# Phosphorus addition mitigates N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions in N saturated subtropical forest, SW China

- 3 Longfei Yu<sup>1</sup>, Yihao Wang<sup>2, 3</sup>, Xiaoshan Zhang<sup>3</sup>, Peter Dörsch<sup>1</sup>, Jan Mulder<sup>1\*</sup>
- 4 <sup>1</sup>Faculty of Environmental Sciences and Natural Resource Management, Norwegian University
- 5 of Life Sciences, Postbox 5003, N-1432 Aas, Norway.
- <sup>6</sup> <sup>2</sup>Chongqing Academy of Forestry, 400036, Chongqing, China.
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>3</sup>Research Center for Eco-Environmental Sciences, Chinese Academy of Sciences, 100085,
- 8 Beijing, China
- 9 \*Correspondence: Jan Mulder, tel. +47 67231852, E-mail jan.mulder@nmbu.no
- 10 Article type: Research Article

#### 11 Abstract

Chronically elevated nitrogen (N) deposition has led to severe nutrient imbalance in forest soils. 12 Particularly in tropical and subtropical forest ecosystems, increasing N loading has aggravated 13 phosphorus (P) limitation of biomass production, and has resulted in elevated emissions of 14 nitrous oxide (N<sub>2</sub>O) and reduced uptake of methane (CH<sub>4</sub>), both of which are important 15 16 greenhouse gases. Yet, the interactions of N and P and their effects on greenhouse gas emissions remain elusive. Here, we report N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions together with soil N and P data for a 17 period of 18 months following a single P addition (79 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup>, as NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub> powder) to an N-18 saturated, Masson pine-dominated forest soil at TieShanPing (TSP), Chongqing, SW China. We 19 20 observed a significant decline in both  $NO_3^-$  concentrations in soil water (5- and 20-cm depths) and in soil N<sub>2</sub>O emissions, following P application. We hypothesize that enhanced N uptake by 21 22 plants in response to P addition, resulted in less available NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> for denitrification. By contrast to 23 most other forest ecosystems, TSP is a net source of CH<sub>4</sub>. P addition significantly decreased CH<sub>4</sub> emissions and turned the soil from a net source into a net sink. Based on our observation and 24 previous studies in South America and China, we believe that P addition relieves N-inhibition of 25 CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation. Within the 1.5 years after P addition, no significant increase of forest growth was 26 observed and P stimulation of forest N uptake by understory vegetation remains to be confirmed. 27 28 Our study indicates that P fertilization of N-saturated, subtropical forest soils may mitigate  $N_2O$ and CH4 emissions, in addition to alleviating nutrient imbalances and reducing losses of N 29 through NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> leaching. 30

Key Word: N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emission, N saturation, Phosphate fertilization, soil CH<sub>4</sub> uptake, acid
forest soil.

#### 33 **1 Introduction**

Anthropogenic activities have transformed the terrestrial biosphere into a net source of CH<sub>4</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O 34 and CO<sub>2</sub>, leading to increased radiative forcing (Montzka et al., 2011; Tian et al., 2016). During 35 the last decade, atmospheric concentrations of CO2, CH4, N2O have increased at rates of 1.9 ppm 36 yr<sup>-1</sup>, 4.8 and 0.8 ppb yr<sup>-1</sup>, respectively (Hartmann et al., 2013). In China, the exponential increase 37 of reactive nitrogen (N) input into the biosphere since the 1970s has likely led to more carbon (C) 38 being sequestered in the biosphere (Cui et al., 2013; Shi et al., 2015). However, enhanced 39 emissions of N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> due to chronic N pollution potentially offset the cooling effect by C 40 sequestration (Liu and Greaver, 2009; Tian et al., 2011). 41

Microbial nitrification and denitrification in soils account for about 60% of N<sub>2</sub>O emissions 42 globally (Ciais et al., 2013; Hu et al., 2015). Although, microbial activity is often restricted in 43 low pH soils of unproductive forests, surprisingly large N<sub>2</sub>O emissions have been reported from 44 acid, upland forest soils in South China (Zhu et al., 2013b). Reported average N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes in 45 humid, subtropical forests range from 2.0 to 5.4 kg N<sub>2</sub>O-N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Fang et al., 2009; Tang et al., 46 2006; Zhu et al., 2013b), which by far exceeds global averages for temperate or tropical forest 47 ecosystems (Werner et al., 2007; Zhuang et al., 2012). This has been attributed to frequent shifts 48 49 between aerobic and anaerobic conditions in soils during monsoonal summers, promoting alternating nitrification and denitrification (Zhu et al., 2013b) and causing large soil  $NO_3^{-1}$ 50 concentrations due to efficient cycling of deposited N in acid subtropical soils (Yu et al., 2016). 51

52 Chronically elevated rates of N deposition (30-65 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>; Xu et al., 2015) have resulted in 53 strong nutrient imbalances in southern Chinese forests, aggravating phosphorus (P) limitation 54 (Du et al., 2016). Phosphorous deficiency in N-saturated forests restricts forest growth and thus

limits its capability to retain N (Huang et al., 2015; Li et al., 2016), resulting in ample amounts 55 of inorganic N (NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>) being present in the soil solution. Accordingly, Hall & Matson 56 (1999) observed larger N<sub>2</sub>O emission in P-limited than in N-limited tropical forests one year 57 after repeated addition of N. Likewise, previous N manipulation studies in forests of South China 58 reported pronounced stimulation of N<sub>2</sub>O emissions by N addition (Chen et al., 2016; Wang et al., 59 2014; Zheng et al., 2016), supporting the idea that P limitation causes forests to be more 60 susceptible to N saturation and N<sub>2</sub>O-N loss. In an N-limited tropical montane forest in southern 61 Ecuador, P addition alone (10 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) had no effect on N<sub>2</sub>O emissions during the first two 62 years. However, N<sub>2</sub>O emission was smaller when P was added together with N (50 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) 63 than in treatments with N addition alone (Martinson et al., 2013). After continued fertilization for 64 three years, also P addition alone reduced N<sub>2</sub>O emissions at these sites (Müller et al., 2015). In 65 tropical China, with high N deposition (~ 36 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>; Mo et al., 2008), P addition (150 kg 66 P ha<sup>-1</sup> vr<sup>-1</sup>) to an old-growth forest revealed a similar pattern, with no initial effect on N<sub>2</sub>O 67 emissions (0-2 years) but a significant longer term effect (3 to 5 years) on N<sub>2</sub>O emissions (Chen 68 et al., 2016; Zheng et al., 2016). In a secondary tropical forests in South China, Wang et al. 69 (2014) found no effect on N<sub>2</sub>O emissions of P alone (100 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), and in treatments 70 combining P with N (100 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), N<sub>2</sub>O emissions increased during the wet season. 71 Meanwhile, they observed a significant increase in soil microbial biomass after P addition, which 72 is in line with previous findings in tropical forest soils of South China (Liu et al., 2012). Thus, 73 they attributed the stimulating effect of P addition on N<sub>2</sub>O emissions to the larger nitrification 74 and denitrification potential of the increased soil microbial biomass. This was also proposed by 75 Mori et al. (2014), based on results from a short-term incubation study with P addition, excluding 76 plant roots. 77

As the sole biogenic sink for CH<sub>4</sub>, upland soils play an important role in balancing terrestrial 78 CH<sub>4</sub> emissions (Ciais et al., 2013; Dutaur and Verchot, 2007). Atmospheric CH<sub>4</sub> uptake in soil is 79 mediated by the activity of methanotrophic bacteria, which oxidize CH<sub>4</sub> to CO<sub>2</sub> to gain energy 80 for growth. Well-drained forest and grassland soils are dominated by yet uncultured, high-81 affinity methanotrophs residing in the upper soil layers (Le Mer and Roger, 2010). In addition to 82 edaphic factors (pH and nutrients), parameters affecting the diffusion of CH<sub>4</sub> into the soil (soil 83 structure, moisture, temperature) are believed to be major controllers for CH<sub>4</sub> uptake (Smith et 84 al., 2003). A number of studies have shown that excess N affects CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in forest soils (Liu 85 and Greaver, 2009; Veldkamp et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2008b). In general, N addition promotes 86 87  $CH_4$  uptake in N-limited soils by enhancing growth and activity of methanotrophs, whereas excessive N input and N saturation inhibit CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation on an enzymatic level by substrate 88 competition between CH<sub>4</sub> and NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> (Aronson and Helliker, 2010; Bodelier and Laanbroek, 89 90 2004). P addition experiments in N-enriched soils have shown positive effects on  $CH_4$  uptake (Mori et al., 2013a; Zhang et al., 2011), but the underlying mechanisms, i.e. whether P addition 91 affects the methanotrophic community directly or alleviates the N-inhibition effect on CH4 92 oxidation through enhanced N uptake (Mori et al., 2013b; Veraart et al., 2015), remain 93 94 unresolved.

