1	Temporary stratification promotes large greenhouse gas emissions in a shallow eutrophic lake
2	Thomas A Davidson <sup>1, 2</sup> , Martin Søndergaard <sup>1, 2, 3</sup> , Joachim Audet <sup>1, 2</sup> , Eti Levi <sup>1</sup> , Chiara Esposito <sup>1, 2</sup> , Tuba
3	Bucak Onay <sup>1</sup> , Anders Nielsen <sup>1,4</sup> .
4	
5	<sup>1</sup> Lake Ecology, Department of Ecoscience, Aarhus University, Denmark
6	<sup>2</sup> WATEC Aarhus University Centre for Water Technology, Aarhus University, Denmark
7	<sup>3</sup> .Sino-Danish Centre for Education and Research (SDC), Beijing, China
8	<sup>4</sup> .WaterITech Aps, Døjsøvej 1, 8660 Skanderborg, Denmark
9	Corresponding author: Thomas A Davidson, Department of Ecoscience, Aarhus University, C. F. Møllers
10	Alle 4-6, DK-8000 Aarhus C, Denmark, e-mail: thd@ecos.au.dk
11	
10	

## 16 Abstract

17 Shallow lakes and ponds undergo frequent temporary thermal stratification. How this affects greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions is moot, with both increased and reduced GHG emissions hypothesised. Here, 18 19 weekly estimation of GHG emissions, over growing season from May to September, were combined with 20 temperature and oxygen profiles of an 11 hectare temperate shallow lake to investigate how thermal 21 stratification shapes GHG emissions. There were three main stratification periods with profound anoxia 22 occurring in the bottom waters upon isolation from the atmosphere. Average diffusive emissions of 23 methane ( $CH_4$ ) and nitrous oxide ( $N_2O$ ) were larger and more variable in the stratified phase, whereas 24 carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$  was on average lower, though these differences were not statistically significant. In 25 contrast, there was a significant, order of magnitude, increase in CH<sub>4</sub> ebullition in the stratified phase. 26 Furthermore, at the end of the period of stratification, there was a large efflux of  $CH_4$  and  $CO_2$  as the lake 27 mixed. Two relatively isolated turnover events were estimated to have released the majority of the CH<sub>4</sub> emitted between May and September. These results demonstrate how stratification patterns can shape 28 29 GHG emissions and highlight the role of turnover emissions and the need for high frequency 30 measurements of GHG emission which are required to accurately characterise emissions, particularly 31 from temporarily stratifying lakes. 32 33

Keywords: Climate change; lake stratification; methane; carbon dioxide; nitrous oxide; climatefeedbacks

### **1. Introduction**

38 Fresh waters are key sites for the processing of greenhouse gases (GHG), methane (CH<sub>4</sub>), carbon dioxide  $(CO_2)$  and nitrous oxide  $(N_2O)$ . Shallow lakes, in particular, have been identified as hot spots of  $CH_4$ 39 release, particularly when ebullition is taken into account (Davidson et al., 2018; Aben et al., 2017). The 40 41 certainty that fresh waters are large emitters of GHGs contrasts with the uncertainties associated with the 42 quantities emitted and this is in large part due to historical paucity of measurements (Cole, 2013). A 43 recent study identified the highly variable emissions from lakes and ponds (Rosentreter et al., 2021). 44 Whilst different morphometric features and chlorophyll-a explained some of the emission patterns 45 (Deemer and Holgerson, 2021), it is also clear that a dearth of measurement combined with these highly 46 variable emissions makes determining the drivers and controls of those emissions a challenge, which in 47 turn makes predicting future emissions difficult.

48

49 The current and future effects of climate change on lakes in general and on their GHG emissions are 50 relevant questions as there is potential for positive feedbacks and synergies with other human impacts such as eutrophication (Davidson et al., 2018; Beaulieu et al., 2019; Delsontro et al., 2016; Meerhoff et 51 52 al., 2022). Taking a broad metabolic theory of ecology approach, temperature increases should promote methanogenesis and shift the balance from primary production to respiration increasing CO<sub>2</sub> emission at 53 54 cellular and ecosystem scale (Yvon-Durocher et al., 2010). However, empirical and experimental data 55 indicate that temperature is not the sole control of primary production and methanogenesis. In particular, 56 eutrophication, and the promotion of large algal crop, has been associated with increased emissions of CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O (Delsontro et al., 2016) both by diffusion and ebullition (Zhou et al., 2019). Furthermore, in 57 58 what is globally the most abundant lake type, small shallow lakes, where macrophytes can colonise large 59 areas of the lake bed, trophic state and the dominance of submerged plants or algae may be more 60 important than temperature in shaping GHG dynamics (Davidson et al., 2015; Davidson et al., 2018; 61 Bastviken et al., 2023).

63 Climate change effects on lakes are not limited to increases in average temperatures and lengthening of the growing season. Increases in both the frequency and intensity of heat waves are predicted, which will 64 promote the warming of surface waters and in turn make permanent and temporary thermal stratification 65 66 of lakes more likely (Woolway and Merchant, 2019), even in lakes typically classified as non-stratifying 67 (Kirillin and Shatwell, 2016). A recent study Holgerson et al. (2022) identified stratification and mixing patterns in small water bodies, with permanent summer stratification common and frequent mixing 68 69 occurring in larger standing waters (>4 ha) lakes. Such periods of stratification and mixing events are 70 likely to have profound effects on GHG dynamics. Emissions of gases, in particular CH<sub>4</sub>, that accumulate in the isolated bottom waters of a stratified lake, occurs upon mixing and can make very significant 71 72 contributions to cumulative emissions (Schubert et al., 2012). High-resolution studies of sites that 73 undergo temporary stratification are rare. Though Søndergaard et al. (2023b), recently showed how 74 stratification shapes patterns and processes across the entire ecosystem, including short term effects on dissolved GHG concentration in bottom and surface waters. In terms of its effects on GHG dynamics, 75 76 there are potentially antagonistic processes at work in a stratified lake. On the one hand the 'shield effect' 77 results in lower temperatures at the sediment surface slowing down metabolic processes that scale with 78 temperature, i.e. methanogenesis and mineralization of organic carbon (C), reducing emission and 79 promoting C burial. On the other hand, anoxia at the sediment surface may shift processes towards 80 fermentation, increasing the proportion and total amount of CH<sub>4</sub> produced and perhaps reducing C burial 81 (Bartosiewicz et al., 2019). Recent work combining empirical observations and models has suggested that 82 shielding effects are larger than the anoxia effects and that stratification, in general, increases C burial and 83 reduces GHG emissions (Bartosiewicz et al., 2015). The stratification induced isolation of bottom waters 84 was reported to lead to reduced ebullition of CH<sub>4</sub> and a shift to diffusive pathways (Bartosiewicz et al., 85 2015. It might, however, be predicted that in shallow lakes stratification would lead to much larger  $CH_4$ 86 release as anoxic conditions would limit CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation by CH<sub>4</sub> oxidizing bacteria (MOBs) (Bastviken et 87 al., 2008). There may also be other factors with the potential to increase GHG emission, such as sediment

organic content and lake trophic status (Delsontro et al., 2016), which may interact with stratification
patterns in shaping GHG emissions.

90

In this study, we used data from a shallow lake with high frequency measurements of temperature profiles
combined with weekly measurements of dissolved gas concentrations in the surface and bottom waters
and continuous measurement of ebullitive emissions of CH<sub>4</sub> to track the effects of lake stratification on
GHG emissions. The key question was how ebullitive and diffusive fluxes of the key GHGs: CH<sub>4</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub>
and N<sub>2</sub>O respond to temporary thermal stratification.

96

## 97 **2. Materials and methods.**

#### 98 2.1 Study site

99 Ormstrup lake, located in Denmark (lat 56.326°, lon 9.639°) (Fig.1) (depth map with GHG sampling

locations), is an 11 ha, shallow lake (average depth 3.4 m), with a maximum depth of 5.5 m, and with a

101 relatively long hydraulic retention time (> 1 year). The lake is eutrophic with high TP and chlorophyll-a

102 (Table 1; Søndergaard et al., 2022) with very sparse occurrence of submerged plants.

