN ecosystem Modelling and Scaling
- 912 infrAStructure (eMAST) facility under the National Collaborative Research
- 913 Infrastructure Strategy (NCRIS) 2013-2014 budget initiative of the Australian
- 914 Government Department of Industry. Rhys Whitley was supported through the ARC
- 915 Discovery Grant (DP130101566). Jason Beringer is funded under an ARC FT
- 916 (FT110100602). We acknowledge the support of the Australian Research Council Centre
- of Excellence for Climate System Science (CE110001028). We thank Jason Beringer,
- 918 Caitlin Moore and Simon Scheiter for their permission to reproduce their results in this919 study.

# 921 **References**:

Abramowitz, G.: Towards a public, standardized, diagnostic benchmarking system for
land surface models, Geosci. Model Dev., 5(3), 819–827, doi:10.5194/gmd-5-819-2012,
2012.

925	Abramowitz, G., Leuning, R., Clark, M. and Pitman, A.: Evaluating the Performance of
926	Land Surface Models, J. Clim., 21(21), 5468–5481, doi:10.1175/2008JCLI2378.1, 2008.
927	Accatino, F., De Michele, C., Vezzoli, R., Donzelli, D. and Scholes, R. J.: Tree–grass co-
928	existence in savanna: Interactions of rain and fire, J. Theor. Biol., 267(2), 235–242,
929	doi:10.1016/j.jtbi.2010.08.012, 2010.
930	Ahlström, A., Raupach, M. R., Schurgers, G., Smith, B., Arneth, A., Jung, M., Reichstein, M.,
931	Canadell, J. G., Friedlingstein, P., Jain, A. K., Kato, E., Poulter, B., Sitch, S., Stocker, B. D.,
932	Viovy, N., Wang, Y. P., Wiltshire, A., Zaehle, S. and Zeng, N.: The dominant role of semi-
933	arid ecosystems in the trend and variability of the land CO2 sink, Science (80 ).,
934	348(6237), 895–899, doi:10.1126/science.aaa1668, 2015.
935	Asner, G. P., Vaughn, N., Smit, I. P. J. and Levick, S.: Ecosystem-scale effects of megafauna
936	in African savannas, Ecography (Cop.)., 39(2), 240–252, doi:10.1111/ecog.01640, 2016.
937	Aubinet, M., Vesala, T. and Papale, D.: Eddy Covariance - A Practical Guide to
938	Measurement and Data Analysis, edited by M. Aubinet, T. Vesala, and D. Papale, Springer
939	Netherlands, Dordrecht., 2012.
940	Baldocchi, D., Falge, E., Gu, L. H., Olson, R., Hollinger, D., Running, S., Anthoni, P.,
941	Bernhofer, C., Davis, K., Evans, R., Fuentes, J., Goldstein, A., Katul, G., Law, B., Lee, X. H.,
942	Malhi, Y., Meyers, T., Munger, W., Oechel, W., U, K. T. P., Pilegaard, K., Schmid, H. P.,
943	Valentini, R., Verma, S., Vesala, T., Wilson, K. B. and Wofsy, S. C.: FLUXNET: A new tool to
944	study the temporal and spatial variability of ecosystem-scale carbon dioxide, water
945	vapor, and energy flux densities [Review], Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 82(11), 2415–2434,
946	2001.

- 947 Ball, J. T., Woodrow, I. E. and Berry, J. A.: A model predicting stomatal conductance and
- 948 its contribution to the control of photosynthesis under different environmental
- 949 conditions., in Progress in Photosynthesis Research, pp. 221–224, Martinus-Nijhoff
- 950 Publishers, Dordrecht, the Netherlands., 1987.

- 951 Balzarolo, M., Boussetta, S., Balsamo, G., Beljaars, A., Maignan, F., Calvet, J.-C., Lafont, S.,
- 952 Barbu, A., Poulter, B., Chevallier, F., Szczypta, C. and Papale, D.: Evaluating the potential
- 953 of large-scale simulations to predict carbon fluxes of terrestrial ecosystems over a
- 954 European Eddy Covariance network, Biogeosciences, 11(10), 2661–2678,
- 955 doi:10.5194/bg-11-2661-2014, 2014.
- 956 Barrett, D. J., Hill, M. J., Hutley, L. B., Beringer, J., Xu, J. H., Cook, G. D., Carter, J. O. and
- 957 Williams, R. J.: Prospects for improving savanna biophysical models by using multiple-
- 958 constraints model-data assimilation methods, Aust. J. Bot., 53(7), 689–714,
- 959 doi:10.1071/bt04139, 2005.
- 960 Baudena, M., Dekker, S. C., van Bodegom, P. M., Cuesta, B., Higgins, S. I., Lehsten, V., Reick,
- 961 C. H., Rietkerk, M., Scheiter, S., Yin, Z., Zavala, M. A. and Brovkin, V.: Forests, savannas,
- and grasslands: bridging the knowledge gap between ecology and Dynamic Global
- 963 Vegetation Models, Biogeosciences, 12(6), 1833–1848, doi:10.5194/bg-12-1833-2015,
- 964 2015.
- 965 Beringer, J., Packham, D. and Tapper, N. J.: Biomass burning and resulting emissions in
- the Northern Territory, Australia, Int. J. Wildl. Fire, 5(4), 229–235, 1995.
- 967 Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., Tapper, N. J., Coutts, A., Kerley, A. and O'Grady, A. P.: Fire
- 968 impacts on surface heat, moisture and carbon fluxes from a tropical savanna in northern
- 969 Australia, Int. J. Wildl. Fire, 12(3–4), 333–340, doi:10.1071/wf03023, 2003.
- 970 Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., Tapper, N. J. and Cernusak, L. A.: Savanna fires and their impact
- 971 on net ecosystem productivity in North Australia, Glob. Chang. Biol., 13(5), 990–1004,
- 972 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2007.01334.x, 2007.
- 973 Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., Hacker, J. M., Neininger, B. and Paw U, K. T.: Patterns and
- 974 processes of carbon, water and energy cycles across northern Australian landscapes:
- 975 From point to region, Agric. For. Meteorol., 151(11), 1409–1416,
- 976 doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.05.003, 2011a.
- 977 Beringer, J., Hacker, J., Hutley, L. B., Leuning, R., Arndt, S. K., Amiri, R., Bannehr, L.,
- 978 Cernusak, L. A., Grover, S., Hensley, C., Hocking, D., Isaac, P., Jamali, H., Kanniah, K.,
- 979 Livesley, S., Neininger, B., Paw U, K. T., Sea, W., Straten, D., Tapper, N., Weinmann, R.,
- 980 Wood, S. and Zegelin, S.: SPECIAL—Savanna Patterns of Energy and Carbon Integrated
- 981 across the Landscape, Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc., 92(11), 1467–1485,
- 982 doi:10.1175/2011BAMS2948.1, 2011b.

