

Dear Editor,

We would like to thank you for your comment. In your comment you point out a common misconception, in which the depth at which organisms are recovered is mistakenly interpreted as also being the depth at which they calcify. As you rightfully indicate this is not necessarily so. This is also one of the main rationales underlying our study and we hoped that this is clear throughout the manuscript. Already at lines 67 and 68 of the original manuscript we hence tried to highlight the difference between living depth and calcification depth. This sentence is somewhat rephrased now to make this more clear and now reads: "Linking foraminiferal test chemistry with pore water chemistry requires in-depth knowledge of, 1) how early diagenesis in sediments affects pore water chemistry, 2) the habitat preference of the foraminiferal species, 3) foraminiferal migration (and the depth at which they calcify) within the uppermost sediment layer."

You also pointed out the differences in living depth between *Uvigerina peregrina* and *U. mediterranea*. At lines 366 and 368 we referred to *U. mediterranea* living deeper than *U. peregrina*, similar to your comment. This is now emphasized in the revised version at lines 359-361: "Both *Uvigerina mediterranea* and *M. barleanus* were in the Gulf of Lyons found to occupy shallow to intermediate infaunal habitat, with *U. peregrina* having a somewhat shallower infaunal habitat (Fontanier et al., 2008)". This is based on existing literature and counts on living foraminifera, which we do not dispute. We fully agree that the difference observed is more likely due to a difference in calcification depth. We indicated this at lines 372-374 of the original manuscript. See also lines 412-413 of the original manuscript, pertaining to the same.

For *Melonis barleanus* Mn uptake is fully in line with its deeper habitat, and depth habitat and calcification depth probably coincide. See also lines 386-387 and 450-452 of the original manuscript. Although we suggest that *M. barleanus* potentially "travels" more along a depth gradient in the sediment (lines 469-470), this would still be consistently deeper than the depth habitats of both *U. peregrina* and *U. mediterranea*. In the revised manuscript this is therefore now changed to: "This is in line with the depth habitat of *M. barleanus* being consistently deeper and this species traveling more actively through the redox zones than *U. mediterranea* or *U. peregrina*."

In the revised version we now also added at lines 390-394: "*Melonis barleanus*, generally considered an intermediate-infaunal species (Fontanier et al., 2002, 2008), contains the highest concentrations of Mn in its test, which is in line with the deepest habitat of the species studied here", to better reflect this fact.

We hope that our answers and the additional changes convince the editor to forward our manuscript.

Many thanks, also on behalf of all other co-authors,
Gert-Jan Reichart

Original review:

Dear Editor,

We are glad to have received two helpful sets of comments. Below we have copied the reviewer's comments one at the time and indicate how we have addressed them or (in a few cases) argue why we respectfully disagree. We would like you to consider the revised manuscript for publication in Biogeosciences.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 2 April 2018

This study looks at the potential for the Mn/Ca of benthic foraminiferal calcite to act as a proxy for pore water oxygenation and labile organic matter. In order to do this, the authors have measured the pore water chemistry as well as the Mn/Ca geochemistry of 4 species of benthic foraminifera from a depth transect of cores in the Mediterranean. Analysis focuses on the living foraminifera recovered from the upper 10 cm of each of these core sites. Ni Fhlaithearta et al., find that the Mn/Ca of benthic foraminifera reflects the pore water environment from which they calcified and the flux of organic material to the site. However, the amount of incorporation and variability in Mn/Ca incorporation is governed by species specific KD as well as ecological and depth preferences in addition to environmentally controlled pore-water conditions.

Overarching comments/questions: The authors analyzed select foraminifera species from specific core depths, however much of the article relies on speculation and inferences from existing literature as to the calcification or habitat depth of these same species. This is clearly extremely relevant to the interpretation of any pore water proxy. Is there a reason that species abundances with depth (at least for the relevant species) has not been included here? It would seem that inclusion of this could clarify some questions of habitat preference, and the degree to which this varies between sites.

Author's response: As referee 1 states, the species abundances with depth have not been added to this manuscript as they were published before already. Included in the manuscript is a brief reference to the average living depth (ALD₁₀), for *U. mediterranea* and *U. peregrina* (line 363-364). The species abundances in these samples have previously been reported in Fontanier et al., (2008). We are aware that it was recently published that partitioning with respect to Mn may vary between species (Barras et al., in press). This was not known at the time the discussion paper was submitted. We now added this to the discussion and refer to the recent paper by Barras et al. (in press) and added to the text:

New Lines 429-434: "Recently Barras et al. (2018), also using controlled growth experiments, showed however that Mn partitioning in *B. marginata* differs from that in *A. tepida*, with that in *B. marginata* being close to one and that of *A. tepida* being 4 times lower. Inter-specific differences are considerable and hence an impact of biomineralization on Mn incorporation can not be disregarded."

Authors's changes to the manuscript: A summary of the species abundances, based on Fontanier et al., (2008) table 5 of that paper, has been added to the text at lines 348-350: 'Both *Uvigerina mediterranea* and *M. barleanus* were in the Gulf of Lyons found to occupy shallow to intermediate infaunal habitat, with *U. peregrina* having a somewhat shallower infaunal habitat (Fontanier et al., 2008).'

It seems to me that the greatest barrier to application of these results to the fossil record is the issue of preservation. The authors discuss this clearly. However, I wonder if the research could not be even more impactful with a statement as to how this could be circumvented (at least in some environments). For example, did the authors undertake any comparative analyses of non-living and potentially altered specimens from the same cores? Could Mn-rich coatings be identified using the same LA techniques applied here to living foraminifera?

Author's response: One way to circumnavigate issues with preservation of the original Mn signal and hence the possibility to apply our approach to the fossil record, is by specifically targeting *H. elegans* for Mn/Ca measurements. The aragonitic nature of this organism prevents overgrowths. Such an approach was previously applied for the reconstruction of the paleo-environment during deposition sapropel S1 in the Mediterranean (Ni Fhlaithearta et al., 2010).

For the other species (*Uvigerina mediterranea*, *Uvigerina peregrina* and *Melonis barleanus*) studied in this paper it would potentially be possible to analyse fossil specimens using selection criteria (for example, degree of visible alteration, diagenetic Fe incorporation, etc.). With laser ablation measurements it is furthermore possible to adjust the analytical window in such a way as to exclude diagenetic coatings (based on the trace metal signature within the test wall), which has been described in several papers (e.g. Reichart et al., 2003).

Author's changes in the manuscript: We added to the discussion a sentence describing this potential approach at lines 307-312 'The fact that this study was based on living foraminifera circumvents potential complications due to Mn-rich coatings. Such coatings would likely not affect the aragonitic shell of *H. elegans* (Ní Fhlaithearta et al., 2010), but might interfere when analyzing fossil calcite shells. Still, a spatially resolved analytical technique like LA-ICP-MS allows detecting such coatings also in fossil specimens.'

27 – and 52-53 – “surface and bottom water” – consider rephrasing surface (pelagic or near-surface?), as most planktic foraminifera do not actually reflect surface conditions

Author Response: No reference to 'surface and bottom water' is seen at line 27. In line 52-53, 'surface' has been changed to 'pelagic'.

Author's changes to the manuscript: 52-53: 'Both pelagic and bottom water conditions...'

262 – What was the detection limit and how was it established?

The detection limit differs for each ablation and is a combination of the number of scans collected (acquisition time) and the background for a certain element. These levels are hence calculated using data reduction software for each single ablation profile. For Mn/Ca in the foraminiferal shells analysed here detection limits were on the order of 1.2 umol/mol. This is indicated in figure 6 of the manuscript.

367 – peregrina

Author Response: changed accordingly.

407 – what is the p value? If the correlation is not significant, is it still meaningful? Also for Fig. 7, can you include the p values?

The exact p-values is not calculated. The fact that it is over 0.05 indicates that, in view of the number of samples, it is not significant. This is stated in the manuscript. The correlation is indeed included as the high value hint towards a relationship. This is included because although a high p-value implies that a statistical significant correlation cannot be proven, it does not exclude a relation may still exist.

412-413- where was *U. peregrina* actually found in these sample? In relation to *U. mediterranea*?

Uvigerina mediterranea has indeed been classified as intermediate to shallow infaunal and *U. peregrina* as shallow infaunal at this location (Fontanier et al., 2008). The somewhat different incorporation of Mn in *U. peregrina* indeed suggests that it calcifies somewhat more shallow, which is in line with the microhabitat study. This is now clarified in the revised manuscript (lines 416-417).

