

Interactive comment on “Multi-year CO₂ budgets in South African semi-arid Karoo ecosystems under different grazing intensities” by Oksana Rybchak et al.

Marc Aubinet (Referee)

marc.aubinet@ulg.ac.be

Received and published: 4 January 2021

Most of the comment I made in this review are quite basic as they highlight elementary errors (insufficient treatment of the data and over-interpretation of the results, notably). By having often worked with PhD students in their early career, I know that such “youthful errors” are frequent. They are, to my opinion excusable and probably normal for beginner scientists.

However, it is the responsibility of the promoter(s) to correct them and help the PhD student driving his/her analysis and this should have been done during the writing process, before submitting the paper. As a promotor, I would never have authorized

C1

a PhD student or a Post Doc to submit a manuscript in this shape. By reviewing this paper, I had the bad feeling to do the work of the promoter in his/her place.

Interactive comment on Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2020-420, 2020>.

C2