

Interactive comment on “Massive carbon addition to an organic-rich Andosol did not increase the topsoil but the subsoil carbon stock” by Antonia Zieger et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 27 November 2017

The authors have revised the manuscript very well. I have only some minor comments. 1) In the Abstract, please revise it in a concise way. For example, the main result is in the line 15, only a sentence. 2) Please give the full name of 'WRB' in page 4 Line 22. 3) In the Table 1, please give full information of 'Xox' in the table title in Page 5. Second, what is the unit for Alox and other mineral, g kg⁻¹ dry soil? or g kg⁻¹ organic C? 4) The similar description as abovementioned for Table 2 in Page 9. 5) In the result section, '3.2 sequential density fractionation' in Page 13 and Page 14, the description is not clear, please revise it in a concise way. 6) In the figure 2, I am wondering why the sampling depths at the two sites are different? 7) In Page 18, the methods and calculation description need to put in the material section? I am wondering why.

C1

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2017-386>, 2017.

C2