103

#### **2.2 Depth profiling and high frequency measurements**

105 In June 2020, a Nexsens (NexSens Technology, Fairborn, OH, USA) CB-450 data buoy system

106 (https://www.nexsens.com/pdf/CB450\_datasheet.pdf) was deployed at the deepest point of the lake

107 equipped with a Nexsens TS210 thermistor string https://www.nexsens.com/pdf/TS210\_datasheet.pdf)

108 with temperature nodes measuring at 4 levels; one sensor "in air", ca. 5 cm above the water surface, (but

shielded from direct light), and three sensors at -1, -2, -3 meters, respectively relative to the water surface.

110 In addition two Aqua TROLL 500 (In-Situ, Fort Collins, CO, USA) multi-sondes were mounted near the

surface (-1.0 meters) and at deeper water depth (-3.8 meters). The near surface and deeper water sonde

were configured with sensors to measure dissolved oxygen (DO) and water temperature (Tw). The opticalsensors were calibrated according to manufacture guidelines and checked on a weekly basis.

114

The optical sensors of the Aqua TROLL 500 have a built-in wiper mechanism to clean sensor heads to
hamper bio-fouling. The wiper function was enabled to perform cleaning in sync with sensor
measurements, hence every 15 minutes. In addition, manual cleaning of sensor heads was done every
week, while routine manual field monitoring was carried out at the lake. Prior to the deployment of the
buoy, and as a validation exercise for the buoy data, weekly manual profiles of DO and Tw were collected
at the deepest point.

121

122 Periods of stratification and depth of the thermocline were defined using the r package rlakeanalyzer

123 (Winslow et al., 2019) based on the density gradient of the water column from the weekly manual

profiling of the system. During periods of defined as stratified, there were partial mixing events where the depth of the thermocline changed and there was some mixing of the sub epilimnetic water and the surface waters, whilst the bottom waters below 3.5 metres remained undisturbed.

127

#### 128 **2.3 Water chemistry**

Water samples for the analysis of Chlorophyll-a were collected weekly from the 20. April 2020 from
surface (-0.5 m) water at station 3 (Fig. (Søndergaard et al., 2005). A volume of water ranging from (0.2
to 1 litre) was filtered and the GFC papers preserved for chlorophyll-a analysis, which were determined
spectrophotometrically after ethanol extraction (Jespersen and Christoffersen, 1987) and alkalinity was
measured weekly by gran titration (Søndergaard et al., 2005). Depth profiles of temperature, electrical
conductivity (EC) and dissolved oxygen (DO) were measured manually with an Aqua TROLL 500 probe
from every -0.5 or -1 m down to -5 m depth).

#### 137 **2.4 Greenhouse gas sampling**

#### 138 2.4.1 Dissolved concentration

Samples of dissolved concentrations of  $CH_4$ ,  $CO_2$  and  $N_2O$  were collected weekly from the 20. April 2020 from surface waters and weekly from surface and bottom water from the 26. May 2020 to the 13. October 2020. The samples were taken using head-space equilibration after (Mcauliffe, 1971), where 20 ml of water was collected from just below the water surface and 20 ml of  $N_2$  was introduced as a headspace in a 60-ml syringe and then shaken vigorously for one minute. The 20 ml headspace was then transferred to a 12-ml pre evacuated glass vial.

145

Gas concentrations in the headspace were determined on a dual-inlet Agilent 7890 GC system interfaced 146 147 with a CTC CombiPal autosampler (Agilent, Nærum, Denmark) (Petersen et al., 2012). For the GC, certified CO<sub>2</sub>, CH<sub>4</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O standards were used for calibration and validation. Aqueous concentrations in 148 N<sub>2</sub>O, CH<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> were calculated from the headspace gas concentrations according to Henry's law and 149 150 using Henry's constant corrected for temperature and salinity (Weiss, 1974; Weiss and Price, 1980; 151 Wiesenburg and Guinasso, 1979). A recent study (Koschorreck et al., 2021) identified significant bias in 152 the estimate of CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations using headspace equilibration at lower concentrations. We applied their correction using separately measured alkalinity as described in Koschorreck et al. (2021). 153

154 The fluxes of  $N_2O$ ,  $CH_4$  and  $CO_2$  between the water and the overlying atmosphere were estimated as

 $f_g = k_g (C_{wat,g} - C_{eq,g})$ 

156 Where  $f_g$  is the flux of a specific gas g,  $k_g$  is the piston velocity of the gas and  $C_{wat,g} - C_{eq,g}$  is the 157 gradient of concentration between the concentration of gas dissolved in the water  $(C_{wat,g})$  and the 158 concentration of gas the water would have at equilibrium with the atmosphere  $(C_{eq,g})$ .

159 We calculated a gas transfer velocity  $k_{600}$  for each sampling occasion using the relationship based on

160 windspeed described in (Cole and Caraco, 1998).

$k_{600} = 2.07 + 0.215 U_{10}^{1.7}$	
---------------------------------------	--

162 U<sub>10</sub> is the mean daily windspeed at 10m (m s<sup>-1</sup>) obtained from the Danish meteorological institute
163 (DMI;20x20 km grid data)
164

165

166

$$k_g = k_{600} \left(\frac{Sc_g}{600}\right)^x$$

167

168  $Sc_g$  is the Schmidt number(Wanninkhof, 1992) of the specific gas g. We chose x = -2/3 as this factor is 169 used for smooth liquid surface (Deacon, 1981).

170

Daily flux rates were calculated using linear interpolation of the weekly surface measurements from each of the sampling points. The diffusive surface water fluxes were calculated by taking an average of the daily flux rate from the 12. May 2020 to the 13. October 2020 for each location. Then an average of the 3 locations was multiplied by the area of the lake and the number of days covered by the study, here 126 days was chosen to match the period over which ebullition was measured.

176

177 The total content of the gases in the lake's bottom waters were calculated from the dissolved

178 concentration of the gases multiplied by an estimate of the volume of the water in the hypolimnion. The

volume of water in the hypolimnion was estimated from the lake profiles manually conducted on the day

180 of sampling. The top of the hypolimnion was determined by the depth below which oxygen was less than

181  $0.5 \text{ mg l}^{-1}$ . A detailed bathymetry of the lake allows the calculation of the area and therefore volume of

182 water that lies below a given depth.

183

184 During the study period two major turnover events occurred, the process of lake turnover and full mixing185 can take a number of days, and the outgassing even longer. The oxygen data, from the buoy, indicated

186 that it can take up to four days and this provides time for CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation to occur (Søndergaard et al., 187 2023b). In order to estimate the amount of  $CH_4$  oxidised over the course of the multiple days of degassing 188 we directly measured  $CH_4$  oxidation rates in the surface waters of the lake. This was done in June 2023 in five locations in this lake using methods outlined in (Thottathil et al., 2019) where five water samples 189 190 from five different locations and each was incubated over 4 days with and the change in CH<sub>4</sub> concentration used to calculate oxidation rates. We used the minimum (0.267  $\mu$ g CH<sub>4</sub>-C l<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>), mean 191  $(0.44 \ \mu g \ CH_4$ -C l<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>) and maximum  $(0.58 \ \mu g \ CH_4$ -C l<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup>) oxidation rates to estimate the range of CH<sub>4</sub> 192 oxidation likely to have occurred over the course of the two main turnover events. Assuming that the 193 194 degassing took four days, these rates would consume between 2 and 8% of the CH<sub>4</sub> contained in the hypolimnion. Using the mean oxidation value the turnover fluxes were reduced by 4.1% on the 30<sup>th</sup> of 195 June 2020 and by 6% for the 25<sup>th</sup> August 2022. 196