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 27 May 2018

This manuscript aims to understand Mn incorporation into benthic foraminifera and explore its potential use for reconstructing pore water redox condition and organic matter content of sediments. Although the topic is potentially very interesting I have serious concerns about the analytical side of Laser ablation measurements. The authors should clarify these issues before 'interpretation/discussion' part of the manuscript can be evaluated. Therefore, I recommended major revision for this work. Below, I summarised the questions for the analytical part of the work. 1- Detection limits for Mn/Ca measurements. Mn values in ontogenetic (i.e. not altered) foraminiferal calcite is very low (umol/mols) which make it challenging to accurately quantify with laser ablation measurements. Usually in our lab we use large laser spot size and energy to get sufficient signal to noise ratio (>100). The authors in this study provided very basic description of analytical procedures in the method section, which overshadows the result and discussion as there is no assurance on the quality of the measurements.

We agree with the reviewer that the analyses of Mn in foraminiferal test is analytically challenging. We have invested much effort in improving this type of analyses since they were published for the first time (Reichert et al., 2003). Currently we are able to not only analyse Mn/Ca in benthic foraminifera, but are now also able to reliably analyse Mn/Ca in planktonic foraminifera (e.g. Steinhardt et al., 2014). The analytical procedures have been

described in detail in several publications, which we refer to (e.g. Koho et al., 2015; 2017). Matrix matched standards were used to verify the analytical procedures and consistency.

The main concern I have is lack of any estimation on detection limits of their method. Fig 2 shows typical ablation profile BUT the Mn signal to noise ratio is very low (<10). Such low noise to signal ratios usually correspond to very noisy measurements (large error bars), which in fact is a common feature of the data presented in this work (figs 5,6,7). In fig 6a, there are labels 'LD' which I presume indicate detection limits and they are 1umol/mol. If this is true detection limit then majority of the data presented in this work (in exception of data for Melonis) has very little analytical base. Simply it is too close to detection limits compared to error bars and therefore statistically indistinguishable from noise. The authors should really accurately estimate their errors in the background (LD = 2SD of the variance in the background signal) and also variance in the signal itself. This is crucial for interpretation of the data. For example, the summary in fig 7 as it presented now shows no trends as the errors are huge and horizontal line is the best solution for these plots. Note, if 1 umol/mol is the detection limit, then more than 60% of the data is within the error bar from the noise.

We are very much aware of the fact the analyses are close to the detection limit. For each profile the detection limit was calculated already according to the procedure suggested by the reviewer. We also know that part of the inter species variability will be due to analytical issues, which is exactly why we have discussed this as a separate issue. We have tried to rephrase this somewhat to accommodate the referees concern. Lines 480-482: 'Although the analyses of foraminiferal test Mn/Ca is challenging, which adds to the inter-specimen variability, we observe systematic differences between species in Mn/Ca variability.'

2- Inappropriate standards for calibration. The authors used NIST610 for Mn/Ca calibration. This standard has 400ppm of Mn, which is $>10,000$ times higher than typical foraminifera values. It is advisable to use NIST 612,614 pair for this kind of application to avoid artefacts/noise in calibration. The typical LA-ICPMS will give 3-5% reproducibility on NIST glass. Considering that calibration is one point calibration and 0=blank, the 5% variability at 400ppm will result in large variance at few ppbs level. Considering very low noise/signal ratio (see above) all propagated errors will cause huge variance in the resulting data. I am afraid this has to be fixed before discussing the science behind Mn incorporation into foraminifera.

When we would do these analyses today we might follow a different analytical approach. The reason for using the NIST610 standard at that time was the large range between species and with depth we had observed already. Moreover, studies into the fundamentals of laser ablation ICP-MS analyses at the ETH had at the time shown that the absorption behaviour of the lower concentrated NIST lead to significant different particle size distributions, which could influence results, especially when analyzing foraminiferal tests. We agree that for the lower concentrations pressed powders or an alternative matrix-matched standard might have been better. These analyses are, however, already performed some time ago and to our opinion we did all possible effort at that time to make sure we included as much cross-checks as possible. We used for instance a matrix-matched carbonate standard which we also analysed off line to check our results. The analyses have been performed in two independent laboratories (ETH, Switzerland and Utrecht University, The Netherlands), with different machines (Micromass Platform and Elan 6100) and using different software packages (Glitter and LamTrace). Results of cross calibrated samples were identical as well as the results of the matrix matched standard. The error is admittedly larger than what it would be when we do these analyses these days, but in view of the large observed differences they still are very useful. We have now added several lines to the methods section explaining the followed procedure and potential caveats at lines 181-185: 'For Mn this standard showed a precision better than 3% over all analyses, at ETH and UU, and with an offset of less than 5% from an off line determined (solution ICP-AES) concentration analyzing discrete sub-samples. The matrix matched standard is routinely included in the analyses and has been monitored since 2010 (Duenas Bohorquez et al., 2011).'

C2

Minor comments

- Measurements in the lab should be validated by their lab publication/s therefore sections 211-215 cannot assure the accuracy of the measurements. It has been mentioned in lines 181-182 that calcite standard were analysed for consistence. Data for this reproducibility will be the best indication of accuracy and reproducibility of the method and has to be reported.

The publications we refer to in lines 211-215 are actually from our lab. This is now indicated in this section and also a reference to Duenas Bohorquez et al. (2011), which gives data on the long time accuracy of standards. The accuracy for the matrix-matched calcite standard has been added to the manuscript at lines 181-185

- Section 2.5/2.5.1/2.5.2 (lines 217-239). It is necessary to break this down in sections if there are only 2 sentences in each section?
These sections have been combined into a single section 2.5.

1 **Manganese incorporation in living (stained) benthic foraminiferal**
2 **shells: A bathymetric and in-sediment study in the Gulf of Lions**
3 **(NW Mediterranean).**

4 Shauna Ní Fhlaithearta¹, Christophe Fontanier^{2, 3, 4}, Frans Jorissen⁴, Aurélia Mouret⁴,
5 Adriana Dueñas-Bohórquez¹, Pierre Anschutz², Mattias B. Fricker⁵, Detlef Günther⁵,
6 Gert J. de Lange¹, Gert-Jan Reichart^{1, 6}

7

8 ¹ Faculty of Geosciences, Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands.

9 ² EPOC, UMR CNRS 5805, University of Bordeaux, Pessac, France

10 ³ FORAM, Foraminiferal Study Group, F-29200, Brest, France

11 ⁴ Université d'Angers, LPG-BIAF, UMR CNRS 6112, 49045 Angers Cedex, France

12 ⁵ Laboratory of Inorganic Chemistry, ETH Zurich, 8093 Zurich, Switzerland.

13 ⁶ Royal NIOZ, Texel, The Netherlands

14

15 Corresponding author: S. Ní Fhlaithearta, s.ni.fhlaithearta@gmail.com

16 Keywords: Benthic foraminifera, minor/trace metals, calibration study, Gulf of Lions, Mn/Ca

17

18 **Abstract**

19 Manganese geochemistry in deep-sea sediments is known to vary greatly over the first
20 few centimeters, which overlaps with the in-sediment depth habitats of several benthic
21 foraminiferal species. Here we investigated manganese incorporation in benthic
22 foraminiferal shell carbonate across a 6-station depth transect in the Gulf of Lions, NW
23 Mediterranean to unravel the impacts of foraminiferal ecology and Mn pore water
24 geochemistry. Over this transect water depth increases from 350 to 1987 m, while
25 temperature (~13°C) and salinity (~38.5) remained relatively constant. Manganese
26 concentrations in the tests of living (Rose Bengal stained) benthic foraminiferal
27 specimens of *Hoeglundina elegans*, *Melonis barleeanus*, *Uvigerina mediterranea*,
28 *Uvigerina peregrina* were measured using laser ablation inductively coupled mass
29 spectrometry (laser ablation ICP-MS). Pore water manganese concentrations show a
30 decrease from shallow to deeper waters, which corresponds to a generally decreasing

31 organic matter flux with water depth. Differences in organic matter loading at the
32 sediment water interface affects oxygen penetration depth into the sediment and hence
33 Mn pore water profiles. Mn/Ca values for the investigated foraminiferal species reflect
34 pore water geochemistry and species-specific microhabitat in the sediment. The
35 observed degree of variability within a single species is in-line with know ranges in
36 depth habitat and gradients in redox conditions. Both Mn/Ca ratio and inter-specific
37 variability hence reflect past Mn cycling and related early diagenetic processes within
38 the sediment, making this a potential tool for bottom-water oxygenation and organic-
39 matter fluxes. Dynamics of both in-sediment foraminiferal depth habitats and Mn
40 cycling, however, limit the application of such a proxy to settings with relatively stable
41 environmental conditions.

