# Modeling the growth and sporulation dynamics of the macroalga *Ulva* in mixed-age populations in cultivation and the formation of green tides

- 3 Uri Obolski<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Thomas Wichard<sup>3</sup>, Alvaro Israel<sup>4</sup>, Alexander Golberg<sup>1</sup>, Alexander Liberzon<sup>5,\*</sup>
- 4 <sup>1</sup> Porter School of the Environment and Earth Sciences, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel
- <sup>5</sup> <sup>2</sup> School of Public Health, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel
- 6 <sup>3</sup> Institute for Inorganic and Analytical Chemistry, Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Jena, Germany
- <sup>7</sup> <sup>4</sup> Israel Oceanographic & Limnological Research Ltd. (PBC), Tel Shikmona, Haifa, Israel
- 8 <sup>5</sup> School of Mechanical Engineering, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv Israel.

## 9 \*Correspondence should be addressed to:

- 10 Uri Obolski: uriobols@tauex.tau.ac.il
- 11 Alexander Liberzon: alexlib@tauex.tau.ac.il

#### 12 Abstract

13 Ulva is a widespread green algal genus with important ecological roles and promising potential as a 14 seagriculture crop. One of the major challenges when cultivating Ulva is sudden biomass disappearance, 15 likely caused by uncontrolled and unpredicted massive sporulation. However, the dynamics of this process 16 are still poorly understood. In this study, we propose a mathematical model describing the biomass 17 accumulation and degradation of Ulva, considering the potential impact of sporulation inhibitors. We 18 developed a differential equation model describing the time evolution of Ulva biomass. Our model 19 simulates biomass in compartments of different Ulva 'age' classes, with varying growth and sporulation 20 rates. Coupled with these classes is a differential equation describing the presence of a sporulation inhibitor, 21 produced and secreted by the algae. Our model mimics observed Ulva dynamics. We present Ulva's 22 biomass accumulation under different initial algae population, age distributions and sporulation rates. 23 Furthermore, we simulate water replacement, effectively depleting the sporulation inhibitor, and examine 24 its effects on Ulva's biomass accumulation. The model developed in this work is the first step towards 25 understanding the dynamics of Ulva growth and degradation. Future work refining and expanding our 26 results should prove beneficial to the ecological research and industrial growth of Ulva.

27

Keywords: Ulva, sporulation, sporulation inhibitor, modeling, green tides, gametogenesis, aging,
aquaculture management.

# 31 **1. Introduction**

32 The genus Ulva (Ulvales, Chlorophyta) comprises a group of green macroalgae, which are cosmopolitan 33 species, both ecologically and economically. Its highly adaptive nature allows it to flourish in various environments, as can be seen from its widespread presence from the Arctic and Antarctic seas to the 34 35 Equator. In natural populations, Ulva spp. are very common in littoral and sublittoral areas and also found at mesophotic depths (Spalding et al., 2016; Pyle et al., 2016). As Ulva in nature is a holobiome, its 36 37 ecological role is vast and includes multiple interactions with other players of the marine ecosystems, such as protista, fungi, bacteria, viruses and various marine fauna. Ulva is highly relevant for aquaculture due to 38 39 its fast growth rates and potential food, feed, materials, chemicals and energy applications. Hence, Ulva is 40 considered as a potential crop for controlled biomass production, onshore and offshore (Fernand et al., 2017). Multiple reports in the last decade addressed Ulva aquaculture alone or in multitrophic systems. In 41 addition, Ulva biorefinery-enabling processes and technologies have made immense progress in the 42 43 production of starch, protein, cellulose, ulvan, salts, methane, biocrude, biodiesel, bioethanol, and 44 polyhydroxyalkanoates, just to mention a few (Bikker et al., 2016). Over the years, various systems 45 including plastic sleeves, raceway ponds, tanks, dripping, ropes, nets, rafts and aerated cages have been 46 proposed for Ulva biomass cultivation. The variation of cultivation systems ranges from closed, artificial 47 and seawater, onshore systems with fresh seawater to near shore and far offshore production. Yet, one of 48 the significant risks in Ulva cultivation is the sudden biomass loss when the algal tissue disintegrates and 49 bleaches, most probably caused by uncontrolled and unpredicted massive sporulation (Gao et al., 2010; Bruhn et al., 2011). 50

51 Opposite to the controlled cultivation, *Ulva* green tides are massive, rapid natural accumulations of 52 unattached green macroalgae biomass usually associated with eutrophicated marine environments.

While green tides of bladed, distromatic *Ulva* species are common (Fort et al., 2020; Zhao et al., 2019;
Sfriso et al., 1992; Martins et al., 2001), mass occurrences of monostromatic tubular forms also occur,
which are the focus of this study. The impact of thalli morphology on the potential of *Ulva* species to
generate green tides is yet to be determined.

57

58 Nevertheless, green tides seriously damage the coastal marine environment, on occasions modifying the 59 shoreline structure, or affecting biodiversity and damaging ecosystem services such as navigation, fishery 60 and recreation (Shan et al., 2019; Zhang et al., 2019). In addition, decaying seaweed biomass causes anoxia 61 yielding hydrogen sulfide at toxic levels in coastal waters and on the shores (Nedergaard et al., 2002; Castel 62 et al., 1996; Viaroli et al., 1995).

