Age distribution, extractability, and stability of mineral-bound organic carbon in central European soils

Marion Schrumpf¹, Klaus Kaiser², Allegra Mayer³, Günter Hempel⁴, Susan Trumbore¹

¹Max-Planck-Institute for Biogeochemistry, Jena, D-07745, Germany

²Soil Science and Soil Protection, Martin Luther University Halle-Wittenberg, Halle (Saale), 06120, Germany
 ³Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, CA 94720, USA
 ⁴Institute of Physics, Martin Luther University Halle-Wittenberg, Halle (Saale), 06120, Germany
 Correspondence to: Marion Schrumpf (mschrumpf@bgc-jena.mpg.de)

- 10 Abstract. The largest share of total soil organic carbon (OC) is associated with minerals. However, the factors that determine the amount and turnover of slower versus faster cycling components of mineral-associated carbon (MOC) are still poorly understood. Bioavailability of MOC is thought to be regulated by desorption, which can be facilitated by displacement and mobilization by competing ions. However, MOC stability is usually determined by exposure to chemical oxidation, which addresses the chemical stability of the organic compounds rather than the bonding strength of the OC-
- 15 mineral bond. We used a solution of NaOH, a strong agent for desorption due to high pH, and NaF, adding F⁻, a strongly sorbing anion that can replace anionic organic molecules on mineral surfaces, to measure the maximum potentially desorbable MOC. For comparison, we measured maximal potential oxidation of MOC using heated H_2O_2 . We selected MOC samples (>1.6 g cm³) obtained from density fractionation of samples from three soil depth increments (0-5 cm, 10-20 cm, 30-40 cm) of five typical soils of central Europe, with a range of clay and pedogenic oxide contents, and under different
- 20 ecosystem types (one coniferous forest, two deciduous forests, one grassland, one cropland). Extracts and residues were analyzed for OC and ¹⁴C contents, and further chemically characterized by CPMAS-¹³C-NMR. We expected that NaF/NaOH extraction would remove less and younger MOC than H₂O₂ oxidation, and that NaF/NaOH extractability of MOC is reduced in subsoils and soils with high contents of pedogenic oxides.

The results showed that a surprisingly consistent proportion of 58±11% (standard deviation) of MOC was extracted with

- 25 NaF/NaOH across soils, independent of depth, mineral assemblage, or land use. NMR spectra revealed strong similarities of the extracted organic matter, with more than 80% of OC in the O/N alkyl and alkyl C region. Total MOC amounts were correlated with the content of pedogenic oxides across sites, independent of variations in total clay, and the same was true for OC in extraction residues. Thus, the uniform extractability of MOC may be explained by dominant interactions between OC and pedogenic oxides across all study sites. While Δ^{14} C values of bulk MOC suggested differences in OC turnover between
- 30 sites, these were not linked to differences in MOC extractability. As expected, OC contents of residues had more negative Δ^{14} C values than extracts (average difference between extracts and residues: 78±36‰), suggesting that non-extractable OC is older. Δ^{14} C values of extracts and residues were strongly correlated and proportional to Δ^{14} C values of bulk MOC, but not

dependent on mineralogy. Neither MOC extractability nor differences in Δ^{14} C values between extracts and residues changed with depth along soil profiles, where declining Δ^{14} C values might indicate slower OC turnover in deeper soils. Thus, the ¹⁴C

- 35 depth gradients in the studied soils were not explained by increasing stability of organic-mineral associations with soil depth. Although H₂O₂ removed 90±8% of the MOC, the Δ^{14} C values of oxidized OC (on average -50±110‰) were similar to those of OC extracted with NaF/NaOH (-51±122‰), but oxidation residues (-345±227‰) were much more ¹⁴C-depleted than residues of the NaF/NaOH extraction (-130±121‰). Accordingly, both chemical treatments removed OC from the same continuum, and oxidation residues were older than extraction residues because more OC was removed. In contrast to the
- 40 NaF/NaOH extractions, higher contents of pedogenic oxides slightly increased the oxidation-resistance of MOC, but this higher H_2O_2 -resistance did not coincide with more negative $\Delta^{14}C$ values of MOC or its oxidation residues. Therefore, none of the applied chemical fractionation schemes was able to explain site-specific differences in $\Delta^{14}C$ values. Our results indicate that total MOC was dominated by OC interactions with pedogenic oxides rather than clay minerals, as we detected no difference in bond strength between clay-rich and clay-poor sites. This suggests that site-specific differences in $\Delta^{14}C$

45 values of bulk MOC and depth profiles are driven by the accumulation and exchange rates of OC at mineral surfaces.

1 Introduction

The persistence of organic matter (OM) in soil is a key control of atmospheric CO_2 concentrations. Association of OM with minerals is considered an effective pathway of stabilizing otherwise degradable OM from microbial mineralization (Schmidt et al., 2011; Lehmann and Kleber, 2015; Hemingway et al., 2019) and in many soils the vast majority of organic carbon

50 (OC) is bound to minerals (Kleber et al., 2015; Kögel-Knabner et al., 2008; Cotrufo et al., 2019). Despite the abundance of mineral-bound OC (MOC), we lack fundamental knowledge on the drivers of stability and turnover of MOC along soil profiles and across sites.

The formation of MOC involves sorption to reactive minerals such as phyllosilicate clays and pedogenic aluminum (Al) and iron (Fe) oxides, oxyhydroxides, and hydroxides (summarily referred to as oxides) (Schrumpf et al., 2013; Kögel-Knabner et

- 55 al., 2008; Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2000; Khomo et al., 2017). Along with plant-derived decomposition products, microbial residues and metabolites are important precursors and sorbates for MOC formation (Avneri-Katz et al., 2017; Chenu and Stotzky, 2002; Cotrufo et al., 2015; Kalbitz et al., 2005; Kallenbach et al., 2016). Experimental studies have shown that sorption to minerals reduces OC mineralization (e.g. Kalbitz et al., 2005; Jones and Edwards, 1998; Eusterhues et al., 2014; Porras et al., 2018). Radiocarbon (¹⁴C) analyses confirmed the greater stability of MOC in soils, showing that average MOC
- 60 age is older than OC not bound to minerals (Schrumpf et al., 2013; Kögel-Knabner et al., 2008; Hemingway et al., 2019; Heckman et al., 2018). Several field and incubation studies suggested that the total amount and stability of MOC increases with the amount of pedogenic Al and Fe oxides (Bruun et al., 2010; Torn et al., 1997; Porras et al., 2017; Rasmussen et al., 2006). Other studies found correlations between Al and Fe oxides and MOC concentrations but not with the ¹⁴C content of MOC or average age (Herold et al., 2014; Khomo et al., 2017; Schrumpf et al., 2013).

- 65 Studying MOC turnover and its drivers in soil is complicated because, similar to bulk soil OC, it is a mixture of younger and older carbon with a range of levels of stabilization (Trumbore et al., 1989; Swanston et al., 2005; Schrumpf and Kaiser, 2015; Koarashi et al., 2012). Various chemical methods, including acid hydrolysis and chemical oxidation, are commonly used to distinguish faster and slower cycling fractions (e.g. Mikutta et al., 2006; Jagadamma et al., 2010; Helfrich et al., 2007; Six et al., 2002; Paul et al., 2001; Eusterhues et al., 2003). All methods separate bulk soil OC or MOC into younger
- 70 and older fractions but differ in the extent of OC removal and the ¹⁴C contents of obtained residues. The oxidants H₂O₂ or Na₂S₂O₈ were more effective in removing OC from samples than NaOCl, and their residues were older (Jagadamma et al., 2010; Helfrich et al., 2007). With increasing presence of Al and Fe oxides in soils, larger amounts of OC resisted chemical oxidation, suggesting that binding to those minerals provides some protection against oxidative attack (Mikutta et al., 2006; Kleber et al., 2005; Eusterhues et al., 2005). However, there are indications that such chemically defined fractions are not
- causally related to MOC bioavailability or persistence in soils (Poirier et al., 2003; Mikutta and Kaiser, 2011; Helfrich et al., 2007; Jagadamma et al., 2010; Paul et al., 2008).