197

#### 198 2.4.2 Ebullition

199 The ebullitive flux of CH<sub>4</sub> was estimated using at total of 40 floating chambers placed on 4 transects of 10 chambers each (Fig. 1). The chambers have a volume of 8 litre and a surface area of 0.075 m<sup>2</sup>, similar to 200 those used by (Bastviken et al., 2015). As the existing literature indicated that ebullition is lower as water 201 202 depth increases (Wik et al., 2013) the transects were placed to maximise the measurement of the low end 203 of the depth gradient on the shallower slopes of the western end of the lake (Fig. 1). The average and 204 maximum depth of each transect was T1: 293 cm and 472 cm; T2: 181 cm and 267, T3: 223 cm and 300 205 cm and T4 166 cm and 220 cm. The chambers were set on the 14. May 2020 and sampled every two weeks from that date, and on one occasion after one week until September 17<sup>th</sup>, which is a period of 127 206 207 days. Twenty ml of sample was taken from the floating chamber and injected into a pre-evacuated 12 ml 208 vial (exetainer, Labco). Gas concentrations were determined on the same GC than described above 209 (Petersen et al., 2012)

210 Ebullitive flux of CH<sub>4</sub> was estimated as:

211 
$$\frac{p_{gas} \times Vol_{bub}}{t \times A}$$

Where  $p_{aas}$  is the concentration of CH<sub>4</sub> in the gas that was trapped,  $Vol_{bub}$  is the volume of the chamber (i.e. 7L), t is the time during which the samples was collected and A is the area of chamber (i.e.  $0.075 \text{ m}^2$ ). 213 214 A portion of the CH<sub>4</sub> released via ebullition in the chamber will have re-dissolved in the water or might 215 leak through the chamber walls, thus underestimating the ebullitive flux. We have made a number of 216 measurements to constrain this error and to compare estimates based on static chambers with other 217 approaches. The result show that whilst static chambers underestimate ebullition, given the temporal 218 variability of ebullition, static chambers continually deployed provide a better estimate of average ebullition 219 than short term (24-48 hours) deployment using portable gas monitors or flushing chambers. 220 221 Therefore, whilst static chambers method cannot be said to accurately quantify CH<sub>4</sub> emissions, they can be 222 relied upon to compare differences in ebullition between time periods, with the caveat that they are always 223 an underestimate of actual ebullitive flux. 224 225 Total ebullitive flux from the lake was calculated by taking a mean of the emissions from each transect over 226 the 126 day period. Then taking an average of the means of four transects and multiplying this by the time 227 of deployment of the chambers in days, which was 126 days, and by the area of the lake. This gives a total 228 ebullitive flux of CH<sub>4</sub> for the lake over the period of measurement from May to mid-September. 229 230 The three different flux types, surface diffusion, ebullition and turnover emission were then converted in 231 comparable units of total lakes emissions (as g or kg of gas) over the studied period and also converted into 232  $CO_2$ -equivalents using a conversion factor related to their 100 year global warming potential (GWP) of 28

233

212

#### 2.5 Statistical methods 235

for CH<sub>4</sub> and 265 for N<sub>2</sub>O.

To test for a significant difference among the emissions from the stratified and mixed phase we used
generalised least squares (GLS) with a variance function to account for heterogeneity of variance between
the phases. In the case of the ebullitive flux, as the collected phase often covered periods including both
mixed and stratified phases there were three categories, mixed, stratified and both mixed and stratified.
All analysis was carried out in R version 4.2.1 (R Development Core Team, 2022) and the GLS used the
package nlme (Pinheiro et al., 2014).

242

## 243 **3.0 Results**

#### 244 **3.1 Lake physical and chemical characteristics**

245 Depth profiles measured weekly from April show that stratification was initiated by the 26. May 2020 this may have broken down briefly and established again, visible in the temperature sensors for the buoy on 246 247 the 5. June 2020 (Fig. 2). There were then 12 days of mixing followed by stable period of stratification with onset the 14. June 2020 and a duration of 16 days until a mixing event around the 30. June 2020. The 248 249 following two weeks had cooler water and a mixed water column, herafter a ca. 6 day period of 250 stratification from the 15. to 21. July 2020. A mixed phase of two weeks then followed until stratification 251 reestablished on 4. August 2020 and persisted until the end of August, partial mixing is indicated by the buoy data from the 21. August 2020, but the weekly manual profile to deeper water inidcate that full 252 253 mixing did not occur until after the 25. August 2020. The effects of the stratification and mixing events on 254 the high frequency DO data measured at -3.8 m are clear, with rapid deoxygenation occuring after the 255 onset of stratification and oxic bottom waters returning when the lake mixed (Fig, 2). The pattern in 256 chlorophyll-a also follow, to some degree, those of stratification, with the exception of early spring. 257 Chlorophyll-a values were extremely high in spring peaking at the start of June 2020 and falling gradually (Fig. 2). (Søndergaard et al., 2023b)During the periods of stratification chlorophyll biomass was lower, 258

and when a mixing event occurred the values increased, which is particularly evident in the July mixingperiods (Fig. 2).

261

#### **3.2** Concentrations of dissolved gases and fluxes from the surface waters.

The concentrations of the dissolved gases showed great variation from near or below atmospheric 263 concentrations in some cases and up to an extremely high concentration (over 5 mg CH<sub>4</sub> C l<sup>-1</sup>) in the 264 265 bottom waters on the 30. June 2020. There was some spatial heterogeneity in the surface waters, with the 266 more littoral locations showing the greatest variation and the highest values (Figs. 3,4,5). In particular the most littoral zone, where the water was shallower around 1 m in depth, showed the highest values just 267 268 prior to, or coincident with, the stratification turnover. Table 2 shows the mean diffusive flux of each gas 269 over the sampling period along with the mean flux in mixed and stratified phases. For CO<sub>2</sub> there was a lot 270 of temporal variation in flux dynamics, though not a large difference between mixed and stratified phases 271 in terms of mean values (Table 2). There were some periods of  $CO_2$  influx in spring and later summer and 272 these tended to coincide with the end of a mixed phase and the start of the stratification phase. Nitrous 273 oxide concentrations were generally low (Figs 4 & 5) with the lake being a source of  $N_2O$  in the spring period and a sink or a very small source thereafter. The CH<sub>4</sub> concentration in the surface waters (Fig. 3) 274 275 and the calculated diffusive emissions are relatively low, but did increase in the stratification periods with higher average values (Table 2 & Fig. 6). There was also some spatial variation with higher CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> 276 277 diffusive emissions in the shallower sampling locations, both in stratified and mixed conditions (Fig. 6).

278

279 The most marked patterns in GHG concentration were evident in the bottom waters sampled at -4.5 m,

which accumulated to very large concentrations of  $CO_2$  but particularly  $CH_4$  in the periods of

stratification (Fig. 3 & 4). The ratio of  $CO_2$  to  $CH_4$  is illustrative in highlighting how stratification has

altered the biogeochemical processes in the hypolimnion with CH<sub>4</sub> production becoming more prevalent.

For example on 30. June 2020 after 16 days of stratification the the ratio  $CO_2$ :CH<sub>4</sub> in the bottom waters was 0.8, whereas 7 days later after the mixing event it was 187 at the same depth.

285

#### 286 **3.3 Ebullitive fluxes**

The CH<sub>4</sub> bubble flux, presented here as mean values for each of the 4 transects, ranged from 0.303 to 81.1 287 mg CH<sub>4</sub> C m<sup>2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup> for the individual transect over the growing season measurement. There is a very clear, 288 289 statistically significant impact of stratification on the ebulltive efflux of CH<sub>4</sub> with stratified periods 290 showing significantly markedly higher levels of emission (Fig. 7 and Table 2). In addition, there was a 291 difference in average emissions among the different transects, with those with lower average water depth 292 (T2 & T4) having lower emission than the transects with chambers over deeper water (T1 & T3) (Fig. 7). 293 The samples collected from the chambers reflect two weeks of bubble and diffusion collection and the 294 quantification of the flux is therefore an average of the period of chamber deployment, which was two 295 weeks, or in one case a single week (Fig. 7). This two week period on occasion covered both stratified 296 and mixed phases and on these occassions efflux was intermediate between purely mixed and stratified 297 periods (Table 2 and Fig. 7).

298

#### 299 **3.4 Total lake fluxes**

Scaling up the results to total flux of gases from the whole lake over the period of study and including the
estimated emissions from two turnover events show a very different effect of stratification on the balance
of types of emissions for the three gases. The majority of CH<sub>4</sub> emission (56%) result from the two shortlived turnover events (Fig. 8), whereas their contribution to CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O emission was 5% and 1%
respectively.