64 Various explanations have been proposed for the rapid accumulation and simultaneous collapse of Ulva 65 dominated green tides. Favorable environmental conditions for *Ulva* habitats, such as temperature, salinity, 66 hydrodynamics and nutrient levels affect the rapid biomass growth. In addition, recent studies showed that 67 blooming leads to the selection of rapidly growing strains (Fort et al., 2020) with potentially differentially 68 expressed genetic signatures (He et al., 2021). Furthermore, for Ulva prolifera, a strain dominating the Yellow Sea bloom, 91.6–96.4 % of the released spores developed into young seedlings, suggesting that 1 69 70 gFW thallus was able to produce about  $2.8 \times 10^8 - 2.7 \times 10^9$  new younger seedlings, of free-floating biomass 71 (Zhang et al., 2013).

72

73 Ulva sp. has a complex reproduction strategy with alternation of generations in which both isomorphic 74 gametophytes and sporophytes coexist. The gametophytes produce biflagellated haploid gametes through 75 mitosis while the sporophytes produce quadriflagellated haploid zoids through meiosis (Wichard, 2015). 76 The initiation of a green tide requires simultaneous sporulation and release of gametes of multiple thalli 77 (Gao et al., 2010), but can be also caused by inhibition of biomass allocation to sporulation (Hiraoka, 2021); 78 the regulation of sporulation is involved in both cases. How this sporulation is achieved and controlled at 79 the initial population is still a puzzling question. The simultaneous release of zoids and gametes in large 80 numbers over a short period, combined with favorable environmental conditions, would provide the 81 prerequisites for the formation of green tides. Indeed, mechanical or other factors, fragmentation of Ulva

thalli would produce large amounts of spores giving rise to the rapid proliferation of the seaweed under
field conditions. This idea was also considered because it likely supports the rapid accumulation of huge
biomass of *U. prolifera* in the green tide observed along the Qingdao coasts in 2008 (Gao et al., 2010).

85 Ecological studies indicate that sporulation in *Ulva* is seasonal, and when it occurs a significant amount of parental biomass contributes to the massive production of swarmers (Amsler and Searles, 1980; Littler and 86 87 Littler, 1980; Niesenbaum, 1988). The formation and release of swarmers is inhibited by "sporulation-88 inhibiting substances" excreted into the growth medium by the whole thalli, or their fragments (Nilsen and 89 Nordby, 1975; Jónsson et al., 1985). Later studies identified sporulation inhibitors in Ulva mutabilis, Ulva 90 linza and U. prolifera. The first sporulation inhibitor 1 (SI-1), is a glycoprotein isolated from the thalli 91 media or the cell wall and the second sporulation inhibitor 2 (SI-2), is a small molecular weight compound 92 that was isolated from the inner space between the two blade cell layers. (Stratmann et al., 1996; Jónsson 93 et al., 1985; Kessler et al., 2018; Vesty et al., 2015). Importantly, removing both SIs induces the 94 gametogenesis by washing (and mincing) the algae (Kessler et al., 2018) and activates specific transcription 95 factors (Liu et al., 2022).

97 Furthermore, formed gametes were only released slowly and asynchronously in the presence of another 98 substance known as a swarming inhibitor, the removal of which resulted in nearly immediate and complete 99 swarming (Stratmann et al., 1996; Wichard and Oertel, 2010). This precise control of swarmer formation 100 and release suggests that Ulva developed a tightly regulated mechanism to guarantee simultaneous release 101 of swarmers to the environment, observed initially by Smith (1947) at the Pacific coast (Smith, 1947), 102 probably to maximize the likelihood of sexual reproduction. Indeed, most recent studies on the floating 103 Ulva prolifera showed that all tested thalli were sporophytes with sexual reproductive patterns (Zhao et al., 104 2019).

105

Notably, the decrease of SI-1 production coincides with the maturation of Ulva and finally causes 106 sporulations (i.e. gametogenesis), first within the Ulva apical marginal zones of the thallus and subsequently 107 108 within the whole alga. Unlike the SI-1, the concentration of SI-2 (per biomass) remains constant, but Ulva's 109 sensitivity towards this inhibitor declines during aging (Stratmann et al. 1996). Unlike SI-2, the presence 110 of SI-1 suppresses gametogenesis at all phases of the life cycle (Fig. 1). In other words, even if Ulva no longer produces enough SI-1 during aging, it is still sensitive to external SI-1 application by an aquaculture 111 operator (Fig. 1). 112 113 Because only one of the two inhibitors is required to be present and active (Stratmann et al. 1996, Vesty et

al. 2015; Kessler et al. 2018), our research concentrates on mathematical model experiments with SI-1, which is produced by the growing *Ulva*, released in excess in its environment and taken up by aging *Ulva*.

116



**Figure 1.** Inhibition of gametogenesis by an externally supplied sporulation inhibitor (SI-1). Two thalli (1 and 2) were

transferred into fresh UCM distributed over two Petri dishes. Mature gametophytes undergo gametogenesis upon

120 removal of SIs by washing the thalli. Within three days, gametes were formed and released on the third day after

induction (left). The addition of 10 units of SI-1 inhibited the differentiation of thallus cells into gametangia (right)

- 122 (see Supplementary Information for detailed method description according to Kessler et al. (2018)).
- 123