Release of mineral-bonded OC, either by desorption or upon mineral dissolution under changing environmental conditions, can support or even be prerequisite for its microbial degradation (Keil et al., 1994; Mikutta et al., 2007). Desorption of OM, although typically small under conditions similar to those during the formation of MOC (e.g. Gu et al., 1994), increases in

- the presence of competing ions such as SO_4^{2-} or $H_2PO_4^{-}$ and is maximized by increasing the alkalinity of solution (e.g. Kaiser and Zech, 1999; Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2007). While some studies observed an increased release of OC from minerals into alkaline solutions with greater mineral OC loading (Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2007, Kaiser et al., 2007), others showed increased OC desorption despite smaller OC concentrations (Kaiser and Zech, 1999; Mikutta et al., 2009). Greater desorption and biodegradation of OM bonded to phyllosilicates than of OM bonded to Al and Fe oxides has been attributed
- to differences in bonding strength. The sorption between OM and phyllosilicates are largely a result of the weaker cation bridges and van der Waals bonds, while the sorption of OM to Al and Fe oxides involves surface complexation, which results in strong chemical bonds (Singh et al., 2016; Mikutta et al., 2007). Thus, the presence and abundance of Al and Fe oxides typically decreased both desorption and mineralization rates (Oren and Chefetz, 2012; Saidy et al., 2012; Singh et al., 2017). Unfortunately, OC desorption has primarily been studied using model minerals in laboratory experiments, and
- 90 observation times for desorption or mineralization were much shorter than carbon residence times in soil. Mikutta et al. (2010) analyzed the ¹⁴C contents of MOC after removing all potentially desorbable OC by extracting soil with a combination of NaF and NaOH. This extraction enables the study of the potential displacement of complexed organic functional groups by introducing OH⁻ and F⁻ anions to compete for and displace mineral-bound OC, and by increasing the pH (Kaiser et al., 2007). Consistently younger OM was extracted from MOC of topsoils, supporting the idea that desorbable
- 95 OC turns over faster than more strongly bonded OC. Results for subsoils were more variable (Mikutta et al., 2010). Along with ¹⁴C contents, the chemical composition of bulk soil OC extractable into alkaline solutions also changes with soil depth, with subsoils containing less lignin-derived aromatics but more O-alkyl C, possibly of microbial origin (Möller et al., 2000; Mikutta et al., 2009). Desorption of OC from MOC has, to our knowledge, not yet been studied systematically across soil

types. If potential OC desorption better represents the mechanism of mineral protection of soil OC than the abovementioned

oxidative or hydrolytic extractions, then further research must focus on factors controlling amount, age, and composition of 100 desorbable OC in soils. Potential factors affecting MOC desorption include soil mineralogy, chemical composition of OM and thus vegetation type, and OM loading on minerals.

Based on the literature review we expect that:

- (1) extraction in NaF/NaOH releases a weaker bound fraction of total MOC, which is younger than the stronger bound residue fraction.
- 105
 - (2) MOC of soil samples with higher proportions of extractable carbon is younger than MOC with more extraction resistant OC.
 - (3) the proportion of NaF/NaOH-extractable MOC decreases with increasing contents of pedogenic oxides, which form strong bonds with OC.
- 110 (4) the chemical composition of extractable MOC varies between study sites due to differences in vegetation composition, and thus litter chemistry.
 - (5) the proportion of NaF/NaOH-extractable MOC declines with depth due to declining OC loading of minerals.
 - (6) the chemical composition of extractable MOC changes with depth due to declining contributions of plant and increasing contributions of microbial derived OC.
- (7) MOC should be less prone to desorption and accordingly of older ¹⁴C age when organic molecules forming MOC 115 have many carboxyl groups that enable strong bonds with minerals surfaces.
 - (8) the strong oxidizing agent H_2O_2 removes more OC from MOC than NaF/NaOH.
 - (9) oxidizable and non-oxidizable OC should both be older than the extractable and non-extractable OC fractions if the harsher oxidation treatment removes more, and thus presumably better stabilized OC from mineral surfaces, leaving
- OC residues of even older ¹⁴C age behind. 120

To test if maximum desorption with NaF/NaOH is a suitable indicator for the labile proportion of MOC, we took advantage of a previous experiment in which MOC was isolated from soils by density fractionation (heavy fraction at a density cutoff of >1.6 g cm⁻³, HF) for a range of sites across central Europe (Schrumpf et al., 2013). We selected five sites across ranges of clay content, type of clay and pedogenic oxides, and land use, with associated differences in amount and quality of litter

125 input. Samples from three soil depths were extracted with a mixture of NaF and NaOH, and the extracted OC was analyzed for amount, composition, and ¹⁴C content. We compared results from the extraction to the amount and age of OC oxidizable by heated H₂O₂, which was shown to remove the most MOC and isolate the oldest MOC (Helfrich et al., 2007; Jagadamma et al., 2010). The in NaF/NaOH extraction experiment seeks to elucidate mineral protection as a stabilization mechanism, while the oxidation treatment explores the chemical recalcitrance of MOC.

130 2 Materials and Methods

Composition and age structure of MOC were studied on heavy fraction (HF) material obtained at five of the sites presented by Schrumpf et al. (2013). The sites include two deciduous forests developed on loess at Hesse (France, Luvisol, (WRB, 2015)) and loess over limestone at Hainich (Germany, Cambisol). Soils at the grassland site Laqueuille (France, Andosol) and the coniferous site Wetzstein (Germany, Podzol) are characterized by large contents of pedogenic oxides. The soil at the

- 135 fifth site, a cropland at Gebesee (Germany, Chernozem), reveals a plow layer down to 30 cm, and large contributions of old OC throughout the profile (Schrumpf et al., 2013). The MOC fraction was separated using two-step sequential density flotation in sodium-polytungstate solution (1.6 g cm⁻³). After removal of the unprotected free light fraction in a first flotation step, samples were sonicated (site-specific energy application) to disrupt aggregates and separate the occluded light fraction from the targeted MOC in the HF (for details see Schrumpf et al. (2013)). Concentrations of OC in MOC are shown in
- 140 supplementary Figure A1 and ranged from 16.8 g kg⁻¹ at Gebesee to 108 g kg⁻¹ at Laqueuille in the uppermost layer, and from 4.6 g kg⁻¹ at Hesse to 44 g kg⁻¹ at Laqueuille in the deepest studied layer. Selected bulk soil properties of respective samples were adopted from Schrumpf et al. (2013) and are summarized in supplementary Table A1. We randomly selected three out of the original ten replicated soil cores per site and analyzed the soil layers 0-5, 10-20, and

30-40 cm (excluding Wetzstein, where 0-10, 10-30, and 30-50 cm layers were analyzed from soil pits instead of cores, see Schrumpf et al. 2013) for (1) extractable MOC and (2) oxidation-resistant MOC.

- NaF-NaOH-extractable MOC was determined as an indicator for maximal potential desorption by weighing 25 g of heavy fraction (MOC) material of each sample into 250-ml polypropylene centrifuge bottles and adding 125 ml of a 1:1 solution containing 0.8 M NaF and 0.2 M NaOH. Containers were then closed and agitated overnight (at least for 18 hours) in an end-over shaker. A few drops of magnesium chloride were added as flocculant to the solution, which was then centrifuged for 15
- 150 minutes at 4000 × g. Then supernatants were decanted into 1000-ml PE bottles and stored in the refrigerator. Another 125 ml of the extraction solution was added to settled soil material in the centrifuge tube, stirred and mixed well to repeat the extraction for a total of four times. Finally, the combined extract solution from each sample was passed through glass fiber filters with a pore size of 1.6 μ m and stored in a 4° C room until transfer into deionized water-rinsed, 75 cm long SERVAPOR 29-mm cellulose-acetate tubing for dialysis. The ~2/3 full tubes were placed into clean 10-l buckets filled with
- 155 deionized water, which was frequently replaced until the electrical conductivity of the external solution was $<2 \mu$ S. The content of the dialysis tubes was then freeze dried and analyzed for total C, N, and ¹⁴C signatures (as described below). The extracted residual soil containing the non-extractable OC was washed three times with deionized water to minimize remaining fluoride content before freeze drying and analyses of total C and N contents, and ¹⁴C signature (as described below).
- 160 Oxidation-resistant MOC was obtained following a slightly modified procedure from Jagadamma et al. (2010). After letting 2 g of soil soak in 20 ml of Millipore DI water for ten minutes, 60 ml of 10% hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) was gradually added to the soil. After the frothing had subsided from the reaction of wet samples with 60 ml of H_2O_2 at room temperature, the

samples were heated and stirred regularly in a 50°C water bath in order to catalyze the oxidation of organic matter. Because H_2O_2 decomposes with exposure to light and temperature, the samples were centrifuged, the supernatant decanted, and fresh

