

Dear Marcelle Boudagher-Fadel,
We appreciate all your comments on our manuscript.
Please find below our answer to all of them.
Kind regards
Authors

This paper is an interesting, well-written contribution to the study of the Photosynthetically-active foraminifera. The conclusion and discussion are speculative. The mode of life concentrate mainly on morphological and habitat comparison with the recent photosymbiont-bearing *Peneroplis* and the conclusion of *Semitextularia* being kleptoplastic is based on the the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ enrichment in relation to rock matrix samples.

Re: Please see our answer above (Reviewer 1 RE: no. 1).

Endosymbiosis however is a more complex co-evolutionary process and should be discussed involving also different factors such as the temperature during the Devonian;

Re: We are not able to accurately estimate the temperature during sedimentation of Skały and Miłoszów strata. It was a tropical shelf of the Laurussia paleocontinent but we do not have more precise information about the temperature of the Devonian sea in the area of the Holy Cross Mountains. The eventual influence of temperature on C isotope fractionation is too small for observed test-bulk rock contrast.

the composition and wall structure of *Semitextularia* (a thin section of a specimen is important to illustrate in this article);

Re: The pictures of thin sections of *Semitextularia* tests have been added to figure 1 which shows that the testwall and test as a whole are transparent.

the presence of any remains of plastids

Re: We have not found any remains of plastids within foraminiferal tests, nor is such preservation likely in fossil shells.

It is also important to discuss the different life strategy adopted by *Semitextularia*. In this article it is confirmed that they were living in the photic zone and are mixotrophs. Could they have used, however, different sources of energy and carbon, instead of having a single trophic mode.

Re: Based on our data we can say that *Semitextularia* stayed photosynthetically active (possibly not continuously being rather mixotrophic). We would like to avoid more speculative interpretations about different sources of energy as we do not have methods to check and prove it. See also comment: Rev 1 No. 2

What is also missing in the manuscript the listing of the foraminiferal assemblages co-existing with *Semitextularia*. In order to study accurately the mode of life and palaeoenvironment of this taxon you have to take into account the whole foraminiferal and floral assemblages in the studied thin section/rock sample. For instance, what other foraminifera are also found? Would the shape of their tests implies that they are also kleptoplastic; were fragments of algae found in the rocks? etc..

Re: *Semitextularia* was the only plurilocular foraminifera in the Skały and Miłoszów assemblages. *Semitextularia* is the oldest and pioneering multichamber form. Apart from *Semitextularia*, there are also some bilocular and tubular forms from Moravaminidae family and many different microproblematica which ecology are unknown. We have supplemented the ms with this informations.

Some recent literature are not referred to.

Re: We have added generally up to three references, noting by “e.g.” that there are often many more possible. We would be very grateful for additional suggestions of missing papers.

Answers to comments directly introduced into the manuscript

Line 114. $\sqrt{\text{area}/\text{height}}$ - Do you mean thickness?

See explanation above

Line 150. You need a thin section too

Re: The thin section pictures have been added to Figure 1

Line 166 Reviewer: “Red algae have been reported from the Devonian but not confirmed. Have you found any? Could be green algae?”

This is a misunderstanding, interestingly by both reviewers. Yes, coralline/ calcareous red alga are only well known from the Jurassic, with possible Paleozoic reports. But we are not referring to calcareous red algae, but rather to unicellular red algae that have been recognized from the Proterozoic, at least since Butterfield et al. (1990), with recent articles noting that red-algal-derived plastids gave rise to dinoflagellates, diatoms, and coccolithophorids. For example:

Jürgen F. H. Strassert, Iker Irisarri, Tom A. Williams & Fabien Burki. 2021. A molecular timescale for eukaryote evolution with implications for the origin of red algal-derived plastids. in Nature Communications [from the abstract: "This period in the Meso- and Neoproterozoic Eras set the stage for the later expansion to dominance of red algal-derived primary production in the contemporary oceans,"]

Line 189 Reviewer: “In my opinion, the only megalospheric specimen is Fig. 1a. The sizes of the tests are similar except for 1a. some of them like 1e the first chamber is broken.”

Re: A comparison of the size range of early chambers has been added, with comparison with known gamonts, agamonts and schizonts of an extant species.