42

43 **1. Introduction**

44
45 Reconstructing past climate and environmental change largely depends on so-called
46 proxies. These proxies relate measurable variables in the geological record to target
47 parameters, such as e.g. temperature, biological productivity and bottom water
48 oxygenation. The carbonate shells of unicellular protists, foraminifera, are one of the
49 most utilized signal carriers for reconstructing past environments. Both the census data
50 of foraminifera and the geochemical composition of the shells are used in this context.
51 The geochemical composition of the shells is investigated for their stable isotopic
52 composition as well as for their trace and minor element incorporation. Both pelagic
53 and bottom water conditions are reconstructed this way, using planktonic and benthic
54 foraminiferal species respectively.

55 Most existing calibrations of trace element uptake in foraminiferal test
56 carbonate are based on comparing their composition with bottom water conditions

Deleted:

58 (Elderfield et al., 2006; Nürnberg et al., 1996; Yu and Elderfield, 2007). Many benthic
59 foraminiferal species live, however, within the sediment and precipitate their calcium
60 carbonate test in contact with pore water. As a result, the trace metal composition of
61 pore water exerts a control on the uptake of trace metals in their test. This effectively
62 links benthic foraminiferal microhabitat preference and pore water chemistry. On the
63 one hand, this creates complications when using foraminiferal trace metal ratios for
64 reconstructing bottom water conditions, whereas on the other hand, it offers the
65 possibility to develop proxies of pore water chemistry in the past.

66 Linking foraminiferal test chemistry with pore water chemistry requires in-
67 depth knowledge of, 1) how early diagenesis in sediments affects pore water chemistry,
68 2) the habitat preference of the foraminiferal species, 3) foraminiferal migration (and
69 **the depth at which they calcify**) within the uppermost sediment layer. In principle, the
70 chemical composition of living (stained) benthic foraminifera will reflect all these
71 processes.

72 For many elements an important inter-specific difference in uptake of trace
73 metals has been observed (Hintz et al., 2006; Wit et al., 2012; **Barras et al., 2018**), a so-
74 called vital effect. This implies that in addition to ecology and pore water geochemistry,
75 trace metal partitioning also needs to be taken into consideration. This requires a
76 comparative study between locations where all three of these aspects have been
77 quantified.

78 Reconstructing past pore water trace metal profiles is important since it provides
79 valuable information on organic carbon degradation and recycling of nutrients at the
80 seafloor (Van Cappellen and Wang, 1996; De Lange, 1986). Such diagenetically
81 controlled trace metal profiles are used in quantitative models constraining oceanic

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted: calcification

Formatted: Highlight

83 carbon fluxes and burial (Wang and Van Cappellen, 1996). Knowledge of such profiles
84 in the past could thus help to reconstruct past carbon cycles.

85 Benthic foraminiferal species have a specific preference for their depth-habitat
86 (Jorissen et al., 1995). Some benthic foraminiferal species are limited to a very narrow
87 environmental in-sediment range, for example, along redox fronts, whereas others have
88 a wider distribution, thriving under variable conditions and consequently occupy a
89 broader niche. These differences in depth-habitat preferences could be related to the
90 presence of different types of metabolism (Koho et al., 2011; Risgaard-Petersen et al.,
91 2006). As such, trace metal profiles and foraminiferal in-sediment depth habitat can be
92 related, such as recently proposed in a conceptual (TROXCHEM³) model for the redox
93 sensitive element, manganese, by Koho et al. (2015). Studying the interplay between
94 benthic foraminiferal habitat preference and incorporation of redox-sensitive trace
95 elements is key to verifying such models.

96 Studying manganese bound in foraminiferal shell carbonate lies at the
97 intersection of foraminiferal ecology and early diagenesis in sediments. Manganese is
98 a redox sensitive element and exists as Mn- (hydr)oxides in the presence of oxygen. As
99 oxygen concentrations in the sediment decreases due to ongoing organic matter
100 remineralization, Mn-(hydr)oxides are reduced to aqueous Mn²⁺, (Froelich et al., 1979).
101 Manganese in sediments cycles continuously between solid and aqueous state as a result
102 of upward diffusion of Mn²⁺ and consequent remineralization to Mn-(hydr)oxides.
103 Hence proxy studies must account for both ecological controls, like foraminiferal
104 habitat preference, as well as geochemical controls like oxygen concentrations and
105 organic matter loading (Glock et al., 2012; Groeneveld and Filipsson, 2013; Koho et
106 al., 2015, 2017; McKay et al., 2015; Reichart et al., 2003). Notably, both benthic
107 foraminifera and trace metal geochemistry react to organic matter recycling and bottom

108 water oxygenation (Jorissen et al., 1995). This implies that locations with contrasting
109 conditions, both low and high bottom-water oxygenation as well as low and high
110 productivity, are required for testing. Whereas most of these studies focused on the role
111 of bottom water oxygenation in relatively oxygen poor settings, here we focus on the
112 well-oxygenated western Mediterranean.

113 In this study we combine pore water geochemistry, foraminiferal habitat
114 preference and test geochemistry in an area characterized by well-oxygenated bottom
115 water conditions and average productivity. Results are compared with earlier studies
116 from high productivity regimes and low-oxygen conditions at the sediment-water
117 interface (e.g. Arabian Sea, Koho et al., 2015 and Mediterranean sapropel deposition,
118 Ní Fhlaithearta et al., 2010). Specifically, we investigate the link between manganese
119 incorporation and benthic foraminiferal ecology and compare this to the recently
120 proposed TROXCHEM³ model (Koho et al., 2015). Four species of living (stained)
121 foraminifera were sampled along a 6-station bathymetric transect in the Gulf of Lions,
122 NW Mediterranean. Individuals were picked from a series of in-sediment depths and
123 analyzed by laser ablation ICP-MS, enabling multiple analyses of single specimens.

124

125 **2. Material and methods**

126

127 **2.1 Study area and sediment sampling**

128 Cores were collected with a classical Barnett multicorer (Barnett et al. 1984) at 6
129 stations in the Gulf of Lions (NW Mediterranean) during the August-September 2006
130 BEHEMOTH cruise (Fig. 1, Table 1). The 6 stations describe a bathymetric transect
131 from 350m to 1987m depth. The shallowest site, station F, is bathed in Mediterranean
132 Intermediate Water (MIW). Stations E (552 m) and D (745 m) are positioned at the

133 transition of MIW and Western Mediterranean Deep Water (WMDW). Stations C (980
134 m), B (1488 m) and A (1987 m) are bathed by the WMDW. Bottom water temperature
135 is stable through the part of the water column studied here (~13.1°C) (Xavier Durrieu
136 de Madron, pers. com.). Salinity ranges between 38.4 and 38.5. The multicorer allowed
137 sampling of the first decimeters of the sediment, the overlying bottom waters, and an
138 undisturbed sediment-water interface. Cores were sliced for foraminiferal studies with
139 a 0.5-cm resolution down to 4 cm, followed by 1 cm slices down to 10 cm depth.
140 Sediments were put in an ethanol-Rose Bengal mixture (95% ethanol with 1g/l Rose
141 Bengal), in order to identify living (stained) specimens. For more detailed information
142 about methods, please consult Fontanier et al., (2008).

143

144

145 **2.2 Pore water geochemistry**

146 Sediment sampling for pore water extraction was carried out under an inert atmosphere
147 (N₂). Hereafter, samples were centrifuged at 3500 rpm for 20 min. The supernatant was
148 filtered and acidified (HNO₃ *s.p.*) for analyzing dissolved metals. Dissolved Mn
149 concentrations were determined with flame atomic absorption spectrometry (Perkin
150 Elmer AA 300). Precision for this method is ± 5%. A pore water subsample was also
151 analyzed for Mn using ICP-MS (Agilent 7500 Series). Relative precision for this
152 method is 3%. Total alkalinity of pore water was measured at Utrecht University using
153 an automated titrator (702 SM Titrino, Metrohm) making Gran plots. Dissolved
154 Inorganic Carbon (DIC) was measured using a Dissolved Carbon Analyser (Shimadzu,
155 Model TOC-5050A). Carbonate ion concentrations were calculated using the CO2SYS
156 software (version 01.05; Lewis and Wallace, 1998). Analytical uncertainty for the
157 alkalinity is about 10 µeq, relative standard deviation for the DIC analyses is 0.8%.

158 Oxygen concentration profiles were determined using Clark-type
159 microelectrodes (Unisense©, Denmark). Labile organic matter was derived from the
160 sum of lipids, amino acids and sugars measured in the top cm of sediment; for details,
161 see Fontanier et al., 2008.