124 Mathematical models are essential tools to study and predict the behavior of complex biological systems. Several models have been developed to predict seaweed biomass growth and decomposition, the behavior 125 126 of harmful green tides and the seaweed biomass production in seagriculture. Indeed, long-term ecological 127 models that predict macroalgal productivity and seasonal blooms in prone ecosystems (Martins and 128 Marques, 2002; Solidoro et al., 1997; Ren et al., 2014; Martins et al., 2007; Port et al., 2015; Brush and 129 Nixon, 2010; Aldridge and Trimmer, 2009; Lavaud et al., 2020; Seip, 1980; Aveytua-Alcázar et al., 2008; 130 Duarte and Ferreira, 1997) or culture models that focus mostly on onshore photobioreactors (Friedlander et al., 1990; Oca Baradad et al., 2019) and offshore cultivation (Broch and Slagstad, 2012; Petrell et al., 1993; 131 Hadley et al., 2015) were developed. These models, which pursue a basic understanding of the 132 thermodynamics of individual algae thalli and photobioreactors (Zollmann et al., 2018; Lehahn et al., 2016; 133 134 Martins and Marques, 2002; Lee and Ang Jr, 1991; Seip, 1980), provide important tools to predict the 135 productivity and seasonal environmental effects on the seaweed population dynamics. However, such 136 models treat the macroalgae population as a bulk and do not differentiate between ages of individual thalli 137 within the population. As discussed above, thalli age is an important factor affecting the activity of 138 sporulation inhibitors in the alga and the ultimate release of swarmers. Furthermore, these models do not 139 consider the possible interthalli chemical interactions, some of which can be based on SI-1 secreted to the 140 environment. The production and secretion to the environment of molecules such as SI-1 could provide insights into the molecular mechanisms behind the synchronization of massive spore release at the 141 142 population level - a phenomenon crucial for both green tide formation and sudden biomass disappearance in Ulva seagriculture of species such as U. mutabilis (U. compressa), U. linza and U. prolifera. 143

This paper aims to introduce a novel framework for the description of population dynamics and collective thalli behavior of *Ulva* biomass, presumably controlled by shared sporulation inhibitors. We propose that various environmental and internal biological changes on the single thallus level predetermine the ability of the individual thallus to produce, and to donate to and receive from the population environment, factors that regulate the synchronized formation and release of swarmers. A natural tool to describe this process is offered by population dynamics models, often employed to describe bacterial and animal population dynamics (Succurro and Ebenhöh, 2018; Friedman and Gore, 2017). In the following sections we develop and simulate such a mathematical model in an attempt to characterizethe dynamics of *Ulva* biomass formation and degradation.

## 153 **2. Methods**

The model presented below consists of n+1 ordinary differential equations (ODEs), where n is set as the number of cultivation days (also equal to the number of age group equations). ODEs 0... *n*-1 describe the rate of change of biomass of n discrete age classes of *Ulva* thalli, denoted  $a_i$ , and an additional *n*+1 equation for the rate of change of the inhibitor *I*. As described previously, there are at least three types of inhibitors involved in the process of *Ulva* swarmers release: SI-1, SI-2 and a swarming inhibitor (SWI). We aggregate these inhibitors into a single quantity that controls the simultaneous swarmers' release from thalli, followed by the biomass decrease.

161 The *n* ODEs follow a simple discretized version of a partial differential equation of m(a,t) where *m* is the 162 biomass of *Ulva* in controlled volume (a bioreactor or a given sea volume, for example), *a* is the age of 163 algae, and *t* is time. As previously shown, the growth rate for thalli decreases with age in *U. mutabilis* 164 (Alsufyani et al., 2017).

165 The following equations specify the dynamics of the biomass of each age class  $a_i$ , coupled with the 166 dynamics of the inhibitor *I*, in the growth environment:

167 
$$\frac{da_i}{dt} = r_i \left( 1 - \frac{\sum_i^a a_i}{K} \right) + \lambda_i a_{i-1} - \lambda_{i+1} a_i - \sigma a_i f(I) \quad i = 1, 2 \dots n$$
168 
$$\frac{dI}{dt} = \sum_i^n a_i \theta_i - I(\sum_i^n \mu_i a_i) - \xi I + \gamma_I$$
(2)

- 169
- 170 <u>**Table 1**</u>: model parameters, their interpretation, and values.

Parameter	Meaning	Value
r <sub>i</sub>	Growth rate of algae age $a_i$	$0.45\left(0.1 + e^{-i\frac{\log(2)}{30}}\right)$
f(I)	Limiting factor due to inhibitor concentration, I	$1 - (1 + e^{-10(l - 0.5)})^{-1}$
σ	Degradation constant	0.3
ξ	Inhibitor loss function to the environment (for example, water replacement)	$0.45\left(0.1 + e^{-i\frac{\log(2)}{120}}\right)$

$ heta_i$	Age-dependent inhibitor generation function	$0.45 \left( 0.1 + e^{-i\frac{\log(2)}{120}} \right)$
$\mu_i$	Age-dependent inhibitor uptake	$0.45 \left( 0.05 + e^{-i \cdot \frac{\log(2)}{120}} \right)$
$\gamma_I$	Constant inhibitor addition or extraction	0.0 - 0.1 (varies in the figures)
K	Maximal carrying capacity	10 kg m <sup>-3</sup>
a <sub>in</sub>	Iinital density	0.2 kg m <sup>-3</sup>

171

The model assumes a logistic growth of biomass with a growth rate parameter  $r_i$  for each algae age class  $a_i$  and a carrying capacity K, defined as the maximum *Ulva* biomass density in the growth environment. Biomass moves between compartment  $a_i$  to  $a_{i+1}$  at rates  $\lambda_i$ , defining the "natural aging" of algae. At each age class  $a_i$ , biomass is degraded at a rate  $\sigma f(I)$ , where  $\sigma$  is the maximal destruction rate, and f(I) is a monotonically decreasing function of the inhibitor *I* (SI-1), scaled between zero and one. The degradation at a rate  $\sigma = 0.3$  is a conservative approximation estimated from a closed aquaculture system with *U*. *mutabilis* (Alsufyani et al., 2020).

