

## ***Interactive comment on “Collection of large benthic invertebrates in sediment traps in the Amundsen Sea, Antarctica” by Minkyoung Kim et al.***

### **Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 15 March 2019

This is an amazing paper. I have spent the weekend thinking about it and I think I have come up with an alternative hypothesis.

But first, the paper has to be published with or without my ideas. Indeed, while I don't agree with their anchor ice hypothesis, it is the only reasonable explanation in the literature. Moreover, it is the second best review of anchor ice that I have seen, and I described anchor ice and stalactites in the 19060s, so know something about the issue. Their observations and explanation really deserve to be published. The paper could be accepted absolutely as it is because the observations are extremely interesting and valuable to all polar marine scientists and their detailed well presented explanation is

C1

the only one consistent with the published literature that they review VERY completely. So in my mind you can accept it as it is, but then let me have an opportunity to present my alternative highly speculative explanation in the same issue because I think that it might be correct!

Or, alternatively, allow them to make the decision and perhaps work my thinking into their paper. Whatever you wish is fine with me, but it is important to get the paper out to the community. I will reply to your questions below and attach my review. Thank you for your patience getting me this interesting manuscript.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:  
<https://www.biogeosciences-discuss.net/bg-2019-57/bg-2019-57-RC1-supplement.pdf>

---

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2019-57>, 2019.

C2