305

Fluxes of  $CO_2$  and  $N_2O$  were mostly diffusive, which represented 95% of emissions of both gases.

307 Methane diffusive flux was 14% of total emission, whereas CH<sub>4</sub> ebulltion was more than twice as much at

29% of total CH<sub>4</sub> emission. In terms of global warming potential CO<sub>2</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> emission were
comparable, but the contribution of the turnover efflux was the dominant factor for CH<sub>4</sub> emissions.
310

311 **4. Discussion** 

312 This study set out to assess the role of thermal stratification on the GHG dynamics in a lake undergoing 313 frequent but temporary stratification. We found that the emission of the three GHGs showed different 314 degrees of variation between the mixed and stratified phases. The largest and most significant variation 315 was in  $CH_4$  ebullition (Table 2), whilst the difference in diffusive fluxes, though marked for  $CH_4$  was not significant. The mean of the total emissions from Ormstrup in the stratified phase (59.9 mg CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> 316 day<sup>-1</sup>) corresponds relatively closely to the mean of the total emissions (ebullition plus diffusion) reported 317 for lakes in this size range (47 mg CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) from a paper synthesising multiple studies 318 (Rosentreter et al., 2021). The mean emissions for the whole period (26.6 CH<sub>4</sub> -C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) were lower 319 than Rosentreter et al. (2021) but similar to other studies with mean emissions of 30.9, 20.7 and 22.7 CH<sub>4</sub> 320 -C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup> and were reported by Peacock et al. (2021), Sø et al. (2023) and Peacock et al. (2019) 321 respectively. Whereas the average CO<sub>2</sub> (504 mg CO<sub>2</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> day ) at Ormstrup was lower than 993.5 1 mg 322 CO<sub>2</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup> measured by Peacock et al. (2021) but higher than the 264.6 and 205.1 mg CO<sub>2</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> 323 day<sup>-1</sup> measured by Sø et al. (2023) and Peacock et al. (2019) respectively. The different temporal 324 325 resolution and duration of these studies, eleven single day sampling from April to December (Peacock et 326 al., 2021), five days continuous sampling on one occasion in late September (Sø et al., 2023) and a single 327 early summer snapshot (Peacock et al., 2019) make direct comparison difficult. The data here do, however, provide a clear answer to the question of how thermal stratification effects GHG dynamics in 328 329 shallow eutrophic lakes with an increase in total emissions (diffusion, ebullition and turnover) during the 330 stratified period (Table 2, Fig 9). Previous work, combining observations and modelling suggested the 331 opposite patterns (Bartosiewicz et al., 2019) as the shielding effect of the stratification results in cooler bottom waters which reduces CH<sub>4</sub> production due to the process being temperature dependent 332

333 (Bartosiewicz et al., 2016). This strong shielding effect may apply in deeper lakes experiencing more stable stratification, or less eutrophic lakes. The result here from a relatively shallow eutrophic lake, 334 335 indicate that temporary stratification causes increases in GHG emissions. 4.1 Diffusive fluxes Diffusive emissions did not, on average, show a strong stratification effect (Table 2). In particular variation in N<sub>2</sub>O 336 337 emissions did not match patterns of stratification, with emissions more directly related to nitrate 338 concentrations (Audet et al., 2020), as reflected by the fact the lake is a sink of  $N_2O$  in late summer when 339 nitrate was below detection limits for several weeks. There were peaks in emission of CH<sub>4</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> at the 340 end of stratification periods, particularly in the shallower water sampling points (Fig. 6). There were periods of influx of CO<sub>2</sub>, which coincided somewhat with periods of stratification, but the pattern was not 341 342 consistent as other factors, for example, chlorophyll-a concentration also play a role. 343 344 Littoral zones can have markedly different GHG dynamics to deeper zones due to shallower water having 345 lower pressure (Wik et al., 2013), less time for  $CH_4$  oxidation (Bastviken et al., 2008) or abundant plants 346 which influence a range of biogeochemical processes (Davidson et al., 2018; Esposito et al., 2023). It is 347 therefore possible that littoral zone dynamics could cause these differences. However, the increase 348 occurred at all three sampling points at the end of June 2020, which indicates a lake-wide driver and the peak may represent the start of mixing after stratification. Strong winds were measured on the 29th and 349

350 30<sup>th</sup> June 2020 (Søndergaard et al., 2023b) coincident with these increased littoral emissions. These

winds would have caused lateral movement of the surface water causing an upwelling of bottom water,

rich in  $CH_4$  and  $CO_2$ , in the littoral margins at the opposite end of the lake. Thus, whilst we do not have

direct evidence it seems more likely that these increased emissions in the littoral zone were driven, at leastin part, by the upwelling of GHG rich bottom waters.

355

356

#### 357 **4.2 Ebullitive fluxes**

358 In contrast to the diffusive flux, the ebullitive emission of CH<sub>4</sub> shows a very clear response to 359 stratification with an order of magnitude difference in emissions between periods where the sampling 360 reflected purely mixed or stratified periods (Table 2 & Fig. 7). The two-week resolution of the sampling meant that some samples covered both stratified and mixed phases and these samples had intermediate 361 362 fluxes, as they cover both low (mixed) and high emission (stratified) periods. The spatial variation in 363 ebullition is also illustrative of the impacts of stratification and the role of anoxia in shaping CH<sub>4</sub> fluxes. 364 The two transects with the largest mean and maximum depths (T1 and T3) had the largest emissions, with 365 the deeper of the two (T1) having the highest emissions and showing the largest relative increase during 366 the stratification phases. This pattern is different to that found some other studies where bubble emissions were larger in shallower water (Wik et al., 2013), although in this, and another study (Sø et al., 2023), 367 there was in increase in bubble flux in deeper water in late summer. The deeper water at Ormstrup 368 369 experienced anoxia early in season resulting in locations with deeper water having higher ebullition rates 370 than shallower areas. This is at odds with ideas stemming from the metabolic theory of ecology stating 371 that temperature (Yvon-Durocher et al., 2014) in particular at the sediment surface (Bartosiewicz et al., 372 2019) can be used to predict  $CH_4$  efflux. Whilst  $CH_4$  production is temperature dependent at the cellular 373 level, CH<sub>4</sub> emissions were rather independent of the sediment temperature, for example in the first two 374 weeks of July 2020 emissions were low and the sediment surface temperature was relatively high. Thus, 375 temperature alone is a poor predictor of ecosystem scale CH<sub>4</sub> emissions.

376

It should be noted that the methods used to estimate bubble flux here, where floating chambers are sampled every two weeks is a "less than perfect method", which in nearly all cases will underestimate ebullitive flux. Logistical and financial constraints make continual sampling difficult and here we balanced these constrains against the greater time required to apply more accurate methods, such as bubble traps (Wik et al., 2013), automatic flushing chambers (Bastviken et al., 2015). Such is the variability of bubble flux in space and time that using measurement from a shorter period of 1-2 days can result in a larger error in estimation of emissions than results from the longer term deployment of a static

384 chamber (see supplementary materials 1 and 2). The results in figure 7 show that sampling a single week 385 a year or even more regular monthly sampling of a shorter duration would be unlikely to accurately 386 characterise ebullition. Bubble traps have been used on longer terms but in eutrophic systems they can suffer extensive biofouling which can impede their use. Thus, the continuous monitoring of ebullition 387 388 using static chamber with known biases was deemed the least worst method available, but we 389 acknowledge that ebullitive emissions are underestimated. We further acknowledge that this approach of 390 static chambers should, where possible, be replaced by other methods to estimate ebullition, such as 391 automatic flushing chambers. It is difficult to compare the mean values of emission with other studies as 392 there are different scales of measurement both in space and time. However, comparing the values for ebullition recorded here with other longer-term studies carried out in lakes using bubble traps (Burke et 393 394 al., 2019; Delsontro et al., 2016), shows higher values recorded at Ormstrup lake compared with other 395 lakes, but lower values that have been measured in ponds (Ray and Holgerson, 2023; Delsontro et al., 396 2016), the latter being known to have higher emissions of  $CH_4$  (Holgerson and Raymond, 2016).