- 165 H_2O_2 added to continue the oxidation. Each sample was oxidized for two periods of 24 hours and one period of 72 hours. After the final oxidation, samples were centrifuged at $3500 \times g$ for at least 15 minutes, and then washed three times with 80 ml of deionized water. Magnesium chloride solution was added to enhance flocculation during centrifugation. After the final oxidation each sample was washed three times with DI water and afterwards freeze dried. The samples were then homogenized using a ceramic ball mill and measured for total carbon and nitrogen content by dry combustion with the Vario
- 170 EL CN analyzer (Elementar Analysensysteme GmbH, Hanau, Germany). All soils analyzed in this study were free of carbonate. Therefore, total carbon measurements are equivalent to total organic carbon in the soil. Radiocarbon contents of the samples were measured on graphitized samples at the ¹⁴C laboratory in Jena, Germany (Steinhof et al., 2017). Soil samples were weighed into tin capsules and combusted in an elemental analyzer. The evolved CO₂ was transferred into a glass tube cooled by liquid nitrogen, and reduced to graphite at 600 °C under hydrogen gas atmosphere,
- 175 using iron as catalyst. The graphite was analyzed by ¹⁴C AMS (3MV Tandetron 4130 AMS ¹⁴C system: High Voltage Engineering Europe, HVEE, The Netherlands). Samples with low OC concentrations from the H₂O₂ residues were combusted with CuO wire in quartz tubes and graphitized using a sealed zinc reduction method, then analyzed at the WM Keck Carbon Cycle AMS facility at UC Irvine (Xu et al., 2007).
- Radiocarbon data are reported as Δ^{14} C in per mille [‰], which is the relative difference in parts per thousand of the ¹⁴C/¹²C ratio of the sample with respect to an absolute standard (0.95 times the oxalic acid standard NBS SRM 4990C decay corrected to 1950), after normalization of the sample ¹⁴C/¹²C for mass dependent fractionation by normalizing to a δ^{13} C of -25‰ (Trumbore et al., 2016). The average measurement precision of the Δ^{14} C values was 2.8‰. Reported in this way, Δ^{14} C values close to zero indicate that most of the C in the sample is close to that of the standard, i.e., it was fixed from the preindustrial atmosphere (up to ~350 years prior to 1950). Negative Δ^{14} C values indicate lower ¹⁴C/¹²C than the standard and
- 185 indicate that most of the C in the sample had been isolated from the atmosphere long enough for detectable radioactive decay to deplete ¹⁴C; samples with negative Δ^{14} C values have been isolated longer. Positive Δ^{14} C values indicate enrichment with bomb-derived ¹⁴C from nuclear weapon testing in the early 1960ies, which suggests that OC from these samples is younger and mostly fixed in the last century. In 2004, when samples in this study were collected, atmospheric Δ^{14} C values (about 70 ‰ (Levin et al., 2010)) were still declining from the peak bomb C in 1963 of about +900 ‰. Thus, comparing oxidized or
- 190 extracted C with the original MOM depends on its original Δ^{14} C values. For total MOM with negative Δ^{14} C values, we assume the extracted or oxidized C is 'younger' if it has Δ^{14} C values that are either less negative or positive. For total MOM that initially has positive Δ^{14} C values, we might expect 'older' C residues to have either higher Δ^{14} C values (closer to the bomb peak) or negative Δ^{14} C values; in both cases we expect 'younger' extracted Δ^{14} C values to have positive Δ^{14} C values. Our previous results based on temporal changes of Δ^{14} C values of MOC at the Hainich site (Schrumpf and Kaiser, 2015),
- 195 indicate that total MOC in our soils will have turnover times > 20 years. Therefore, if extracted/oxidized OC has Δ^{14} C values that are higher than unextracted or residual MOM, we refer to these as younger throughout the manuscript.
 - 6

To determine the amount of carbon in the residues from both extraction procedures, we multiplied the measured OC content in the recovered residues with its mass. The amount of carbon lost by the treatments was determined as difference between the original OC content of the HF sample and OC in the residues. The radiocarbon contents of the H_2O_2 residues were directly measured, and the ¹⁴C fraction of the OC lost/extracted (¹⁴C_{extract}) was determined by mass balance as follows:

$${}^{14}C_{HF} = (OC_{extract}/OC_{HF}) \cdot {}^{14}C_{extract} + (OC_{residue}/OC_{HF}) \cdot {}^{14}C_{residue}$$
$${}^{14}C_{extract} = ({}^{14}C_{HF} - (OC_{residue}/OC_{HF}) \cdot {}^{14}C_{residue})/(OC_{extract}/OC_{HF})$$

200

205

The same formula was used to determine the ¹⁴C fraction of OC extracted by NaF/NaOH. Since OC extracted by NaF/NaOH extraction was also measured directly, the mass balance results allow for identifying potential bias in measured ¹⁴C data caused by losses of extracted OC during dialyses.

Solid-state cross-polarization magic angle spinning ¹³C-nuclear magnetic resonance (CPMAS ¹³C-NMR) spectra of NaF/NaOH extracted, dialyzed, and freeze-dried OM were recorded on an Avance III spectrometer (Bruker BioSpin GmbH, Rheinstetten, Germany) at a resonance frequency of 100.5 MHz, with a proton spin-lock and decoupling frequency of 400 MHz. The proton nutation frequency was 80 kHz, corresponding to a $\pi/2$ pulse duration of 3.12 μ s. The cross-polarization

- 210 time was 500 µs. Samples were weighed into 4-mm zirconium oxide rotors that were spun at 10 kHz around an axis declined by the 'magic angle' of 54.74° against the static magnetic field; contact time was 1 ms and the recycle delay time was set to 0.4 s. Depending on the sample, between 4,000 and 35,000 scans were recorded. The spectra were processed with a line broadening of 100 Hz. Chemical shifts are given relative to the resonance of tetramethylsilane. After baseline correction, the intensities of spectral regions were corrected for different cross-polarization efficiencies in different spectral regions. To do
- so, ${}^{1}\text{H} T_{1p}$ as well as T_{CH} were estimated selectively for the regions. Since OM samples with C contents >30% were analyzed, no treatment for removal of paramagnetic mineral phases was required and the obtained spectra were well resolved and showed no indications of paramagnetic interferences. In addition, we analyzed one bulk MOC sample low in pedogenic oxides without removal of paramagnetic phases. In all cases, spectra were reasonably well resolved and without indications of paramagnetic interferences.
- 220 Resonance areas were calculated by electronic integration: alkyl region (0–50 ppm), mainly representing C atoms bonded to other C atoms (methyl, methylene, methine groups); O/N-alkyl region (50–110 ppm), mainly representing C bonded to O and N (carbohydrates, alcohols, and ethers) and including the methoxyl C (peak centered around 56 ppm); phenolic/aromatic region (110–160 ppm), representing C in aromatic systems and olefins, and (d) the carbonyl region (160–220 ppm), including carboxyl C (160–190 ppm). Further information on the assignment of ¹³C-NMR regions are given by Wilson 225 (1987) and Orem and Hatcher (1987).

3 Results

3.1 Mineral-associated organic carbon extracted by NaF/NaOH

The NaF/NaOH extraction removed on average $58\pm11\%$ of bulk MOC across sites and soil depths (Figure 1). Extraction efficiency was not explained by soil depth, as average extraction removal values were $57\pm7\%$ in the uppermost, $60\pm15\%$ in

- 230 the intermediate, and 56±11% in the deepest analyzed soil layer. Average extraction efficiency was smaller at the Gebesee site compared to other sites (41±10% vs. 62±11% on average across depths). The amounts of extracted and residual OC, which represent similar proportions of bulk MOC, were strongly correlated to bulk MOC concentrations across sites and soil depths (r=0.96, p<0.01; Figure 2, Figure A2). Neither contents of pedogenic oxides, OC loadings of minerals, nor soil pH affected the proportion of extractable MOC. However, since bulk MOC concentration was positively related to contents of</p>
- pedogenic oxides (Schrumpf et al. 2013), the same relationship applied to OC concentrations in extraction residues (Figure 3).

3.1 Radiocarbon contents of NaF/NaOH extracts and residues

Directly measured Δ^{14} C values of dialyzed NaF/NaOH extracts were comparable to calculated Δ^{14} C values in extracts using 240 the mass balance approach (Figure 4), suggesting that there were no systematic losses of older or younger C during the extraction and subsequent dialysis procedure. The only exceptions were the results from Gebesee, where the mass balance approach suggests that some young carbon was lost during dialysis of the extracts.

Extracted fractions had consistently higher Δ^{14} C values than extraction residues, and Δ^{14} C values decreased with depth at all sites (Figure 5). The Δ^{14} C values of the OC extracted from the uppermost layers increased in the order Gebesee (Chernozem) < Wetzstein (0-10 cm, Podzol) < Laqueuille (Andosol) < Hainich (Cambisol) < Hesse (Luvisol) from -126‰ to 142‰. The average difference in Δ^{14} C between extracted and residue OC was 79±36‰ across sites and increased in the order Gebesee (34±4‰) < Laqueuille (38±6‰) < Hainich (63±3‰) < Hesse (84±5‰) < Wetzstein (100±15‰). As indicated by the almost parallel shifts in Δ^{14} C values, there was no general trend for increasing or declining differences in ¹⁴C contents with soil

250 depth (Figure 5). Instead, Δ^{14} C values of extracts and extraction residues were highly correlated (r²=0.91, p<0.01, supplementary Figure A3). However, Δ^{14} C values of bulk MOC, extractable or residual MOC were all unrelated to total MOC or its extractability (results not shown).

255 3.3 NMR spectroscopy of NaF/NaOH treated samples

The NMR spectra of extracted OM from soils of the sites Hainich, Hesse, and Laqueille were remarkably similar and dominated by signals in the O/N-alkyl C region (62-74% of total peak area across sites and depths) and the alkyl C region (18-25%), suggesting a strong contribution of carbohydrates and aliphatic compounds to the extracted OM (Figure 6, Table 1). All six spectra also reveal a distinct peak centered around 174 ppm, due to carboxyl C, which is in line with the fact that

260 the alkaline extraction tends to preferentially release acidic compounds (5-9%). All spectra show small signals in the aromatic regions centered around 150 ppm (phenols) and 130 ppm (non-substituted aromatic systems). All six spectra featured signals, some even well-resolved, around 56 ppm, indicating the presence of methoxyl C.