Subtropical forests in South China show strong signs of N saturation, with exceedingly high NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations in soil water (Larssen et al., 2011; Zhu et al., 2013b). Little is known about how P addition affects N cycling and N<sub>2</sub>O emission in these acidic, nutrient-poor soils. Likewise, the importance of increased inorganic N concentrations for soil-atmosphere exchange of CH<sub>4</sub>, and how this is affected by P fertilization remain to be elucidated for soils of the subtropics. Here, we assessed N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in an N-saturated subtropical forest in SW China under ambient 101 N deposition and studied the effects of P addition on emission rates, nutrient availability and tree 102 growth. We hypothesized that i) P addition stimulates forest growth; ii) stimulated forest growth 103 results in increased N uptake by trees and understory vegetation, and thus decreases the soil 104 inorganic N concentration; iii) P addition reduces soil N<sub>2</sub>O emission and promotes CH<sub>4</sub> uptake.

#### **2 Materials and Methods**

#### 106 **2.1 Site description**

The study site TieShanPing (TSP) is a 16.2 ha subtropical forest (29° 380 N, 106° 410 E; 450 m 107 a.s.l.), about 25 km northeast of Chongqing, SW China. TSP is a naturally regenerated, 108 109 secondary mixed coniferous-broadleaf forest, which developed after clear cutting in 1962 (Larssen et al., 2011). The forest stand is dominated by Masson pine (Pinus massoniana) and has 110 a density of about 800 stems ha<sup>-1</sup> (Huang et al., 2015). TSP has a monsoonal climate, with mean 111 annual precipitation of 1028 mm, and a mean annual temperature of 18.2 °C (Chen and Mulder, 112 2007a). Most of the precipitation (> 70%) occurs during summer periods (April to September). 113 Soils are predominantly well-drained, loamy yellow mountain soil, classified as Haplic Acrisol 114 (WRB 2014), with a thin O horizon (< 2 cm). In the O/A horizon, soil pH is around 3.7, and the 115 mean C/N and N/P ratios are 17 and 16, respectively. In the AB horizon, which has a slightly 116 higher pH, mean C/N is well above 20. The soil bulk density of the O/A horizon (~ 5 cm) is 117 about 0.75 g cm<sup>-3</sup>. Generally, soil water-filled pore space (10 cm) on the hillslopes ranges from 118 50 to 70% (mean  $\sim$  60%; Zhu et al., 2013b). More details on soil properties are given in Table 1. 119

Annual inorganic N deposition at TSP measured in throughfall varies between 40 and 65 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> (dominated by  $NH_4^+$ ; Yu et al., 2016), while the annual bulk N deposition is from 20 to 30 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> (Chen and Mulder, 2007b). According to regional data, annual P deposition via throughfall is < 0.40 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> (Du et al., 2016). Strong soil acidification has been reported to cause severe decline in forest growth at TSP since 2001 (Li et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2007), and a decrease in abundance and diversity of ground vegetation (Huang et al., 2015). Pronounced N saturation with strong NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> leaching from the top soil has aggravated P deficiency at TSP 127 (Huang et al., 2015). The total P content in the O/A horizon is ~ 300 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>, while ammonium 128 lactate-extractable P is smaller than 5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> (Table 1).

## 129 2.2 Experimental Design

Three blocks, each having two 20 m  $\times$  20 m plots, were established on well drained soils of a 130 gently sloping hillside. Adjacent plots were separated by at least 10-m buffer zone. In each block, 131 plots were randomly assigned to a Reference and a P treatment. On 4 May 2014, a single dose of 132 P fertilizer was applied as solid NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub><sup>-2</sup>H<sub>2</sub>O, at a rate of 79.5 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup>. The amount of P 133 added was estimated from P adsorption isotherms (Supplementary Materials, Table S1 and 134 Figure S1), to ensure significantly increase in soil available P. To apply P fertilizer evenly, we 135 divided each plot into a 5 m \* 5 m grid and broadcasted the powdered fertilizer by hand in each 136 grid cell. The P dose applied at TSP was intermediate as compared to the 10 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> 137 applied by Müller et al. (2015) to a mountain forest in Ecuador and the 150 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> applied 138 by Zheng et al. (2016) to a subtropical forest in South China. 139

The addition of NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>·2H<sub>2</sub>O at the P-treated plots also resulted in an input of 59.0 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> of sodium (Na). One month after the fertilizer application, Na<sup>+</sup> concentrations in soil water of the P treatments were about 5 mg L<sup>-1</sup> at 5-cm depth and 3 mg L<sup>-1</sup> at 20-cm depth (Table S2). Although somewhat larger than in the Reference plots (0.52-1.31 mg L<sup>-1</sup>), the Na<sup>+</sup> concentration in soil water of the P treatments are unlikely to have exerted a significant negative impact on plant and microbial activities.

# 146 **2.3 Sample collection and analyses**

Within each plot, three ceramic lysimeters (P80; Staatliche Porzellanmanufaktur, Berlin) were 147 installed at 5- and 20-cm soils near the plot centre in August 2013. To obtain water samples, 148 350-ml glass bottles with rubber stoppers were pre-evacuated, using a paddle pump, and 149 connected to the lysimeters for overnight sampling. Between November 2013 and October 2015, 150 we sampled soil pore water bi-monthly in the dry and dormant season and monthly during the 151 growing season. All water samples were kept frozen during storage and transport. Concentrations 152 of  $NH_4^+$ ,  $NO_3^-$ , potassium (K<sup>+</sup>), calcium (Ca<sup>2+</sup>), and magnesium (Mg<sup>2+</sup>) in soil water were 153 measured at the Research Center for Eco-Environmental Sciences (RCEES), Chinese Academy 154 of Sciences, Beijing, using ion chromatography (DX-120 for cations and DX-500 for anions). 155

156 In August 2013, soils from the O/A (0-3 cm), AB (3-8 cm) and B (8-20 cm) horizons were sampled near the lysimeters for soil analysis. Total P and plant-available P contents were 157 monitored in samples collected from the O/A horizons every six months, starting two days 158 before P addition. Soil samples were kept cold (< 4 °C) during transport and storage. Before 159 analysis, soil samples were air dried and sieved (2 mm). Soil pH was measured in soil 160 suspensions (10 g dry soil and 50 ml deionized water) using a pH meter (PHB-4, Leici, China). 161 Total soil C and N contents were determined on dried and milled samples, using a LECO 162 elemental analyzer (TruSpec<sup>@</sup>CHN, USA). To measure total P, 1 g dry soil was digested with 5 163 ml of 6 M H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (Singh et al., 2005) and measured as ortho-phosphate by the molybdenum blue 164 method (Murphy and Riley, 1962). Ammonium lactate (0.01 M)-extractable P and H<sub>2</sub>O-165 extractable P (P<sub>Al</sub> and P<sub>H2O</sub>, respectively) were measured as ortho-phosphate after extraction (1.5 166 167 g dry soil in 50 ml solution) (Singh et al., 2005). Ammonium oxalate (0.2 M)-extractable Fe, Al and P were measured by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectroscopy (ICP-OES, 168 169 Agilent, USA) after extraction (1.5 g dry soil in 50 ml solution).