Furthermore, we define  $\mu_i$  as the SI-1 uptake rate of each age class  $a_i$ ;  $\xi$  the leakage or injection of the inhibitor *I*, that can be managed externally to the system (e.g., washing the algae, destroying the algae, injection nutrients); and  $\gamma$  is the nutrient supply flux in the units of inhibitor concentration. Because this is a novel theoretical model, there were no available empirical estimates of the specific functions underlying its dynamics. Hence, whenever a rate was modeled as some monotonic function which saturates, we used the standard in ecological modeling - the logistic equation and exponential decay (Jørgensen and Bendoricchio, 2001). The model functions and parameters are summarized in Table 1.

Finally, we note that our model does not take into account addition of new thalli due to soprolation events during the simulated timeframe. This may be construed as simulating an experiment where spores freely flow out of the container used for growing the algae (e.g., (Prabhu et al., 2020)). Or, this may serve as an approximation if the amount of new thalli produced by sporulation in the simulated experimental time frame can be neglected.

191

## **3. Results and Discussion**

Here, we study the *Ulva* biomass population dynamics, controlled by sporulation inhibitor production andabsorption, by simulating the biomass accumulation under various scenarios for mixed-age populations, for

195 100 days (Stratmann et al., 1996; Alsufyani et al., 2017). In all the following simulations, we set the initial 196 density of seaweed in the cultivation media to  $a_{in} = 0.2$  kg m<sup>-3</sup>, and at the maximum carrying capacity the 197 biomass can reach a density of 10 kg m<sup>-3</sup> (*K*). In addition, for the initial population conditions, we denoted 198 young thalli as the population of  $a_0$  at t = 0 and old thalli as the population of  $a_{120}$  at t = 0. From a 199 physiological point of view, young thalli are those thalli, whose cell differentiation is controlled by SI and 200 old thalli are those thalli, which are insensitive to SI and do not produce it.

201

In the following plots, we simulated the behavior of populations with a mixed-age composition. Each population was labeled by the percentage of young and old thalli at initial population. Thus, for example, 100/0 labels an entirely young initial population (0.2 kg m<sup>-3</sup> of thalli with  $a_i = 0$  at t = 0); 0/100 labels a completely old initial population (0.2 kg m<sup>-3</sup> of thalli with  $a_i = 120$  days at t = 0); and 50/50 represents an initial population comprised of equal parts of old and young algae (0.1 kg m<sup>-3</sup> of thalli with  $a_i=0$  at t=0 and 0.1 kg m<sup>-3</sup> of thalli with  $a_i = 120$  days at t = 0).

208

209 The biomass yield (density increase due to growth; i.e. initial density subtracted from final density) over 210 time for various mixed-age populations is shown in Fig. 2a. The growth of mixed aged populations with 100/0, 80/20 and 50/50 population mix of old and young thalli showed a typical sigmoidal growth, reaching 211 90% of the maximum biomass density (9 kg m<sup>-3</sup>) at 27, 30 and 37 days, respectively. Populations with 212 213 predominantly old biomass at the beginning (20/80) showed a long lag phase but exhibited positive growth, 214 reaching 90% of the maximum biomass density at day 87 (Fig. 2b). The population with only old algae 215 (0/100) at the beginning of the cultivation showed degradation of the biomass from day 1 and never showed 216 positive growth (Fig. 2b). The population with a 10/90 mix of initial ages showed a small growth (positive 217 yield) during the first 40 days but then showed biomass degradation and never reached 90% of the 218 maximum density (Fig. 2a,b).

219

220 As simulated in our model, such dynamics of the biomass growth could be explained by the dynamics of 221 the production of the sporulation inhibitor (Fig. 2c). For populations 100/0, 80/20, 50/50 and 20/80 the rate 222 of sporulation inhibitor generation is positive and increases over time, while for the 10/90 and 0/100223 populations, although initial production of the sporulation inhibitor is observed, it is reduced over time (Fig. 224 **2c**). These findings show that sporulation inhibitor production by a small (20% in our simulations) young 225 population could potentially provide enough inhibitor to prevent the old algae population from biomass 226 loss, thus leading to overall positive biomass production. Additionally, the rate of biomass accumulation 227 increases with the increased fraction of the young thalli in the initial population. Nevertheless, the maximum 228 inhibitor production decreases with time in all populations as all thalli age (Fig. 2c). To account for a less

homogeneous initial population structure, the dynamics were also simulated with a different initialdistributions of ages, and produced qualitatively similar results (Supplemental Information Figure S1).

231



Figure 2. a. Yield for populations with various initial age mixes (biomass gain in kg/m<sup>3</sup> up to the limit of 10 kg/m<sup>3</sup>
in a bioreactor with a starting density of 0.2 kg/m<sup>3</sup> in total for each simulated age mix [old / young thalli in %]). b. *Ulva* biomass growth kinetics as a function of the initial age distribution of thalli in the population. Values of the 0/100, and 10/90 populations are not presented as they did not reach 90% of the maximal carrying capacity. In any other case, mixed populations achieved at least 90% of the maximal biomass carrying capacity c. Inhibitor amount in the system over time. Insets in (a) and (c) present zoomed-in dynamics during the first 10 days.