The spectra obtained on OM extracted from the Chernozem-type soil at site Gebesee resembles those of the sites Hainich, Hesse, and Laqueille, except for that they indicate more non-substituted aromatic systems, which is consistent with the occurrence of pyrogenic OM in this soil type. When comparing the spectra of OM from top- and subsoils, differences were surprisingly small at Hainich, Hesse, Laqueille, and Gebesee, with proportions of alkyl and aromatic C tending to decrease in favor of increased signals of O/N-alkyl C. The contribution of carbonyl/carboxyl C remained constant with soil depth.

The spectra obtained on extracted OM from the Podzol-type soil at Wetzstein showed the strongest deviation in spectral features. The signals due to carbonyl/carboxyl, aromatic, and alkyl C were much more prominent than in all other spectra. Also the change in composition with depth was much more evident for the Podzol site Wetzstein than the others. Here,

aromatic and alkyl C decreased while O/N-alkyl increased, reflecting the strong re-distribution of OM along the profile during podzolization. The composition of the subsoil OM at Wetzstein approached that of the OM at the sites Hainich, Hesse, and Laqueille.

To understand how the extract differed from the bulk and residual fractions, we also analyzed the bulk MOM and the

275 NaF/NaOH extraction residue of the Hainich 0-5 cm sample. The signal-to-noise ratio of these spectra was lower than in the extracted OM due to the presence of paramagnetic minerals (Figure 7). Nevertheless, the results reveal larger proportions of carbonyl/carboxyl C and especially phenolic/aromatic C but less O/N-alkyl C for the extraction residue than in the extracted OM (Figure 7, Table 2).

3.4 MOC oxidation in heated H₂O₂

- On average, only 11±6% of MOC resisted treatment with heated H₂O₂, with 90±8% of MOC oxidized in the uppermost layer, 90±6% oxidized in the intermediate layer, and 87±5% oxidized in deepest studied soil layer (Figure 1). The proportion of MOC resisting the H₂O₂ treatment differed between study sites. The largest proportion of H₂O₂-resistant MOC was found at the Wetzstein site (Podzol, on average 19±4%), especially in the deepest layer, while the smallest proportions of H₂O₂resistant MOC occurred at Gebesee (Chernozem, 5±3%). The absolute amount of H₂O₂-resistant OC was correlated with the
- 285 bulk MOC concentration (r=0.76, p<0.01; Figure 2) but the correlation was weaker than the one found for residual OC after NaF/NaOH extraction and bulk MOC.
 - 9

Residues of the H₂O₂ treatment had much lower Δ^{14} C values than residues of the NaF/NaOH extractions (Figure 5). The average Δ^{14} C values of H₂O₂ residues ranged between -36±8‰ (Laqueuille) and -691±21‰ (Gebesee) in the uppermost, and between -310±73‰ (Wetzstein) and -630±70‰ (Hainich) in the deepest layer (Figure 5). The difference between Δ^{14} C

values of oxidized and residual OC in the uppermost layer increased in the order Laqueuille = Wetzstein (115‰) < Hesse 290 (239‰) < Hainich (290‰) < Gebesee (591‰), and increased slightly with soil depth at Hesse, Hainich, and Wetzstein. When comparing Δ^{14} C values of OC removed by either NaF/NaOH or H₂O₂ treatments, we were surprised to find no ¹⁴Cdifference for most sites (Figure 8), despite different amounts of OC being removed by the individual procedures. The almost parallel shift in Δ^{14} C values of H₂O₂ residues from NaF/NaOH residues in all soil profiles indicate that both were

highly correlated within depth profiles (Figure 8). For the sites rich in pedogenic oxides, Wetzstein and Lagueuille (Podzol 295 and Andosol), Δ^{14} C values in NaF/NaOH residues deviated from H₂O₂ residues by only 62±26‰. In contrast the difference in extraction and oxidation residual Δ^{14} C values were 258±99‰ for the Luvisol and Cambisol sites Hesse and Hainich (Figure 8). The only exception was again the Chernozem site (Gebesee), where OC extracted by NaF/NaOH was on average younger than OC removed by H₂O₂, and ¹⁴C contents of the two residues differed on average by 456±135‰ and were not 300 correlated.

4 Discussion

4.1 Unexpected similarity of the NaF/NaOH-extractable MOC

Strong hysteresis, rendering part of adsorbed OC resistant to desorption, is a common phenomenon found in sorptiondesorption experiments with OM (Gu et al., 1994; Oren and Chefetz, 2012). Given that desorption rates in ambient soil 305 solutions are low, we consider NaF/NaOH extractability an indicator for maximum potential desorption. Because the NaF/NaOH extraction offers ideal desorption conditions of the combination of competing OH⁻ and F⁻ anions and alkaline conditions, the method targets OC bound to minerals by Coulombic forces and surface complexation. The OC desorbed likely also includes OC held by different weaker forces, such as hydrogen bonds, cation bridges, or hydrophobic interactions.

- We expected that the proportion of extractable C would increase with OC loading of minerals and thus be higher in topsoils 310 with larger MOC concentrations than in subsoil layers with smaller concentrations. Since minerals have different characteristic dominant binding modes for OC at a given pH (Mikutta et al., 2007), we further assumed that extractability would depend on mineral composition and soil pH, with the lowest desorption in acidic soils with larger amounts of pedogenic oxides (i.e. the Podzol or the Andosol site in our study). And finally, we expected that land use- and site-specific
- differences in OM quality would influence MOC extraction. Our results showed, however, that for our four uncultivated test 315 sites a surprisingly constant proportion of on average $62\pm11\%$ of the MOC was extracted by NaF/NaOH, irrespective of soil depth, study site, and original OC concentration. Thus, despite the presumed variation in the chemical composition of litter input and the mineral assemblage between sites, actual interactions between soil OC and minerals were uniform.

Laboratory experiments showed similar proportions of extracted OC by NaF/NaOH from two Fe oxides, despite differences

- 320 in the absolute amounts of OC sorbed by goethite and ferrihydrite (Kaiser et al., 2007). The amounts extracted from these model MOC were surprisingly similar to results of this study (around 65%, Kaiser et al., 2007). Results from another experiment in which OC was extracted with NaOH from experimentally produced MOC on goethite also extracted a similar fraction of MOC (57-60%, Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2007). Thus, we expected to observe more extractable MOC at sites poor in Al and Fe oxides but rich in clay minerals (like for the Cambisol at Hainich with 50-70% clay), which we expected
- 325 would have a larger share of weakly bound OC on MOC. It is possible that some of the weakly bonded OC was already lost in the preceding density fractionation with Na polytungstate solution (Schrumpf et al., 2013). However, the uniform extractability suggests that the extracted OC was bound to minerals by the same mechanism, irrespective of mineral composition. This indicates that either the same dominant bond mechanism operates for different minerals, or that extracted OC originated predominantly from one mineral type. While OC adsorbed by covalent bonds is usually associated with
- 330 pedogenic oxides, covalent bonds have also been shown to bind OC on the edges of clay minerals. (e.g. Chen et al., 2017; Gu et al., 1994). In our study, the linear relation between MOC and extraction residues with the sum of oxalate-extractable Al and dithionite-extractable Fe indicates that pedogenic Al and Fe oxides were important for OC binding across the study sites (Figure 3, A3). Even very high clay contents (>50%), such as at the Hainich site, could not compensate for lower pedogenic oxide content, resulting in lower MOC storage. The measured uniform extractability of MOC is therefore likely an immediate result of the pedogenic oxides controlling MOC accumulation.
- The similar chemical composition of MOC extracted from the sites Hainich, Hesse, and Laqueuille further supports a uniform mechanism dominating association of organic C with minerals, especially given the lack of variation with pedogenic oxide content. One explanation could be that the type of sorptive interaction targeted by the NaF/NaOH extraction selects for a specific composition of the extracted MOC. Alternatively, the similar MOC composition may reflect uniform microbial
- 340 processing of the organic input (Liang et al., 2017). However, the different chemical composition at the sites Gebesee and Wetzstein suggest that site-specific properties and pedogenic properties can indeed influence MOC composition. For the Chernozem at Gebesee, higher contents of non-substituted aromatic systems are likely due to a different vegetation history, where also fire played a role. Differences in OM composition between the sites Wetzstein and Laqueille were surprising, since the pedo-environmental conditions (acidity and mineralogy) of OM accumulation in Podzol-type and Andosol-type soil
- 345 are often considered similar (Aran et al., 2001; Young et al., 1980). The unique MOC composition in the podzol-type soil is likely due to the unique decomposition conditions at that site (conifer-dominated vegetation, pH, microbial community, soil climate), which subsequently uniquely influences the dissolved organic carbon (DOC) production and chemistry at that site. Experiments on model minerals suggested that desorption increases with increasing OC loading of minerals, i.e. when more OC is bound per mineral content of a sample (Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2007). This is consistent with our observation of
- 350 reduced NaF/NaOH extraction at the agricultural soil Gebesee, where OC loading of minerals is reduced relative to undisturbed soils due to lower inputs, increased mineralization, and soil mixing by plowing (Plante et al., 2005; Helfrich et al., 2007). Although Figure 3 shows that for the same amount of pedogenic oxides, less OC was bound to MOM in subsoils,
 - 11

soil depth did not affect MOC extractability in this study. This result is supported by studies by Mikutta et al. (2010) and Möller et al. (2000), which observed no significant decrease in NaF/NaOH extractability of OC with soil depth. One

355 explanation for the uniform extraction with soil depth could be that DOC input to subsoils occurs mostly along specific flow paths (Bundt et al., 2001), enabling exposed mineral surfaces in subsoils to have similar OC loads as topsoils. Additionally, increasing pH with soil depth could reduce the sorption capacity of minerals in subsoils. Assuming that pH reduces the total number of available sorption sites at depth, the same proportion of available sorption sites could be occupied in subsoils than in topsoils, despite a smaller ratio of OC-to-pedogenic oxide contents. Whatever the mechanism, our findings confirm that a 360 decline in potential desorption is not responsible for greater subsoil OC stability (Rumpel and Kögel-Knabner, 2011) and cannot explain increased carbon ages of MOC with depth.