- 983 Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., Abramson, D., Arndt, S. K., Briggs, P., Bristow, M., Canadell, J. G.,
- 984 Cernusak, L. a, Eamus, D., Evans, B. J., Fest, B., Goergen, K., Grover, S. P., Hacker, J.,
- 985 Haverd, V., Kanniah, K., Livesley, S. J., Lynch, A., Maier, S., Moore, C., Raupach, M., Russell-
- 986 Smith, J., Scheiter, S., Tapper, N. J. and Uotila, P.: Fire in Australian Savannas: from leaf to
- 987 landscape., Glob. Chang. Biol., 11(1), 6641, doi:10.1111/gcb.12686, 2015.
- 988 Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., McHugh, I., Arndt, S. K., Campbell, D., Cleugh, H. A., Cleverly, J.,
- 989 Resco de Dios, V., Eamus, D., Evans, B., Ewenz, C., Grace, P., Griebel, A., Haverd, V., Hinko-
- 990 Najera, N., Huete, A., Isaac, P., Kanniah, K., Leuning, R., Liddell, M. J., Macfarlane, C.,
- 991 Meyer, W., Moore, C., Pendall, E., Phillips, A., Phillips, R. L., Prober, S. M., Restrepo-Coupe,
- 992 N., Rutledge, S., Schroder, I., Silberstein, R., Southall, P., Yee, M. S., Tapper, N. J., van
- 993 Gorsel, E., Vote, C., Walker, J. and Wardlaw, T.: An introduction to the Australian and
- New Zealand flux tower network OzFlux, Biogeosciences, 13(21), 5895–5916,
- 995 doi:10.5194/bg-13-5895-2016, 2016a.
- 996 Beringer, J., McHugh, I., Hutley, L. B., Isaac, P. and Kljun, N.: Dynamic INtegrated Gap-
- 997 filling and partitioning for OzFlux (DINGO), Biogeosciences Discuss., 1–36,
- 998 doi:10.5194/bg-2016-188, 2016b.
- 999 Best, M. J., Abramowitz, G., Johnson, H. R., Pitman, A. J., Balsamo, G., Boone, A., Cuntz, M.,
- 1000 Decharme, B., Dirmeyer, P. A., Dong, J., Ek, M., Guo, Z., Haverd, V., van den Hurk, B. J. J.,
- 1001 Nearing, G. S., Pak, B., Peters-Lidard, C., Santanello, J. A., Stevens, L. and Vuichard, N.: The
- 1002 Plumbing of Land Surface Models: Benchmarking Model Performance, J. Hydrometeorol.,
- 1003 16(3), 1425–1442, doi:10.1175/JHM-D-14-0158.1, 2015.
- 1004 Bevan, K. and Freer, J.: Equifinality, data assimilation, and uncertainty estimation in
- 1005 mechanistic modelling of complex environmental systems using the GLUE methodology,
- 1006 J. Hydrol., 249(1–4), 11–29, doi:10.1016/S0022-1694(01)00421-8, 2001.
- 1007 Blyth, E., Clark, D. B., Ellis, R., Huntingford, C., Los, S., Pryor, M., Best, M. and Sitch, S.: A
- 1008 comprehensive set of benchmark tests for a land surface model of simultaneous fluxes of
- 1009 water and carbon at both the global and seasonal scale, Geosci. Model Dev., 4(2), 255–
- 1010 269, doi:10.5194/gmd-4-255-2011, 2011.
- Bond, W. J.: What Limits Trees in C 4 Grasslands and Savannas?, Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol.
  Syst., 39(1), 641–659, doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.39.110707.173411, 2008.
- 1013 Bond, W. J. and Keeley, J. E.: Fire as a global "herbivore": the ecology and evolution of
- 1014 flammable ecosystems, Trends Ecol. Evol., 20(7), 387–394,

- 1015 doi:10.1016/j.tree.2005.04.025, 2005.
- 1016 Bond, W. J. and Van Wilgen, B. W.: Surviving fires vegetative and reproductive
- 1017 responses, in Fire and plants, pp. 38–42, Chapman & Hall, London., 1996.
- 1018 Bond, W. J., Woodward, F. I. and Midgley, G. F.: The global distribution of ecosystems in a
- 1019 world without fire, New Phytol., 165, 525–538, doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2004.01252.x,
- 1020 2005.
- Bowman, D. M. J. S. D. M. J. and Prior, L. D.: Why do evergreen trees dominate the
  Australian seasonal tropics?, Aust. J. Bot., 53(5), 379–399, 2005.
- 1023 Cernusak, L. A., Hutley, L. B., Beringer, J. and Tapper, N. J.: Stem and leaf gas exchange
- and their responses to fire in a north Australian tropical savanna, Plant Cell Environ.,
  29(4), 632–646, doi:10.1111/j.1365-3040.2005.01442.x, 2006.
- 1026 Cernusak, L. A., Hutley, L. B., Beringer, J., Holtum, J. A. M. and Turner, B. L.:
- 1027 Photosynthetic physiology of eucalypts along a sub-continental rainfall gradient in
- 1028 northern Australia, Agric. For. Meteorol., 151(11), 1462–1470,
- 1029 doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.01.006, 2011.
- 1030 Chen, X., Eamus, D. and Hutley, L. B.: Seasonal patterns of fine-root productivity and
- 1031 turnover in a tropical savanna of northern Australia, J. Trop. Ecol., 20(2), 221–224,
- 1032 doi:10.1017/S0266467403001135, 2004.
- 1033 Chen, X. Y., Hutley, L. B. and Eamus, D.: Carbon balance of a tropical savanna of northern
  1034 Australia, Oecologia, 137(3), 405–416, doi:10.1007/s00442-003-1358-5, 2003.
- 1035 Chesson, P., Gebauer, R. L. E., Schwinning, S., Huntly, N., Wiegand, K., Ernest, M. S. K.,
- 1036 Sher, A., Novoplansky, A. and Weltzin, J. F.: Resource pulses, species interactions, and
- 1037 diversity maintenance in arid and semi-arid environments, Oecologia, 141(2), 236–253,
- 1038 doi:10.1007/s00442-004-1551-1, 2004.
- 1039 Cleverly, J., Boulain, N., Villalobos-Vega, R., Grant, N., Faux, R., Wood, C., Cook, P. G., Yu, Q.,
- 1040 Leigh, A. and Eamus, D.: Dynamics of component carbon fluxes in a semi-arid Acacia
- 1041 woodland, central Australia, J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosciences, 118(3), 1168–1185,
- 1042 doi:10.1002/jgrg.20101, 2013.
- 1043 Coughenour, M. B.: Spatial modeling and landscape characterization of an African
- 1044 pastoral ecosystem: a prototype model and its potential use for monitoring drought, in