397

#### 398 4.3 Turnover fluxes

399 In addition to the diffusive and ebullitive emissions, the turnover flux, which consists of the gases 400 accumulated in the hypolimnion being released on turnover, was also estimated, with a correction of CH<sub>4</sub> 401 oxidation applied. There were two major turnover events at the end of June and in late in August 2020, 402 which were preceded by 16 and 22 days of stratification, respectively. It was not possible to directly-403 measure turnover flux, as they are relatively discrete events where the efflux likely occurs over the course 404 of a few hours, or a few days (Søndergaard et al., 2023b). Thus, the efflux estimation is based on a series 405 of assumptions and thus must be treated with caution. Notwithstanding this uncertainty, we can be 406 confident the turnover flux represents a very large proportion of the total emission of CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from 407 Ormstrup Lake over the growing season. We estimate it contributed more than 50 % of growing season 408 CH<sub>4</sub> emissions and 5 % of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. This highlights a very significant, and difficult to measure,

- 409 contribution to GHG emissions from lakes undergoing temporary stratification, which are among the
  410 most common lake type in Denmark (Søndergaard et al., 2023a).
- 411

#### 412 **4.1 Stratification effects**

413 The results here suggest that GHG dynamics were driven both directly and indirectly by the stratification 414 patterns and the anoxia it induced in the bottom waters. At Ormstrup Lake the thermal stratification of the water column quickly led to anoxia, with only a matter of hours to days for the oxygen to be consumed 415 416 once the bottom waters were isolated (Fig. 2). The ratios of CO<sub>2</sub>:CH<sub>4</sub> evidence how this promotes CH<sub>4</sub> 417 over  $CO_2$  production in the stratification phase (see Fig 9). In addition to promoting  $CH_4$  production such 418 conditions would preclude, or severely limit, oxic CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation, which has the potential to consume a 419 large proportion of CH<sub>4</sub> produced in the anoxic sediments (Bastviken et al., 2008), though anoxic 420 consumption of  $CH_4$  can still occur (Blees et al., 2014). The raw emission data do not provide any direct 421 information on the balance of production versus oxidation, but the CO<sub>2</sub>:CH<sub>4</sub> suggest there was marked 422 shift to conditions where methanogenesis was the dominant process and there was reduced  $CO_2$ 423 production. Studies have shown that CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation can consume large proportions of the CH<sub>4</sub> produced 424 under hypoxia (Saarela et al., 2019) and it is possible that there is intense  $CH_4$  oxidation occurring at the 425 thermocline during the periods of stratification at Ormstrup lake, but this was not directly measured at the 426 lake. In addition to the more direct effects of anoxia there may be some indirect effects of the patterns of 427 stratification and mixing that promote greater GHG emissions. Søndergaard et al. (2023b) recently 428 reported how nutrient dynamics at Ormstrup Lake were altered by the lake stratification and full details 429 can be found there, of relevance here is the impact on chlorophyll-a which saw a large spring peak after 430 which the abundance tracked the stratification and mixing regime, with a lag time. There was a general 431 reduction, or at least no increase as the stratification period progressed, perhaps due to nutrient limitation in the epilimnion. Upon mixing there was generally an increase in chlorophyll-a, though the weekly 432 sampling resolution makes this difficult to assess. Chlorophyll-a and the labile dissolved organic carbon 433

434 (DOC) that result from abundant chlorophyll-a have been shown to be associated with higher diffusive 435 and ebullitive CH<sub>4</sub> emissions (Davidson et al., 2015; Beaulieu et al., 2019; West et al., 2012; Zhou et al., 436 2019). It is not possible to say here whether a stable summer long stratification would have led to decreased chlorophyll-a as nutrients became limiting due to their isolation in the bottom waters and 437 438 reliable high frequency chlorophyll-a data are required to convincingly demonstrate this phenomenon. 439 Notwithstanding these uncertainties it may be the case that the temporary stratification, interspersed with 440 mixing events, observed here represents a 'sweet spot' providing both the resources, i.e. chlorophyll-a and 441 the labile DOC it produces, and optimal conditions (anoxia) for CH<sub>4</sub> production.

442

Predicting climate change effects on GHG emissions in a future warmer world is not straightforward, as there are multiple interacting drivers which combine to shape the GHG emissions of lakes. However, this study suggests that temporary stratification, which is increasingly recognised as prevalent in ponds and shallow lakes (Holgerson et al., 2022) and is likely to become more common with continued climate change impacts (Woolway and Merchant, 2019) is likely to increase GHG emissions. This will be particularly the case in more eutrophic systems where abundance algal derived dissolved organic matter can fuel CH<sub>4</sub> production (Zhou et al., 2019).

450

451 The combination of high frequency data on water temperature and dissolved oxygen combined with 452 weekly measurements of GHGs increase the reliability of the findings presented here. Up until relatively recently it has been assumed that for shallow lakes, such as Ormstrup lake, stratification is not an 453 454 important feature. Sampling has therefore focused on the surface layers of water bodies, using dissolved concentrations of gases or floating chambers to characterise flux, e.g. (Davidson et al., 2015; Audet et al., 455 456 2020; Peacock et al., 2021). Thus, most studies have overlooked bottom waters and do not have the 457 temporal resolution required to capture turnover flux emissions from surface measurements. Furthermore, 458 whilst many studies now include estimates of bubble emissions of CH<sub>4</sub> e.g. (Bergen et al., 2019), the 459 necessary temporal resolution to accurately characterise ebullitive emission is not well established. The

460 finding here indicated that in such dynamic systems near continuous measurement is desirable and that
461 short term collection over one or two days could provide massive, over or underestimate of CH<sub>4</sub>
462 ebullition.

463

Our results show very large temporal variation in emissions of all three gases, but in particular CO2 and 464 465 CH<sub>4</sub>, and this highlights the need for high frequency measurements to accurately characterize emissions 466 from lakes. Even the weekly frequency of the sampling in this study was not sufficient to directly measure 467 all the emission pathways and turnover flux had to be inferred from bottom water calculations. These data 468 show that to capture the extent of GHG emissions from lakes it is vital we include all forms of flux, 469 including ebullition and turnover flux. Recent work has highlighted the fact that most emissions of CH<sub>4</sub> 470 (over 50%) from fresh waters come from highly variable systems (Rosentreter et al., 2021), with the mean 471 and median emission rates of CH<sub>4</sub> differing greatly, indicating a few large emitters are responsible for a 472 large proportion of emissions. The sampling frequency applied here is rare, if a more standard resolution 473 of monthly measurements was applied the emissions estimate of all the gases, but in particular CH<sub>4</sub>, 474 would be highly dependent on what phase of the stratification was captured. As an example, a monthly 475 sampling frequency could potentially miss all the stratification peaks - consequently massively 476 underestimating emissions, whereas a different sampling frequency could catch a number of peaks and 477 give a much higher estimate. Thus, the same sampling frequency on the same lake, but timed differently 478 could lead to conclusions of highly variable emissions. Consequently, in these highly dynamic systems 479 where temporary stratification occur in summer, high frequency measurements are required to accurately 480 estimate emissions. This is possible through eddy covariance approaches capable of capturing short term 481 changes and covering a large area (Erkkilä et al., 2018) but the cost of these systems means they are not 482 scalable to many sites. An increasingly accessible alternative is the use of automatic flushing chambers 483 using low cost sensors (Bastviken et al., 2020), which provide the potential for affordable high spatial and 484 temporal resolution measurement of GHG dynamics. This is a requisite for understanding the drivers of

485	GHG dynamic, which is required for being able to predict how they will respond in a range of scenarios
486	related to land use, climate change and management interventions.

### 488 **Code/data availability**

- 489 The datasets generated during and/or analysed during the current study are not publicly available as they
- 490 form part of ongoing research projects but are available from the corresponding author on reasonable
- 491 request and will be made publicly available later in the research project.

492

#### 493 Author contributions

494 MS secured the funding for the wider lake restoration research project supplying the data. TAD, MS and

495 JA conceptualized the gas study. TAD and AN established the buoy and sensor system. EL, CE, TAD,

496 TB and JA collected and analysed the data. TAD wrote the paper and all authors commented on earlier

497 versions and read and approved the final draft.

