

***Interactive comment on “The sensitivity of estuarine aragonite saturation state and pH to the carbonate chemistry of a freshet-dominated river” by Benjamin L. Moore-Maley et al.***

**J. Middelburg (Editor)**

[j.b.m.middelburg@uu.nl](mailto:j.b.m.middelburg@uu.nl)

Received and published: 1 December 2017

Dear Dr. Moore-Maley:

Thank you for submitting your paper to Biogeosciences (Discussion).

As you have seen two referees have handed in their report and both expressed founded and balanced reservations on the quality and readability of your paper. The bottom line is that your paper (1) lacks focus: too many items are addressed and essential information is often lacking, (2) does not incorporate essential recent key papers: i.e. your results need to better put in context, and (3) does not articulate clearly what is new

C1

and what has been published before. The referees provided many useful suggestions to improve and focus your paper.

I propose that you provide a detailed rebuttal to the comments of the referees and additionally upload (as a rebut to this short editors' feedback) an outline of a revised paper that resolves the issues identified. On the basis of that outline I will decide whether this manuscript will be further considered for Biogeosciences or not. If further considered it will go through at least one other full round of external evaluation.

With best regards, Jack Middelburg, Associate Editor

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2017-349>, 2017.

C2