- 1045 Ecological Inidcators, Vol 1, edited by D. H. McKenzie, D. E. Hyatt, and V. J. McDonald, pp.
- 1046 787–810, Elsevier Applied Science, New York, New York., 1992.
- 1047 Cox, P. M., Betts, R. A., Collins, M., Harris, P. P., Huntingford, C. and Jones, C. D.:
- 1048 Amazonian forest dieback under climate-carbon cycle projections for the 21st century,
- 1049 Theor. Appl. Climatol., 78(1), 137–156 [online] Available from:
- 1050 http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00704-004-0049-4, 2004.
- 1051 Cramer, W., Bondeau, A., Woodward, F. I., Prentice, I. C., Betts, R. A., Brovkin, V., Cox, P.
- 1052 M., Fisher, V., Foley, J. A., Friend, A. D., Kucharik, C., Lomas, M. R., Ramankutty, N., Sitch,
- 1053 S., Smith, B., White, A. and Young-Molling, C.: Global response of terrestrial ecosystem
- 1054 structure and function to CO2 and climate change: results from six dynamic global
- 1055 vegetation models, Glob. Chang. Biol., 7(4), 357–373, doi:10.1046/j.1365-
- 1056 2486.2001.00383.x, 2001.
- 1057 Donohue, R. J., McVICAR, T. R. and Roderick, M. L.: Climate-related trends in Australian
- 1058 vegetation cover as inferred from satellite observations, 1981-2006, Glob. Chang. Biol.,
- 1059 15(4), 1025–1039, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01746.x, 2009.
- 1060 Duursma, R. A., Barton, C. V. M., Eamus, D., Medlyn, B. E., Ellsworth, D. S., Forster, M. a,
- 1061 Tissue, D. T., Linder, S. and McMurtrie, R. E.: Rooting depth explains [CO2] x drought
- 1062 interaction in Eucalyptus saligna., Tree Physiol., 31(9), 922–31,
- 1063 doi:10.1093/treephys/tpr030, 2011.
- 1064 Eamus, D.: Ecophysiological traits of deciduous and evergreen woody species in the
- seasonally dry tropics., Trends Ecol. Evol., 14(1), 11–16, 1999.
- Eamus, D., Myers, B., Duff, G. and Williams, D.: Seasonal changes in photosynthesis of
  eight savanna tree species., Tree Physiol., 19(10), 665–671, 1999.
- 1068 Eamus, D., Prior, L. and Figures: Ecophysiology of trees of seasonally dry tropics:
- 1069 Comparisons among phenologies [Review] Caswell H, Adv. Ecol. Res. Vol 32, 32 PG. 113,
  1070 113–197, 2001.
- 1071 Eamus, D., Chen, X., Kelley, G. and Hutley, L. B.: Root biomass and root fractal analyses of
- an open Eucalyptus forest in a savanna of north Australia, Aust. J. Bot., 50(1), 31–41,
- 1073 2002.
- 1074 Farquhar, G. D., von Caemmerer, S. and Berry, J. A.: A Biochemical Model of

1075 Photosynthetic CO2 Assimilation in Leaves of C3 species, Planta, 149, 78–90, 1980.

1076 February, E. C. and Higgins, S. I.: The distribution of tree and grass roots in savannas in

relation to soil nitrogen and water, South African J. Bot., 76(3), 517–523,

1078 doi:10.1016/j.sajb.2010.04.001, 2010.

Fensham, R. J., Fairfax, R. J. and Ward, D. P.: Drought-induced tree death in savanna, Glob.
Chang. Biol., 15(2), 380–387, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01718.x, 2009.

1081 Fensholt, R., Langanke, T., Rasmussen, K., Reenberg, A., Prince, S. D., Tucker, C., Scholes,

1082 R. J., Le, Q. B., Bondeau, A., Eastman, R., Epstein, H., Gaughan, A. E., Hellden, U., Mbow, C.,

1083 Olsson, L., Paruelo, J., Schweitzer, C., Seaquist, J. and Wessels, K.: Greenness in semi-arid

- 1084 areas across the globe 1981-2007 an Earth Observing Satellite based analysis of trends
- 1085 and drivers, Remote Sens. Environ., 121, 144–158, doi:10.1016/j.rse.2012.01.017, 2012.

1086 Fisher, R. A., Williams, M., Da Costa, A. L., Malhi, Y., Da Costa, R. F., Almeida, S. and Meir,

1087 P.: The response of an Eastern Amazonian rain forest to drought stress: results and

1088 modelling analyses from a throughfall exclusion experiment, Glob. Chang. Biol., 13(11),

1089 2361–2378, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2007.01417.x, 2007.

1090 Fox, I. D., Neldner, V. J., Wilson, G. W., Bannink, P. J., Wilson, B. A., Brocklehurst, P. S.,

1091 Clark, M. J., Dickinson, K. J. M., Beard, J. S., Hopkins, A. J. M., Beeston, G. R., Harvey, J. M.,

1092 Thompson, E. J., Ryan, T. S., Thompson, S. L., Butler, D. W., Cartan, H., Addicott, E. P.,

1093 Bailey, L. P., Cumming, R. J., Johnson, D. C., Schmeider, M., Stephens, K. M. and Bean, A. R.:

1094 The Vegetation of the Australian Tropical Savannas, Environmental Protection Agency,1095 Brisbane., 2001.

1096 Franco, A. C., Rossatto, D. R., de Carvalho Ramos Silva, L. and da Silva Ferreira, C.:

1097 Cerrado vegetation and global change: the role of functional types, resource availability

and disturbance in regulating plant community responses to rising CO2 levels and

1099 climate warming, Theor. Exp. Plant Physiol., 26(1), 19–38, doi:10.1007/s40626-014-

1100 0002-6, 2014.

1101 Friedlingstein, P., Cox, P., Betts, R., Bopp, L., von Bloh, W., Brovkin, V., Cadule, P., Doney,

1102 S., Eby, M., Fung, I., Bala, G., John, J., Jones, C., Joos, F., Kato, T., Kawamiya, M., Knorr, W.,

1103 Lindsay, K., Matthews, H. D., Raddatz, T., Rayner, P., Reick, C., Roeckner, E., Schnitzler, K.

1104 G., Schnur, R., Strassmann, K., Weaver, A. J., Yoshikawa, C. and Zeng, N.: Climate-carbon

1105 cycle feedback analysis: Results from the C4MIP model intercomparison, J. Clim., 19(14),

1106 3337–3353, doi:10.1175/JCLI3800.1, 2006.

- 1107 Görgen, K., Lynch, A. H., Marshall, A. G. and Beringer, J.: Impact of abrupt land cover
- 1108 changes by savanna fire on northern Australian climate, J. Geophys. Res., 111(D19),
- 1109 19106, doi:10.1029/2005jd006860, 2006.
- 1110 Grace, J., San Jose, J., Meir, P., Miranda, H. S., Montes, R. a. and Jose, J. S.: Productivity and
- carbon fluxes of tropical savannas, J. Biogeogr., 33(3), 387–400, doi:10.1111/j.13652699.2005.01448.x, 2006.
- 1112 2099.2005.01448.x, 2006.
- 1113 Hamel, P., Mchugh, I., Coutts, A., Daly, E., Beringer, J. and Fletcher, T. D.: Automated
- 1114 Chamber System to Measure Field Evapotranspiration Rates, J. Hydrol. Eng., 20(2),
- 1115 4014037, doi:10.1061/(ASCE)HE.1943-5584.0001006, 2015.
- 1116 Harris, I., Jones, P. D., Osborn, T. J. and Lister, D. H.: Updated high-resolution grids of
- 1117 monthly climatic observations the CRU TS3.10 Dataset, Int. J. Climatol., 34(3), 623–642,
- 1118 doi:10.1002/joc.3711, 2014.
- 1119 Haverd, V., Raupach, M. R., Briggs, P. R., Canadell, J. G., Isaac, P., Pickett-Heaps, C.,
- 1120 Roxburgh, S. H., van Gorsel, E., Viscarra Rossel, R. A. and Wang, Z.: Multiple observation
- 1121 types reduce uncertainty in Australia's terrestrial carbon and water cycles,
- 1122 Biogeosciences, 10(3), 2011–2040, doi:10.5194/bg-10-2011-2013, 2013.
- 1123 Haverd, V., Smith, B., Raupach, M. R., Briggs, P. R., Nieradzik, L. P., Beringer, J., Hutley, L.
- 1124 B., Trudinger, C. M. and Cleverly, J. R.: Coupling carbon allocation with leaf and root
- 1125 phenology predicts tree-grass partitioning along a savanna rainfall gradient,
- 1126 Biogeosciences, 12, 16313–16357, doi:10.5194/bgd-12-16313-2015, 2016.
- 1127 Haxeltine, A. and Prentice, I. C.: An equilibrium terrestrial biosphere model based on
- ecophysiological constraints, resource availability, Global Biogeochem. Cycles, 10(4),
  693–709, 1996.
- 1130 Hiernaux, P., Diarra, L., Trichon, V., Mougin, E., Soumaguel, N. and Baup, F.: Woody plant
- 1131 population dynamics in response to climate changes from 1984 to 2006 in Sahel
- 1132 (Gourma, Mali), J. Hydrol., 375(1–2), 103–113, doi:10.1016/j.jhydrol.2009.01.043, 2009.
- 1133 Higgins, S. I. and Scheiter, S.: Atmospheric CO2 forces abrupt vegetation shifts locally,
- 1134 but not globally, Nature, 488(7410), 209–212,
- 1135 doi:http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v488/n7410/abs/nature11238.html#sup
- 1136 plementary-information, 2012.