4.2 MOC desorption and \Delta^{14}C values

Results of ¹⁴C analyses of NaF/NaOH extracts and residues confirmed our hypothesis of preferential extraction of younger carbon, with lower Δ¹⁴C-values in residues compared to extracts or unextracted MOM across soil types and depths. These
findings indicate that desorption facilitates the exchange of old OC for new OC on mineral surfaces, while non-extractable OC is less frequently exchanged. Using Na pyrophosphate as extractant, Heckman et al. (2018) also observed consistently younger OC in MOC extracts and older OC in extraction residues across different soils and soil depths. We expected Na pyrophosphate would have a similar effect on MOC as NaF/NaOH due to the comparable increase in pH and because both pyrophosphate and fluoride act as chelating agents to strongly compete with OC for binding sites on mineral surfaces.

- 370 Some MOC may be resistant to extraction due to multiple chemical bonds binding the OC with greater strength to mineral surfaces (Kaiser and Guggenberger, 2007). Since multiple bonds require a higher number of involved functional groups, OC of extraction residues of multiply bonded OC should be enriched in carboxylic groups. Our NMR data support the resistance mechanism of multiple bonds, showing a higher share of carbonyl/carboxyl groups in non-extractable than in extractable MOC from the Hainich site. Phenolic and aromatic groups, which are also known to bind preferentially and strongly to
- 375 mineral surfaces (Chorover and Amistadi, 2001; Kothawala et al., 2012; Avneri-Katz et al., 2017), were also enriched in the residues, while O/N-alkyl-C was depleted. Given this mechanism, we expect the non-desorbable OC to be composed of aromatic and other compounds strongly bound to mineral surfaces by multiple functional groups, but this remains to be tested in future studies.

Our results did not confirm our original expectation, that the average age of MOC is inversely related to its extraction in

380 NaF/NaOH, due to the strength of the stabilizing chemical bonds in non-desorbable MOC. This may be a direct consequence of the small variation in OC extractability between samples and shows that extraction in NaF/NaOH is not able to explain between-site variation in Δ^{14} C values.

4.3 Comparison between NaF/NaOH extraction and H₂O₂ oxidation results

As expected, residues of H₂O₂ treatments were older than residues of NaF/NaOH extractions. We further hypothesized that

- the heated H₂O₂ treatment would remove a larger and on average more stable fraction, and therefore the oxidized OC would have an older mean age than the extracted OC. While H₂O₂ removed on average 89% of bulk HF-OC and NaF/NaOH removed only 62%, the ¹⁴C ages of MOC removed by oxidation were surprisingly comparable to those extracted by NaF/NaOH. This result indicates that NaF/NaOH residues contain oxidizable OC of similar or only slightly older age as the extracted material. We found that both NaF/NaOH and H₂O₂ mostly removed OC from a younger, ¹⁴C-enriched pool, resulting in increasingly old residual OC as more OC is removed. Jagadamma et al. (2010) similarly observed that
- ³⁹⁰ resulting in increasingly old residual OC as more OC is removed. Jagadamma et al. (2010) similarly observed that sequentially stronger oxidants removed C with similar ¹⁴C contents, irrespective of the extent of OC removal. Applying a mass balance approach to the results of the extraction procedures used by Helfrich et al. (2007) showed similar soil ¹⁴C contents of removed OC, irrespective of the extracted OC amounts. Accordingly, a large proportion of MOC is more homogenous in ¹⁴C contents than previously thought, while only a small proportion is very old.
- 395 The Δ¹⁴C difference between NaF/NaOH and oxidation residues was unexpectedly smaller for the two soils rich in pedogenic oxides (Laqueuille, Wetzstein) compared to the Luvisol and the Cambisol. The soils rich in pedogenic oxides had slightly higher amounts of OC left in oxidation residues, suggesting that they protected a larger proportion of OC against oxidation. Eusterhues et al. (2005) similarly observed that more OC resisted H₂O₂ oxidation in subsoils rich in pedogenic oxides, and older residues in the Dystriic Cambisol than the Haplic Podzol studied. This study, in combination with our results, suggests that high contents of pedogenic oxides in soils increase oxidation resistance of MOC but do not increase
- residue ages. Accordingly, also oxidation is likely not the dominant mechanism for exchange of OC on these mineral surfaces. The relatively young oxidation residues at Wetzstein and Laqueuille in our study could be due to high DOC fluxes, and thus, overall faster OC replacement of all MOC components at the Podzol site Wetzstein, and the younger soil age of the Andosol soil at Laqueuille. It is further possible that at some of the sites, old oxidation-resistant OC was inherited from the parent material (e.g., the loess layer or limestone residues at Hainich and Hesse) or a specific fire history (e.g., at the
- Chernozem site Gebesee, where only small, but very old amounts of OC were left after the H₂O₂ treatment).

4.4 Changes in OC turnover along soil profiles

The close correlations between Δ^{14} C values of NaF/NaOH extracts and residues along the soil profiles (see also Figure A4) result in a parallel decline in Δ^{14} C values of both fractions with soil depths. Not only was the same proportion of OC extracted across soil depths, but also the absolute differences between Δ^{14} C values of extracts and residues remained constant. The observed constant extractability indicates that changes in Δ^{14} C with depth are not driven by an increase in the stability of residual or extractable OC. This suggests that (1) the distribution fast and slower cycling MOC is constant with depth and that (2) the shape of the ¹⁴C distribution of MOC (if we consider ¹⁴C in MOC to be a continuum) remains constant with depth. This is supported by the observation that residues of the H₂O₂ treatment, though on average much older, declined



- 415 almost parallel to NaF/NaOH residues with soil depth. The factor that causes the decline of Δ^{14} C values with soil depth is shifting the entire ¹⁴C distribution of MOC. This, along with the uniform extractability, suggests that subsoil and topsoil MOC are at comparable equilibriums with their environment, and the reasons for overall ¹⁴C declines with depth in soils are not due to changes in the character of mineral- organic matter stabilization mechanisms.
- Previous studies showed that the oxidation resistant proportion of bulk soil samples increased with soil depth (Butnor et al., 2017; Eusterhues et al., 2005). While the MOC analyzed in this study showed only a small and insignificant trend in oxidation resistance with depth, we observed a stronger decline in Δ^{14} C values of oxidation residues with depth relative to bulk MOC. Thus, oxidation resistance (i.e., chemical recalcitrance), rather than desorption resistance could contribute to some extent to the formation of stable MOC with soil depth. The divergence of oxidized and residual Δ^{14} C values as more OC is oxidized occurred across sites (Figure A5), suggesting an overall trend of increasingly older OC with smaller amounts of OC remaining on the minerals.
- 8

5 Synthesis and implications

5.1 Suitability of chemical fractionation schemes to study MOC stability

NaF/NaOH extraction and H₂O₂ oxidation results suggest that, rather than averaging over a wide distribution of ages, the majority of total MOC has very similar ¹⁴C contents, with only a small proportion (on average <12%) of total MOC being much older than the mean of the extracted or oxidized fractions. The different chemical fractionation schemes removed OC from the same pool, leaving increasingly old OC behind. Neither chemical oxidation nor NaF/NaOH extractability of MOC were related to the Δ^{14} C values of the removed OC. The combined application of several fractionation schemes can therefore help identify ¹⁴C distributions of samples (see Figure A6), but their value for explaining site-specific differences in Δ^{14} C values is limited.

435 5.2 Similarity of MOC extraction results across sites

The initial assumption of this study was that the stability of mineral-bound OC would be related to desorption, and thus, vary between soils with different mineral composition and under different land use. We found that OC extracted in NaF/NaOH was indeed consistently younger than bulk MOC, suggesting that desorbed OC was more frequently exchanged than the older residue. The chemical uniformity of extracted MOC for three sites (two beech forests and one grassland) suggests a certain selection for specific OC molecules during MOC formation or that microbial processing of OC on mineral surfaces homogenizes MOC composition relative to original OM differences from litter and vegetation types. However, the Podzol site and the Chernozem site deviated from the pattern of the other results, indicating that factors including decomposition conditions affecting DOC or a specific fire history can affect the organic matter composition of MOC.