162

163 **2.3 Foraminiferal trace metal geochemistry**

164 Foraminiferal trace element concentrations were determined using two laser ablation
165 ICP-MS systems. Prior to laser ablation, all samples were gently cleaned in methanol
166 (x1) and UHQ water (x4). Between each rinse, the samples were placed in a sonic bath
167 for several seconds to thoroughly clean the tests. Benthic foraminifera from 745 m
168 (station D), 980 m (station C), 1488 m (station B) and 1987 m (station A) were
169 measured at Utrecht University using a deep UV (193nm) ArF excimer laser (Lambda
170 Physik) with GeoLas 200Q optics. Ablation was performed at a pulse repetition rate of
171 10 Hz, and energy density of 1.4 J/cm², with a crater size of 80µm. Ablated particles
172 were measured by a quadrupole ICP-MS (Micromass Platform) equipped with a
173 collision and reaction cell. Such a collision and reaction cell improves carbonate
174 analyses by eliminating interferences on mass 44. Scanned masses included ²⁴Mg, ²⁶Mg,
175 ²⁷Al, ⁴²Ca, ⁴³Ca, ⁵⁵Mn, ⁸⁸Sr, ¹³⁷Ba, ¹³⁸Ba, ²⁰⁸Pb. Benthic foraminifera from stations F (350
176 m) and E (552 m) were analyzed at ETH-Zurich (due to laboratory renovations at
177 Utrecht University). The laser type and ablation parameters were identical to those
178 detailed above. The ablated particles were measured using a quadrupole ICP-MS
179 (ELAN 6100 DRC, Perkin-Elmer). In both cases, calibration was performed using an
180 international standard (NIST610) with Ca as an internal standard (Jochum et al. 2011).
181 The same masses as measured in Utrecht were monitored, in addition to ⁷Li, ²³Na, ⁴⁷Ti,
182 ⁶⁰Ni, ⁶¹Ni and ⁸⁹Y. Inter-laboratory compatibility was monitored using a matrix-matched

183 calcite standard. For Mn this standard showed a precision better than 3% over all
184 analyses, at ETH and UU, and with an offset of less than 5% from an off line determined
185 (solution ICP-AES) concentration analyzing discrete sub-samples. The matrix matched
186 standard is routinely included in the analyses and has been monitored since 2010
187 (Duenas Bohorquez et al., 2011).

Formatted: Highlight

188 Analytical error (equivalent to 1 sigma), based on repeated measurement of an
189 external standard, was <5% for reported elements. Each laser ablation measurement
190 was screened for contamination by monitoring Al and Pb. On encountering surface
191 contamination, the data integration interval was adjusted to exclude any Al or Pb
192 enrichment. Cross-plots between Al and Pb versus Mn showed that they are unrelated,
193 confirming accuracy of the integrations.

194 During the laser ablation analyses the different trace elements were monitored
195 with respect to time, thus representing a cross section of the test wall. This allows not
196 only quantification of the different trace metals of interest, but also to observe
197 variability within individual tests. Each species has a distinct test-wall thickness,
198 permitting the study of intra-test variability. A typical ablation profile for *H. elegans* is
199 shown in Fig. 2.

200

201 **2.4 Analyses of manganese in foraminiferal tests**

202 Contamination and presence of secondary Mn-rich coatings on benthic foraminiferal
203 tests has been a longstanding challenge in trace metal analyses of benthic foraminifera
204 (Boyle 1983, Lea and Boyle 1989). In this study the trace metal data are based
205 exclusively on living (Rose Bengal stained) foraminifera, which effectively rules out
206 the impact of Mn-rich coatings on trace metal concentrations. At the time of
207 sampling, the collected tests were still enveloped by foraminiferal cytoplasm,

208 preventing the formation of extraneous inorganic precipitates. Although benthic
209 foraminifera live within the sediment, their test is physically separated from the
210 environment as they are enveloped in an organic sheath (Ní Fhlaithearta et al., 2013).
211 In case a recently deceased foraminifer was mistakenly analyzed (still with sufficient
212 protoplasm to stain with Rose Bengal) the Mn oxide would not only have had limited
213 time to develop, but it would also show up as a Mn spike at the start of a laser ablation
214 profile. The ablation profiles confirm that no Mn-rich phases are present at the test
215 surfaces (Fig. 2).

216 Comparing LA-ICP-MS data with traditional solution analyses for foraminiferal
217 Mg/Ca values showed that data are directly comparable (Rosenthal et al., 2011). Also
218 for trace metals such as Ni²⁺, Cu²⁺ and Mn²⁺, cross-calibration of LA-ICP-MS and
219 micro-XRF shows those analytical results are robust (Munsel et al., 2010).

220

221 **2.5 Benthic foraminiferal Mn/Ca**

222 Manganese incorporation in benthic foraminiferal test carbonate was analyzed from 4
223 different species (*Hoeglundina elegans*, *Melonis barleeanus*, *Uvigerina mediterranea*,
224 *Uvigerina peregrina*), from 6 coring sites, for up to 9 depths in the sediment. Sample
225 coverage for all stations is described in Table 2. Descriptive statistics are presented in
226 Table 3.

227 From the largest taxon, *Uvigerina mediterranea*, 3-4 analyses were routinely carried
228 out per test, and no trend in Mn/Ca values was seen in consecutive growth stages. From
229 the other species two analyses were performed per test. The resolution of the ablation
230 profiles themselves does not allow quantifying changes in trace metals within the test
231 wall. Still, comparing the data within individual ablation profiles shows that the
232 intratest variability is generally limited for Mn (Table 4). As the ablation profiles target

Deleted: ¶
2.5.1 Intra-individual variability ¶

235 one chamber mostly, this does not include the full potential range. Comparing different
236 ablation profiles between chambers in a single shell would circumvent this, but this data
237 is somewhat limited.

238 Boxplots are used to describe the range of Mn/Ca values and how the distribution,
239 median, average and skewness compares between species. All ICP-MS measurements
240 are included, and as such represent both intra- and inter-individual variation.

241

242 3. Results

243 3.1 Pore water data

244 Pore water dissolved manganese (Mn^{2+}) concentrations were measured at all six
245 stations. Manganese concentrations increase below the oxygen penetration depth at
246 stations C and D (Fig. 3), with the highest in-sediment Mn^{2+} concentrations reached at
247 station D. At stations E and F manganese concentrations remain low after crossing the
248 oxygen penetration depth. At stations A and B the oxygen penetration depth and
249 MnO_2/Mn^{2+} redox boundary are deeper than 10 cm's. Dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC)
250 and total alkalinity (TA), were measured at stations E, C and B (Fig. 4). At stations D,
251 C and E, DIC concentrations in the top 10 cm have a similar range (2350-2700
252 $\mu\text{mol/kg}$). The DIC profile at station B has a narrower range, ranging from 2400-2550
253 $\mu\text{mol/kg}$. Total alkalinity values range from 3242 $\mu\text{mol/kg}$ at station E to a minimum
254 of 2774 at station B. Carbonate ion concentrations [CO_3^{2-}] were derived based on TA
255 and DIC values. The [CO_3^{2-}] profiles were relatively similar (Fig. 4) for stations E and
256 C and B. Values for all three stations ranged from a maximum of 419 $\mu\text{mol/kg}$ at station
257 E to a minimum of 192 $\mu\text{mol/kg}$ at station C (Fig. 4).

Deleted: ¶
2.5.2 Distribution characteristics of Mn/Ca in benthic
foraminiferal calcite¶

Deleted: .

262 **3.2 Mn/Ca data**

263 **3.2.1 Intra-individual variability**

264 For most species some Mn/Ca analyses were below detection limit, except for *M.*
265 *barleeanus*, which contained measurable quantities of Mn in all shells analyzed. This
266 was most evident for *H. elegans*, where all but three Mn/Ca measurements were below
267 detection limit (dl). *Uvigerina peregrina* had a wider range of Mn/Ca values than *U.*
268 *mediterranea*. *Melonis barleeanus* exhibited the largest range of Mn/Ca values of the
269 four studied species (Fig. 5). For all species, except *H. elegans*, values are somewhat
270 skewed towards higher values.

271

272 **3.2.3 Foraminiferal Mn/Ca variation across a depth transect**

273 A trend of decreasing manganese incorporation with increasing water depth (350-1987
274 m) is most clearly visible in *M. barleeanus* (Fig. 6), except that the maximum values
275 are observed at station E at 552 m. *Melonis barleeanus* shows the highest Mn/Ca values
276 and the largest Mn/Ca variability. Station E registers the broadest Mn/Ca variability,
277 which decreases with increasing water depth. *U. peregrina* also exhibits the largest
278 variability in Mn/Ca values at station E. For *U. peregrina*, Mn²⁺ incorporation decreases
279 from 350 m to 1987 m, except for station D (745 m), where Mn/Ca values (between the
280 10 – 90th percentile) are approximately equivalent to those at station A (350 m; Fig. 6).
281 For *U. mediterranea* a trend of decreasing Mn incorporation with increasing depth is
282 found in specimens of *U. mediterranea* from the sediments at 552, 745 and 980 m. The
283 highest values are reached at the shallowest station (350 m). Station E is also marked
284 by the highest minimum Mn/Ca values for *U. mediterranea*. At station A only two *U.*
285 *mediterranea* measurements are above the detection limit. *Hoeglundina elegans* shells
286 from three stations (350 m, 1488 m and 1987 m) were analyzed, however, all but three

287 measurements were below detection limit (Fig. 6). These slightly elevated values were
288 recorded at the shallowest station (station F). These Mn/Ca values are still very low
289 compared to ranges in Mn/Ca values observed for the other species (Fig. 6).