From August 2013 onwards, we measured N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions in triplicate close to the 170 lysimeters, using static chambers (Zhu et al., 2013b). The measurements were conducted bi-171 monthly in the dry and dormant season and monthly during the growing season, simultaneously 172 with the sampling of soil pore water. To investigate the immediate effect of P addition on N<sub>2</sub>O 173 emissions, we also sampled the gas emissions once before (2 May) and three times (7, 10 and 12 174 May) after the P application. Gas samples were taken 1, 5, 15 and 30 minutes after chamber 175 deployment. 20 ml gas samples were injected into pre-evacuated glass vials (12 ml) crimp-sealed 176 177 with butyl septa (Chromacol, UK), maintaining overpressure to avoid contamination during shipment. Mixing ratios of N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> were analyzed using a gas chromatograph (Model 178 7890A, Agilent, USA) at RCEES, equipped with an ECD for detection of N<sub>2</sub>O (at 375 °C with 179 25 ml min<sup>-1</sup> Ar/CH<sub>4</sub> as make up gas), a FID for CH<sub>4</sub> (250 °C; 20 ml min<sup>-1</sup> N<sub>2</sub> as make-up gas) 180 and a TCD for CO<sub>2</sub>. Exchange rates between soil and atmosphere (emission/uptake) were 181 182 calculated from measured concentration change in the chambers over time, applying linear or polynomial fits to the concentration data. Cumulative N2O emissions over time were estimated 183 by linear interpolation between measurement dates (Zhu et al., 2013b). 184

From October 2013 onwards, litterfall was collected during the first week of every month in five 185 replicates per plot. Litterfall collectors were made of 1 m<sup>2</sup> nylon nets (1 mm mesh size), held in 186 place by four wooden poles 0.8 m above the ground. Fresh litter was dried at 65°C. In early 187 November 2013 and 2014 (at the end of the growing season), we collected current-year pine 188 needles from several branches of three trees in each plot. The collected needles were dried at 189 65 °C and the dry weight of 500 needles was determined. A subsample was dried at 80 °C and 190 finely milled prior to chemical analysis at the Chinese Academy of Forestry. Total C and N were 191 measured using an elemental analyzer (FLASH 2000; Thermo Scientific; USA). The contents of 192

K, Ca, Mg and P in the needles were determined by ICP-AES (IRIS Intrepid II; Thermo Scientific; USA) after digesting 0.25 g dry weight samples with 5 ml of ultra-pure nitric acid. In November 2013, and 2014, and in February of 2015, we measured the height and the diameter at breast height (DBH) of 6 to 10 Masson pines (marked in November 2013; DBH > 5 cm) at each plot. DBH was then used to estimate the standing biomass of Masson pines based on standard allometric equations (Li et al., 2011; Zeng et al., 2008).

Daily average air temperature and daily total precipitation were monitored from July 2013 to
November 2015 by a weather station (WeatherHawk 232, USA) placed on the roof at the local
forest bureau, in about 1 km distance from the sampling site (Yu et al., 2016).

# 202 2.4 Statistical analyses

203 Statistical analyses were performed using R version 3.3.1 (R Core Team, 2016). All data were tested for normality (Kolmogorov-Smirnov's test) and homoscedasticity (Levene's test) before 204 further analysis. If not normally distributed, the data were normalized by logarithmic 205 206 transformation. Considering heterogeneity among blocks, temporal variabilities of  $NO_3^$ concentrations, N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes were presented separately for each block. For time series 207 data, we used linear mixed-effect (LME) models, to account for both repeated measurements and 208 within-group variance of a stratification variable (block design). LME models were applied to 209 test the effects of P addition on soil  $N_2O$  and  $CH_4$  fluxes,  $NH_4^+$ ,  $NO_3^-$ ,  $K^+$ ,  $Ca^{2+}$  and  $Mg^{2+}$ 210 concentrations in soil water, as well as litterfall weight (Koehler et al., 2009; Müller et al., 2015). 211 The analysis was based on data for plot means (the average of 3 subplot replicates) from three 212 blocks. In LME models, treatments (Reference or P addition) were considered fixed effects, 213 while sampling time and plots were treated as random effects. We then assessed the significance 214

- of fixed effects through analysis of variance for LME models. One-way analysis of variance
- 216 (ANOVA) was conducted to examine the treatment effects on soil pH, nutrient contents in
- organic matter, tree biomass, 500-needle weight and needle nutrient content for each sampling.
- Significance levels were set to p < 0.05, if not specified otherwise.

#### 219 **3 Results**

#### 220 3.1 Nutrient concentrations in soil and soil water

Addition of P resulted in a significant increase in soil P content in the O/A horizon, both as P<sub>Al</sub> 221 and total P (Table 2). However, after 15 months, only PAI indicated an enhanced P status, while 222 223 total soil P did not differ significantly from background values at the Reference sites. P addition had no significant effect on soil pH, or soil C and N content. The NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration in soil 224 water collected at 5 cm depth varied seasonally, with significantly greater values (30-40 mg N L<sup>-</sup> 225 <sup>1</sup>) towards the start of the growing season in 2015 (April, Fig. S2), but not in 2014, likely due to 226 dilution by abundant precipitation in February to March 2014. Addition of P resulted in 227 significantly smaller  $NO_3^-$  concentrations in soil water at both 5- and 20-cm depths (Fig. 1b). In 228 general, the concentration of  $NH_4^+$  in soil water was small (< 0.5 mg N L<sup>-1</sup>) and not affected by P 229 addition (Fig. 1a). At both depths, mean soil water concentrations of  $Mg^{2+}$  and  $Ca^{2+}$  were 230 significantly smaller in the P-treated than the Reference plots, and the overall cationic charge 231 declined significantly in response to P addition (Fig. S3). 232

## 233 3.2 N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes: effects of P addition

In the Reference plots, N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes varied seasonally (Fig. 2), showing a significant relationship with daily precipitation (Fig. S4a), but not with daily mean temperature (Fig. S4b). Mean N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes were generally below 50  $\mu$ g N<sub>2</sub>O-N m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> in the dry, cool season, but reached values of up to 600  $\mu$ g N<sub>2</sub>O-N m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> in the growing season (Fig. 2). Cumulative N<sub>2</sub>O emissions were estimated with seasonally averaged fluxes, and they differed greatly among the three blocks (Fig. 3), of which block 2 had the greatest annual N<sub>2</sub>O emission (7.9 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup>). CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in the Reference plots also varied greatly among blocks (Fig. 5). Net emission of CH<sub>4</sub> was observed in summer 2013 (~ 80  $\mu$ g CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup>) in blocks 1 and 2, whereas block 3 showed net uptake. From spring 2014 until October 2015, CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes were less variable in all blocks, with values fluctuating around zero. A longer period of net emission was observed in block 3 during the dry season 2014. The fluxes did not correlate with precipitation or air temperature (Figs. S5c&d).

Mean N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes during the 1.5 years after P addition were significantly smaller in the P treatment than in the Reference (Fig. 4). The P addition resulted in a 50% (3 kg N<sub>2</sub>O-N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> on average) reduction of cumulative N<sub>2</sub>O emission (Fig. 3). No immediate effect (within days) of P addition on N<sub>2</sub>O emission was observed (Fig. S5).

In the 1.5 years following P addition, mean CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes indicated net CH<sub>4</sub> emission (~  $3.8 \mu g$ CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup>) in the Reference, whereas net CH<sub>4</sub> uptake (~  $6.5 \mu g$  CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup>) was observed in the P treatment (Fig. 6). The suppressing effect of P addition on CH<sub>4</sub> emission was significant, in accordance with what was found for NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration and N<sub>2</sub>O emission.

#### 253 **3.3 The effect of P addition on tree growth**

Throughout the 2-year experimental period, we observed no significant change in tree biomass in response to P addition (Table S3). Likewise, there was no effect of P treatment on the 500-needle weight. Between the two samplings in 2013 and 2014, we found differences in chemical composition of the pine needles, but the difference between the Reference and P treatment was not significant. Also, the C/N and N/P ratios of the needles (40 and 16, respectively) were not affected by P addition. Monthly litterfall varied seasonally in both Reference and P treatment (Fig. S6), but no significant difference was found between the two treatments.

# 261 **4 Discussion**

N<sub>2</sub>O emission rates in the Reference plots were relatively large (Fig. 2), with mean values close 262 to 100  $\mu$ g N<sub>2</sub>O-N m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 4). This is within the range of N<sub>2</sub>O emission rates previously 263 reported for well-drained hillslope soils at TSP (Zhu et al., 2013b), but greater than the rates 264 reported for other forests in South China. For instance, N<sub>2</sub>O emission rates averaged to 37 µg 265 N<sub>2</sub>O-N m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> in unmanaged sites at Dinghushan (Fang et al., 2009; Tang et al., 2006) and 50 266 µg N<sub>2</sub>O-N m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> in N-fertilized sites (Zhang et al., 2008a). TSP Reference plots emitted on 267 average 5.3 kg N<sub>2</sub>O-N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 3), which is about 10% of the annual N deposition (50 kg N 268 ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) (Huang et al., 2015). These fluxes are well above average fluxes reported for tropical 269 rainforests (Werner et al., 2007). Large N<sub>2</sub>O emissions at TSP are likely due to the large N 270 deposition rates (Huang et al., 2015). A similar trend of increasing N<sub>2</sub>O emissions with 271 272 increasing N deposition rates has been reported for a wide range of ecosystems (Liu et al., 2009). Also, warm-humid conditions during monsoonal summers may stimulate N<sub>2</sub>O emissions (Ju et 273 al., 2011), as monsoonal rainstorms trigger peak fluxes (Pan et al., 2003). The positive 274 correlation between precipitation and N<sub>2</sub>O emission peaks (Fig. S4a) may indicate the 275 importance of denitrification as the dominant N<sub>2</sub>O source. This is supported by recent <sup>15</sup>N tracing 276 277 experiments at TSP (Yu et al., 2017; Zhu et al., 2013a).