- 1137 Higgins, S. I., Bond, W. J. and Trollope, W. S. W.: Fire, resprouting and variability: A recipe
- 1138 for grass-tree coexistence in savanna, J. Ecol., 88, 213–229, doi:10.1046/j.1365-
- 1139 2745.2000.00435.x, 2000.
- 1140 Higgins, S. I., Scheiter, S. and Sankaran, M.: The stability of African savannas: insights
- from the indirect estimation of the parameters of a dynamic model, Ecology, 91(6),1682–1692, 2010.
- House, J. I., Archer, S., Breshears, D. D. and Scholes, R. J.: Conundrums in mixed woody –
  herbaceous plant systems, J. Biogeogr., 30, 1763–1777, doi:10.1046/j.13652699.2003.00873.x, 2003.
- 1146 Hutley, L. B. and Beringer, J.: Disturbance and climatic drivers of carbon dynamics of a
- 1147 north Australian tropical savanna, in Ecosystem Function in Savannas: Measurement
- and Modeling at Landscape to Global Scales, edited by M. J. Hill and N. P. Hanan, pp. 57–
- 1149 75, CRC Press, Boca Raton, Flordia., 2011.
- Hutley, L. B. and Setterfield, S. A.: Savanna, in Encyclopedia of Ecology, pp. 3143–3154.,2008.
- Hutley, L. B., O'Grady, A. P. and Eamus, D.: Evapotranspiration from Eucalypt open-forest
  savanna of Northern Australia, Funct. Ecol., 14(2), 183–194, 2000.
- 1154 Hutley, L. B., Beringer, J., Isaac, P. R., Hacker, J. M. and Cernusak, L. a.: A sub-continental
- scale living laboratory: Spatial patterns of savanna vegetation over a rainfall gradient in
- 1156 northern Australia, Agric. For. Meteorol., 151(11), 1417–1428,
- 1157 doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.03.002, 2011.
- 1158 Hutley, L. B., Evans, B. J., Beringer, J., Cook, G. D., Maier, S. M. and Razon, E.: Impacts of an
- 1159 extreme cyclone event on landscape-scale savanna fire, productivity and greenhouse gas
- 1160 emissions, Environ. Res. Lett., 8(4), 45023, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/8/4/045023, 2013.
- 1161 Huxman, T. E., Snyder, K. A., Tissue, D., Leffler, A. J., Ogle, K., Pockman, W. T., Sandquist,
- 1162 D. R., Potts, D. L. and Schwinning, S.: Precipitation pulses and carbon fluxes in semiarid
- 1163 and arid ecosystems, Oecologia, 141(2), 254–268, doi:10.1007/s00442-004-1682-4,
- 1164 2004.
- 1165 IPCC: Contribution of Working Group I to the fifth assessment report of the
- 1166 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change., Climate ch., edited by T. Stocker, D. Qin, M.

- 1167 Plattner, M. M. B. Tignor, S. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex, and P. Midgley,
- 1168 Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA., 2013.

1169 Isbell, R.: The Australian Soil Classification, Revised Ed., CSIRO Publishing, Collingwood,1170 Victoria., 2002.

- 1171 Jenerette, G. D., Scott, R. L. and Huxman, T. E.: Whole ecosystem metabolic pulses
- following precipitation events, Funct. Ecol., 22, 924–930 [online] Available from:
- 1173 http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/bsc/fecol/2008/00000022/00000005/art00
- 1174 022, 2008.
- 1175 Jolly, W. M., Nemani, R. and Running, S. W.: A generalized, bioclimatic index to predict
- 1176 foliar phenology in response to climate, Glob. Chang. Biol., 11(4), 619–632,
- 1177 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2005.00930.x, 2005.
- 1178 Kanniah, K. D., Beringer, J. and Hutley, L. B.: The comparative role of key environmental
- 1179 factors in determining savanna productivity and carbon fluxes: A review, with special

1180 reference to northern Australia, Prog. Phys. Geogr., 34(4), 459–490,

- 1181 doi:10.1177/0309133310364933, 2010.
- 1182 Kanniah, K. D., Beringer, J. and Hutley, L. B.: Environmental controls on the spatial
- 1183 variability of savanna productivity in the Northern Territory, Australia, Agric. For.
- 1184 Meteorol., 151(11), 1429–1439, doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.06.009, 2011.
- Kanniah, K. D., Beringer, J., North, P. and Hutley, L.: Control of atmospheric particles on
  diffuse radiation and terrestrial plant productivity: A review, Prog. Phys. Geogr., 36(2),
  209–237, doi:doi: 10.1177/0309133311434244, 2012.
- 1107 209 237, doi.doi. 10.1177/03091353511131211, 2012.
- 1188 Karan, M. L., Liddell, M., Prober, S., Metcalfe, D., Grace, P., Hero, J.-M., Van Gorsel, E.,
- 1189 Wardlaw, T., Beringer, J., Arndt, S., Boer, M., Meyer, W., Eamus, D. and Hutley, L.: The
- 1190 Australian SuperSite Network: a new approach to establishing a continental, long-term
- 1191 terrestrial ecosystem observatory, Sci. Total Environ., Accepted 2(Special Issue: Critical
- 1192 Zone Science in Australia), 2016.
- 1193 De Kauwe, M. G., Zhou, S.-X., Medlyn, B. E., Pitman, A. J., Wang, Y. P., Duursma, R. A. and
- 1194 Prentice, I. C.: Do land surface models need to include differential plant species
- 1195 responses to drought? Examining model predictions across a latitudinal gradient in
- 1196 Europe, Biogeosciences Discuss., 12(15), 12349–12393, doi:10.5194/bgd-12-12349-
- 1197 2015, 2015.

Keenan, T. F., Davidson, E., Moffat, A. M., Munger, W. and Richardson, A. D.: Using modeldata fusion to interpret past trends, and quantify uncertainties in future projections, of
terrestrial ecosystem carbon cycling, Glob. Chang. Biol., 18(8), 2555–2569,

1201 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2012.02684.x, 2012.

