

Co-Editor-in-Chief Decision: Publish subject to minor revisions (review by editor) (25 May 2021) by Kirsten Thonicke

Dear Angelica,

I agree with the minor revisions suggested by Sandy.

Best wishes,

Kirsten

Associate Editor Decision: Publish subject to minor revisions (review by editor) (21 May 2021)

by Sandy Harrison

Comments to the Author (doc): [bg-2021-1-comments-to-author.doc](#)

Comments to the Author:

Dear Angelica,

Thank you for your response and for addressing the reviewers' comments so thoroughly in your updated manuscript. The addition of the new tables with information about the experimental results is very welcome. The expanded discussion of previous work is also useful. The revised and expanded manuscript is much improved, and I am happy to accept this subject to minor editorial revisions. Please could you reorganise Table 2 to make it more immediately readable. I think you could do this by organising it so that all of the measurements made on a single species are in a single row. Also by having the PFT as a separate column rather than a heading. (See attached suggested layout in the attached word file).

While it is important to keep Appendix A in the main text, Appendix B should be moved to Supplementary online material. Figure 4 should be moved into this Supplementary. The clarity of the text could be further improved. I have made some suggestions for correcting and simplifying the text in the attached file (in red), but are not compulsory. I hope that these suggestions will help you revise the manuscript.

Sandy
P.S. You said in your response that you didn't quantify the degree of angels, which is hardly surprising given there are so few of them about nowadays.

Dear editors,

Please find enclosed a revised version (2) of my manuscript entitled 'Experimental production of charcoal morphologies to discriminate fuel source and fire type: an example from Siberian taiga'.

I have incorporated all the additional minor comments made by the Associate Editor, which includes:

- (a) Made all the linguistic corrections she has suggested. I very much appreciate her effort to make these improvements.
- (b) I have re-organised the layout of Table 2 as she suggested i.e, made all the measurements of a single species and fuel types in a single row.
- (c) I have moved all the pictures of macrocharcoal (Fig.4a,b,c) and microcharcoal (Appendix B) morphologies into the Supplementary online material. Fig.4a,b,c is now File S5a,b,c, whereas Appendix B is now File S6a,b.

Many thanks for these additional suggestions to improve the manuscript, and looking forward to seeing this manuscript published.

Kind regards

Angelica

Department of Physical Geography, Goethe-University

Altenhöferallee 1,60438 Frankfurt am Main

angelica.feurdean@gmail.com

Feurdean@em.uni-frankfurt.de

Telefon 49 (0)69 798 40166