#### 498 **Competing interests**

499 The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

# 501 Acknowledgement

We thank our splendid technician team of Lene Vigh, Malene Kragh, Dorte Nedergaard and Dennis Hansen for their extreme competence on the lab and the field. We acknowledge Theis Kragh for the depth map of the lake already published in Søndergaard et al. 2023. We would also like to acknowledge the hard and diligent work of two anonymous reviewers and the associate editor **David McLagan** who very significantly improved the quality of the paper. We are very grateful to the Poul Due Jensen Foundation for providing great support for this work and the Ormstrup project generally. TAD and CE were also supported by GREENLAKES (No. 9040-00195B) and The European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programmes under grant agreement No 869296-The PONDERFUL Project. 

Table 1. Summary lake information, summer mean values and (standard deviation) of a range ofvariables

<b>X</b> 7 <b>2</b> - <b>1</b> -1-	n	Year	
variable		2020	
Secchi depth (m)	22	0.86 (0.28)	
Chlorophyll a (µg/l)	20	53.4 (28.9)	
pH	22	8.04 (0.77)	
Total phosphorus (mg/l)	22	0.58 (0.11)	
Total nitrogen (mg/l)	22	1.50 (0.41)	

#### 517

Table 2. Mean greenhouse gas flux (units CO<sub>2</sub>: mg CO<sub>2</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>, N<sub>2</sub>O: mg N<sub>2</sub>O -N m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>, CH<sub>4</sub> both 518 diffusive and ebullitive in mg CH<sub>4</sub>-C m<sup>-2</sup> day<sup>-1</sup>) from the lake from spring to Autumn 2020. The emissions 519 520 are divided in diffusive, ebullitive emissions. The mean values for all the surface water stations and all 521 four transects of chambers are given. Emissions area separated into mixed versus stratified phases and 522 there SD are also given. Ebullition was collected for a period covering two weeks so on a number of 523 occasion covered both mixed and stratified periods thus ebullition has a third category where both 524 mixed and stratified conditions occurred is given. Ebullition was significantly different across the three phases, diffusive fluxes were not significantly different for *p* values of 0.05. 525

526

Emission type	gas	mean	mixed	Stratified	Strat and
					mixed
	CO <sub>2</sub>	493.7	559.6	449.8	
Diffusive		(529.6)	(433.1)	(587.6)	
	CH <sub>4</sub>	9.47	5.9	12.7	
		(16.0)	(4.1)	(20.2)	
	N <sub>2</sub> O	0.11	0.09	0.12	
		(0.09)	(0.08)	(0.11)	
Ebullition	CH <sub>4</sub>	17.28	4.84	47.29	12.74
		(19.62)	(3.44)	(21.95)	(10.34)

531 Figure legends

- 532 Figure 1. Ormstrup lake bathymetry and sampling stations for surface water greenhouse gas sampling
- 533 (St1, St2, St3) bottom waters were sampled at S3. Transects of 10 bubble traps were placed on T1- T4.
- 534 Adapted from the Søndergaard et al. 2023.
- Figure 2 Temperature profile from June 2020 when the buoy was deployed and surface and bottom water
- oxygen from June to the end of September 2020. Manual chlorophyll-a (µg L<sup>-1</sup>) values are also given in
  the top panel.
- 538 Figure 3. Dissolved CH<sub>4</sub> concentrations from surface and bottom waters thermal stratification periods
- 539 highlighted in grey and the white background indicate mixed waters
- 540 Figure 4 . Dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations from surface and bottom waters-thermal stratification periods
- 541 highlighted in grey and the white background indicate mixed waters
- Figure 5 Dissolved N<sub>2</sub>O gas concentrations surface and bottom thermal stratification periods highlighted
  in grey and the white background indicate mixed waters
- 544 Figure 6. Omstrup lake surface fluxes of the CH<sub>4</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O gases based on dissolved conentration ,
- thermal stratification periods highlighted in grey and the white background indicate mixed waters
- 546 Figure 7. Plot of CH<sub>4</sub> ebullition averaged for each transect (10 chambers per transect), data collected from
- 547 40 traps every two weeks. Thermal stratification periods highlighted in grey and the white background
- 548 indicate mixed waters.
- 549 Figure 8 Total lake emissions per gas over the growing season in  $CO_2$  equivalents. The emissions are
- 550 divided different emission modes: Diffusive, ebullitive and turnover flux. All estimates constain some
- uncertainty, in particular ebulltive flux is an underestimate and the turnover flux also contains a gret deal
- 552 of uncertainty.

- 553 Figure 9. Summary of the quantities of the gases present in the water and the volumes emited from the
- different pathways. The size of the arrow is proportional to the emissions from each pathway and with the
- startified state on the left and the mixed state on the right, with the turnover flux in the centre.

#### 557 Figures and legends

#### 558 Figure 1.



- 560 Figure 1. Ormstrup lake bathymetry and sampling stations for surface water greenhouse gas sampling (S1,
- 561 S2, S3) bottom waters were sampled at S3. Transects of 10 bubble traps were placed on T1- T4. Adapted
- 562 from the Søndergaard et al. 2023.
- 563

559



564

- 565 Figure 2 Temperature profile from June when the buoy was deployed and surface and bottom water
- 566 oxygen from June to the end of September. Chlorophyll-a ( $\mu$ g L<sup>-1</sup>) values are also given in the top panel
- 567 and surface (DO TOP) and bottom (DO Bottom) dissolved oxygen (mg L<sup>-1</sup>) are also given



569

 $\label{eq:Figure 3} {Figure 3. Dissolved CH_4 concentrations from surface and bottom waters - thermal stratification periods}$ 

571 highlighted in grey; white background indicate mixed waters. Note different y axis scales



573 Figure 4 . Dissolved CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations from surface and bottom waters–





575

576 Figure 5 Dissolved N<sub>2</sub>O gas concentrations surface and bottom thermal stratification periods highlighted

<sup>577</sup> in grey; white background indicate mixed waters



Figure 6. Omstrup lakesurface fluxes of the CH<sub>4</sub>, CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub>O gases based on dissolved conentration ,
thermal stratification periods highlighted in grey; white background indicate mixed waters

# CH<sub>4</sub> bubble emission



583

Figure 7. Plot of  $CH_4$  ebullition averaged for each transect (10 chambers per transect), data collected from

40 traps every two weeks. thermal stratification periods highlighted in grey; whitle background indicate

586 mixed waters.



588

Figure 8 – Total lake emissions per gas over the growing seasson in CO<sub>2</sub> equivalents. The emissions are
divided different emission pathways: Diffusive, ebullitive and turnover flux.

592



593

594 Figure 9 Summary of different flux types (bubble, diffusive and turnover) for the main greenhouse gases

595 ( $CH_4 CO_2$  and  $N_2O$ ) observed between the stratified and mixed phases at Ormstrup lake patterns in the

stratified and mixed phase. The turnover flux of  $CH_4$  and  $CO_2$  is also represented. The size of the arrow

- 597 represents the relative amount of emission and the size of the circle in the lake represents the
- 598 concentration of dissolved gases in stratified or mixed water column.