290 Variability in Mn/Ca increases together with the overall Mn/Ca concentration
291 within benthic foraminiferal species (Table 4). This suggests that even at those stations
292 and depth levels where the highest Mn concentrations are recorded, individuals with
293 relatively low amounts of Mn in their calcitic test were found. Comparing relative
294 standard deviations, as a measure for the inter-specimen variability, for the different
295 stations and species suggests that with increasing Mn concentration for *M. barleeanus*
296 and *U. mediterranea* variability increases, whereas for *U. peregrina* it decreases.

297

298 **3.2.4 In-sediment variation**

299 For most species Mn/Ca values are more or less constant with in-sediment depth (Fig.
300 3). However, *M. barleeanus* shows increasing Mn/Ca values with in-sediment depth.
301 This is most apparent at the shallowest station (station F - 350 m) (Fig. 3d).

302

303 **4. Discussion**

304

305 Incorporation of Mn in benthic foraminiferal carbonate depends both on foraminiferal
306 ecology and early diagenesis in sediments. Although other factors such as temperature,
307 sea water carbonate chemistry, growth rate etc., might also affect the uptake of Mn in
308 the shell carbonate (Koho et al., 2017), these effects are most likely several orders of
309 magnitude smaller compared to the large range in dissolved Mn in pore water. Since
310 pore water Mn is the dominant factor controlling Mn incorporation, studies must
311 account for ecological controls, like foraminiferal depth habitat preference, as well as

312 for geochemical controls like oxygen concentrations and organic matter fluxes (Koho
313 et al., 2015; De Lange, 1986; Reichart et al., 2003). The fact that this study was based
314 on living foraminifera circumvents potential complications due to Mn-rich coatings.
315 Such coatings would likely not affect the aragonitic shell of *H. elegans* (Ní Fhlaithearta
316 et al., 2010), but might interfere when analyzing fossil calcite shells. Still, a spatially
317 resolved analytical technique like LA-ICP-MS allows detecting such coatings also in
318 fossil specimens.

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Italic, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

319

320 **4.1 Impact of redox conditions and foraminiferal habitat preference** 321 **on Mn incorporation**

322 In general, flux of organic matter arriving at the sea floor decreases with increasing
323 water depth, due to ongoing degradation during settling (Arndt et al., 2013 and
324 references therein). Consequently, redox boundaries within the sediment generally also
325 deepen as a function of water depth, as oxygen consumption in the sediment decreases.
326 Such a fundamental organic matter-depth relation is in line with the much deeper
327 oxygen penetration depths at stations A and B compared to the more shallow stations.
328 At station F the relative shallow oxygen penetration depth observed is in line with its'
329 relative shallow water depth, although the organic matter which arrives here at the
330 seafloor apparently undergoes winnowing (Fontanier et al., 2008). The organic matter
331 along the transect studied is concentrated at a so-called depocenter, which largely
332 coincides with the depths of stations C and D (Fontanier et al., 2008). As bottom waters
333 at all stations are well oxygenated, organic matter concentration can be considered the
334 main control for redox conditions at stations F-A, with the amount of organic matter
335 arriving at the seabed being regulated by water depth and sedimentary processes, such
336 as focusing versus winnowing.

337 At stations C, D and F, the oxygen penetration depth and the Mn²⁺ redox
338 boundaries are at the same depth, as expected. Station F shows the shallowest OPD of
339 all stations, although the organic matter concentration is relatively low. One explanation
340 for this observation is that a lower porosity at F (56% versus 76% and 79 % at stations
341 D and E, respectively) impedes oxygen diffusion through the sediment. Alternatively,
342 the pore water profile reflects an earlier organic matter deposition event, with this
343 organic matter being largely consumed at the time of sampling. The pore water profiles
344 require more time to re-equilibrate to the new conditions (Burdige and Gieskes, 1983).
345 At station E there is a mismatch between oxygen penetration depth and the Mn²⁺ redox
346 boundary as the Mn²⁺ redox boundary is considerably deeper than the OPD. Although
347 this is in line with the observed higher bioirrigation at this station (Fontanier et al.,
348 2008), this might reflect non-equilibrium conditions as well.

349 The vertical distribution of benthic foraminiferal species varies between
350 stations, in accordance with organic matter concentrations and redox zonation, which
351 is consistent with the TROX model (Jorissen et al., 1995; Fontanier et al., 2008). In
352 case of a shallower redox zone, infaunal benthic foraminifera biomineralize in contact
353 with Mn-enriched pore water, with highest dissolved manganese concentrations
354 occurring just below the oxygen penetration depth at all stations, except for station E
355 (552 m). This is in contrast to low bottom-water oxygen environments often studied in
356 the context of proxy development studies, where pore water Mn²⁺ is released from the
357 pore water (Koho et al., 2015, 2017; Mangini et al., 2001).

358 The species studied here cover the range of shallow-infauna to intermediate-
359 infauna niches. Both *Uvigerina mediterranea* and *M. barleeanus* were in the Gulf of
360 Lyons found to occupy shallow to intermediate infaunal habitat, with *U. peregrina*
361 having a somewhat shallower infaunal habitat (Fontanier et al., 2008). *Hoeglundina*

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Italic, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Italic, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted:

363 *elegans*, a typically shallow infaunal species, is often found close to the sediment-water
364 interface (Jorissen et al., 1998; Schönfeld 2001; Fontanier et al., 2002; Fontanier et al.,
365 2008) and contains the lowest concentration of Mn in its test. Only at the shallowest
366 station (350 m) three specimens of *H. elegans* show concentrations above the detection
367 level, with values still low compared to the values observed for the other species (Fig.
368 6). In the Bay of Biscay Reichart et al. (2003) also suggested that elevated Mn
369 concentrations in *H. elegans* were confined to stations with oxygen depleted bottom
370 waters and/or with a shallow oxygen penetration depth. *Uvigerina mediterranea* and
371 *Uvigerina peregrina* are also classed as shallow-infaunal species; they are typically
372 found within the top few centimeters of the sediment column (Fontanier et al. 2002,
373 Fontanier et al. 2008). The calculated average living depth (ALD₁₀) as calculated in
374 Fontanier et al. (2008) is consistently shallower than the ALD₁₀ for *U. mediterranea*.
375 This is at odds with previous reports suggesting *U. peregrina* has a slightly deeper
376 microhabitat than *U. mediterranea* (Fontanier et al. 2002; 2006). That *U. peregrina* has
377 a deeper microhabitat is further supported by the usual distinct $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ offset in *U.*
378 *peregrina*, which is more depleted compared to *U. mediterranea* (Schmiedl et al., 2004;
379 Fontanier et al, 2002, 2006). The higher Mn/Ca values observed here for *U. peregrina*
380 (Figure 6) supports the idea that it calcifies somewhat deeper in the sediment compared
381 to *U. mediterranea*. Alternatively, *U. peregrina* may migrate downwards within
382 burrows to track food resources, recording redox steepness (Loubere et al., 1995). This
383 could highlight a disparity between the assumed living depth (the depth interval of
384 recovery) and biomineralization depth of foraminifera. Still, this would also result in a
385 higher variability of Mn/Ca values at higher Mn/Ca levels, which is not observed.
386 Hence, more likely the observed disparity between the geochemical signals
387 incorporated into foraminiferal calcite and depth of recovery in *U. peregrina* reflects

388 opportunistic behaviour, with calcification at a shallower in-sediment depth in response
389 to more favourable conditions after e.g. seasonal peaks in organic matter fluxes
390 (Accornero et al., 2003), when the OPD is close to the sediment water interface.

391 *Melonis barleeanus*, generally considered an intermediate-infaunal species
392 (Fontanier et al., 2002, 2008), contains the highest concentrations of Mn in its test,
393 which is in line with the deepest habitat of the species studied here. Manganese
394 incorporation in this species increases with increasing labile organic matter (Fig. 7a).

395 In summary, the habitat preference of the benthic foraminiferal species studied
396 here is reflected in the Mn/Ca values recorded in their tests. This is in contrast with
397 other results showing lower Mn/Ca values in foraminiferal tests with shallower redox
398 fronts (Koho et al., 2015). This, however, critically depends on the Mn being released
399 to the water column, which only occurs when the bottom waters are disoxic. In case of
400 a seasonal organic matter deposition event, an increase of Mn concentration in
401 foraminiferal test carbonate would initially occur in the deeper and ultimately also in
402 the more shallow calcifying foraminifera. This is in line with the conceptual
403 TROXCHEM³ model, with the conditions studied here falling within the first stage of
404 the temporal succession considered in the model. Bottom water remains well
405 oxygenated (O₂ concentrations at the study area: 199-219 μmol/l (Fontanier et al.,
406 2008)) and organic matter loading is controlling Mn²⁺ concentrations in the sediment.
407 To what extent species are high in Mn/Ca depends on living depth and opportunistic
408 behavior.