Kelley, D. I., Harrison, S. P. and Prentice, I. C.: Improved simulation of fire-vegetation
interactions in the Land surface Processes and eXchanges dynamic global vegetation
model (LPX-Mv1), Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., 7(1), 931–1000, doi:10.5194/gmdd-7-

- 1205 931-2014, 2014.
- 1206 Kgope, B., Bond, W. J. and Midgley, G. F.: Growth responses of African savanna trees
- 1207 implicate atmospheric [CO2] as a driver of past and current changes in savanna tree
- 1208 cover, Austral Ecol., 35(4), 451–463, doi:10.1111/j.1442-9993.2009.02046.x, 2010.
- 1209 Kilinc, M. and Beringer, J.: The spatial and temporal distribution of lightning strikes and
- 1210 their relationship with vegetation type, elevation, and fire sears in the Northern
- 1211 Territory, J. Clim., 20(7), 1161–1173, doi:10.1175/jcli4039.1, 2007.
- 1212 Lai, C.-T. and Katul, G.: The dynamic role of root-water uptake in coupling potential to
- 1213 actual transpiration, Adv. Water Resour., 23(4), 427–439, doi:10.1016/S0309-
- 1214 1708(99)00023-8, 2000.
- Laws, R. M.: Elephants as Agents of Habitat and Landscape Change in East Africa, Oikos,
  21(1), 1, doi:10.2307/3543832, 1970.
- Lehmann, C. E. R. and Parr, C. L.: Tropical grassy biomes: linking ecology, human use and
  conservation, Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci., 371(1703), 2016.
- 1219 Lehmann, C. E. R., Archibald, S. A., Hoffmann, W. A. and Bond, W. J.: Deciphering the
- distribution of the savanna biome., New Phytol., 191(1), 197–209, doi:10.1111/j.1469-
- 1221 8137.2011.03689.x, 2011.
- 1222 Lehmann, C. E. R., Anderson, T. M., Sankaran, M., Higgins, S. I., Archibald, S., Hoffmann, W.
- 1223 a, Hanan, N. P., Williams, R. J., Fensham, R. J., Felfili, J., Hutley, L. B., Ratnam, J., San Jose, J.,
- 1224 Montes, R., Franklin, D., Russell-Smith, J., Ryan, C. M., Durigan, G., Hiernaux, P., Haidar, R.,
- 1225 Bowman, D. M. J. S. and Bond, W. J.: Savanna vegetation-fire-climate relationships differ
- 1226 among continents., Science, 343(6170), 548–52, doi:10.1126/science.1247355, 2014.
- 1227 Littleboy, M. and Mckeon, G. M.: GRASP: grass production model., 1997.

- Liu, Y. Y., van Dijk, A. I. J. M., de Jeu, R. A. M., Canadell, J. G., McCabe, M. F., Evans, J. P. and
- Wang, G.: Recent reversal in loss of global terrestrial biomass, Nat. Clim. Chang., advanceon, doi:10.1038/nclimate2581, 2015.
- 1231 Lloyd, J., Bird, M. I., Vellen, L., Miranda, A. C., Veenendaal, E. M., Djagbletey, G., Miranda,
- 1232 H. S., Cook, G. and Farquhar, G. D.: Contributions of woody and herbaceous vegetation to
- 1233 tropical savanna ecosystem productivity: a quasi-global estimate., Tree Physiol., 28,
- 1234
   451-468, 2008.
- 1235 Luo, Y. Q., Randerson, J. T., Abramowitz, G., Bacour, C., Blyth, E., Carvalhais, N., Ciais, P.,
- 1236 Dalmonech, D., Fisher, J. B., Fisher, R., Friedlingstein, P., Hibbard, K., Hoffman, F.,
- 1237 Huntzinger, D., Jones, C. D., Koven, C., Lawrence, D., Li, D. J., Mahecha, M., Niu, S. L., Norby,
- 1238 R., Piao, S. L., Qi, X., Peylin, P., Prentice, I. C., Riley, W., Reichstein, M., Schwalm, C., Wang,
- 1239 Y. P., Xia, J. Y., Zaehle, S. and Zhou, X. H.: A framework for benchmarking land models,
- 1240 Biogeosciences, 9(10), 3857–3874, doi:10.5194/bg-9-3857-2012, 2012.
- 1241 Lynch, A. H., Abramson, D., Görgen, K., Beringer, J. and Uotila, P.: Influence of savanna fire
- 1242 on Australian monsoon season precipitation and circulation as simulated using a
- distributed computing environment, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34(20), L20801,
- 1244 doi:10.1029/2007gl030879, 2007.
- 1245 Ma, X., Huete, A., Yu, Q., Coupe, N. R., Davies, K., Broich, M., Ratana, P., Beringer, J., Hutley,
- 1246 L. B., Cleverly, J., Boulain, N. and Eamus, D.: Spatial patterns and temporal dynamics in
- 1247 savanna vegetation phenology across the North Australian Tropical Transect, Remote
- 1248 Sens. Environ., 139, 97–115, doi:dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2013.07.030, 2013.
- 1249 Mahecha, M. D., Reichstein, M., Jung, M., Seneviratne, S. I., Zaehle, S., Beer, C., Braakhekke,
- 1250 M. C., Carvalhais, N., Lange, H., Le Maire, G. and Moors, E.: Comparing observations and
- 1251 process-based simulations of biosphere-atmosphere exchanges on multiple timescales, J.
- 1252 Geophys. Res. Biogeosciences, 115(2), 1–21, doi:10.1029/2009JG001016, 2010.
- 1253 Malhi, Y., Aragão, L. E. O. C., Galbraith, D., Huntingford, C., Fisher, R., Zelazowski, P., Sitch,
- 1254 S., McSweeney, C. and Meir, P.: Exploring the likelihood and mechanism of a climate-
- 1255 change-induced dieback of the Amazon rainforest., Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A., 106(49),
- 1256 20610-5, doi:10.1073/pnas.0804619106, 2009.
- 1257 Medlyn, B. E., Duursma, R. A., Eamus, D., Ellsworth, D. S., Prentice, I. C., Barton, C. V. M.,
- 1258 Crous, K. Y., De Angelis, P., Freeman, M. and Wingate, L.: Reconciling the optimal and
- 1259 empirical approaches to modelling stomatal conductance, Glob. Chang. Biol., 17(6),

- 1260 2134–2144, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02375.x, 2011.
- Menaut, J.: The vegetation of African Savannas, in Tropical savannas, edited by F.
  Bourliére, pp. 109–149, Elsevier, New York., 1983.
- Midwood, A. J., Boutton, T. W., Archer, S. R. and Watts, S. E.: Water use by woody plants
  on contrasting soils in a savanna parkland: assessment with δ2H and δ180, Plant Soil,
- 1265 205(1), 13–24, doi:10.1023/A:1004355423241, 1998.
- 1266 Miranda, A. C., Miranda, H. S., Lloyd, J., Grace, J., Francey, R. J., McIntyre, J. A., Meir, P.,
- Riggan, P., Lockwood, R. and Brass, J.: Fluxes of Carbon, Water and Energy over Brazilian
  Cerrado an Analysis Using Eddy Covariance and Stable Isotopes, Plant. Cell Environ.,
  20(3), 315–328, 1997.
- 1270 Mitchell, S., Beven, K., Freer, J. and Law, B.: Processes influencing model-data mismatch 1271 in drought-stressed, fire-disturbed eddy flux sites, J. Geophys. Res., 116(G2), G02008,
- 1272 doi:10.1029/2009JG001146, 2011.
- 1273 Moncrieff, G. R., Bond, W. J. and Higgins, S. I.: Revising the biome concept for
- understanding and predicting global change impacts, J. Biogeogr., 43(5), 863–873,
  doi:10.1111/jbi.12701, 2016a.
- 1276 Moncrieff, G. R., Scheiter, S., Langan, L., Trabucco, A. and Higgins, S. I.: The future
- 1277 distribution of the savannah biome: model-based and biogeographic contingency, Philos.
- 1278 Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci., 371(1703), 2016b.
- 1279 Moore, C. E., Brown, T., Keenan, T. F., Duursma, R., Van Dijk, A. I. J. M., Beringer, J.,
- 1280 Culvenor, D., Evans, B., Huete, A., Hutley, L. B., Maier, S., Restrepo-Coupe, N., Sonnentag,
- 1281 O., Specht, A., Taylor, J. R., van Gorsel, E. and Liddell, M. J.: Australian vegetation
- 1282 phenology: new insights from remote-sensing and digital repeat photography,
- 1283 Biogeosciences, (OzFlux Special Issue), 2016a.
- 1284 Moore, C. E., Beringer, J., Evans, B., Hutley, L. B., McHugh, I. and Tapper, N. J.: The
- 1285 contribution of trees and grasses to productivity of an Australian tropical savanna,
- 1286 Biogeosciences, 13(8), 2387–2403, doi:10.5194/bg-13-2387-2016, 2016b.
- 1287 Nielsen, U. N. and Ball, B. A.: Impacts of altered precipitation regimes on soil
- 1288 communities and biogeochemistry in arid and semi-arid ecosystems., Glob. Chang. Biol.,
- 1289 21(4), 1407–21, doi:10.1111/gcb.12789, 2015.