As seaweeds rarely grow in closed bodies of water, where the inhibitor could accumulate continuously in 239 240 the environment, we sought to stimulate the impact of inhibitor removal from the seaweed environment by 241 water replacement. We simulate each event of water replacement as complete removal of the inhibitor 242 produced by the seaweed during the time interval from the previous water replacement. Figure 3a shows 243 the dynamics of various initial age mixed populations yields when the inhibitor is removed by water 244 replacement. In the scenario where water is replaced every 14 days, only few, relatively "young" 245 populations (100/0, 90/10, 80/20 and 70/30) achieved the 90% of the maximum yield. Moreover, the time 246 to reach this yield level increased from 27-30 days (without replacement for these four age groups) to 37-40 days, in the 100/0, 90/10, 80/20 and 70/30 populations, respectively (Fig. 3b). The growth yield shows 247 248 fluctuating dynamics, showing in the initial overall growth for populations with predominantly young thalli 249 during the first 60 cultivation days, followed by the overall reduction of the yield in the aging populations. 250 Interestingly, these fluctuations yield dynamics that are similar to those previously reported by us during a 251 12-month offshore cultivation work with Ulva harvesting every week (Chemodanov et al., 2018). Although 252 many other factors could be at play, it is possible that the weekly removal of the whole seaweed biomass 253 from the sea and cages for weighting also removed the sporulation inhibitor accumulated in the boundary

layer near the thalli. This suggestion, of course, requires further detailed experiments investigating the ability to monitor the dynamics of sporulation inhibitors production and accumulation/diffusion in the thalli environment. In our simulations, increasing the frequency of water exchange, and thus removal of SI-1 (**Fig. 3c**), reduced the ability of populations with a large portion of old algae to produce a positive yield during the whole cultivation period (**Fig. 3a**).



Figure 3. a. Yield (biomass gain in kg/m<sup>3</sup> up to the limit of 10 kg/m<sup>3</sup> in a bioreactor with a starting density of 0.2 g/m<sup>3</sup>) for populations with various initial age mixes [% of old / young thalli] with 14 days water replacement frequency. b. *Ulva* biomass growth kinetics as a function of the initial age distribution of thalli in the population with various frequencies of water replacement. c. Inhibitor production in the population of the time with 14 days of water replacement frequency.

As seaweed in the natural environment usually live in high energy conditions, we also studied the coupled effects of degradation ( $\sigma$ ) and population age distribution on the ability of the population biomass yield (**Fig. 4a**). Higher rates of degradation prevent positive yields in all mixed-age populations. Lower degradation affects a smaller portion of the population with higher initial portions of young thalli (**Fig. 4a**) showing again the regenerative ability of the populations with high growth (lower sporulation) capabilities.





Figure 4. a. Time to achieve 90% of the maximum carrying capacity as a heatmap (color represents the time in days) depending on the initial age distribution (x-axis; [% of old / young thalli]) and the degradation parameter  $\sigma_i$  (y-axis). b. Time to 90% as a heatmap (color represents the time in days; note the different scales in (a) and (b)) depending on the initial age distribution (x-axis) and the addition of the external inhibitor  $\gamma$  (y-axis). White color means that the population never achieves 90% of the maximum carrying capacity.

277

We investigated the impact of direct addition of the sporulation inhibitor to the seaweed growth media computationally. Adding an external sporulation inhibitor (up to 0.1) reduced the time to achieve 90% of the maximum yield from 27 days (without inhibitor addition) to 21 days for 100/0 group, 29 days (without inhibitor addition) to 24 for 80/20 group, from 35 days (without inhibitor addition) to 28 for the 50/50 group and from 60 (without inhibitor addition) to 45 days for the 20/80 group. No effects at this maximum concentration have been observed for the 0/100 group.

# **4.** Conclusions

In this study, we aimed to further understand the growth and sporulation dynamics of Ulva using a mathematical model. We found that successful accumulation of Ulva biomass depends on the age distribution of the Ulva thalli of a given seedstock, where older starter populations produce lower yields at a given time. However, this age-dependent effect can be mitigated, leading to prolonged maintenance of Ulva's aquacultures, by external addition of sporulation inhibitors. We note that our modeling study is a first attempt to uncover the mechanism underlying the heterogeneity of vegetative growth stability in different Ulva populations. At this point, we developed a general model, which is not species specific. Indeed, several studies have revealed that the SIs of *U. linza*, *U. compressa* (*U. mutabilis*), and *U. intestinalis* are exchangeable (Vesty et al., 2015; Steinhagen et al., 2019; Stratmann et al., 1996). We assume the more closely related the *Ulva* species are, the more likely the SIs will be interchangeable between the species. The SI-1, in fact, cannot be swapped between *U. compressa* and *U. rigida* (Stratmann et al., 1996).

Bioassays with SI-1 have supported the finding of the model that age-mixed populations are more stable than uniform ones. When purified SI-1 is added to mature and induced *Ulva* thalli, it can be perceived by *Ulva* and used to regulate gametogenesis of cultures of the 100/0 group. We thus conclude that the sporulation event is delayed or even inhibited in age-mixed cultures composed of young, smaller thalli and old, larger thalli.

302 Overall the sporulation phenomenon creates unique constraints on the age structure of *Ulva* populations. 303 In higher plants, sexual reproduction and vegetative propagation compete for nutrients, but the competition 304 may be mitigated by separating these processes through time (Evans and Black, 1993). However, in Ulva, 305 the whole thallus can be transformed into gametangia and sporangia while flowering plants assign only a 306 specific portion of biomass to reproductive structures. Ulva thus requires a strict regulation of sporulation, 307 e.g. through the age-dependent production of SI. Only if the SI-1 synthesis ceases during the Ulva's 308 development cycle and its concentration falls below a critical threshold concentration, gametogenesis is 309 induced at positions of the blade where the SI-2 concentration between the cell layers is also sufficiently 310 low or not perceived anymore (Stratmann et al., 1996). Our findings thus imply that the more SI provided 311 by young algae in mixed cultures, the higher the growth rate and biomass yields. As purified SIs are not yet 312 widely available in large quantities, the use of mixed-aged cultures can be an important tool to maintain 313 them at adequate nutrient levels e.g. in integrated multi trophic aquaculture. The modeling of Ulva's growth 314 indicates the importance of SI-producing algae for sustainable and successful seagricultures, and paves the 315 way for a better understanding of the green tide formation in coastal areas.

