

Interactive comment on “Geochemistry of the dissolved loads of rivers in Southeast Coastal Region, China: Anthropogenic impact on chemical weathering and carbon sequestration” by Wenjing Liu et al.

L. Abril

gwenael.abril@u-bordeaux.fr

Received and published: 30 April 2018

Comment on Geochemistry of the dissolved loads of rivers in Southeast Coastal Region, China: Anthropogenic impact on chemical weathering and carbon sequestration
Liu et al. report here some interesting data and interpretations on chemical weathering in southern China; using classical geochemical analysis, they were able to quantify the respective contributions of different weathering reactions in the watersheds, including those impacted by humans through acid rain deposition. The paper fits well within

C1

the scope of the BG special issue and is based on appropriate methods. However, I found important anomalies concerning the way this paper refers to previous works by the same group on the same topics and in the same region, which makes its originality questionable. Indeed, the submitted paper presents many similarities with a paper published in 2016 (Liu et al. (2016) Water geochemistry of the Qiantangjiang River, East China: Chemical weathering and CO₂ consumption in a basin affected by severe acid deposition, Journal of Asian Earth Sciences Volume 127, 246-256), although the 2016 paper IS NOT CITED HERE. From my brief analysis of the two papers, I understood they were based on different datasets in different watersheds (although it is not clear if the dataset published in 2016 is included in the BGD paper or not, and why not). However the construction of the two papers is identical with many similarities in the text. In addition, figs. 2, 3, 4 and 6 in the submitted BGD paper (4 figures on 7 in total) are very similar from those in Liu et al. (2016) although with different data. In order to respect good practice in publishing scientific work, similarities in figures and text should be minimized, and the submitted paper should refer to previous similar works in the same region, citing and incorporating the information already available in the new paper, and extending its conclusion to a broader context. Since the approach and conclusions of the two papers are very similar, it is very odd that the Liu et al. (2016) is not cited and data from the Qiantangjiang River are not incorporated here or at least discussed in comparison with this new dataset.

Gwenaël Abril, BG associate editor, Editor of the special issue “Human impacts on carbon fluxes in Asian river systems”

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2018-109>, 2018.

C2