- 1290 O'Grady, A. P., Eamus, D., Hutley, L. B. and Grady, A. P. O.: Transpiration increases during
- 1291 the dry season: patterns of tree water use in eucalypt open-forests of northern Australia,
- 1292 Tree Physiol., 19(9), 591–597, 1999.
- 1293 Pachzelt, A., Forrest, M., Rammig, A., Higgins, S. I. and Hickler, T.: Potential impact of
- large ungulate grazers on African vegetation, carbon storage and fire regimes, Glob. Ecol.
  Biogeogr., 24(9), 991–1002, doi:10.1111/geb.12313, 2015.
- 1296 Pitman, A. J.: The evolution of, and revolution in, land surface schemes designed for
- 1297 climate models, Int. J. Climatol., 23(5), 479–510, doi:10.1002/joc.893, 2003.
- 1298 Poulter, B., Frank, D., Ciais, P., Myneni, R. B., Andela, N., Bi, J., Broquet, G., Canadell, J. G.,
- 1299 Chevallier, F., Liu, Y. Y., Running, S. W., Sitch, S. and van der Werf, G. R.: Contribution of
- 1300 semi-arid ecosystems to interannual variability of the global carbon cycle., Nature,
- 1301 509(7502), 600–3, doi:10.1038/nature13376, 2014.
- 1302 Ratnam, J., Bond, W. J., Fensham, R. J., Hoffmann, W. A., Archibald, S., Lehmann, C. E. R.,
- 1303 Anderson, M. T., Higgins, S. I. and Sankaran, M.: When is a "forest" a savanna, and why
- does it matter?, Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr., 20(5), 653–660, doi:10.1111/j.1466-
- 1305 8238.2010.00634.x, 2011.
- Raupach, M. R.: Dynamics and Optimality in Coupled Terrestrial Energy, Water, Carbon
  and Nutrient Cycles, in IAHS Publication, vol. 301, pp. 223–238., 2005.
- Ruesch, A. and Gibbs, H. K.: New IPCC Tier-1 Global Biomass Carbon Map For the Year2000, Oak Ridge, Tennessee., 2008.
- 1310 Ryu, Y., Sonnentag, O., Nilson, T., Vargas, R., Kobayashi, H., Wenk, R. and Baldocchi, D. D.:
- 1311 How to quantify tree leaf area index in an open savanna ecosystem: A multi-instrument
- 1312 and multi-model approach, Agric. For. Meteorol., 150(1), 63–76,
- 1313 doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2009.08.007, 2010a.
- 1314 Ryu, Y., Baldocchi, D. D., Verfaillie, J., Ma, S., Falk, M., Ruiz-Mercado, I., Hehn, T. and
- 1315 Sonnentag, O.: Testing the performance of a novel spectral reflectance sensor, built with
- 1316 light emitting diodes (LEDs), to monitor ecosystem metabolism, structure and function,
- 1317 Agric. For. Meteorol., 150(12), 1597–1606, doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2010.08.009,
- 1318 2010b.
- 1319 Sanchez, P. a, Ahamed, S., Carré, F., Hartemink, A. E., Hempel, J., Huising, J., Lagacherie, P.,

- 1320 Mcbratney, A. B., Mckenzie, N. J., De, M., Mendonça-santos, L., Minasny, B., Montanarella,
- 1321 L., Okoth, P., Palm, C. a, Sachs, J. D., Shepherd, K. D., Vågen, T., Vanlauwe, B., Walsh, M. G.,
- 1322 Winowiecki, L. a and Zhang, G.: Digital Soil Map of the World, Science (80-.)., 325, 6–7,
- 1323 doi:10.1126/science.1175084, 2009.
- Sankaran, M., Ratnam, J. and Hanan, N. P.: Tree-grass coexistence in savannas revisited insights from an examination of assumptions and mechanisms invoked in existing
- 1326 models, Ecol. Lett., 7(6), 480–490, doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2004.00596.x, 2004.
- 1327 Sankaran, M., Hanan, N. P., Scholes, R. J., Ratnam, J., Augustine, D. J., Cade, B. S., Gignoux,
- 1328 J., Higgins, S. I., Le Roux, X., Ludwig, F., Ardo, J., Banyikwa, F., Bronn, A., Bucini, G., Caylor,
- 1329 K. K., Coughenour, M. B., Diouf, A., Ekaya, W., Feral, C. J., February, E. C., Frost, P. G. H.,
- 1330 Hiernaux, P., Hrabar, H., Metzger, K. L., Prins, H. H. T., Ringrose, S., Sea, W., Tews, J.,
- 1331 Worden, J. and Zambatis, N.: Determinants of woody cover in African savannas, Nature,
- 1332 438(7069), 846–849, 2005a.
- 1333 Sankaran, M., Hanan, N. P., Scholes, R. J., Ratnam, J., Augustine, D. J., Cade, B. S., Gignoux,
- 1334 J., Higgins, S. I., Le Roux, X., Ludwig, F., Ardo, J., Banyikwa, F., Bronn, A., Bucini, G., Caylor,
- 1335 K. K., Coughenour, M. B., Diouf, A., Ekaya, W., Feral, C. J., February, E. C., Frost, P. G. H.,
- 1336 Hiernaux, P., Hrabar, H., Metzger, K. L., Prins, H. H. T., Ringrose, S., Sea, W., Tews, J.,
- 1337 Worden, J. and Zambatis, N.: Determinants of woody cover in African savannas., Nature,
- 1338 438, 846–849, doi:10.1038/nature04070, 2005b.
- Scheiter, S. and Higgins, S. I.: Partitioning of root and shoot competition and the stability
  of savannas., Am. Nat., 170(4), 587–601, doi:10.1086/521317, 2007.
- Scheiter, S. and Higgins, S. I.: Impacts of climate change on the vegetation of Africa: an
  adaptive dynamic vegetation modelling approach, Glob. Chang. Biol., 15(9), 2224–2246,
- 1343 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01838.x, 2009.
- 1344 Scheiter, S., Langan, L. and Higgins, S. I.: Next-generation dynamic global vegetation
- 1345 models: learning from community ecology., New Phytol., 198(3), 957–69,
- 1346 doi:10.1111/nph.12210, 2013.
- 1347 Scheiter, S., Higgins, S. I., Beringer, J. and Hutley, L. B.: Climate change and long-term fire
- 1348 management impacts on Australian savannas., New Phytol., 205(3), 1211–26,
- 1349 doi:10.1111/nph.13130, 2015.
- 1350 Scholes, D. and Hall, R.: The carbon budget of tropical savannas; woodlands and