316

#### 317 **5. Code availability**

The model creation process is explained in detail in the Methods. Code for creating the figures is availableupon request.

#### 320 **6. Author contributions**

AG and AL conceived the initial idea for the study; UO, AG and AL designed the study and the mathematical model; AL produced the results; TW produced the experimental results; All authors interpreted the results and wrote the manuscript.

## 324 7. Acknowledgements

325 Ralf Kessler (Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany) is acknowledged for carrying out the shown

- biotest with *Ulva*. The authors thank the Israel Ministry of Health (grant #3-16052) for the support. This
- article is based upon work from COST Action CA20106, supported by COST (European Cooperation in
- 328 Science and Technology, <u>www.cost.eu</u>).

## 329 8. Competing interests

330 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

- 332
- 333
- 334

## 335 **References**

- Aldridge, J. and Trimmer, M.: Modelling the distribution and growth of 'problem' green seaweed in the
- 337 Medway estuary, UK, in: Eutrophication in Coastal Ecosystems, Springer, 107–122, 2009.
- Alsufyani, T., Weiss, A., and Wichard, T.: Time course exo-metabolomic profiling in the green marine
- macroalga *Ulva* (Chlorophyta) for identification of growth phase-dependent biomarkers, Mar. Drugs, 15,
  14, 2017.
- 341 Alsufyani, T., Califano, G., Deicke, M., Grueneberg, J., Weiss, A., Engelen, A. H., Kwantes, M., Mohr, J.
- F., Ulrich, J. F., and Wichard, T.: Macroalgal-bacterial interactions: identification and role of thallusin in
  morphogenesis of the seaweed *Ulva* (Chlorophyta), J. Exp. Bot., 71, 3340–3349, 2020.
- Amsler, C. D. and Searles, R. B.: Vertical distribution of seaweed spores in a water column offshore of
- 345 North Carolina , J. Phycol., 16, 617–619, 1980.
- Aveytua-Alcázar, L., Camacho-Ibar, V. F., Souza, A. J., Allen, J., and Torres, R.: Modelling *Zostera marina* and *Ulva* spp. in a coastal lagoon, Ecol. Model., 218, 354–366, 2008.
- Bikker, P., van Krimpen, M. M., van Wikselaar, P., Houweling-Tan, B., Scaccia, N., van Hal, J. W.,
- 349 Huijgen, W. J., Cone, J. W., and López-Contreras, A. M.: Biorefinery of the green seaweed Ulva lactuca
- to produce animal feed, chemicals and biofuels, J. Appl. Phycol., 28, 3511–3525, 2016.
- Blomster, J., Bäck, S., Fewer, D. P., Kiirikki, M., Lehvo, A., Maggs, C. A., and Stanhope, M. J.: Novel
  morphology in Enteromorpha (Ulvophyceae) forming green tides, Am. J. Bot., 89, 1756–1763, 2002.
- Broch, O. J. and Slagstad, D.: Modelling seasonal growth and composition of the kelp *Saccharina latissima*, J. Appl. Phycol., 24, 759–776, 2012.
- Bruhn, A., Dahl, J., Nielsen, H. B., Nikolaisen, L., Rasmussen, M. B., Markager, S., Olesen, B., Arias, C.,
  and Jensen, P. D.: Bioenergy potential of *Ulva lactuca*: biomass yield, methane production and
  combustion, Bioresour. Technol., 102, 2595–2604, 2011.
- Brush, M. J. and Nixon, S. W.: Modeling the role of macroalgae in a shallow sub-estuary of Narragansett
  Bay, RI (USA), Ecol. Model., 221, 1065–1079, 2010.
- Cai, C., Gu, K., Zhao, H., Steinhagen, S., He, P., and Wichard, T.: Screening and verification of
  extranuclear genetic markers in green tide algae from the Yellow Sea, PloS One, 16, e0250968, 2021.
- Castel, J., Caumette, P., and Herbert, R.: Eutrophication gradients in coastal lagoons as exemplified by
  the Bassin d'Arcachon and the Etang du Prévost, Hydrobiologia, 329, ix–xxviii, 1996.
- 364 Chemodanov, A., Jinjikhashvily, G., Habiby, O., Liberzon, A., Israel, A., Yakhini, Z., and Golberg, A.:
- 365 Net primary productivity, biofuel production and CO<sub>2</sub> emissions reduction potential of *Ulva*
- 366 sp.(Chlorophyta) biomass in a coastal area of the Eastern Mediterranean (vol 148, pg 1497, 2017), Energy
- **367** Convers. Manag., 166, 772–772, 2018.
- Duarte, P. and Ferreira, J.: A model for the simulation of macroalgal population dynamics and
   productivity, Ecol. Model., 98, 199–214, 1997.
- 370 Evans, R. and Black, R. A.: Growth, photosynthesis, and resource investment for vegetative and
- reproductive modules of *Artemisia tridentata*, Ecology, 74, 1516–1528, 1993.