409 At a given location, a benthic foraminiferal species' depth preference or
410 biomineralization depth, is reflected in its average Mn/Ca value (Fig. 5). The trend
411 across a depth transect shows a strong correlation to labile organic matter
412 concentrations in the surface sediments (Fig. 7). The strong correlation between labile

Formatted: Highlight

413 organic matter (i.e. sedimentary lipid content) and Mn incorporation in shallow and
414 intermediate infaunal species *U. mediterranea* ($R^2 = 0.80$ ($p < 0.05$)) suggests that test
415 Mn has potential as a proxy for detecting past labile organic matter fluxes. Notably,
416 *M. barleeanus* has a very strong correlation (0.81), though this correlation lacks
417 statistical significance ($p > 0.05$). In contrast, *U. peregrina* shows a correlation
418 coefficient of only 0.45 (R^2) between test Mn and labile organic matter. *Uvigerina*
419 *peregrina* is reported to respond opportunistically to the concentration and quality of
420 organic matter produced during bloom events (Fontanier et al., 2003; Koho et al., 2008;
421 Barras et al., 2010). This response is in the form of increased reproduction and growth.

422 Perhaps *U. peregrina* calcifies preferentially at shallower depths and therefore does not
423 capture the full Mn^{2+} gradient.

424 At low oxygen concentrations Mn is released through the reduction of
425 manganese (oxy)hydroxides. Here we show an increase in Mn/Ca incorporation in
426 several species, from shallow to intermediate-depth infaunal habitats, as a function of
427 oxygen penetration depth. Such a correlation agrees with studies by Ní Fhlaithearta et
428 al. (2010) and McKay et al. (2015) from a down core record of Mn/Ca_{H. elegans} during the
429 formation of sapropel (S1) in the Eastern Mediterranean and a paleoproductivity study
430 of an upwelling system in the NE Atlantic, respectively. Here, a comparison of Mn
431 (oxy)hydroxides in the sediment and foraminiferal Mn^{2+} showed that Mn^{2+}
432 incorporation in an epifaunal to shallow infaunal species was higher during times of
433 enhanced Mn^{2+} remobilization and hence higher pore water Mn^{2+} . Such a correlation,
434 however, requires that the bottom waters remain somewhat oxygenated to retain the
435 dissolved Mn^{2+} in the pore water. With disoxic bottom waters Mn^{2+} escapes the
436 porewater and foraminiferal Mn/Ca values decrease (Koho et al., 2015). However, with
437 high organic matter deposition, which might be concentrated in events, also

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted: depths

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted:

440 foraminiferal species living at or close to the sediment water interface may show
441 elevated Mn concentrations.

442 In addition to the here observed changes, biomineralization could affect Mn²⁺
443 incorporation. In a controlled laboratory study by Munsel et al (2010) Mn
444 incorporation in *Ammonia tepida* increased with increasing Mn²⁺ concentrations in the
445 culture water and the partition coefficient was well above 1. The lack of an
446 appreciable discrimination argues against a major biomineralization impact on Mn²⁺

447 partitioning. Recently Barras et al. (2018), also using controlled growth experiments,
448 showed, however, that Mn partitioning in *B. marginata* differs from that in *A. tepida*,
449 with that in *B. marginata* being close to one and that of *A. tepida* being 4 times lower.
450 Inter-specific differences are considerable and hence an impact of biomineralization
451 on Mn incorporation can not be disregarded.

452 In summary, Mn incorporation seems primarily controlled by pore water
453 conditions in close proximity to the test, biomineralization and with a secondary
454 control determined by the ability of a foraminifer to seasonally calcify and migrate
455 within the sediment.

456 4.2 Pore water Mn dynamics and foraminiferal migration within the sediment

458 Manganese is incorporated in foraminiferal carbonate with a partition coefficient (D)
459 close to 1, or somewhat lower (Munsel et al., 2010; Barras et al., 2018). We calculated
460 Mn partition coefficients for *U. mediterranea*, *U. peregrina* and *M. barleeanus* at
461 stations E, C and B (Table 6) based on average Mn/Ca_{foram} and average Mn/Ca_{pore water}
462 values found above the Mn²⁺-MnO(H) redox boundary. Calculated D_{Mn} agrees with the
463 previously reported D_{Mn} by Munsel et al., (2010), with values varying between ~1-2 for
464 *U. mediterranea* and *U. peregrina*. The Mn partition coefficient for *Melonis barleeanus*
465 ranges from ~4-7. The partition coefficient for this species most likely reflects its

Deleted: To date, however, no studies have been carried out under controlled conditions to constrain species-specific offsets in Mn incorporation.

Deleted: y

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Italic, Underline, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Italic, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted: Also our data does not suggest a major impact of biomineralization on Mn incorporation

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted: , which argues for a minor biomineralization control

474 capacity to calcify under dysoxic conditions, close to or even below the oxygen
475 penetration depth. Still, this calculation is based on two assumptions: (1) the depth
476 foraminifera are recovered from during sampling corresponds with the average depth
477 of calcification and, (2) variation in pore water is limited. Establishing species specific
478 Mn partitioning coefficients using culture experiments might, however, be needed for
479 unlocking the full potential of this proxy (Barras et al., 2018).

Formatted: Highlight

480 A foraminifer calcifying within a steep Mn²⁺ gradient is exposed to a higher
481 range of Mn²⁺ concentrations (over a fixed depth interval) compared to specimens living
482 along a more gradual Mn²⁺ concentration gradient. Since foraminifera can migrate
483 through the sediment as a response to food availability and oxygen concentrations (Alve
484 and Bernhard 1995; Gross, 2000), not only the slope of the Mn gradient, but also the
485 in-sediment depth range (microhabitat) of the foraminifer in relation to the Mn redox
486 boundary, should be considered (Fig. 8). Although the analyses of foraminiferal test

Formatted: Highlight

487 Mn/Ca is challenging, which adds to the inter-specimen variability, we observe
488 systematic differences between species in Mn/Ca variability. A shallow-infauna
489 species, with a limited in-sediment range, would be expected to exhibit lower variability
490 than an intermediate- infauna species, which possibly migrates considerably in depth.
491 This is exemplified at station F (350 m) where we note an increase in foraminiferal test
492 Mn/Ca variability at 2 cm depth, consistent with the oxygen penetration depth at that
493 station (Fig. 3). Moreover, the variability in Mn/Ca values increases towards higher
494 Mn/Ca values. This is in line with the depth habitat of *M. barleeanus* being consistently

Formatted: Highlight

495 deeper and this species traveling more actively through the redox zones than *U.*
496 *mediterranea* or *U. peregrina*. Nitrate respiration could be mechanism allowing this
497 dynamic behaviour by *M. barleeanus* in the intermediate depth habitat. However, Pina-
498 Ochoa et al. (2010), studying denitrification in foraminifera, reports nitrate storage in

Deleted: This is in line with *M. barleeanus* traveling more actively through the redox zones than *U. mediterranea* or *U. peregrina*.

502 all three species mentioned here. Notably, nitrate storage in *M. barleeanus* is lower than
503 *U. mediterranea* and *U. peregrina*. Alternatively *M. barleeanus* thrives in habitats with
504 varying oxygenation and hence also varying Mn levels, whereas the stable but high
505 Mn/Ca values in the Uvigerinids are related to their opportunistic behaviour.

506 With a redox-sensitive element such as Mn, in a dynamic geochemical
507 environment, it is not surprising that foraminifera exhibit high inter-individual
508 variability in their Mn/Ca incorporation. Benthic foraminifera reside in a 3D
509 geochemical mosaic, as reflected by a large spread of Mn values, in addition to
510 undergoing substantial temporal variability. Still, using Mn/Ca as a potential proxy for
511 redox conditions or primary productivity seems promising, as established ecological
512 characteristics of species are reflected by differences in Mn incorporation. Apparently
513 the large variability on both spatial and temporal scales averages out, making Mn into
514 a promising proxy for paleo-redox and organic matter flux.