# 601 **References**

- Aben, R. C. H., Barros, N., van Donk, E., Frenken, T., Hilt, S., Kazanjian, G., Lamers, L. P. M., Peeters, E. T.
- H. M., Roelofs, J. G. M., de Senerpont Domis, L. N., Stephan, S., Velthuis, M., Van de Waal, D. B., Wik, M.,
- Thornton, B. F., Wilkinson, J., DelSontro, T., and Kosten, S.: Cross continental increase in methane
- 605 ebullition under climate change, Nat. Comms., 8, 1682, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-017-01535-y</u>,
- 606 2017.
- Audet, J., Carstensen, M. V., Hoffmann, C. C., Lavaux, L., Thiemer, K., and Davidson, T. A.: Greenhouse
   gas emissions from urban ponds in Denmark, Inland Waters, 1-13,
- 609 https://doi.org/10.1080/20442041.2020.1730680, 2020.
- 610 Bartosiewicz, M., Laurion, I., and MacIntyre, S.: Greenhouse gas emission and storage in a small shallow 611 lake, Hydrobiologia, 757, 101-115, <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-015-2240-2</u>, 2015.
- 612 Bartosiewicz, M., Laurion, I., Clayer, F., and Maranger, R.: Heat-Wave Effects on Oxygen, Nutrients, and
- 613 Phytoplankton Can Alter Global Warming Potential of Gases Emitted from a Small Shallow Lake, Environ.
- 614 Sci. Technol., 50, 6267-6275, <u>https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/acs.est.5b06312</u>, 2016.
- Bartosiewicz, M., Przytulska, A., Lapierre, J.-F., Laurion, I., Lehmann, M. F., and Maranger, R.: Hot tops,
- 616 cold bottoms: Synergistic climate warming and shielding effects increase carbon burial in lakes, Limnol.
- 617 Oceanogr. Lett., 4, 132-144, <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/lol2.10117</u>, 2019.
- Bastviken, D., Cole, J. J., Pace, M. L., and Van de Bogert, M. C.: Fates of methane from different lake
- habitats: Connecting whole-lake budgets and CH4 emissions, J. Geophys. Res., 113, G02024,
- 620 <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2007JG000608</u>, 2008.
- Bastviken, D., Nygren, J., Schenk, J., Parellada Massana, R., and Duc, N. T.: Technical note: Facilitating the
- 622 use of low-cost methane (CH4) sensors in flux chambers calibration, data processing, and an open-
- 623 source make-it-yourself logger, Biogeosciences, 17, 3659-3667, https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-17-3659-
- 624 <u>2020</u>, 2020.
- Bastviken, D., Sundgren, I., Natchimuthu, S., Reyier, H., and Gålfalk, M.: Technical Note: Cost-efficient
- 626 approaches to measure carbon dioxide fluxes and concentrations in terrestrial and aquatic
- 627 environments using mini loggers, Biogeosciences, 12, 3849-3859,
- 628 <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-12-3849-2015</u>, 2015.
- 629 Bastviken, D., Treat, C. C., Pangala, S. R., Gauci, V., Enrich-Prast, A., Karlson, M., Gålfalk, M., Romano, M.
- 630 B., and Sawakuchi, H. O.: The importance of plants for methane emission at the ecosystem scale, Aquat.
- 631 Bot., 184, 103596, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquabot.2022.103596</u>, 2023.
- 632 Beaulieu, J. J., DelSontro, T., and Downing, J. A.: Eutrophication will increase methane emissions from
- 633 lakes and impoundments during the 21st century, Nat. Comms., 10, 1-5,
- 634 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-09100-5</u>, 2019.
- 635 Bergen, T. J. H. M., Barros, N., Mendonça, R., Aben, R. C. H., Althuizen, I. H. J., Huszar, V., Lamers, L. P.
- 636 M., Lürling, M., Roland, F., and Kosten, S.: Seasonal and diel variation in greenhouse gas emissions from
- an urban pond and its major drivers, Limnol. Oceanogr., 64, 2129-2139,
- 638 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/lno.11173</u>, 2019.
- Blees, J., Niemann, H., Wenk, C. B., Zopfi, J., Schubert, C. J., Kirf, M. K., Veronesi, M. L., Hitz, C., and
- 640 Lehmann, M. F.: Micro-aerobic bacterial methane oxidation in the chemocline and anoxic water column
- of deep south-Alpine Lake Lugano (Switzerland), Limnol. Oceanogr., 59, 311-324,
- 642 <u>https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.2014.59.2.0311</u>, 2014.
- 643 Burke, S. A., Wik, M., Lang, A., Contosta, A. R., Palace, M., Crill, P. M., and Varner, R. K.: Long-Term
- Measurements of Methane Ebullition From Thaw Ponds, J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci. 124, 2208-2221,
   https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JG004786, 2019.
- 646 Cole, J.: Freshwater in flux, Nat. Geosci., 6, 13-14, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo1696</u>, 2013.

- 647 Cole, J. J. and Caraco, N. F.: Atmospheric exchange of carbon dioxide in a low-wind oligotrophic lake
- 648 measured by the addition of SF6, Limnol. Oceanogr., 43, 647-656,
- 649 <u>https://doi.org/10.4319/lo.1998.43.4.0647</u>, 1998.
- 650 Davidson, T. A., Audet, J., Jeppesen, E., Landkildehus, F., Lauridsen, T. L., Søndergaard, M., and
- 651 Syvaranta, J.: Synergy between nutrients and warming enhances methane ebullition from experimental
- 652 lakes, Nat. Clim. Chang., 8, 156-160, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-017-0063-z</u>, 2018.
- Davidson, T. A., Audet, J., Svenning, J.-C. C., Lauridsen, T. L., Søndergaard, M., Landkildehus, F., Larsen, S.
- E., and Jeppesen, E.: Eutrophication effects on greenhouse gas fluxes from shallow-lake mesocosms
- override those of climate warming, Glob. Chang. Biol., 21, 4449-4463,
- 656 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13062</u>, 2015.
- Deacon, E. L.: Sea-air gas transfer: The wind speed dependence, Bound.- Layer. Meteorol., 21, 31-37,
   https://doi.org/10.1007/bf00119365, 1981.
- Deemer, B. R. and Holgerson, M. A.: Drivers of Methane Flux Differ Between Lakes and Reservoirs,
- 660 Complicating Global Upscaling Efforts, J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci. . 126, e2019JG005600,
- 661 <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2019JG005600</u>, 2021.
- 662 DelSontro, T., Boutet, L., St-Pierre, A., del Giorgio, P. A., and Prairie, Y. T.: Methane ebullition and
- diffusion from northern ponds and lakes regulated by the interaction between temperature and system
- 664 productivity, Limnol. Oceanogr., 61, S62-S77, <u>http://doi.wiley.com/10.1002/lno.10335</u>, 2016.
- 665 Erkkilä, K. M., Ojala, A., Bastviken, D., Biermann, T., Heiskanen, J. J., Lindroth, A., Peltola, O., Rantakari,
- 666 M., Vesala, T., and Mammarella, I.: Methane and carbon dioxide fluxes over a lake: comparison between
- eddy covariance, floating chambers and boundary layer method, Biogeosciences, 15, 429-445,
  10.5194/bg-15-429-2018, 2018.
- 669 Esposito, C., Nijman, T. P. A., Veraart, A. J., Audet, J., Levi, E. E., Lauridsen, T. L., and Davidson, T. A.:
- 670 Activity and abundance of methane-oxidizing bacteria on plants in experimental lakes subjected to
- different nutrient and warming treatments, Aquat. Bot., 185, 103610,
- 672 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquabot.2022.103610</u>, 2023.
- Holgerson, M. A. and Raymond, P. A.: Large contribution to inland water CO2 and CH4 emissions from
  very small ponds, Nat. Geosci., 9, 222-226, 2016.
- Holgerson, M. A., Richardson, D. C., Roith, J., Bortolotti, L. E., Finlay, K., Hornbach, D. J., Gurung, K., Ness,
- A., Andersen, M. R., Bansal, S., Finlay, J. C., Cianci-Gaskill, J. A., Hahn, S., Janke, B. D., McDonald, C.,
- 677 Mesman, J. P., North, R. L., Roberts, C. O., Sweetman, J. N., and Webb, J. R.: Classifying Mixing Regimes 678 in Ponds and Shallow Lakes, Water Resour. Res., 58, e2022WR032522,
- 679 https://doi.org/10.1029/2022WR032522, 2022.
- 680 Jespersen, A. and Christoffersen, K.: Measurements of Chlorophyll a from phytoplankton using ethanol
- 681 as extraction solvent., Archiv für Hydrobiologie, 109, 445-454, 1987.
- Kirillin, G. and Shatwell, T.: Generalized scaling of seasonal thermal stratification in lakes, Earth Sci. Rev.,
  161, 179-190, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2016.08.008, 2016.
- 684 Koschorreck, M., Prairie, Y. T., Kim, J., and Marcé, R.: Technical note: CO2 is not like CH4 limits of and
- 685 corrections to the headspace method to analyse pCO2 in fresh water, Biogeosciences, 18, 1619-1627,
- 686 10.5194/bg-18-1619-2021, 2021.
- 687 McAuliffe, C.: Gas chromatographic determination of solutes by multiple phase equilibrium, Chem 688 Technol, 1, 46-51, 1971.
- 689 Meerhoff, M., Audet, J., Davidson, T. A., De Meester, L., Hilt, S., Kosten, S., Liu, Z., Mazzeo, N., Paerl, H.,
- 690 Scheffer, M., and Jeppesen, E.: Feedbacks between climate change and eutrophication: revisiting the
- 691 allied attack concept and how to strike back, Inland Waters, 1-42,
- 692 https://doi.org/10.1080/20442041.2022.2029317, 2022.