- Fernand, F., Israel, A., Skjermo, J., Wichard, T., Timmermans, K. R., and Golberg, A.: Offshore
- macroalgae biomass for bioenergy production: Environmental aspects, technological achievements and
   challenges, Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev., 75, 35–45, 2017.
- Fort, A., Mannion, C., Fariñas-Franco, J. M., and Sulpice, R.: Green tides select for fast expanding *Ulva*strains, Sci. Total Environ., 698, 134337, 2020.
- Friedlander, M., Galai, N., and Farbstein, H.: A model of seaweed growth in an outdoor culture in Israel,
  Hydrobiologia, 204, 367–373, 1990.
- Friedman, J. and Gore, J.: Ecological systems biology: The dynamics of interacting populations, Curr.
  Opin. Syst. Biol., 1, 114–121, 2017.
- Gao, S., Chen, X., Yi, Q., Wang, G., Pan, G., Lin, A., and Peng, G.: A strategy for the proliferation of *Ulva prolifera*, main causative species of green tides, with formation of sporangia by fragmentation,
  PLoS One, 5, e8571, 2010.
- Hadley, S., Wild-Allen, K., Johnson, C., and Macleod, C.: Modeling macroalgae growth and nutrient
  dynamics for integrated multi-trophic aquaculture, J. Appl. Phycol., 27, 901–916, 2015.
- He, Y., Shen, S., Yu, D., Wang, Y., Yin, J., Wang, Z., and Ye, Y.: The *Ulva prolifera* genome reveals the
  mechanism of green tides, J. Oceanol. Limnol., 1–13, 2021.
- Hiraoka, M.: Massive *Ulva* green tides caused by inhibition of biomass allocation to sporulation, Plants,
  10, 2482, 2021.
- 390 Jónsson, S., Laur, M.-H., and Pham-Quang, L.: Mise en évidence de différents types de glycoprotéines
- dans un extrait inhibiteur de la gamétogenèse chez *Enteromorpha prolifera*, Chlorophycée marine,
- **392** Cryptogam. Algol., 6, 253–264, 1985.
- Jørgensen, S. E. and Bendoricchio, G.: Fundamentals of ecological modelling, Elsevier, 2001.
- 394 Kessler, R.W., Alsufyani, T., and Wichard, T.: Purification of sporulation and swarming inhibitors from
- 395 *Ulva*: application in algal life cycle controlling. In: Charrier, B., Wichard, T., and Reddy, C.R.K. (Eds.),
- Protocols for macroalgae research. CRC Press, Francis & Taylor Group, Boca Raton, pp. 139–157, 2018.
- Lavaud, R., Filgueira, R., Nadeau, A., Steeves, L., and Guyondet, T.: A Dynamic Energy Budget model
  for the macroalga *Ulva lactuca*, Ecol. Model., 418, 108922, 2020.
- Lee, C. and Ang Jr, P.: A simple model for seaweed growth and optimal harvesting strategy, Ecol.
  Model., 55, 67–74, 1991.
- 401 Lehahn, Y., Ingle, K. N., and Golberg, A.: Global potential of offshore and shallow waters macroalgal
- biorefineries to provide for food, chemicals and energy: feasibility and sustainability, Algal Res., 17,
  150–160, 2016.
- Littler, M. M. and Littler, D. S.: The evolution of thallus form and survival strategies in benthic marine
   macroalgae: field and laboratory tests of a functional form model, Am. Nat., 116, 25–44, 1980.
- 406 Liu, X., Blomme, J., Bogaert, K., D'hondt, S., Wichard, T., Thomas, Deforce, D., Van Nieuwerburgh, F.,
- 407 and De Clerck, O.: Transcriptional profiling of gametogenesis in the green seaweed *Ulva mutabilis*
- 408 identifies an RWP-RK transcription factors linked to reproduction, BMC Plant Biol., 22, 19, 2022.
- 409 Martins, I. and Marques, J.: A model for the growth of opportunistic macroalgae (Enteromorpha sp.) in

- tidal estuaries, Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci., 55, 247–257, 2002.
- 411 Martins, I., Pardal, M., Lillebø, A., Flindt, M., and Marques, J.: Hydrodynamics as a major factor
- 412 controlling the occurrence of green macroalgal blooms in a eutrophic estuary: a case study on the
- 413 influence of precipitation and river management, Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci., 52, 165–177, 2001.
- 414 Martins, I., Lopes, R., Lillebø, A., Neto, J., Pardal, M., Ferreira, J., and Marques, J.: Significant variations
- in the productivity of green macroalgae in a mesotidal estuary: implications to the nutrient loading of the
- system and the adjacent coastal area, Mar. Pollut. Bull., 54, 678–690, 2007.
- 417 Nedergaard, R. I., Risgaard-Petersen, N., and Finster, K.: The importance of sulfate reduction associated
- with *Ulva lactuca* thalli during decomposition: a mesocosm experiment, J. Exp. Mar. Biol. Ecol., 275,
  15–29, 2002.
- 420 Niesenbaum, R. A.: The ecology of sporulation by the macroalga *Ulva lactuca* L.(Chlorophyceae), Aquat.
  421 Bot., 32, 155–166, 1988.
- 422 Nilsen, G. and Nordby, Ø.: A sporulation-inhibiting substance from vegetative thalli of the green alga
  423 *Ulva mutabilis*, Føyn, Planta, 125, 127–139, 1975.
- 424 Oca Baradad, J., Cremades Ugarte, J., Jiménez de Ridder, P., Pintado, J., and Masaló Llorà, I.: Culture of
- the seaweed *Ulva ohnoi* integrated in a *Solea senegalensis* recirculating system, J. Appl. Phycol., 31, 1–7,
  2019.
- Petrell, R., Tabrizi, K. M., Harrison, P., and Druehl, L.: Mathematical model of *Laminaria* production
  near a British Columbian salmon sea cage farm, J. Appl. Phycol., 5, 1–14, 1993.
- 429 Port, A., Bryan, K. R., Pilditch, C. A., Hamilton, D. P., and Bischof, K.: Algebraic equilibrium solution of
- tissue nitrogen quota in algae and the discrepancy between calibrated parameters and physiological
  properties, Ecol. Model., 312, 281–291, 2015.
- 432 Prabhu, M., Levkov, K., Levin, O., Vitkin, E., Israel, A., Chemodanov, A., and Golberg, A.: Energy
- 433 efficient dewatering of far offshore grown green macroalgae *Ulva* sp. biomass with pulsed electric fields 434 and mechanical press, Bioresour. Technol., 295, 122229, 2020.
- 435 Pyle, R. L., Boland, R., Bolick, H., Bowen, B. W., Bradley, C. J., Kane, C., Kosaki, R. K., Langston, R.,
- 436 Longenecker, K., Montgomery, A., and others: A comprehensive investigation of mesophotic coral
  437 ecosystems in the Hawaiian Archipelago, PeerJ, 4, e2475, 2016.
- 438 Ren, J. S., Barr, N. G., Scheuer, K., Schiel, D. R., and Zeldis, J.: A dynamic growth model of macroalgae:
- application in an estuary recovering from treated wastewater and earthquake-driven eutrophication,
  Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci., 148, 59–69, 2014.
- Seip, K. L.: A computational model for growth and harvesting of the marine alga *Ascophyllum nodosum*,
  Ecol. Model., 8, 189–199, 1980.
- Sfriso, A., Pavoni, B., Marcomini, A., and Orio, A.: Macroalgae, nutrient cycles, and pollutants in the
  Lagoon of Venice, Estuaries, 15, 517–528, 1992.
- 445 Shan, J., Li, J., and Xu, Z.: Estimating ecological damage caused by green tides in the Yellow Sea: A
- choice experiment approach incorporating extended theory of planned behavior, Ocean Coast. Manag.,181, 104901, 2019.
- 448 Smith, G. M.: On the reproduction of some Pacific coast species of *Ulva*, Am. J. Bot., 80–87, 1947.