515

516 **5. Conclusion**

517 This study investigates the link between benthic foraminiferal habitat preferences and
518 manganese incorporation in their tests. Manganese incorporation increases with
519 bottom-arriving labile organic matter content, driven by enhanced oxygen demand.
520 This results in a more shallow oxygen penetration depth with immediately below it
521 enhanced dissolved Mn levels. Shallow infaunal species calcify under lower
522 concentrations of Mn compared to intermediate infauna, in line with their depth
523 preference. Their depth habitat is related to in-sediment changes in redox conditions.
524 However, these distribution not necessarily vary synchronous with changes in redox
525 zonation as illustrated by the Mn/Ca variability in their tests (Fig. 8). The latter reflects
526 the Mn/Ca porewater composition, which itself is directly related to reactive organic

527 matter concentration and redox conditions. The foraminiferal Mn/Ca ratio and inter-
528 specimen variability, therefore, provides information on past Mn cycling within the
529 sediment. Consequently, foraminiferal Mn/Ca ratio is a potential proxy for bottom-
530 water oxygenation and organic matter fluxes.

Deleted: the

531

532 **Acknowledgements**

533 We thank captain and crew of the *N/O Téthys 2* (CNRS-INSU) for their assistance
534 during the *BEHEMOTH* campaign. We acknowledge the technical assistance given by
535 Christine Barras, Mélissa Gaultier, Sophie Terrien and Gérard Chabaud from Angers
536 and Bordeaux University. We thank Serge Berné and Laetitia Maltese (Ifremer), for
537 providing us with maps of the study area and Xavier Durrieu de Madron (Perpignan
538 University) for discussions about water column structure. Helen de Waard (LA-ICP-
539 MS) and Karoliina Koho (SEM) (Utrecht University) are acknowledged for their
540 laboratory assistance. The associate editor and two anonymous reviewers are
541 acknowledged for their helpful comments. The Darwin Center for Biogeosciences
542 provided partial funding for this project. This paper contributes to the Netherlands Earth
543 Systems Science Center (NESSC –www.nessc.nl)

Formatted: Highlight

544

545 **References**

- 546 Accornero, A., Picon, P., De Bovée, F., Charrière, B., & Buscail, R.: Organic carbon
547 budget at the sediment–water interface on the Gulf of Lions continental margin.
548 *Continental Shelf Research*, 23(1), 79-92, 2003.
- 549
550 Alve, E., & Bernhard, J. M.: Vertical migratory response of benthic foraminifera to
551 controlled oxygen concentrations in an experimental mesocosm. *Oceanographic*
552 *Literature Review*, 9(42), 771, 1995.
- 553
554
555 Arndt, S., Jørgensen, B. B., LaRowe, D. E., Middelburg, J. J., Pancost, R. D. and
556 Regnier, P.: Quantifying the degradation of organic matter in marine sediments: A
557 review and synthesis, *Earth-Science Rev.*, 123, 53–86,

559 doi:10.1016/j.earscirev.2013.02.008, 2013.

560

561 Barnett, P. R. O., Watson, J. and Connely, D.: A multiple corer for taking virtually
562 undisturbed sample from shelf, bathyal and abyssal sediments, *Oceanologica Acta*, 7,
563 399-408, 1984.

564

565 Barras, C., Fontanier, C., Jorissen, F. and Hohenegger, J.: A comparison of spatial and
566 temporal variability of living benthic foraminiferal faunas at 550 m depth in the Bay
567 of Biscay, *Micropaleontology*, 56, 275-295, 2010.

568

569 **Barras, C., Mouret, A., Nardelli, M.P., Metzger, E., Petersen, J., La, C., Filipsson,**
570 **H.L., Jorissen, F.: Experimental calibration of manganese incorporation in**
571 **foraminiferal calcite. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 237, 49-64, 2018.**

572

573 Boyle, E. A.: Manganese carbonate overgrowths on foraminifera tests, *Geochim.*
574 *Cosmochim. Acta*, 47, 1815-1819, DOI: 10.1016/0016-7037(83)90029-7, 1983.

575

576 Burdige, D. J. and Gieskes, J. M. : A pore water/solid phase diagenetic model for
577 manganese in marine sediments. *American Journal of Science*, 283(1), 29-47, 1983.

578

579 De Lange, G. J.: Early diagenetic reactions in interbedded pelagic and turbiditic
580 sediments in the Nares Abyssal Plain (western North Atlantic): Consequences for the
581 composition of sediment and interstitial water, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 50(12),
582 2543-2561, doi:10.1016/0016-7037(86)90209-7, 1986.

583

584 **Dueñas-Bohórquez, A., Rocha, R., Kuroyanagi, A., de Nooijer, L., Bijma, J.,**
585 **Reichert, G.J.: Interindividual variability and ontogenetic effects on Mg and Sr**
586 **incorporation in the planktonic foraminifer *Globigerinoides sacculifer*. *Geochim.***
587 ***Cosmochim. Acta*, 75 (2), 520-532, 2011.**

588

589 Elderfield, H., Yu, J., Anand, P., Kiefer, T. and Nyland, B.: Calibrations for benthic
590 foraminiferal Mg/Ca paleothermometry and the carbonate ion hypothesis, *Earth*
591 *Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 250(3-4), 633-649, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2006.07.041, 2006.

592

593 Fontanier, C., Jorissen, F. J., Licari, L., Alexandre, A., Anschutz, P. and Carbonel, P.:
594 Live benthic foraminiferal faunas from the Bay of Biscay: faunal density,
595 composition, and microhabitats, *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research*
596 *Papers*, 49, 751-785, DOI: 10.1016/S0967-0637(01)00078-4, 2002.

597

598 Fontanier, C., Jorissen, F. J., David, C., Anschutz, P., Chaillou, G. and Lafon, V.:
599 Seasonal and interannual variability of benthic foraminiferal faunas at 550m depth in
600 the Bay of Biscay. *Deep-Sea Research I*, 50, 457-494, 2003.

601

602 Fontanier, C., Mackensen, A., Jorissen, F. J., Anschutz, P., Licari, L., & Griveaud, C.:
603 Stable oxygen and carbon isotopes of live benthic foraminifera from the Bay of
604 Biscay: Microhabitat impact and seasonal variability. *Marine Micropaleontology*,
605 58(3), 159-183, 2006.

606

607 Fontanier, C., Jorissen, F. J., Lansard, B., Mouret, A., Buscail, R., Schmidt, S.,
608 Kerhervé, P., Buron, F., Zaragosi, S., Hunault, G., Ernoult, E., Artero, C., Anschutz,

Formatted: Highlight

Deleted: ¶

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: Not Bold, Highlight

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Font: (Asian) Japanese

610 P. and Rabouille, C.: Live foraminifera from the open slope between Grand Rhône
611 and Petit Rhône Canyons (Gulf of Lions, NW Mediterranean), *Deep. Res. Part I*
612 *Oceanogr. Res. Pap.*, 55(11), 1532–1553, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2008.07.003, 2008.
613

614 Froelich P. N., Klinkhammer G. P., Bender M. L., Luedtke N. A., Heath G. R., Cullen
615 D., Dauphin P., Hammond D., Hartman B. and Maynard V.: Early oxidation of
616 organic matter in pelagic sediments of the eastern equatorial Atlantic: suboxic
617 diagenesis. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 43(1075), 1090, 1979.

618 Glock, N., Eisenhauer, A., Liebetrau, V., Wiedenbeck, M., Hensen, C. and Nehrke,
619 G.: EMP and SIMS studies on Mn/Ca and Fe/Ca systematics in benthic foraminifera
620 from the Peruvian OMZ: A contribution to the identification of potential redox
621 proxies and the impact of cleaning protocols, *Biogeosciences*, 9(1), 341–359,
622 doi:10.5194/bg-9-341-2012, 2012.
623

624 Groeneveld, J. and Filipsson, H. L.: Mg/Ca and Mn/Ca ratios in benthic foraminifera:
625 the potential to reconstruct past variations in temperature and hypoxia in shelf
626 regions, *Biogeosciences*, 10(7), 5125–5138, doi:10.5194/bg-10-5125-2013, 2013.
627

628 Gross, O.: Influence of temperature, oxygen and food availability on the migrational
629 activity of bathyal benthic foraminifera: evidence by microcosm experiments. In *Life*
630 *at Interfaces and Under Extreme Conditions* (pp. 123-137). Springer Netherlands,
631 2000.
632

633 Hintz, C. J., Shaw, T. J., Chandler, G. T., Bernhard, J. M., McCorkle, D. C. and
634 Blanks, J. K.: Trace/minor element: calcium ratios in cultured benthic foraminifera.
635 Part I: Inter-species and inter-individual variability, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*,
636 70(8), 1952–1963, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2005.12.018, 2006a.
637

638 Jochum, K. P., Weis, U., Stoll, B., Kuzmin, D., Yang, Q., Raczek, I., Jacob, D. E.,
639 Stracke, A., Birbaum, K., Frick, D. A., Gunther, D., Enzweiler, J.:
640 Determination of Reference Values for NIST SRM 610-617 Glasses Following ISO
641 Guidelines, *Geostandards and Geoanalytical Research*, 35, 4, 397-421, 2011.
642