- grasslands, in Global change: effects on; coniferous forests and grassland, edited by B. A.
  H. D. M. J. green GI, pp. 69–100, Wiley, New York., 1996.
- Scholes, R. J. and Archer, S.: Tree-grass interactions in savannas, Annu. Rev. Ecol. Syst.,28, 517–544, 1997.
- Scholes, R. J., Frost, P. G. H. and Tian, Y.: Canopy structure in savannas along a moisture
  gradient on Kalahari sands, Glob. Chang. Biol., 10(3), 292–302, doi:10.1046/j.13652486.2003.00703.x, 2004.
- 1358 Schymanski, S. J., Roderick, M. L., Sivapalan, M., Hutley, L. B. and Beringer, J.: A test of the
- 1359 optimality approach to modelling canopy properties and CO(2) uptake by natural
- 1360 vegetation, Plant Cell Environ., 30(12), 1586–1598, doi:10.1111/j.1365-
- 1361 3040.2007.01728.x, 2007.
- 1362 Schymanski, S. J., Sivapalan, M., Roderick, M. L., Beringer, J. and Hutley, L. B.: An
- optimality-based model of the coupled soil moisture and root dynamics, Hydrol. EarthSyst. Sci., 12(3), 913–932, 2008.
- 1365 Schymanski, S. J., Sivapalan, M., Roderick, M. L., Hutley, L. B. and Beringer, J.: An
- 1366 optimality-based model of the dynamic feedbacks between natural vegetation and the
- 1367 water balance, Water Resour. Res., 45 [online] Available from:
- 1368 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2008WR006841, 2009.
- 1369 Schymanski, S. J., Roderick, M. L. and Sivapalan, M.: Using an optimality model to
- 1370 understand medium- and long-term responses of vegetation water use to elevated
- 1371 atmospheric CO2 concentrations., AoB Plants, 7, doi:10.1093/aobpla/plv060, 2015.
- 1372 Scott, K., Setterfield, S. A., Douglas, M. M., Parr, C. L., Schatz, J. and Andersen, A. N.: Does
- 1373 long-term fire exclusion in an Australian tropical savanna result in a biome shift? A test
- using the reintroduction of fire, Austral Ecol., 37(6), 693–711, doi:10.1111/j.1442-
- 1375 9993.2012.02379.x, 2012.
- Simioni, G., Roux, X. Le, Gignoux, J. and Sinoquet, H.: Treegrass: a 3D, process-based
  model for simulating plant interactions in tree–grass ecosystems, Ecol. Modell., 131, 47–
  63, 2000.
- Singh, J., Hanxi, Y. and Sajise, P.: Structural and functional aspects of Indian and
  southeast Asian savanna ecosystems., in International Savanna Symposium 1984, edited

1381 by J. Tothill and J. Mott, pp. 34–51, Australian Academy of Science, Canberra., 1985.

1382 Smith, B., Prentice, I. C. and Sykes, M. T.: Representation of vegetation dynamics in the

1383 modelling of terrestrial ecosystems: Comparing two contrasting approaches within

1384 European climate space, Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr., 10(6), 621–637, doi:10.1046/j.1466-

1385 822X.2001.t01-1-00256.x, 2001.

1386 Sonnentag, O., Hufkens, K., Teshera-Sterne, C., Young, A. M., Friedl, M., Braswell, B. H.,

1387 Milliman, T., O'Keefe, J. and Richardson, A. D.: Digital repeat photography for

1388 phenological research in forest ecosystems, Agric. For. Meteorol., 152(1), 159–177,

1389 doi:10.1016/j.agrformet.2011.09.009, 2012.

Steudle, E.: Water uptake by plant roots: an integration of views, Plant Soil, 226(1), 45–
56, doi:10.1023/A:1026439226716, 2000.

Stevens, N., Lehmann, C. E. R., Murphy, B. P. and Durigan, G.: Savanna woody
encroachment is widespread across three continents, Glob. Chang. Biol., 23(1), 235–244,
doi:10.1111/gcb.13409, 2017.

1395 Torello-Raventos, M., Feldpausch, T. R., Veenendaal, E., Schrodt, F., Saiz, G., Domingues,

1396 T. F., Djagbletey, G., Ford, A., Kemp, J., Marimon, B. S., Hur Marimon Junior, B., Lenza, E.,

1397 Ratter, J. A., Maracahipes, L., Sasaki, D., Sonké, B., Zapfack, L., Taedoumg, H., Villarroel, D.,

1398 Schwarz, M., Quesada, C. A., Yoko Ishida, F., Nardoto, G. B., Affum-Baffoe, K., Arroyo, L.,

1399 M.J.S. Bowman, D., Compaore, H., Davies, K., Diallo, A., Fyllas, N. M., Gilpin, M., Hien, F.,

1400 Johnson, M., Killeen, T. J., Metcalfe, D., Miranda, H. S., Steininger, M., Thomson, J., Sykora,

1401 K., Mougin, E., Hiernaux, P., Bird, M. I., Grace, J., Lewis, S. L., Phillips, O. L. and Lloyd, J.: On

1402 the delineation of tropical vegetation types with an emphasis on forest/savanna

1403 transitions, Plant Ecol. Divers., 6(1), 101–137, doi:10.1080/17550874.2012.762812,

1404 2013.

1405 Vrugt, J. A., van Wijk, M. T., Hopmans, J. W. and Šimunek, J.: One-, two-, and three-

1406 dimensional root water uptake functions for transient modeling, Water Resour. Res.,

1407 37(10), 2457–2470, doi:10.1029/2000WR000027, 2001.

Walter, H.: Vegetation of the earth in relation to climate and the eco-physiologicalconditions., English Universities Press., 1973.

Walter, H. and Burnett, J. H.: Ecology of tropical and subtropical vegetation, Oliver &Boyd., 1971.