- Solidoro, C., Pecenik, G., Pastres, R., Franco, D., and Dejak, C.: Modelling macroalgae (*Ulva rigida*) in
- the Venice lagoon: Model structure identification and first parameters estimation, Ecol. Model., 94, 191–
  206, 1997.
- 452 Spalding, H. L., Conklin, K. Y., Smith, C. M., O'Kelly, C. J., and Sherwood, A. R.: New Ulvaceae
- (Ulvophyceae, Chlorophyta) from mesophotic ecosystems across the Hawaiian archipelago, J. Phycol.,
  52, 40–53, 2016.
- Steinhagen, S., Barco, A., Wichard, T., and Weinberger, F.: Conspecificity of the model organism *Ulva mutabilis* and *Ulva compressa* (Ulvophyceae, Chlorophyta), J. Phycol., 55, 25–36, 2019.
- 457 Stratmann, J., Paputsoglu, G., and Oertel, W.: Differentiation of *Ulva mutabilis* (Chlorophyta)
  458 gametangia and gamete release are controlled by extracellular inhibitors, J. Phycol., 32, 1009–1021, 1996.
- Succurro, A. and Ebenhöh, O.: Review and perspective on mathematical modeling of microbial
  ecosystems, Biochem. Soc. Trans., 46, 403–412, 2018.
- 461 Vesty, E. F., Kessler, R. W., Wichard, T., and Coates, J. C.: Regulation of gametogenesis and
- zoosporogenesis in *Ulva linza* (Chlorophyta): comparison with *Ulva mutabilis* and potential for
  laboratory culture, Front. Plant Sci., 6, 15, 2015.
- Viaroli, P., Bartoli, M., Bondavalli, C., and Naldi, M.: Oxygen fluxes and dystrophy in a coastal lagoon
- 465 colonized by *Ulva rigida* (Sacca di Goro, Po River Delta, northern Italy), Fresenius Environ. Bull., 4,
  466 381–386, 1995.
- Wichard, T.: Exploring bacteria-induced growth and morphogenesis in the green macroalga order Ulvales(Chlorophyta), Front. Plant Sci., 6, 86, 2015.
- 469 Wichard, T. and Oertel, W.: Gametogenesis and gamete release of *Ulva mutabilis* and *Ulva lactuca*
- 470 (Chlorophyta): regulatory effects and chemical characterization of the "swarming inhibitor", J. Phycol.,
  471 46, 248–259, 2010.
- 472 Zhang, J., Huo, Y., Yu, K., Chen, Q., He, Q., Han, W., Chen, L., Cao, J., Shi, D., and He, P.: Growth
- characteristics and reproductive capability of green tide algae in Rudong coast, China, J. Appl. Phycol.,
  25, 795–803, 2013.
- Zhang, Y., He, P., Li, H., Li, G., Liu, J., Jiao, F., Zhang, J., Huo, Y., Shi, X., Su, R., and others: *Ulva prolifera* green-tide outbreaks and their environmental impact in the Yellow Sea, China, Natl. Sci. Rev.,
  2019.
- Zhao, X., Cui, J., Zhang, J., Shi, J., Kang, X., Liu, J., Wen, Q., and He, P.: Reproductive strategy of the
- floating alga *Ulva prolifera* in blooms in the Yellow Sea based on a combination of zoid and chromosome
- 480 analysis, Mar. Pollut. Bull., 146, 584–590, 2019.
- Zollmann, M., Traugott, H., Chemodanov, A., Liberzon, A., and Golberg, A.: Exergy efficiency of solar
- 482 energy conversion to biomass of green macroalgae *Ulva* (Chlorophyta) in the photobioreactor, Energy
- 483 Convers. Manag., 167, 125–133, 2018.
- 484