Despite differences in mineral and chemical composition, extractability of MOC was uniform across non-cultivated soils and

- 445 depths for the acid to neutral central European soils studied. Based on these results, most extractable MOC is formed from specific interactive functional groups, including metal-coordinated hydroxyl groups on the minerals and carboxyl groups of OM. The minerals or OM molecules that these groups are attached to are interchangeable. Since total MOC amounts were controlled by contents of pedogenic Al and Fe oxides across sites, extraction results may mostly reflect the response of oxides, which would overshadow potential mineral-specific differences in binding strengths observed in pure minerals in the
- 450 laboratory. This supports the paradigm that oxides are more important than clay for OC storage in soil (Rasmussen et al., 2018) and could facilitate modelling of MOC formation and turnover in the future.

5.3 Subsoil MOC stability

455

We observed no indication of the presence of stronger, less desorbable bonds between OC and minerals in subsoils than topsoils, and declines in the ¹⁴C content of extracts and extraction residues with depth paralleled each other. Consequently, subsoil OC was not better protected against desorption, and thus, potential subsequent degradation than topsoil OC. Although older, subsoil MOC can be equally vulnerable to changes in soil environmental conditions like temperature.

Reduced NaF/NaOH-extraction at the cropland site indicates that desorption may be explained in part by OC loading of minerals. A possible explanation for the missing depth gradient in MOC extraction is that subsoil MOC is typically at a similar equilibrium with the local conditions as the topsoil. This could be the case if OC input to undisturbed subsoils occurs
mostly in hotspots, for example via root inputs or along preferential flow paths, where OC binds to exposed mineral surfaces but bypasses surfaces located inside aggregates or away from such hot spots.

5.4 Alternative hypothesis for site- and depth-specific differences in ¹⁴C

- Originally, we expected that the persistence of MOC would be related to different bond strengths expressed between OM
 and minerals, and that these should vary with soil depth and mineralogy, and could be identified by differing extractability into NaF-NaOH (Figure 9). Our results revealed, however, an overall similarity in MOC composition and extractability across sites, despite site-specific variations in Δ¹⁴C values. Since Δ¹⁴C values of bulk MOC and its fractions were therefore independent of OC resistance to desorption and soil mineralogy, site specific differences are likely driven by factors driving MOC accumulation and displacement, rather than intrinsic differences in bond stabilities. Assuming that MOC is the product of DOC entering and leaving mineral surfaces, Δ¹⁴C values of MOC should be sensitive to site-specific differences in fluxes, composition and Δ¹⁴C values of DOC (Figure 9). These metrics should reflect differences in overall ecosystem properties and decomposition conditions, including litter chemistry, soil pH, microbial community composition or climate, rather than soil mineralogy. Differences in depth profiles of Δ¹⁴C values would then be caused variations in OC input by roots and DOC transport. Under conditions of lower direct litter input, vertical OC transport e.g. the "cycling downwards" concept (Kaiser
 - 15

and Kalbitz, 2012) would shape the trends of Δ^{14} C values with depth. Alternatively, differences in the stability of pedogenic oxide minerals themselves are also shaped by soil environmental factors.

For example, at the Podzol site Wetzstein, the thick organic layer (8-14 cm) overlying the topsoil could have contributed to old Δ^{14} C values of total and extractable MOC in the uppermost mineral layer relative to the other undisturbed sites via input of pre-aged DOC. Kindler et al. (2011) measured much higher DOC leaching rates from topsoils at Wetzstein than at

- 480 Laqueuille or Hainich, despite only slightly higher subsoil leaching rates, suggesting that a large proportion of this mobilized topsoil DOC at Wetzstein was adsorbed in the subsoil. The absorption of leachate in the subsoil explains the shallower depth decline of ¹⁴C compared to the other two sites. Future research on the role of DOC formation, composition and Δ^{14} C values for accumulation and exchange rates of OC on mineral surfaces along soil profiles under field conditions will contribute to the understanding of the age distribution of MOC in soils.
- 485

7 Appendices : see supplementary tables and figures

8 Code availability: not applicable

9 Data availability: Data will be published in the ISRAD database

490 10 Sample availability: all remaining material of original MOC samples and the obtained fractions is stored at the MPI-BGC and can be made available upon request.

11 Video supplement: none

- 12 Supplement link: not applicable unless primary data should be provided for review in the supplement
- 13 Team list: who should be mentioned in addition to people contributing as authors or added to the acknowledgement?

495 14 Author contributions

MS, KK, AM and ST designed the experiments and AM carried them out. GH conducted the NMR analyses. MS prepared the manuscript with contributions from all co-authors.

15 Competing interests: none

16 Disclaimer The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial

500 relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

17 not applicable

18 Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the Routine Measurements and Analyses group (Roma, Ines Hilke and Birgit Fröhlich), and the ¹⁴C Analytik group (Axel Steinhof, Heike Machts) of the Max-Planck Institute for Biogeochemistry and Xiaomei Xu (UC

505 Irvine) for their help with sample analyses.

19 References

Aran, D., Gury, M., and Jeanroy, E.: Organo-metallic complexes in an Andosol: a comparative study with a Cambisol and Podzol, Geoderma, 99, 65-79, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(00)00064-1</u>, 2001.

- Avneri-Katz, S., Young, R. B., McKenna, A. M., Chen, H., Corilo, Y. E., Polubesova, T., Borch, T., and Chefetz, B.: Adsorptive fractionation of dissolved organic matter (DOM) by mineral soil: Macroscale approach and molecular insight, Org. Geochem., 103, 113-124, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.orggeochem.2016.11.004, 2017.
 - Bruun, T. B., Elberling, B., and Christensen, B. T.: Lability of soil organic carbon in tropical soils with different clay minerals, Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 42, 888-895, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2010.01.009</u>, 2010.
- Bundt, M., Jaggi, M., Blaser, P., Siegwolf, R., and Hagedorn, F.: Carbon and nitrogen dynamics in preferential flow paths and matrix of a forest soil, Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J., 65, 1529-1538, <u>https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2001.6551529x</u>, 2001.
- Butnor, J. R., Samuelson, L. J., Johnsen, K. H., Anderson, P. H., González Benecke, C. A., Boot, C. M., Cotrufo, M. F., Heckman, K. A., Jackson, J. A., Stokes, T. A., and Zarnoch, S. J.: Vertical distribution and persistence of soil organic carbon in fire-adapted longleaf pine forests, Forest Ecology and Management, 390, 15-26, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2017.01.014</u>, 2017.
- Chen, H., Koopal, L. K., Xiong, J., Avena, M., and Tan, W.: Mechanisms of soil humic acid adsorption onto montmorillonite and kaolinite, Journal of Colloid and Interface Science, 504, 457-467, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2017.05.078</u>, 2017.
- Chenu, C., and Stotzky, G.: Interactions between microorganisms and soil particles: an overview, in: Interactions between Soil Particles and Microorganisms: Impact on the Terrestrial Ecosystem, edited by: Huang, P. M., Bollag, J.-M., and Senesi, N., John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, Chichester, 3-40, 2002.
- Chorover, J., and Amistadi, M. K.: Reaction of forest floor organic matter at goethite, birnessite and smectite surfaces, Geochim. 525 Cosmochim. Acta, 65, 95-109, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7037(00)00511-1</u>, 2001.
- Cotrufo, M. F., Soong, J. L., Horton, A. J., Campbell, E. E., Haddix, M. L., Wall, D. H., and Parton, A. J.: Formation of soil organic matter via biochemical and physical pathways of litter mass loss, Nat. Geosci., 8, 776+, 10.1038/ngeo2520, 2015.
- Cotrufo, M. F., Ranalli, M. G., Haddix, M. L., Six, J., and Lugato, E.: Soil carbon storage informed by particulate and mineral-associated organic matter, Nat. Geosci., 12, 989-994, 10.1038/s41561-019-0484-6, 2019.
- 530 Eusterhues, K., Rumpel, C., Kleber, M., and Kogel-Knabner, I.: Stabilisation of soil organic matter by interactions with minerals as revealed by mineral dissolution and oxidative degradation, Org. Geochem., 34, 1591-1600, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.orggeochem.2003.08.007</u>, 2003.
- Eusterhues, K., Rumpel, C., and Kogel-Knabner, I.: Stabilization of soil organic matter isolated via oxidative degradation, Org. Geochem., 36, 1567-1575, 10.1016/j.orggeochem.2005.06.010, 2005.
- Eusterhues, K., Neidhardt, J., Hadrich, A., Kusel, K., and Totsche, K. U.: Biodegradation of ferrihydrite-associated organic matter, Biogeochemistry, 119, 45-50, 10.1007/s10533-013-9943-0, 2014.
 Gu, B., Schmitt, J., Chen, Z., Liang, L., and McCarthy, J. F.: Adsorption and desorption of natural organic matter on iron oxide:
- mechanisms and models, Environmental Science & Technology, 28, 38-46, 10.1021/es00050a007, 1994. Heckman, K., Lawrence, C. R., and Harden, J. W.: A sequential selective dissolution method to quantify storage and stability of organic carbon associated with Al and Fe hydroxide phases, Geoderma, 312, 24-35, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2017.09.043, 2018.
- Helfrich, M., Flessa, H., Mikutta, R., Dreves, A., and Ludwig, B.: Comparison of chemical fractionation methods for isolating stable soil organic carbon pools, Eur. J. Soil Sci., 58, 1316-1329, 10.1111/j.1365-2389.2007.00926.x, 2007.
 Hemingway, J. D., Rothman, D. H., Grant, K. E., Rosengard, S. Z., Eglinton, T. I., Derry, L. A., and Galy, V. V.: Mineral protection regulates long-term global preservation of natural organic carbon, Nature, 570, 228-231, 10.1038/s41586-019-1280-6, 2019.
- 545 Herold, N., Schoening, I., Michalzik, B., Trumbore, S., and Schrumpf, M.: Controls on soil carbon storage and turnover in German landscapes, Biogeochemistry, 119, 435-451, 10.1007/s10533-014-9978-x, 2014. Jagadamma, S., Lal, R., Ussiri, D. A. N., Trumbore, S. E., and Mestelan, S.: Evaluation of structural chemistry and isotopic signatures of
- refractory soil organic carbon fraction isolated by wet oxidation methods, Biogeochemistry, 98, 29-44, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-009-9374-0</u>, 2010. Jones, D. L., and Edwards, A. C.: Influence of sorption on the biological utilization of two simple carbon substrates, Soil Biol. Biochem.,
- 30, 1895-1902, 10.1016/s0038-0717(98)00060-1, 1998.
 Kaiser, K., and Zech, W.: Release of natural organic matter sorbed to oxides and a subsoil, Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J., 63, 1157-1166, 1999.
 Kaiser, K., and Guggenberger, G.: The role of DOM sorption to mineral surfaces in the preservation of organic matter in soils, Org. Geochem., 31, 711-725, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0146-6380(00)00046-2</u>, 2000.
- 555 Kaiser, K., and Guggenberger, G.: Sorptive stabilization of organic matter by microporous goethite: sorption into small pores vs. surface complexation, Eur. J. Soil Sci., 58, 45-59, <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2389.2006.00799.x</u>, 2007. Kaiser, K., Mikutta, R., and Guggenberger, G.: Increased stability of organic matter sorbed to ferrihydrite and goethite on aging, Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J., 71, 711-719, <u>https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2006.0189</u>, 2007.
- Kaiser, K., and Kalbitz, K.: Cycling downwards dissolved organic matter in soils, Soil Biol. Biochem., 52, 29-32, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.04.002, 2012.
 - 17

