

Interactive comment on “Oxygen isotope composition of final chamber of planktic foraminifera provides evidence for vertical migration and depth integrated growth” by Hilde Pracht et al.

T. Toyofuku (Referee)

toyofuku@jamstec.go.jp

Received and published: 27 June 2018

This is a nice research that clearly verified their own constructed hypotheses under excellent research philosophy by accumulated precise data. The illustrations are also very beautiful and meaningful. The study should be published on "Biogeosciences". The broader audience of the journal will enjoy to read this article.

I have just small question. For Question 2 of P10L25, can you expect that the difference among size groups will become statistically significant as the number of samples

C1

increases?

It is quite happy for me if the comments are useful for authors what is indicated below.

P6L8 Put "2012" after Ishimura

P11L6 (Peeters et al., 1999) → Peeters et al. (1999)

P13L7 Be→Bé. Check other description about him through the manuscript. The both descriptions are found.

P13L11 Check the authors' name→Bé, A. W. H., Van Donk, J., Hecht, A. D., and Savin, S. M.: Oxygen-18 Studies of Recent Planktonic Foraminifera, *Science*, 173, 167-169, 1971.

P13L13 Put "a" after foraminifer Be, A. W. H., Spero, H. J., and Anderson, O. R.: Effects of symbiont elimination and reinfection on the life processes of the planktonic foraminifer "a" *Globigerinoides sacculifer*, *Marine Biology*, 70, 73-86, 1982.

P13L18-21 Same study is referred twice.

P13L22 Remove "-" from journal title: Bijma, J. and Hemleben, C.: Population dynamics of the planktonic foraminifer *Globigerinoides sacculifer* (Brady) from the central Red Sea, *Deep-Sea Research I*, 41, 485-510, 1994.

P13L24 Remove "a" from planktonic foraminifer "a"

P13L30 *Globigerinidae* is not italicized.

P14L1 Put Journal name, volume and pages. Brummer, G.-J. A., Hemleben, C., and Spindler, M.: Planktonic foraminiferal ontogeny and new perspectives for micropalaeontology, *Nature*, 319, 50, 1986.

P14L5 Caron et al. is published in 1982.

P14L10 Put page numbers for Davila and Hunt as 117-145.

C2

P14L11 Change to lower-case letters with the each word other than Oxygen. Remove additional ",," before "Science".

P14L17 Faber et al. is cited twice.

P14L24 "*Globorotalia truncatulinoides*" would be italicized.

P14L27 Pages would be 1337-"1349".

P14L31 Italisize "Orbulina universa"

P14L32 The page numbers would be "145-166".

P15L1 The volume and page numbers would be "30:141-171" for Hemleben and Spindler (1983).

P15L24 Check the usage of abbreviations about "Clim. Past Discuss". Other refer-ences are shown in full spells.

P15L27 Page numbers can be shown as "413-427".

P16L1 "1023–1031" will be shown. Check about double "2018".

P16L10 Check the title of Mix (1987). Isn't it "glaciation" instead of "deglaciation"? Show page numbers if it is possible.

P16L18 Show volume and page numbers of Peeters et al (2002). Maybe 34, 269-291. Remove double "2002".

P17L6 Check about double ",,".

P17L7 Put "The" at the beginning of journal title.

P17L28 Remove "2017" before page numbers.

P17L30 Remove "n/a-n/a,". "18" would be superscript.

P17L31 "18" would be superscript.

C3

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2018-146>, 2018.

C4