- 1412 Wang, Y. P., Kowalczyk, E., Leuning, R., Abramowitz, G., Raupach, M. R., Pak, B., van
- 1413 Gorsel, E. and Luhar, A.: Diagnosing errors in a land surface model (CABLE) in the time
- 1414 and frequency domains, J. Geophys. Res., 116(G1), G01034, doi:10.1029/2010JG001385,
- 1415 2011.
- 1416 Van Der Werf, G. R., Randerson, J. T., Giglio, L., Gobron, N. and Dolman, a. J.: Climate
- 1417 controls on the variability of fires in the tropics and subtropics, Global Biogeochem.
- 1418 Cycles, 22(3), 1–13, doi:10.1029/2007GB003122, 2008.
- 1419 Whitley, R., Beringer, J., Hutley, L., Abramowitz, G., De Kauwe, M. G., Duursma, R., Evans,
- 1420 B., Haverd, V., Li, L., Ryu, Y., Smith, B., Wang, Y.-P., Williams, M. and Yu, Q.: A model inter-
- 1421 comparison study to examine limiting factors in modelling Australian tropical savannas,
- 1422 Biogeosciences Discuss., 12(23), 18999–19041, doi:10.5194/bgd-12-18999-2015, 2015.
- 1423 Whitley, R., Beringer, J., Hutley, L. B., Abramowitz, G., De Kauwe, M. G., Duursma, R.,
- 1424 Evans, B., Haverd, V., Li, L., Ryu, Y., Smith, B., Wang, Y.-P., Williams, M. and Yu, Q.: A model
- 1425 inter-comparison study to examine limiting factors in modelling Australian tropical
- 1426 savannas, Biogeosciences, 13(11), 3245–3265, doi:10.5194/bg-13-3245-2016, 2016.
- 1427 Whitley, R. J., Macinnis-Ng, C. M. O., Hutley, L. B., Beringer, J., Zeppel, M., Williams, M.,
- 1428 Taylor, D. and Eamus, D.: Is productivity of mesic savannas light limited or water
- 1429 limited? Results of a simulation study, Glob. Chang. Biol., 17(10), 3130–3149,
- 1430 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2011.02425.x, 2011.
- 1431 Wilks Rogers, C. D. and Beringer, J.: Describing rainfall in northern Australia using
- 1432 multiple climate indices, Biogeosciences, 14(3), 597–615, doi:10.5194/bg-14-597-2017,
  1433 2017.
- 1434 Williams, C. A., Hanan, N., Scholes, R. J. and Kutsch, W.: Complexity in water and carbon
- 1435 dioxide fluxes following rain pulses in an African savanna, Oecologia, 161(3), 469–480,
- 1436 doi:10.1007/s00442-009-1405-y, 2009.
- 1437 Williams, M., Rastetter, E. B., Fernandes, D. N., Goulden, M. L., Wofsy, S. C., Shaver, G. R.,
- 1438 Melillo, J. M., Munger, J. W., Fan, S.-M. and Nadelhoffer, K. J.: Modelling the soil-plant-
- 1439 atmosphere continuum in a Quercus Acer stand at Harvard Forest: the regulation of
- 1440 stomatal conductance by light, nitrogen and soil/plant hydraulic properties, Plant, Cell
- 1441 Environ., 19, 911–927, 1996.
- 1442 Williams, M., Bond, B. J. and Ryan, M. G.: Evaluating different soil and plant hydraulic

- 1443 constraints on tree function using a model and sap flow data from ponderosa pine, Plant,
- 1444 Cell Environ., 24(7), 679–690, doi:10.1046/j.1365-3040.2001.00715.x, 2001.
- 1445 Yang, Q., HongLang, X., LiangJu, Z., MaoXian, Z., CaiZhi, L. and ShengKui, C.: Stable isotope
- techniques in plant water sources : a review, Sci. Cold Arid Reg., 2(2), 112–122, 2010.
- 1447 Zeppel, M., Macinnis-Ng, C., Palmer, A., Taylor, D., Whitley, R., Fuentes, S., Yunusa, I.,
- 1448 Williams, M. and Eamus, D.: An analysis of the sensitivity of sap flux to soil and plant
- 1449 variables assessed for an Australian woodland using a soil-plant-atmosphere model,
- 1450 Funct. Plant Biol., 35(6), 509–520, doi:10.1071/FP08114, 2008.

#### 1452 **Figure Captions**:

Figure 1: Global maps of (a) mean annual temperature and (b) mean annual rainfall for
the period 1901 to 2015, determined from the CRU TS v. 3.23 dataset (Harris et al.,
2014). The dataset has been clipped to the eco-floristic regions that approximate the
global extent of savannas using the following plant functional types: tropical moist
deciduous forest, tropical dry forest, subtropical dry forest and tropical shrubland
(Ruesch and Gibbs, 2008).

- 1459 **Figure 2:** Predicted changes to aboveground biomass <u>between over the period</u> 2012
- 1460 and-to 2100 for the Australian savanna region following three scenarios of projected
- rainfall seasonality according to IPCC SRES A1B (IPCC, 2007). The simulations were
- 1462 conducted using an adaptive Dynamic Global Vegetation Model (aDGVM) shows and
- 1463 <u>predicted predicts how changes to</u> (a) present day <u>(2012)</u> aboveground biomass
- 1464 <u>changes</u>, when (b) rainfall seasonality does not change, (c) rainfall seasonality increases,
- and (d) rainfall seasonality decreases <u>over the forecast period</u>. In all cases, the
- aboveground biomass of the Australian savanna region increases, with the magnitude of
- change determined by the degree of seasonality. Reprinted with permission fromScheiter et al. (2015).

Figure 3: Representation of how changes to (a) tree and grass phenology determines
changes in (b) savanna gross primary productivity (GPP) for an Australian mesic
savanna. Time-varying signals of tree and grass LAI (a) are determined from a MODIS
bulk LAI product using the method of Donohue et al. (Donohue et al., 2009), and are
prescribed as inputs to the Soil-Plant-Atmosphere (SPA) model to predict separate tree
and grass GPP. Data and model outputs are from Whitley et al., 2016)
(Whitley et al., 2015) (this issue).

Figure 4: Simulated differences in total ecosystem latent energy (LE) and the resultant
evolution of soil moisture content through the soil profile over time for a mesic
Australian savanna site. Simulations were conducted using two different terrestrial
biosphere models (TBMs) that use different root-water root water extraction schemes.
The top panel (a) shows outputs of savanna water flux using the Community
Atmosphere Biosphere Land-surface Exchange (CABLE) model, where the density of the

- Atmosphere Biosphere Land-surface Exchange (CABLE) model, where the density of the
- 1482 fine-root biomass weights soil-water extraction. The bottom panel (b) shows outputs of
- savanna water flux from the Soil-Plant-Atmosphere (SPA) model, where soil-water is

1484 dynamically extracted from where it sustainably available. Model outputs are from1485 Whitley et al. (Whitley et al., 2015) (*this issue*).

Figure 5: The nonlinear response of net ecosystem productivity (NEP) as the canopy 1486 1487 regenerates after a fire event in 2003 at an Australian mesic savanna site. Fire 1488 disturbance of a sufficient intensity suppresses productivity, pushing the savanna state 1489 from sink to source over a period of 70 days at this site, as the rate of respiration 1490 exceeds the rate of assimilation due to resprouting costs. Empirical models created 1491 using an artificial neural network (NN) describe the 'UnBurnt' and 'Burnt' canopy NEP 1492 responses over the same period, and their difference estimates the loss of canopy 1493 productivity as a consequence of fire. Reprinted with permission from Beringer et al.

1494 (Beringer et al., 2007).

1495 **Figure 6:** Smoothed (10-day running mean) time-series of understorey (red),

1496 overstorey (green) and total ecosystem (red) gross primary productivity (GPP) for a

1497 mesic savanna site in northern Australia. Rainfall is represented as black bars. Negative

and positive signs represent the savanna state as a carbon source or sink respectively,

1499 and orange arrows depict the occurrence of fire events. Data products for total

1500 ecosystem and understorey GPP are inferred from observations of net ecosystem

1501 exchange using eddy-covariance towers at heights of 23 m and 5 m respectively.

1502 Overstorey GPP is determined as the difference between the ecosystem and the

1503 understorey. Reprinted with permission from Moore et al. (Moore et al., 2016b) (*this* 

1504 *issue*).

Figure 7: Rank plot showing the average performance of 6 terrestrial biosphere models
(TBMs) across the North Australian Tropical Transect (NATT). The closer a model's rank
is to 1 the better its performance is at predicting latent energy (LE) and gross primary
productivity (GPP). Empirical benchmarks representing increasing levels of complexity
(emp1 < emp2 < emp3) are represented as grey lines, and coloured lines denote each</li>

1510 model. The lines have no scientific value and are used for visual purposes only.

Benchmarking and model evaluation data are from Whitley et al. (Whitley et al., 2015)(*this issue*).





# **Figure 3**





**Figure 5** 



# **Figure 6**