Addition of P caused a significant decline in soil inorganic N in soil water (predominantly  $NO_3^-$ ; Fig. 2), particularly during summers, when  $NO_3^-$  concentrations were relatively large (Fig. S2). At the same time, annual N<sub>2</sub>O emissions decreased by more than 50% (Figs. 3 and 4). These findings are consistent with a number of previous studies (Baral et al., 2014; Hall and Matson, 1999; Mori et al., 2014), which attributed the reduction of N<sub>2</sub>O emissions in P-treated soils to

decreased NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> availability and thus less denitrification. The attenuation of soil NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> by P 283 addition at TSP may reflect stimulated N uptake by plants and/or soil microorganisms. In a 284 similarly N-rich, tropical forest in South China, Chen et al. (2016) reported a stimulation of net 285 N mineralization and nitrification after six years of bi-monthly P addition, despite reduced soil 286 NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration. Therefore, it is likely that plant uptake plays a more important role in P-287 induced N retention than immobilization by soil microbes. However, during our study period of 288 two years, we did not find significant increase of N uptake based on tree biomass and foliar N 289 content measurements (Table S3). An alternative explanation could be that P addition stimulated 290 of N uptake by ground vegetation, which remains to be confirmed. 291

In contrast to our study, P-addition experiments in South Ecuador (Martinson et al., 2013) and 292 South China (at Dinghushan Biosphere Reserve (Zheng et al., 2016) found no effect of a single P 293 addition on N2O emission during the first two years after application. However, significant 294 reduction in N<sub>2</sub>O emission was observed after three to five years of continuous P addition, both 295 at the Ecuadorian and the Chinese site (Chen et al., 2016; Müller et al., 2015). For the montane 296 forest site in Ecuador, the observed delay in N<sub>2</sub>O emission response to P addition may be 297 explained by the relatively low ambient N deposition (~ 10 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and small N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes 298 (~ 0.36 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in the Reference plots) (Martinson et al., 2013; Müller et al., 2015). In 299 addition, the moderate amount of P added (10 kg P ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>; Martinson et al., 2013) could have 300 resulted in an insignificant P effect in the first two years. The Dinghushan site in South China 301 receives 36 kg inorganic N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> by throughfall (Chen et al., 2016; Fang et al., 2008), which is 302 303 similar to the inorganic N deposition at TSP (Chen and Mulder, 2007b; Huang et al., 2015). However, soil KCl-extractable inorganic N (~ 40 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup>; Zheng et al., 2016) and NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-1</sup> 304 leaching (~ 20 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>; Fang et al., 2008) at the Dinghushan site are several-fold smaller 305

than at our site (~ 100 mg N kg<sup>-1</sup> and ~ 50 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>, respectively) (Huang et al., 2015; Zhu 306 et al., 2013b). Also, the mean N<sub>2</sub>O emission rates in the reference plots (10  $\mu$ g m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>) at 307 Dinghushan were smaller than at TSP (> 50  $\mu$ g m<sup>-2</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>; Fig. 4). These indicate that Dinghushan 308 forest has stronger N assimilation and is thus less N-rich than TSP forest. Therefore, we suggest 309 that the response of N<sub>2</sub>O emission to P addition may depend on the N status of the soil. The fact 310 that numerous studies found apparent suppression of N<sub>2</sub>O emission in short-term experiments (< 311 2 years) in N + P treatments, but not in treatments with P alone, supports this idea (Müller et al., 312 313 2015; Zhang et al., 2014b; Zheng et al., 2016).

Another study in South China reported increased N<sub>2</sub>O emissions during two years after P 314 315 addition, in a secondary mixed forest (Wang et al., 2014). While suppression of N<sub>2</sub>O emission by P has been attributed to increased plant N uptake (Mori et al., 2014), increased N<sub>2</sub>O emission is 316 generally explained by enhanced microbial growth (Liu et al., 2012) and denitrification activity 317 318 (Ehlers et al., 2010; He and Dijkstra, 2015). P stimulation of N<sub>2</sub>O emission by microbial denitrification should be rather fast, as indicated by Mori et al. (2013c) in a short-term (one week) 319 incubation experiment with soils from an Acacia mangium plantation. Unlike Mori et al. (2013c), 320 we did not find increased N<sub>2</sub>O emissions within a week after P addition at our site (Fig. S5). This 321 may suggest that the denitrifier community at TSP was not responsive to the P applied, probably 322 323 because TSP hillslope soils have large denitrification potentials (Zhu et al., 2013c).

The Reference plots at TSP showed net  $CH_4$  emission for extended periods (Figs. 5 and 6). Also, long-term  $CH_4$  fluxes sampled between 2012 and 2014 on hillslope soils near-by (Fig. S7; Zhu et al., unpublished data) showed net  $CH_4$  emission. This is in contrast to the generally reported  $CH_4$ sink function of forested upland soils (Ciais et al., 2013; Dutaur and Verchot, 2007). For example, net  $CH_4$  fluxes reported for well-drained, forest soils in South China range from -30 to

-60 µg CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> (Fang et al., 2009; Tang et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2014a). Since aerated 329 upland soils typically provide favourable conditions for microbial CH<sub>4</sub> uptake (Le Mer and 330 Roger, 2010), the net emission observed in our sites is unlikely to be due to enhanced CH<sub>4</sub> 331 production, but rather due to supressed CH<sub>4</sub> consumption. One general explanation for the net 332 CH<sub>4</sub> emission at TSP could be inhibition of CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation by NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>, which competes with CH<sub>4</sub> 333 for the active site at the methane monooxygenase enzyme (Bodelier and Laanbroek, 2004; Zhang 334 et al., 2014a). The concentration of  $NH_4^+$  in the soil water was rather small (< 0.5 g L<sup>-1;</sup> Fig. 1), 335 which does not preclude, however, that  $NH_4^+$  availability from the soil exchangeable pool may 336 have been high. Zhu et al. (2013b) found extraordinarily high KCL-extractable NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> in TSP 337 surface soils, likely reflecting the large atmogenic  $NH_4^+$  input at the TSP site (Huang et al., 338 2015). On the other hand, Reay and Nedwell (2004) found that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> inhibits methanotrophic 339 activity in acidic soils, where NH<sub>3</sub> is scarce. Possible mechanisms are the toxicity of 340 denitrification intermediates (e.g. NO<sub>2</sub>; Wang and Ineson, 2003) and the osmotic effect of high 341  $NO_3^-$  concentration (Hütsch et al., 1996). This deduction can be supported by the high  $NO_3^-$ 342 concentration in the acidic soils at TSP (Figs. 1 and S2). 343

P addition had a significant impact on CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes, changing the soil from a net source to a net 344 sink on an annual basis (Fig. 6). However, the uptake rates of CH<sub>4</sub> in the P treatments remained 345 smaller than those reported for forest soils in tropical China (Tang et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 346 2008b). The stimulating effect of P addition on CH<sub>4</sub> uptake is consistent with previous studies 347 (Mori et al., 2013a, 2013b; Zhang et al., 2011), and has been attributed to alleivating N inhibition 348 349 of methane oxidation. P addition may also result in a change of the taxonomic composition of the methane oxidizing community (Mori et al., 2013a; Veraart et al., 2015). Alternatively, CH<sub>4</sub> 350 oxidation may be stimulated by increased CH<sub>4</sub> diffusion into the soil, due to enhanced root 351

growth and increased soil water loss due to transpiration in P-amended plots (Zhang et al., 2011). Given the strong N enrichment of TSP forest (Huang et al., 2015), it is likely that the reason for the observed reduction in  $CH_4$  emissions in response to P fertilization is due to alleviating direct  $NH_4^+$  inhibition of methane monooxygenase (Veldkamp et al., 2013), rather than due to Pstimulation of methanotrophic activity (Veraart et al., 2015).