Kalbitz, K., Schwesig, D., Rethemeyer, J., and Matzner, E.: Stabilization of dissolved organic matter by sorption to the mineral soil, Soil Biol. Biochem., 37, 1319-1331, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2004.11.028</u>, 2005.

Kallenbach, C. M., Frey, S. D., and Grandy, A. S.: Direct evidence for microbial-derived soil organic matter formation and its ecophysiological controls, Nature Communications, 7, 13630, 10.1038/ncomms13630, 2016.

565 Keil, R. G., Montluçon, D. B., Prahl, F. G., and Hedges, J. I.: Sorptive preservation of labile organic matter in marine sediments, Nature, 370, 549-552, 10.1038/370549a0, 1994.

Khomo, L., Trumbore, S., Bern, C. R., and Chadwick, O. A.: Timescales of carbon turnover in soils with mixed crystalline mineralogies, SOIL, 3, 17-30, 10.5194/soil-3-17-2017, 2017.

- Kindler, R., Siemens, J., Kaiser, K., Walmsley, D. C., Bernhofer, C., Buchmann, N., Cellier, P., Eugster, W., Gleixner, G., Grunwald, T.,
 Heim, A., Ibrom, A., Jones, S. K., Jones, M., Klumpp, K., Kutsch, W., Larsen, K. S., Lehuger, S., Loubet, B., McKenzie, R., Moors, E.,
 Osborne, B., Pilegaard, K., Rebmann, C., Saunders, M., Schmidt, M. W. I., Schrumpf, M., Seyfferth, J., Skiba, U., Soussana, J. F., Sutton,
 M. A., Tefs, C., Vowinckel, B., Zeeman, M. J., and Kaupenjohann, M.: Dissolved carbon leaching from soil is a crucial component of the
- net ecosystem carbon balance, Global Change Biology, 17, 1167-1185, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02282.x, 2011.
 Kleber, M., Mikutta, R., Torn, M. S., and Jahn, R.: Poorly crystalline mineral phases protect organic matter in acid subsoil horizons, Eur. J. Soil Sci., 56, 717-725, 10.1111/j.1365-2389.2005.00706.x, 2005.
- Kleber, M., Eusterhues, K., Keiluweit, M., Mikutta, C., Mikutta, R., and Nico, P. S.: Chapter One Mineral–Organic Associations: Formation, Properties, and Relevance in Soil Environments, in: Advances in Agronomy, edited by: Donald, L. S., Academic Press, 1-140, 2015.
- Koarashi, J., Hockaday, W. C., Masiello, C. A., and Trumbore, S. E.: Dynamics of decadally cycling carbon in subsurface soils, J. 580 Geophys. Res.-Biogeosci., 117, 13, 10.1029/2012jg002034, 2012.
- Kögel-Knabner, I., Guggenberger, G., Kleber, M., Kandeler, E., Kalbitz, K., Scheu, S., Eusterhues, K., and Leinweber, P.: Organo-mineral associations in temperate soils: Integrating biology, mineralogy, and organic matter chemistry, Journal of Plant Nutrition and Soil Science, 171, 61-82, <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/jpln.200700048</u>, 2008.
- Kothawala, D. N., Roehm, C., Blodau, C., and Moore, T. R.: Selective adsorption of dissolved organic matter to mineral soils, Geoderma,
 189, 334-342, 10.1016/j.geoderma.2012.07.001, 2012.
- Lehmann, J., and Kleber, M.: The contentious nature of soil organic matter, Nature, 528, 60-68, 10.1038/nature16069, 2015. Levin, I., Naegler, T., Kromer, B., Diehl, M., Francey, R. J., Gomez-Pelaez, A. J., Steele, L. P., Wagenbach, D., Weller, R., and Worthy, D. E.: Observations and modelling of the global distribution and long-term trend of atmospheric 14CO(2), Tellus Series B-Chemical and Physical Meteorology, 62, 26-46, 2010.
- Liang, C., Schimel, J. P., and Jastrow, J. D.: The importance of anabolism in microbial control over soil carbon storage, Nature Microbiology, 2, 10.1038/nmicrobiol.2017.105, 2017.
 Mikutta, R., Kleber, M., Torn, M. S., and Jahn, R.: Stabilization of soil organic matter: Association with minerals or chemical recalcitrance?, Biogeochemistry, 77, 25-56, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-005-0712-6</u>, 2006.
 Mikutta, R., Mikutta, C., Kalbitz, K., Scheel, T., Kaiser, K., and Jahn, R.: Biodegradation of forest floor organic matter bound to minerals
- via different binding mechanisms, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 71, 2569-2590, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2007.03.002</u>, 2007.
 Mikutta, R., Schaumann, G. E., Gildemeister, D., Bonneville, S., Kramer, M. G., Chorover, J., Chadwick, O. A., and Guggenberger, G.:
- Biogeochemistry of mineral-organic associations across a long-term mineralogical soil gradient (0.3-4100 kyr), Hawaiian Islands, Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 73, 2034-2060, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2008.12.028</u>, 2009.
- Mikutta, R., Kaiser, K., Dörr, N., Vollmer, A., Chadwick, O. A., Chorover, J., Kramer, M. G., and Guggenberger, G.: Mineralogical impact on organic nitrogen across a long-term soil chronosequence (0.3–4100kyr), Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 74, 2142-2164, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2010.01.006, 2010.

Mikutta, R., and Kaiser, K.: Organic matter bound to mineral surfaces: Resistance to chemical and biological oxidation, Soil Biol. Biochem., 43, 1738-1741, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2011.04.012</u>, 2011.

Möller, A., Kaiser, K., Amelung, W., Niamskul, C., Udomsri, S., Puthawong, M., Haumaier, L., and Zech, W.: Forms of organic C and P
 extracted from tropical soils as assessed by liquid-state 13C- and 31P-NMR spectroscopy, Soil Research, 38, 1017-1036, https://doi.org/10.1071/SR99111, 2000.

Oren, A., and Chefetz, B.: Successive sorption-desorption cycles of dissolved organic matter in mineral soil matrices, Geoderma, 189-190, 108-115, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2012.05.004</u>, 2012.

Paul, E. A., Collins, H. P., and Leavitt, S. W.: Dynamics of resistant soil carbon of midwestern agricultural soils measured by naturally occurring ¹⁴C abundance, Geoderma, 104, 239-256, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(01)00083-0</u>, 2001.

- Paul, S., Veldkamp, E., and Flessa, H.: Differential response of mineral-associated organic matter in tropical soils formed in volcanic ashes and marine Tertiary sediment to treatment with HCl, NaOCl, and Na4P2O7, Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 40, 1846-1855, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2008.03.008</u>, 2008.
- Plante, A. F., Pernes, M., and Chenu, C.: Changes in clay-associated organic matter quality in a C depletion sequence as measured by differential thermal analyses, Geoderma, 129, 186-199, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2004.12.043</u>, 2005.

