

# ***Interactive comment on “Massive carbon addition to an organic-rich Andosol did not increase the topsoil but the subsoil carbon stock” by Antonia Zieger et al.***

## **Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 27 November 2017

The authors have revised the manuscript very well. I have only some minor comments.

- 1) In the Abstract, please revise it in a concise way. For example, the main result is in the line 15, only a sentence.
- 2) Please give the full name of 'WRB' in page 4 Line 22.
- 3) In the Table 1, please give full information of 'Xox' in the table title in Page 5. Second, what is the unit for Alox and other mineral, g kg<sup>-1</sup> dry soil? or g kg<sup>-1</sup> organic C?
- 4) The similar description as abovementioned for Table 2 in Page 9.
- 5) In the result section, '3.2 sequential density fractionation' in Page 13 and Page 14, the description is not clear, please revise it in a concise way.
- 6) In the figure 2, I am wondering why the sampling depths at the two sites are different?
- 7) In Page 18, the methods and calculation description need to put in the material section? I am wondering why.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2017-386>, 2017.

**BGD**

---

Interactive  
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