Shortly after fertilizer application, we observed a modest, albeit significant increase of Na<sup>+</sup> 357 concentration in soil water (Table S2). Other studies have documented the potential toxicity of 358 excess Na<sup>+</sup> in soil water to plant and microbial activities (Rengasamy et al., 2003; Wong et al., 359 2008). However, Na<sup>+</sup> toxicity to a degree affecting N turnover processes in our plots is unlikely, 360 as Na<sup>+</sup> concentrations in soil water, within one month after application (Table S2), did not 361 exceed 5 mg  $L^{-1}$ , which is far smaller than the values commonly assumed to cause toxicity (40 to 362 100 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) (Bernstein 1975). Frequent precipitation at TSP (Yu et al., 2016), both prior and 363 following the addition of NaH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>.2H<sub>2</sub>O (Fig. 2), may have diluted and leached Na<sup>+</sup>, thus 364 preventing toxic effects. 365

P application significantly increased plant-available P in the P-limited TSP soil (Table 2). 366 Meanwhile, concentrations of leachable base cations ( $K^+$ ,  $Mg^{2+}$ ,  $Ca^{2+}$ ) in soil water decreased 367 (Fig. S3), as expected from the reduction of  $NO_3^-$  concentrations in the P-treatments, which 368 represent a major decline in mobile anions in the P-treated soils (Mochoge and Beese, 1986). We 369 370 observed no sign of stimulated forest growth or increased N uptake by trees within the relatively short period of our study (Table S3 and Fig. S6), making it difficult to link the observed 371 reduction in inorganic N in the soil solution (Fig. 1) to plant growth. When interpreting the 372 observed P effect on NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentrations in soil water, several aspects need to be considered. 373 Firstly, two years of observation may be too short to detect any significant increase in tree 374

375 growth, due to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> uptake, given the commonly large variabilities in tree biomass estimates 376 (Alvarez-Clare et al., 2013; Huang et al., 2015). Secondly, a significant proportion of the added P, and of excess N, may have been assimilated by the understory vegetation, which was not 377 assessed in this study. Previously, understory biomass has been reported to quickly respond to P 378 addition (Fraterrigo et al., 2011). Thirdly, as long-term N saturation and acidification at TSP 379 have reduced forest health (Lu et al., 2010; Wang et al., 2007), we may not expect immediate 380 response of forest growth to P addition. Large needle N/P ratios (17-22, Table S3) indicated that 381 382 P limitation for tree growth was not relieved 1.5 years after P addition (Li et al., 2016). Therefore, enhanced N uptake by understory growth may have been the main mechanisms responsible for 383 observed NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> decline in the P-treated soil (Hall & Matson 1999). 384

Our study suggests that N-saturated TSP soils act as a regional hotspot for N<sub>2</sub>O (Zhu et al., 2013b) and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions. Within the short experimental period of 1.5 years, P fertilization was shown to significantly decrease  $NO_3^-$  concentrations in soil water and to overall reduce N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emissions. These findings provide a promising starting point for improving forest management towards GHG abatement targets, taking into account the P and N status of subtropical soils in the region.

# 391 **5 Acknowledgement**

Longfei Yu thanks the China Scholarship Council (CSC) for supporting his PhD study. Support from the Norwegian Research Council to project 209696/E10 'Forest in South China: an important sink for reactive nitrogen and a regional hotspot for  $N_2O$ ?' is gratefully acknowledged. We thank Prof. Wang Yanhui, Prof. Duan Lei, Dr. Wang Zhangwei, Zhang Yi, Zhang Ting, Zou Mingquan for their help during sample collection and data analysis. Dr. Zhu Jing is gratefully acknowledged for providing unpublished data on long-term CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in the TSP catchment.

# 398 **Reference**

- 399 Alvarez-Clare, S., Mack, M. C. and Brooks, M.: A direct test of nitrogen and phosphorus
- limitation to net primary productivity in a lowland tropical wet forest, Ecology, 94(7), 1540–
  1551, 2013.
- 402 Anon: World reference base for soil resources 2014, FAO, Rome., 2014.
- Aronson, E. L. and Helliker, B. R.: Methane flux in non-wetland soils in response to nitrogen
  addition: A meta-analysis, Ecology, 91(11), 3242–3251, doi:10.1890/09-2185.1, 2010.
- Bernstein, L.: Effects of salinity and sodicity on plant growth, Annual Review of Phytopathology,
  13, 295-312, 1975.
- Baral, B. R., Kuyper, T. W. and Van Groenigen, J. W.: Liebig's law of the minimum applied to a
  greenhouse gas: Alleviation of P-limitation reduces soil N<sub>2</sub>O emission, Plant Soil, 374(1–2),
  539–548, doi:10.1007/s11104-013-1913-8, 2014.
- 410 Bodelier, P. L. E. and Laanbroek, H. J.: Nitrogen as a regulatory factor of methane oxidation in
- 411 soils and sediments, FEMS Microbiol. Ecol., 47(3), 265–277, doi:10.1016/S0168-
- 412 6496(03)00304-0, 2004.
- 413 Chen, H., Gurmesa, G. A., Zhang, W., Zhu, X., Zheng, M., Mao, Q., Zhang, T. and Mo, J.:
- Nitrogen saturation in humid tropical forests after 6 years of nitrogen and phosphorus addition:
  Hypothesis testing, Funct. Ecol., 30(2), 305–313, doi:10.1111/1365-2435.12475, 2016.
- 416 Chen, X. and Mulder, J.: Indicators for nitrogen status and leaching in subtropical forest
- 417 ecosystems, South China, Biogeochemistry, 82(2), 165–180, doi:10.1007/s10533-006-9061-3,
  418 2007a.
- Chen, X. Y. and Mulder, J.: Atmospheric deposition of nitrogen at five subtropical forested sites
  in South China., Sci. Total Environ., 378(3), 317–30, doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2007.02.028, 2007b.
- 421 Ciais, P., Sabine, C., Bala, G., Bopp, L., Brovkin, V., Canadell, J., Chhabra, A., DeFries, R.,
- 422 Galloway, J., Heimann, M., Jones, C., Quéré, C. Le, Myneni, R. B., Piao, S. and Thornton, P.:
- 423 Carbon and other biogeochemical cycles. In: Climate change 2013: the physical science basis.,
- 424 edited by T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V.
- B. and P. M. M. Stocker, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New
  York, NY, USA., 2013.
- Cui, S., Shi, Y., Groffman, P. M., Schlesinger, W. H. and Zhu, Y.-G.: Centennial-scale analysis
  of the creation and fate of reactive nitrogen in China (1910-2010), Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.,
  110(6), 2052–7, doi:10.1073/pnas.1221638110, 2013.
- Du, E., de Vries, W., Han, W., Liu, X., Yan, Z. and Jiang, Y.: Imbalanced phosphorus and
  nitrogen deposition in China's forests, Atmos. Chem. Phys., (16), 8571–8579, doi:10.5194/acp2015-984, 2016.
- 433 Dutaur, L. and Verchot, L. V.: A global inventory of the soil CH<sub>4</sub> sink, Global Biogeochem.
- 434 Cycles, 21(4), 1–9, doi:10.1029/2006GB002734, 2007.

- 435 Ehlers, K., Bakken, L. R., Frostegård, Å., Frossard, E. and Bünemann, E. K.: Phosphorus
- 436 limitation in a Ferralsol: Impact on microbial activity and cell internal P pools, Soil Biol.
- 437 Biochem., 42, 558–566, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2009.11.025, 2010.

Fang, Y. T., Gundersen, P., Mo, J. M. and Zhu, W. X.: Input and output of dissolved organic and
inorganic nitrogen in subtropical forests of South China under high air pollution, Biogeosciences,
5(2), 339–352, doi:10.5194/bg-5-339-2008, 2008.