Poirier, N., Derenne, S., Balesdent, J., Mariotti, A., Massiot, D., and Largeau, C.: Isolation and analysis of the non-hydrolysable fraction of a forest soil and an arable soil (Lacadee, southwest France), Eur. J. Soil Sci., 54, 243-255, 10.1046/j.1365-2389.2003.00520.x, 2003.

- Porras, R. C., Hicks Pries, C. E., McFarlane, K. J., Hanson, P. J., and Torn, M. S.: Association with pedogenic iron and aluminum: effects on soil organic carbon storage and stability in four temperate forest soils, Biogeochemistry, 133, 333-345, 10.1007/s10533-017-0337-6, 2017.
- Porras, R. C., Hicks Pries, C. E., Torn, M. S., and Nico, P. S.: Synthetic iron (hydr)oxide-glucose associations in subsurface soil: Effects on decomposability of mineral associated carbon, Science of The Total Environment, 613-614, 342-351, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.08.290, 2018.
- Rasmussen, C., Southard, R. J., and Horwath, W. R.: Mineral control of organic carbon mineralization in a range of temperate conifer forest soils, Global Change Biology, 12, 834-847, 10.1111/j.1365-2486.2006.01132.x, 2006.
- Rasmussen, C., Heckman, K., Wieder, W. R., Keiluweit, M., Lawrence, C. R., Berhe, A. A., Blankinship, J. C., Crow, S. E., Druhan, J. L., Hicks Pries, C. E., Marin-Spiotta, E., Plante, A. F., Schädel, C., Schimel, J. P., Sierra, C. A., Thompson, A., and Wagai, R.: Beyond clay: towards an improved set of variables for predicting soil organic matter content, Biogeochemistry, 137, 297-306, 10.1007/s10533-018-0424-3, 2018.
- 630 Rumpel, C., and Kögel-Knabner, I.: Deep soil organic matter-a key but poorly understood component of terrestrial C cycle, Plant and Soil, 338, 143-158, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-010-0391-5</u>, 2011. Saidy, A. R., Smernik, R. J., Baldock, J. A., Kaiser, K., Sanderman, J., and Macdonald, L. M.: Effects of clay mineralogy and hydrous iron

oxides on labile organic carbon stabilisation, Geoderma, 173-174, 104-110, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2011.12.030</u>, 2012.

Schmidt, M. W. I., Torn, M. S., Abiven, S., Dittmar, T., Guggenberger, G., Janssens, I. A., Kleber, M., Kogel-Knabner, I., Lehmann, J.,
Manning, D. A. C., Nannipieri, P., Rasse, D. P., Weiner, S., and Trumbore, S. E.: Persistence of soil organic matter as an ecosystem property, Nature, 478, 49-56, 10.1038/nature10386, 2011.

Schrumpf, M., Kaiser, K., Guggenberger, G., Persson, T., Kögel-Knabner, I., and Schulze, E. D.: Storage and stability of organic carbon in soils as related to depth, occlusion within aggregates, and attachment to minerals, Biogeosciences, 10, 1675-1691, doi:10.5194/bg-10-1675-2013, 2013.

- 640 Schrumpf, M., and Kaiser, K.: Large differences in estimates of soil organic carbon turnover in density fractions by using single and repeated radiocarbon inventories, Geoderma, 239, 168-178, 10.1016/j.geoderma.2014.09.025, 2015. Singh, M., Sarkar, B., Biswas, B., Churchman, J., and Bolan, N. S.: Adsorption-desorption behavior of dissolved organic carbon by soil clay fractions of varying mineralogy, Geoderma, 280, 47-56, 10.1016/j.geoderma.2016.06.005, 2016. Singh, M., Sarkar, B., Biswas, B., Bolan, N. S., and Churchman, G. J.: Relationship between soil clay mineralogy and carbon protection
- 645 capacity as influenced by temperature and moisture, Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 109, 95-106, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2017.02.003, 2017.
 Six, J., Callewaert, P., Lenders, S., De Gryze, S., Morris, S. J., Gregorich, E. G., Paul, E. A., and Paustian, K.: Measuring and California a
- understanding carbon storage in afforested soils by physical fractionation, Soil Sci. Soc. Am. J., 66, 1981-1987, https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2002.1981, 2002.
- 650 Steinhof, A., Altenburg, M., and Machts, H.: Sample Preparation at the Jena 14C Laboratory, Radiocarbon, 59, 815-830, 10.1017/RDC.2017.50, 2017.

Swanston, C. W., Torn, M. S., Hanson, P. J., Southon, J. R., Garten, C. T., Hanlon, E. M., and Ganio, L.: Initial characterization of processes of soil carbon stabilization using forest stand-level radiocarbon enrichment, Geoderma, 128, 52-62, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2004.12.015, 2005.

- Torn, M. S., Trumbore, S. E., Chadwick, O. A., Vitousek, P. M., and Hendricks, D. M.: Mineral control of soil organic carbon storage and turnover, Nature, 389, 170-173, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/38260</u>, 1997.
 Trumbore, S. E., Vogel, J. S., and Southon, J. R.: AMS C-14 MEASUREMENTS OF FRACTIONATED SOIL ORGANIC-MATTER -AN APPROACH TO DECIPHERING THE SOIL CARBON-CYCLE, Radiocarbon, 31, 644-654, 1989.
 Trumbore, S. E., Sierra, C. A., and Hicks Pries, C. E.: Radiocarbon Nomenclature, Theory, Models, and Interpretation: Measuring Age,
- Determining Cycling Rates, and Tracing Source Pools, in: Radiocarbon and Climate Change: Mechanisms, Applications and Laboratory Techniques, edited by: Schuur, E. A. G., Druffel, E., and Trumbore, S. E., Springer International Publishing, Cham, 45-82, 2016.
 WRB, I. W. G.: World Reference Base for Soil Resources 2014, FAO, Rome, 2015.
 Xu, X., Trumbore, S. E., Zheng, S., Southon, J. R., McDuffee, K. E., Luttgen, M., and Liu, J. C.: Modifying a sealed tube zinc reduction
- method for preparation of AMS graphite targets: Reducing background and attaining high precision, Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms, 259, 320-329, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nimb.2007.01.175</u>, 2007.

Young, A. W., Campbell, A. S., and Walker, T. W.: Allophane isolated from a podsol developed on a non-vitric parent material, Nature, 284, 46-48, 10.1038/284046a0, 1980.

670

List of figures and tables

695

Figure 1: Proportion of OC extractable with NaF/NaOH or oxidized with heated H₂O₂ from the mineral associated OC fractions of soil samples from five different sites (Hainich, Hesse, Laqueuille, Wetzstein, Gebesee) and three soil depths (0-5 cm, 10-20 cm, 30-40 cm); for Wetzstein the studied soil depths were 0-10 cm, 10-30 cm, and 30-50 cm.

- 675 Figure 2: Residual OC depended on original concentrations of mineral associated OC for A) NaF/NaOH extraction (left) and B) the H₂O₂ oxidation (right) for all study sites (Hainich (Ha), Hesse (He), Laqueuille (La), Wetzstein (We), Gebesee (Ge)).
 Figure 3: OC concentrations in each fraction (bulk MOC, NaF/NaOH extraction residue, and oxidation residue) was related to the pedogenic oxide content of the sample, which is expressed as the sum of the acid oxalate-extractable Al and dithionite-extractable Fe.
- 680 Figure 4: Comparison of ¹⁴C contents of NaF/NaOH extracted OC obtained using a mass balance approach with direct measurements of the extracts after dialyses (study sites: Hainich (Ha), Hesse (He), Laqueuille (La), and Wetzstein (We) on the left, Gebesee (Ge) on the right).

Figure 5: Depth profiles of radiocarbon (Δ^{14} C) in bulk mineral associated OC (bulk MOC), as well as in OC removed from mineral surfaces using either NaF/NaOH or H₂O₂, and in the respective OC residues remaining on mineral surfaces.

685 Figure 6: NMR spectra of OM extracted into NaF/NaOH from the mineral associated fraction of two soil depths from the five study sites Gebesee (Chernozem, cropland), Hainich (Cambisol, beech), Hesse (Luvisol, beech), Laqueuille (Andosol, grassland), and Wetzstein (Podzol, spruce).

Figure 7: NMR spectra of OM from the 0-5 cm layer of the site Hainich (Cambisol, beech). Top: total mineral associated OM (MOM), middle: MOM-fraction extracted into NaF/NaOH, bottom: residual OM after extraction of MOM into NaF/NaOH.

690 Figure 8: Relationships between the radiocarbon content of OC removed from mineral surfaces by H₂O₂ and NaF/NaOH (upper graphs) and the radiocarbon content of OC residues after treatment with H₂O₂ and NaF/NaOH (lower graphs) for the study sites Hainich (Ha), Hesse (He), Laqueuille (La), Wetzstein (We), and Gebesee (Ge).

Figure 9: Graphical summary of (1) original expectations (left) where potential MOC desorption explains MOC persistence and varies with mineral composition and soil depth; (2) the observation of site-independent desorption (right), and alternative hypotheses explaining variations in Δ^{14} C values of MOC across sites and with depth.