- 693 Peacock, M., Audet, J., Jordan, S., Smeds, J., and Wallin, M. B.: Greenhouse gas emissions from urban
- 694 ponds are driven by nutrient status and hydrology, Ecosphere, 10, e02643,
- 695 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/ecs2.2643</u>, 2019.
- 696 Peacock, M., Audet, J., Bastviken, D., Cook, S., Evans, C. D., Grinham, A., Holgerson, M. A., Högborn, L.,
- 697 Pickard, A. E., Zieliński, P., and Futter, M. N.: Small artificial waterbodies are widespread and persistent
- emitters of methane and carbon dioxide, Glob. Chang. Biol., 27, 5109-5123,
- 699 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.15762</u>, 2021.
- 700 Petersen, S. O., Hoffmann, C. C., Schäfer, C. M., Blicher-Mathiesen, G., Elsgaard, L., Kristensen, K.,
- Total Larsen, S. E., Torp, S. B., and Greve, M. H.: Annual emissions of CH4 and N2O, and ecosystem respiration,
- from eight organic soils in Western Denmark managed by agriculture, Biogeosciences, 9, 403-422,
- 703 <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-9-403-2012</u>, 2012.
- Pinheiro, J., Bates, D., DebRoy, S., Sarkar, D., and R Core Team: nlme: Linear and Nonlinear Mixed EffectsModels, 2014.
- 706 R Development Core Team: R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
- 707 Statistical Computing (4.2.1) [code], 2022.
- 708 Ray, N. E. and Holgerson, M. A.: High Intra-Seasonal Variability in Greenhouse Gas Emissions From
- 709 Temperate Constructed Ponds, Geophysical Research Letters, 50, e2023GL104235,
- 710 <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2023GL104235</u>, 2023.
- 711 Rosentreter, J. A., Borges, A. V., Deemer, B. R., Holgerson, M. A., Liu, S., Song, C., Melack, J., Raymond, P.
- A., Duarte, C. M., Allen, G. H., Olefeldt, D., Poulter, B., Battin, T. I., and Eyre, B. D.: Half of global methane
- emissions come from highly variable aquatic ecosystem sources, Nat. Geosci., 14, 225-230,
- 714 <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-021-00715-2</u>, 2021.
- 715 Saarela, T., Rissanen, A. J., Ojala, A., Pumpanen, J., Aalto, S. L., Tiirola, M., Vesala, T., and Jäntti, H.: CH4
- oxidation in a boreal lake during the development of hypolimnetic hypoxia, Aquat. Sci., 82, 19,
   https://doi.org/10.1007/s00027-019-0690-8, 2019.
- 718 Schubert, C. J., Diem, T., and Eugster, W.: Methane Emissions from a Small Wind Shielded Lake
- 719 Determined by Eddy Covariance, Flux Chambers, Anchored Funnels, and Boundary Model Calculations: A
- 720 Comparison, Environ. Sci. Technol., 46, 4515-4522, <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/es203465x</u>, 2012.
- 721 Sø, J. S., Sand-Jensen, K., Martinsen, K. T., Polauke, E., Kjær, J. E., Reitzel, K., and Kragh, T.: Methane and
- carbon dioxide fluxes at high spatiotemporal resolution from a small temperate lake, Sci. Total Environ.,
  878, 162895, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.162895, 2023.
- 724 Søndergaard, M., Jeppesen, E., Peder Jensen, J., and Lildal Amsinck, S.: Water Framework Directive:
- ecological classification of Danish lakes, J. Appl. Ecol., 42, 616-629, <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-</u>
- 726 <u>2664.2005.01040.x</u>, 2005.
- 727 Søndergaard, M., Nielsen, A., Johansson, L. S., and Davidson, T. A.: Temporarily summer-stratified lakes
- are common: profile data from 436 lakes in lowland Denmark, Inland Waters, 1-14,
- 729 10.1080/20442041.2023.2203060, 2023a.
- 730 Søndergaard, M., Nielsen, A., Skov, C., Baktoft, H., Reitzel, K., Kragh, T., and Davidson, T. A.: Temporarily
- and frequently occurring summer stratification and its effects on nutrient dynamics, greenhouse gas
- emission and fish habitat use: case study from Lake Ormstrup (Denmark), Hydrobiologia, 850, 65-79,
  https://doi.org/10.1007/s10750-022-05039-9, 2023b.
- Thottathil, S. D., Reis, P. C. J., and Prairie, Y. T.: Methane oxidation kinetics in northern freshwater lakes,
  Biogeochemistry, 143, 105-116, 10.1007/s10533-019-00552-x, 2019.
- 736 Wanninkhof, R.: Relationship between wind-speed and gas-exchange over the ocean, J. Geophys. Res.
- 737 Oceans, 97, 7373-7382, <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/92jc00188</u>, 1992.
- 738 Weiss, R. F.: Carbon dioxide in water and seawater: the solubility of a non-ideal gas, Mar. Chem., 2, 203-
- 739 215, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4203(74)90015-2</u>, 1974.

- 740 Weiss, R. F. and Price, B. A.: Nitrous oxide solubility in water and seawater, Mar. Chem., 8, 347-359,
- 741 https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4203(80)90024-9, 1980.
- 742 West, W. E., Coloso, J. J., and Jones, S. E.: Effects of algal and terrestrial carbon on methane production
- rates and methanogen community structure in a temperate lake sediment, Freshw. Biol., 57, 949-955,
   <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2427.2012.02755.x</u>, 2012.
- 745 Wiesenburg, D. A. and Guinasso, N. L.: Equilibrium solubilities of methane, carbon monoxide, and
- hydrogen in water and sea water, J. Chem. Eng. Data . 24, 356-360,
- 747 <u>https://doi.org/10.1021/je60083a006</u>, 1979.
- 748 Wik, M., Crill, P. M., Varner, R. K., and Bastviken, D.: Multiyear measurements of ebullitive methane flux
- from three subarctic lakes, J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci. . 118, 1307–1321,
- 750 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/jgrg.20103</u>, 2013.
- 751 Winslow, L., Read, J., Woolway, I., Brentrup, J., Leach, T., Zwart, J., Albers, S., and Collinge, D.:
- rLakeAnalyzer: Lake Physics Tools: R package (1.11.4.1) [code], 2019.
- 753 Woolway, R. I. and Merchant, C. J.: Worldwide alteration of lake mixing regimes in response to climate
- 754 change, Nat. Geosci., 12, 271-276, <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-019-0322-x</u>, 2019.
- 755 Yvon-Durocher, G., Allen, A. P., Montoya, J. M., Trimmer, M., and Woodward, G.: The temperature
- dependence of the carbon cycle in aquatic ecosystems, Adv. Ecol. Res., 43, 267-313,
- 757 https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-385005-8.00007-1, 2010.
- 758 Yvon-Durocher, G., Allen, A. P., Bastviken, D., Conrad, R., Gudasz, C., St-Pierre, A., Thanh-Duc, N., and del
- Giorgio, P. A.: Methane fluxes show consistent temperature dependence across microbial to ecosystem
   scales, Nature, 507, 488-491, https://doi.org/10.1038/nature13164, 2014.
- 761 Zhou, Y., Zhou, L., Zhang, Y., de Souza, J. G., Podgorski, D. C., Spencer, R. G. M., Jeppesen, E., and
- 762 Davidson, T. A.: Autochthonous dissolved organic matter potentially fuels methane ebullition from
- 763 experimental lakes, Water Res., 166, 115048, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2019.115048</u>, 2019.