- 441 Fang, Y., Gundersen, P., Zhang, W., Zhou, G., Christiansen, J. R., Mo, J., Dong, S. and Zhang,
- 442 T.: Soil-atmosphere exchange of N<sub>2</sub>O, CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> along a slope of an evergreen broad-leaved
- 443 forest in southern China, Plant Soil, 319(1–2), 37–48, doi:10.1007/s11104-008-9847-2, 2009.
- 444 Fraterrigo, J. M., Strickland, M. S., Keiser, A. D. and Bradford, M. A.: Nitrogen uptake and
- preference in a forest understory following invasion by an exotic grass, Oecologia, 167(3), 781–
  791, doi:10.1007/s00442-011-2030-0, 2011.
- Hall, S. J. and Matson, P. A.: Nitrogen oxide emissions after nitrogen additions in tropical forests,
  Nature, 400(July), 152, doi:10.1038/22094, 1999.
- 449 Hartmann, D. J., Klein Tank, A. M. G., Rusticucci, M., Alexander, L. V, Brönnimann, S.,
- 450 Charabi, Y. A.-R., Dentener, F. J., Dlugokencky, E. J., Easterling, D. R., Kaplan, A., Soden, B. J.,
- 451 Thorne, P. W., Wild, M. and Zhai, P.: Observations: atmosphere and surface, In: Climate change
- 452 2013: the physical science basis., edited by T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J.
- Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. B. and P. M. M. Stocker, Cambridge University Press,
- 454 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA., 2013.
- He, M. and Dijkstra, F. A.: Phosphorus addition enhances loss of nitrogen in a phosphorus-poor
  soil, Soil Biol. Biochem., 82, 99–106, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2014.12.015, 2015.
- Huang, Y., Kang, R., Mulder, J., Zhang, T. and Duan, L.: Nitrogen saturation, soil acidification,
  and ecological effects in a subtropical pine forest on acid soil in southwest China, J. Geophys.
  Res. Biogeosciences, 120, 2457–2472, doi:10.1002/2015JG003048., 2015.
- Hu, H. W., Chen, D. and He, J. Z.: Microbial regulation of terrestrial nitrous oxide formation:
  Understanding the biological pathways for prediction of emission rates, FEMS Microbiol. Rev.,
  39(5), 729–749, doi:10.1093/femsre/fuv021, 2015.
- 463 Hütsch, B. W., Russell, P. and Mengel, K.: CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation in two temperate arable soils as
- affected by nitrate and ammonium application, Biol. Fertil. Soils, 23(1), 86–92,
  doi:10.1007/s003740050142, 1996.
- 466 Ju, X., Lu, X., Gao, Z., Chen, X., Su, F., Kogge, M., Römheld, V., Christie, P. and Zhang, F.:
- Processes and factors controlling N<sub>2</sub>O production in an intensively managed low carbon
  calcareous soil under sub-humid monsoon conditions, Environ. Pollut., 159(4), 1007–1016,
- 469 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2010.10.040, 2011.
- 470 Koehler, B., Corre, M. D., Veldkamp, E., Wullaert, H. and Wright, S. J.: Immediate and long-
- term nitrogen oxide emissions from tropical forest soils exposed to elevated nitrogen input, Glob.
- 472 Chang. Biol., 15(8), 2049–2066, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01826.x, 2009.
- 473 Larssen, T., Duan, L. and Mulder, J.: Deposition and leaching of sulfur, nitrogen and calcium in
- 474 four forested catchments in China: implications for acidification, Environ. Sci. Technol., 45(4),

- 475 1192–8, doi:10.1021/es103426p, 2011.
- 476 Li, Y., Niu, S. and Yu, G.: Aggravated phosphorus limitation on biomass production under
- 477 increasing nitrogen loading: A meta-analysis, Glob. Chang. Biol., 22(2), 934–943,
- 478 doi:10.1111/gcb.13125, 2016.
- Li, Z., Wang, Y., Liu, Y., Guo, H., Li, T., Li, Z. H. and Shi, G.: Long-term effects of liming on
  health and growth of a Masson pine stand damaged by soil acidification in Chongqing, China,
  PLoS One, 9(4), 1–9, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0094230, 2014.
- Li, Z., Yu, P., Y., W., Li, Z., Y., W. and Du, A.: Charcters of litter-fall in damaged pinus
  massoniana forests and its responses to environmental factors in the acid rain region of
  Chongqing, China, Sci. Silvae Sin., 47(8), 19–24, 2011.
- 485 Liu, L. and Greaver, T. L.: A review of nitrogen enrichment effects on three biogenic GHGs:
- 486 The CO<sub>2</sub> sink may be largely offset by stimulated N<sub>2</sub>O and CH<sub>4</sub> emission, Ecol. Lett., 12(10), 487 1103-1117, doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2009.01351.x, 2009.
- Liu, L., Gundersen, P., Zhang, T. and Mo, J.: Effects of phosphorus addition on soil microbial
  biomass and community composition in three forest types in tropical China, Soil Biol. Biochem.,
  44(1), 31–38, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2011.08.017, 2012.
- Lu, X., Mo, J., Gilliam, F. S., Zhou, G. and Fang, Y.: Effects of experimental nitrogen additions
  on plant diversity in an old-growth tropical forest, Glob. Chang. Biol., 16(10), 2688–2700,
  doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02174.x, 2010.
- Martinson, G. O., Corre, M. D. and Veldkamp, E.: Responses of nitrous oxide fluxes and soil
  nitrogen cycling to nutrient additions in montane forests along an elevation gradient in southern
  Ecuador, Biogeochemistry, 112(1–3), 625–636, doi:10.1007/s10533-012-9753-9, 2013.
- Le Mer, J. and Roger, P.: Production, oxidation, emission and consumption of methane by soils:
  A review, Eur. J. Soil Biol., 37(2001), 2010.
- Mo, J., Li, D. and Gundersen, P.: Seedling growth response of two tropical tree species to
  nitrogen deposition in southern China, Eur. J. For. Res., 127(4), 275–283, doi:10.1007/s10342008-0203-0, 2008.
- Mochoge, B. O. and Beese, F.: Leaching of plant nutrients from an acid forest soil after nitrogen
   fertilizer application, Plant and Soil, 91, 17–29, 1986.
- Montzka, S. A., Dlugokencky, E. J. and Butler, J. H.: Non-CO<sub>2</sub> greenhouse gases and climate change, Nature, 476(7358), 43–50, doi:10.1038/nature10322, 2011.
- Mori, T., Ohta, S., Ishizuka, S., Konda, R., Wicaksono, A. and Heriyanto, J.: Effects of
   phosphorus application on CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in an Acacia mangium plantation with and without root
   exclusion, Tropics, 22(1), 13–17, 2013a.
- 509 Mori, T., Ohta, S., Ishizuka, S., Konda, R., Wicaksono, A. and Heriyanto, J.: Phosphorus
- application reduces  $N_2O$  emissions from tropical leguminous plantation soil when phosphorus
- 511 uptake is occurring, Biol. Fertil. Soils, 50(1), 45–51, doi:10.1007/s00374-013-0824-4, 2014.
- 512 Mori, T., Ohta, S., Ishizuka, S., Konda, R., Wicaksono, A., Heriyanto, J., Hamotani, Y., Gobara,

- Y., Kawabata, C., Kuwashima, K., Nakayama, Y. and Hardjono, A.: Soil greenhouse gas fluxes 513
- and C stocks as affected by phosphorus addition in a newly established Acacia mangium 514
- plantation in Indonesia, For. Ecol. Manage., 310, 643-651, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2013.08.010, 515
- 2013b. 516
- Mori, T., Ohta, S., Ishizuka, S., Konda, R., Wicaksono, A., Heriyanto, J. and Hardjono, A.: 517
- 518 Effects of phosphorus addition with and without ammonium, nitrate, or glucose on N<sub>2</sub>O and NO
- emissions from soil sampled under Acacia mangium plantation and incubated at 100 % of the 519 water-filled pore space, Biol. Fertil. Soils, 49(1), 13–21, doi:10.1007/s00374-012-0690-5, 2013c.
- 520
- Müller, A. K., Matson, A. L., Corre, M. D. and Veldkamp, E.: Soil N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes along an 521 elevation gradient of tropical montane forests under experimental nitrogen and phosphorus 522
- addition, Front. Earth Sci., 3(October), 1-12, doi:10.3389/feart.2015.00066, 2015. 523
- Murphy, J. and Riley, J. P.: A modified single method for the determination of phosphate in 524 natural waters, Anal. Chim. Acta, 27(27), 31-36, doi:10.1016/S0003-2670(00)88444-5, 1962. 525
- Pan, F., Peters-Lidard, C. D. and Sale, M. J.: An analytical method for predicting surface soil 526
- moisture from rainfall observations, Water Resour. Res., 39(11), 1314, 527
- 528 doi:10.1029/2003WR002142, 2003.
- 529 R Core Team: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for statistical computing, 2015; Vienna, Austria, 2016. 530
- Reay, D. S. and Nedwell, D. B.: Methane oxidation in temperate soils: Effects of inorganic N, 531 Soil Biol. Biochem., 36(12), 2059–2065, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2004.06.002, 2004. 532
- Rengasamy, P., Chittleborough D. and Helyar K.: Root-zone constraints and plant-based 533
- solutions for dryland salinity, Plant and Soil, 257, 249-260, 2003. 534
- Shi, Y., Cui, S., Ju, X., Cai, Z. and Zhu, Y.: Impacts of reactive nitrogen on climate change in 535 536 China, Sci. Rep., 5, 8118, doi:10.1038/srep08118, 2015.
- Singh, B. R., Krogstad, T., Shivay, Y. S., Shivakumar, B. G. and Bakkegard, M.: Phosphorus 537 fractionation and sorption in P-enriched soils of Norway, Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosystems, 73(2–3), 538 245-256, doi:10.1007/s10705-005-2650-z, 2005. 539
- Smith, K. a., Ball, T., Conen, F., Dobbie, K. E., Massheder, J. and Rev, A.: Exchange of 540
- greenhousegases between soil and atmosphere: interactions of soil physical factors and 541
- biological processes, Eur. J. Soil Sci., 54(December), 779-791, doi:10.1046/j.1365-542
- 2389.2003.00567.x, 2003. 543
- Tang, X., Liu, S., Zhou, G., Zhang, D. and Zhou, C.: Soil-atmospheric exchange of CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub>, 544
- and N<sub>2</sub>O in three subtropical forest ecosystems in southern China, Glob. Chang. Biol., 12(3), 545
- 546-560, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01109.x, 2006. 546
- Tian, H., Lu, C., Ciais, P., Michalak, A. M., Canadell, J. G., Saikawa, E., Huntzinger, D. N., 547
- Gurney, K. R., Sitch, S., Zhang, B., Yang, J., Bousquet, P., Bruhwiler, L., Chen, G., 548
- Dlugokencky, E., Friedlingstein, P., Melillo, J., Pan, S., Poulter, B., Prinn, R., Saunois, M., 549
- Schwalm, C. R. and Wofsy, S. C.: The terrestrial biosphere as a net source of greenhouse gases 550
- to the atmosphere, Nature, 531(7593), 225-228, doi:10.1038/nature16946, 2016. 551