643 Jorissen, F. J., de Stigter, H. C. and Widmark, J. G. V: A conceptual model explaining
644 benthic foraminiferal microhabitats, *Mar. Micropaleontol.*, 26(1–4), 3–15,
645 doi:10.1016/0377-8398(95)00047-X, 1995.
646

647 Jorissen, F. J., Wittling, I., Peypouquet, J. P., Rabouille, C. and Relexans, J. C.: Live
648 benthic foraminiferal faunas off Cape Blanc, NW-Africa: Community structure and
649 microhabitats, *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers*, 45, 2157-
650 2188, DOI: 10.1016/S0967-0637(98)00056-9, 1998.
651

652 Koho, K. A., Langezaal, A. M., van Lith, Y. A., Duijnste, I. A. P. and van der
653 Zwaan, G. J.: The influence of a simulated diatom bloom on deep-sea benthic
654 foraminifera and the activity of bacteria: A mesocosm study, *Deep. Res. Part I*
655 *Oceanogr. Res. Pap.*, 55(5), 696–719, doi:10.1016/j.dsr.2008.02.003, 2008.
656

657 Koho, K. A., Piña-Ochoa, E., Geslin, E. and Risgaard-Petersen, N.: Vertical
658 migration, nitrate uptake and denitrification: Survival mechanisms of foraminifers

659 (Globobulimina turgida) under low oxygen conditions, FEMS Microbiol. Ecol., 75(2),
660 273–283, doi:10.1111/j.1574-6941.2010.01010.x, 2011.
661
662 Koho, K. A., de Nooijer, L. J. and Reichart, G. J.: Combining benthic foraminiferal
663 ecology and shell Mn/Ca to deconvolve past bottom water oxygenation and
664 paleoproductivity, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 165, 294–306,
665 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2015.06.003, 2015.
666
667 Koho, K. A., De Nooijer, L. J., Fontanier, C., Toyofuku, T., Oguri, K., Kitazato, H.
668 and Reichart, G. J.: Benthic foraminiferal Mn / Ca ratios reflect microhabitat
669 preferences, Biogeosciences, 14(12), 3067–3082, doi:10.5194/bg-14-3067-2017, 2017
670
671 Lea, D. and Boyle, E.: Barium content of benthic foraminifera controlled by bottom-
672 water composition, Nature, 338, 751-753, 1989.
673
674 Lewis, E., and Wallace, D. W. R.: Program Developed for CO2 Systems Calculations.
675 ORNL/CDIAC-105, Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Centre, Oak Ridge
676 National Laboratory U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tennessee, 1998.
677
678 Loubere, P., Meyers, P., and Gary, A.: Benthic foraminiferal microhabitat selection,
679 carbon isotope values, and association with larger animals: A test with uvigerina
680 peregrina, Journal of Foraminiferal Research, 25, 83-95. DOI:10.2113/gsjfr.25.1.83,
681 1995.
682
683 Mangini, A., Jung, M. and Laukenmann, S.: What do we learn from peaks of uranium
684 and of manganese in deep sea sediments?, Mar. Geol., 177(1–2), 63,
685 doi:10.1016/S0025-3227(01)00124-4, 2001.
686
687 McKay, C. L., Groeneveld, J., Filipsson, H. L., Gallego-Torres, D., Whitehouse, M.
688 J., Toyofuku, T. and Romero, O. E.: A comparison of benthic foraminiferal Mn / Ca
689 and sedimentary Mn / Al as proxies of relative bottom-water oxygenation in the low-
690 latitude NE Atlantic upwelling system, Biogeosciences, 12(18), 5415–5428,
691 doi:10.5194/bg-12-5415-2015, 2015.
692
693 Munsel, D., Kramar, U., Dissard, D., Nehrke, G., Berner, Z., Bijma, J., Reichart, G. J.
694 and Neumann, T.: Heavy metal incorporation in foraminiferal calcite: Results from
695 multi-element enrichment culture experiments with Ammonia tepida, Biogeosciences,
696 7(8), 2339–2350, doi:10.5194/bg-7-2339-2010, 2010.
697
698 Ní Fhlaithearta, S., Reichart, G.-J., Jorissen, F.J., Fontanier, C., Rohling, E.J.,
699 Thomson, J. & de Lange, G.J.: Reconstructing the seafloor environment during
700 sapropel formation using benthic foraminiferal trace metals, stable isotopes, and
701 sediment composition. *Paleoceanography*, 25(4), 2010. DOI:10.1029/2009PA001869
702
703 Ní Fhlaithearta, S., Ernst, S. R., Nierop, K. G. J., de Lange, G. J. and Reichart, G.-J.:
704 Molecular and isotopic composition of foraminiferal organic linings, Mar.
705 Micropaleontol., 102, doi:10.1016/j.marmicro.2013.06.004, 2013.
706

707 Nürnberg, D., Bijma, J. and Hemleben, C.: Assessing the reliability of magnesium in
708 foraminiferal calcite as a proxy for water mass temperatures, *Geochim. Cosmochim.*
709 *Acta*, 60(5), 803–814, doi:10.1016/0016-7037(95)00446-7, 1996.
710

711 Pina-Ochoa, E., Hogslund, S., Geslin, E., Cedhagen, T., Revsbech, N. P., Nielsen, L.
712 P., Schweizer, M., Jorissen, F., Rysgaard, S. and Risgaard-Petersen, N.: Widespread
713 occurrence of nitrate storage and denitrification among Foraminifera and Gromiida,
714 *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*, 107(3), 1148–1153, doi:10.1073/pnas.0908440107, 2010.
715

716 Reichart, G. J., Jorissen, F., Anschutz, P. and Mason, P. R. D.: Single foraminiferal
717 test chemistry records the marine environment, *Geology*, 31(4), 355–358,
718 doi:10.1130/0091-7613(2003)031<0355:SFTCRT>2.0.CO;2, 2003.
719

720 Risgaard-Petersen, N., Langezaal, A. M., Ingvarsdén, S., Schmid, M. C., Jetten, M. S.
721 M., Op Den Camp, H. J. M., Derksen, J. W. M., Pina-Ochoa, E., Eriksson, S. P.,
722 Nielsen, L. P., Revsbech, N. P., Cedhagen, T. and Van Der Zwaan, G. J.: Evidence for
723 complete denitrification in a benthic foraminifer, *Nature*, 443(7107), 93–96,
724 doi:10.1038/nature05070, 2006.
725

726 Rosenthal, Y., Morley, A., Barras, C., Katz, M. E., Jorissen, F., Reichart, G.-J., Oppo,
727 D. W. and Linsley, Braddock. K.: Temperature calibration of Mg/Ca ratios in the
728 intermediate water benthic foraminifera *Hyalinea Balthica*, *Geochem. Geophys.*
729 *Geosyst.*, 12(4), 2011. doi: 10.1029/2010GC003333
730

731 Schönfeld, J.: Benthic foraminifera and pore water oxygen profiles: A reassessment of
732 species boundary conditions at the Western Iberian margin, *Journal of Foraminiferal*
733 *Research*, 31, 86-107, 10.2113/0310086, 2001.
734

735 Schmiedl, G., Pfeilsticker, M., Hemleben, C., Mackensen, A.: Environmental and
736 biological effects on the stable isotope composition of recent deep-sea benthic
737 foraminifera from the western Mediterranean Sea *Mar. Micropaleontol.*, 51, 129–152
738 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.marmicro.2003.10.001>, 2004.
739

740 Van Cappellen, P. and Wang, Y.: Cycling of iron and manganese in surface
741 sediments: A general theory for the coupled transport and reaction of carbon, oxygen,
742 nitrogen, sulfur, iron, and manganese, *Am. J. Sci.*, 296(3), 197–243,
743 doi:10.2475/ajs.296.3.197, 1996.
744

745 Wang, Y. and Van Cappellen, P.: A multicomponent reactive transport model of early
746 diagenesis: Application to redox cycling in coastal marine sediments, *Geochim.*
747 *Cosmochim. Acta*, 60(16), 2993–3014, doi:10.1016/0016-7037(96)00140-8, 1996.
748

749 Wit, J. C., De Nooijer, L. J., Barras, C., Jorissen, F. J. and Reichart, G. J.: A
750 reappraisal of the vital effect in cultured benthic foraminifer *Bulimina marginata* on
751 Mg/Ca values: Assessing temperature uncertainty relationships, *Biogeosciences*, 9(9),
752 3693–3704, doi:10.5194/bg-9-3693-2012, 2012.
753

754 Yu, J. and Elderfield, H.: Benthic foraminiferal B/Ca ratios reflect deep water
755 carbonate saturation state, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 258(1–2), 73–86,
756 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2007.03.025, 2007.

757
758
759