- 552 Tian, H., Xu, X., Lu, C., Liu, M., Ren, W., Chen, G., Melillo, J. and Liu, J.: Net exchanges of
- 553  $CO_2$ ,  $CH_4$ , and  $N_2O$  between China's terrestrial ecosystems and the atmosphere and their
- contributions to global climate warming, J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosciences, 116(2), 1–13,
  doi:10.1029/2010JG001393, 2011.
- 556 Veldkamp, E., Koehler, B. and Corre, M. D.: Indications of nitrogen-limited methane uptake in
- tropical forest soils, Biogeosciences, 10(8), 5367–5379, doi:10.5194/bg-10-5367-2013, 2013.
- Veraart, A. J., Steenbergh, A. K., Ho, A., Kim, S. Y. and Bodelier, P. L. E.: Beyond nitrogen:
   The importance of phosphorus for CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation in soils and sediments, Geoderma, 259–260,
- 560 337–346, doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2015.03.025, 2015.
- Wang, F., Li, J., Wang, X., Zhang, W., Zou, B., Neher, D. a and Li, Z.: Nitrogen and phosphorus
  addition impact soil N<sub>2</sub>O emission in a secondary tropical forest of South China., Sci. Rep., 4,
  5615, doi:10.1038/srep05615, 2014.
- Wang, Y., Solberg, S., Yu, P., Myking, T., Vogt, R. D. and Du, S.: Assessments of tree crown
  condition of two Masson pine forests in the acid rain region in south China, For. Ecol. Manage.,
  242(2–3), 530–540, doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2007.01.065, 2007.
- Wang, Z. P. and Ineson, P.: Methane oxidation in a temperate coniferous forest soil: Effects of
  inorganic N, Soil Biol. Biochem., 35(3), 427–433, doi:10.1016/S0038-0717(02)00294-8, 2003.
- 569 Werner, C., Butterbach-Bahl, K., Haas, E., Hickler, T. and Kiese, R.: A global inventory of N<sub>2</sub>O
- emissions from tropical rainforest soils using a detailed biogeochemical model, Global
  Biogeochem. Cycles, 21(3), doi:10.1029/2006GB002909, 2007.
- Wong, V.N.L., Dalal, R.C., Greene, R.S.B.: Salinity and sodicity effects on respiration and
  microbial biomass of soil, Biology and Fertility of Soils, 44, 943-953, 2008.
- 574 Xu, W., Luo, X. S., Pan, Y. P., Zhang, L., Tang, A. H., Shen, J. L., Zhang, Y., Li, K. H., Wu, Q.
- 575 H., Yang, D. W., Zhang, Y. Y., Xue, J., Li, W. Q., Li, Q. Q., Tang, L., Lu, S. H., Liang, T., Tong,
- Y. A., Liu, P., Zhang, Q., Xiong, Z. Q., Shi, X. J., Wu, L. H., Shi, W. Q., Tian, K., Zhong, X. H.,
  Shi, K., Tang, Q. Y., Zhang, L. J., Huang, J. L., He, C. E., Kuang, F. H., Zhu, B., Liu, H., Jin, X.,
- 578 Xin, Y. J., Shi, X. K., Du, E. Z., Dore, A. J., Tang, S., Collett, J. L., Goulding, K., Sun, Y. X.,
- 579 Ren, J., Zhang, F. S. and Liu, X. J.: Quantifying atmospheric nitrogen deposition through a
- nationwide monitoring network across China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 15(21), 12345–12360,
- 581 doi:10.5194/acp-15-12345-2015, 2015.
- 582 Yu, L., Kang, R., Mulder, J., Zhu, J. and Dörsch, P.: Distinct fates of atmogenic  $NH_4^+$  and  $NO_3^-$ 583 in subtropical, N-saturated forest soils, Biogeochemistry, (3), doi:10.1007/s10533-017-0332-y, 584 2017.
- Yu, L., Zhu, J., Mulder, J. and Dörsch, P.: Multiyear dual nitrate isotope signatures suggest that
  N-saturated subtropical forested catchments can act as robust N sinks, Glob. Chang. Biol., 22,
  3662-3674, doi:10.1111/gcb.13333, 2016.
- Zeng, L., Wang, P., Xiao, W., Wan, R., Huang, Z. and Pan, L.: Allocation of Biomass and
- Productivity of Main Vegetations in Three Gorges Reservoir Region, Sci. Silvae Sin., 44(8), 16–
  22, 2008.
- 591 Zhang, T., Zhu, W., Mo, J., Liu, L. and Dong, S.: Increased phosphorus availability mitigates the

- inhibition of nitrogen deposition on CH4 uptake in an old-growth tropical forest, southern China,
  Biogeosciences, 8(9), 2805–2813, doi:10.5194/bg-8-2805-2011, 2011.
- Zhang, W., Mo, J., Yu, G., Fang, Y., Li, D., Lu, X. and Wang, H.: Emissions of nitrous oxide
  from three tropical forests in Southern China in response to simulated nitrogen deposition, Plant
  Soil, 306(1–2), 221–236, doi:10.1007/s11104-008-9575-7, 2008a.
- 597 Zhang, W., Mo, J., Zhou, G., Gundersen, P., Fang, Y., Lu, X., Zhang, T. and Dong, S.: Methane
- uptake responses to nitrogen deposition in three tropical forests in southern China, J. Geophys.
  Res. Atmos., 113(11), 1–10, doi:10.1029/2007JD009195, 2008b.
- 600 Zhang, W., Wang, K., Luo, Y., Fang, Y., Yan, J., Zhang, T., Zhu, X., Chen, H., Wang, W. and
- 601 Mo, J.: Methane uptake in forest soils along an urban-to-rural gradient in Pearl River Delta, 602 South China, Sci. Rep. 4, 5120. doi:10.1038/srep05120.2014a
- 602 South China., Sci. Rep., 4, 5120, doi:10.1038/srep05120, 2014a.
- <sup>603</sup> Zhang, W., Zhu, X., Luo, Y., Rafique, R., Chen, H., Huang, J. and Mo, J.: Responses of nitrous
- oxide emissions to nitrogen and phosphorus additions in two tropical plantations with N-fixing
  vs. non-N-fixing tree species, Biogeosciences, 11, 4941-4951, doi:10.5194/bg-11-4941-2014,
  2014.
- Zheng, M., Zhang, T., Liu, L., Zhu, W., Zhang, W. and Mo, J.: Effects of nitrogen and
  phosphorus additions on nitrous oxide emission in a nitrogen-rich and two nitrogen-limited
  tropical forests, Biogeosciences, 13, 3503–3517, doi:10.5194/bg-2015-552, 2016.
- Zhu, J., Mulder, J., Bakken, L. and Dörsch, P.: The importance of denitrification for N<sub>2</sub>O
- emissions from an N-saturated forest in SW China: results from in situ <sup>15</sup>N labeling experiments,
  Biogeochemistry, 116(1–3), 103–117, doi:10.1007/s10533-013-9883-8, 2013a.
- Zhu, J., Mulder, J., Wu, L. P., Meng, X. X., Wang, Y. H. and Dörsch, P.: Spatial and temporal
  variability of N<sub>2</sub>O emissions in a subtropical forest catchment in China, Biogeosciences, 10(3),
  1309–1321, doi:10.5194/bg-10-1309-2013, 2013b.
- Zhu, J., Mulder, J., Solheimslid, S. O. and Dörsch, P.: Functional traits of denitrification in a
  subtropical forest catchment in China with high atmogenic N deposition, Soil Biol. Biochem., 57,
  577–586, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.09.017, 2013c.
- <sup>619</sup> Zhuang, Q., Lu, Y. and Chen, M.: An inventory of global N<sub>2</sub>O emissions from the soils of
- 620 natural terrestrial ecosystems, Atmos. Environ., 47, 66–75, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2011.11.036,
- **621** 2012.

	Soil Layer		Total C	Total N	Total P	C/N	N/P
			g kg <sup>-1</sup>	g kg <sup>-1</sup>	mg kg <sup>-1</sup>		
Block 1	O/A (0-3 cm)	3.7 (0.1)	80.7 (32.3)	4.8 (1.7)	308 (57)	17.0 (2.5)	15.5 (5.7)
	AB (3-8 cm)	3.8 (0.0)	23.9 (9.3)	1.3 (0.6)	*	20.0 (3.0)	-
	B (8-20 cm)	3.9 (0.2)	8.6 (1.2)	< 0.05	-	-	-
	O/A (0-3 cm)	3.6 (0.1)	77.6 (13.4)	4.7 (0.8)	297 (44)	16.7 (1.3)	15.7 (2.8)
Block 2	AB (3-8 cm)	3.7 (0.1)	20.2 (5.3)	1.0 (0.3)	-	21.4 (3.3)	-
	B (8-20 cm)	3.9 (0.1)	7.1 (1.6)	< 0.05	-	-	-
	O/A (0-3 cm)	3.6 (0.1)	67.0 (15.5)	3.8 (0.8)	223 (45)	17.4 (0.6)	17.2 (3.7)
Block 3	AB (3-8 cm)	3.6 (0.1)	21.0 (7.9)	1.1 (0.5)	-	24.5 (4.6)	-
	B (8-20 cm)	3.8 (0.1)	7.2 (1.5)	< 0.05	-	-	-
	Soil Layer	P <sub>Al</sub>	Al <sub>ox</sub>	Fe <sub>ox</sub>	P <sub>ox</sub>	Pox/	
		mg kg <sup>-1</sup>	mg kg <sup>-1</sup>	mg kg <sup>-1</sup>	mg kg <sup>-1</sup>	$(Al_{ox} + Fe_{ox})$	)
	O/A (0-3 cm)	5.8 (1.4)	1700 (513)	1933 (350)	85.8 (22.6)	0.025 (0.008	3)
Block 1	AB (3-8 cm)	2.1 (0.6)	1217 (243)	1692 (493)	47.1 (22.0)	0.016 (0.007)	
	B (8-20 cm)	< 1.0	1083 (90)	1158 (249)	29.3 (28.6)	0.012 (0.011)	
	O/A (0-3 cm)	5.9 (1.0)	1500 (238)	1792 (215)	79.2 (21.5)	0.024 (0.007	')
Block 2	AB (3-8 cm)	1.6 (0.4)	925 (149)	1517 (320)	37.2 (10.7)	0.016 (0.006)	
	B (8-20 cm)	< 1.0	892 (209)	1033 (413)	16.1 (10.5)	0.009 (0.007	')
	O/A (0-3 cm)	4.1 (0.9)	1367 (180)	1667 (168)	50.7 (10.9)	0.017 (0.003	5)
Block 3	AB (3-8 cm)	4.4 (4.0)	1075 (128)	1350 (150)	24.8 (8.3)	0.010 (0.002)	
	B (8-20 cm)	< 1.0	992 (130)	875 (138)	8.0 (2.0)	0.004 (0.001	)

**Table 1** Ambient soil properties of the experimental plots at Tieshanping (TSP). Values are means and standard deviations in parenthesis (n = 6)<sup> $\phi$ </sup>. Soils were sampled in August 2013.

624  $P_{Al} = Ammonium lactate-extractable P$ ,

625  $Al_{ox} = Oxalate extractable Al, Fe_{ox} = Oxalate extractable Fe, P_{ox} = Oxalate extractable P.$ 

<sup>626</sup>  $^{\phi}$  Water-extractable P was below a detection limit of 5 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>, thus not presented in table,

627 <sup>\*</sup> Data not available

**Table 2** Soil pH, C, N and P contents in the O/A horizon (0-3 cm) in the References (Ref) and P treatments. Values are means and standard deviations in parenthesis (n = 9). P addition was conducted on 14/05/04, after the first two sampling dates.

		pН	Total C	Total N	C/N	P <sub>Al</sub>	Total P
			g kg <sup>-1</sup>	g kg <sup>-1</sup>		mg kg <sup>-1</sup>	mg kg <sup>-1</sup>
13/08/02	Ref	3.7 (0.1) <sup>ab†</sup>	8.3 (2.3) <sup>ab</sup>	$0.5 (0.1)^{ab}$	16.9 (1.1) <sup>b</sup>	5.4 (1.4) <sup>a</sup>	292 (46) <sup>ab</sup>
	Р	$3.6(0.1)^{b}$	6.7 (2.0) <sup>b</sup>	$0.4 (0.1)^{b}$	17.1 (2.1) <sup>ab</sup>	5.1 (1.3) <sup>a</sup>	260 (70) <sup>b</sup>
14/05/02	Ref	3.7 (0.1) <sup>a</sup>	12.2 (4.2) <sup>a</sup>	$0.9 (0.3)^{a}$	13.7 (1.5) <sup>b</sup>	19.0 (8.0) <sup>a</sup>	336 (65) <sup>a</sup>
	Р	3.8 (0.2) <sup>a</sup>	9.0 (3.5) <sup>ab</sup>	0.7 (0.2) <sup>ab</sup>	14.2 (2.8) <sup>ab</sup>	13.7 (5.2) <sup>a</sup>	270 (72) <sup>a</sup>
14/05/10	Ref	3.8 (0.1) <sup>ab</sup>	9.9 (2.1) <sup>a</sup>	0.7 (0.2) <sup>ab</sup>	$14.0 (0.7)^{b}$	15.4 (7.0) <sup>b</sup>	304 (49) <sup>b</sup>
	Р	$3.9(0.3)^{a}$	8.0 (1.9) <sup>a</sup>	$0.6 (0.1)^{b}$	14.3 (1.3) <sup>ab</sup>	174 (114) <sup>a</sup>	572 (242) <sup>a</sup>
14/12/02	Ref	3.8 (0.1) <sup>a</sup>	10.5 (3.6) <sup>a</sup>	$0.7 (0.3)^{a}$	14.5 (1.3) <sup>ab</sup>	14.2 (7.4) <sup>b</sup>	328 (102) <sup>b</sup>
	Р	3.9 (0.2) <sup>a</sup>	9.5 (2.1) <sup>a</sup>	0.7 (0.1) <sup>ab</sup>	14.0 (0.8) <sup>b</sup>	66 (24) <sup>a</sup>	442 (106) <sup>ab</sup>
15/08/02	Ref	3.9 (0.2) <sup>ab</sup>	8.3 (2.2) <sup>ab</sup>	$0.4 (0.1)^{ab}$	20.5 (2.5) <sup>a</sup>	13.4 (6.2) <sup>b</sup>	291 (61) <sup>a</sup>
	Р	$4.0(0.2)^{a}$	6.5 (1.9) <sup>b</sup>	0.3 (0.1) <sup>b</sup>	19.7 (2.2) <sup>ab</sup>	57 (36) <sup>a</sup>	383 (136) <sup>a</sup>

<sup>†</sup> Different letters indicate significant differences between References and P treatments (p < 0.05).



**Fig. 1** Box whisker plots of  $NH_4^+$  (a) and  $NO_3^-$  (b) concentration in soil water at 5- and 20-cm depths in the References and P treatments, throughout 1.5 years after the P addition; red dashed lines indicate mean values; different letters indicate significant differences (p < 0.05).



636

**Fig. 2** Daily mean air temperature and precipitation (a), and monthly mean  $N_2O$  fluxes (±SE) in the References (Ref) and P treatments in each of the three blocks (b-d); the red vertical line gives the date of P addition (4 May, 2014).





summer 2013 to autumn 2015; the red arrows refer to the date of P addition (4 May, 2014).



**Fig. 4** Box whisker plots for N<sub>2</sub>O fluxes in the Reference and P treatment throughout 1.5 years

after the P addition; red dashed lines indicate mean values; linear mixed-effect models were used to test the P treatment effect; different letters indicate significant difference (p < 0.05).



647

**Fig. 5** Monthly mean  $CH_4$  fluxes (±SE) in the References (Ref) and P treatments for three blocks (a-c); the horizontal broken line indicates zero flux the red vertical line refers to the date of P addition (4 May, 2014).



**Fig. 6** Box whisker plots of CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes in the Reference and P treatment throughout 1.5 years

- after the P addition; red dash lines indicate mean values; linear mixed-effect models were used to
- test the P treatment effect; the different letters indicate significant difference (p < 0.05).